# CHAPTER **I**O

# "SUPPLIED FLAG TO MARINES TO FLY FROM MT. SURIBACHI" Confirming the Role of LST-779 in the Second Flag Raising

by Christopher B. Havern Sr.

On 19 February 1945, U.S. naval, land, and air forces launched Operation Detachment, the amphibious assault to seize the Japanese-held island of Iwo Jima. Though the battle would last 36 days, it is largely remembered for the 23 February events during just a few hours on the extinct volcano Mount Suribachi at the island's southern end. That morning, as John C. Chapin wrote in The Fifth Marine Division in World War II, "a patrol from Company E of the 28th Marines did discover a path up the mountain which they were able to ascend, and at 1037 that morning of D plus 4 [23 February] the American flag was hoisted on top of Mt. Suribachi."1 It was this flag raising, as witnessed by Secretary of Navy James V. Forrestal, that prompted him to remark to Lieutenant General Holland M. Smith, commanding general, expeditionary troops for the invasion, "Holland, the raising of that flag on Suribachi means a Marine Corps for the next 500 years."<sup>2</sup> Ironically, it was not the raising of this particular flag, but its replacement that served to do what Forrestal had predicted. It was the second flag raising, documented by Associated Press photographer Joseph Rosenthal and Sergeant William H. Genaust, that would serve as the embodiment of the Marine Corps and its ethos in the eyes of the American public. The image that recorded 1/400th of a second in human history transmogrified from a simple serendipitous photograph to an exemplar of American iconography.<sup>3</sup> It has assumed a significance that is more than cultural, occupying a position that is arguably unequaled in American history (see figure 0.2). Given its ultimate significance, the event is bounded in even greater irony, as the second flag raising was not even mentioned in the 2d Battalion, 28th Marines' action report. As James Bradley, author of Flags of Our Fathers, wryly noted, "The Action Report made no mention of a second flagraising [sic]. It was, after all, only a replacement flag."4

Some participants saw these events as a moment in the performance of their duty, while some sought celebrity from their involvement. Others proclaimed association with the event, yet had either only the remotest connection or were not even present; as if being associated with the flag raising would confer, by some transitive property, a degree of status upon them. Given this phenomenon, the event's stature generated not only an insatiable interest, but a corresponding controversy. The years subsequent to the battle saw the emergence of a vast literature. Most readers might expect that most matters regarding various aspects of the multifaceted battle would have, in the years since, been identified, debated, and resolved to confirm not just a consensus, but an orthodoxy.<sup>5</sup> More particularly, the narrative of the flag raisings on Suribachi had seemingly been established. After all, it was the subject of several iterations of Marine Corps official histories and also the subject of Parker B. Albee Jr. and Keller C. Freeman's Shadow of Suribachi: Raising the Flags on Iwo Jima. The authors conducted interviews with many of the participants and timed the publication of their book to coincide with the event's 50th anniversary in 1995.6

The aforementioned sources state that the landing ship, tank USS LST-779 provided the second flag. After Secretary Forrestal expressed an interest in acquiring the first flag raised by Company E, 2d Battalion, 28th Marines, Lieutenant Colonel Chandler W. Johnson, the battalion's commanding officer, told Second Lieutenant Albert T. Tuttle, assistant operations officer for 2d Battalion, 28th Marines, to go down to one of the ships on the beach and get a battle flag "large enough that the men at the other end of the island will see it. It will lift their spirits also."7 Lieutenant Tuttle went on board LST-779, beached near the base of the volcano, and obtained a larger set of colors. Fittingly, the flag obtained from LST-779 that would soon fly over the first captured Japanese home territory had been salvaged from Pearl Harbor. Tuttle returned to the command post with the larger flag and Colonel Johnson directed him to give it to Private First Class Rene A. Gagnon, the runner from Company E who was headed up the hill with replacement batteries for First Lieutenant Harold G. Schrier, Company E's executive officer. As Gagnon carried this second, larger flag (96" x 56") up the slope, Rosenthal was just beginning his ascent of the mountain.

This narrative was further bolstered in 2000. As part of the commemoration of the 55th anniversary of the assault on Iwo Jima, World War II magazine published an article by R. C. House for the January issue wherein he interviewed Alan S. Wood, the communications officer on board LST-779. In the article, Wood detailed his having provided the replacement flag.<sup>8</sup> Later in May that same year, James Bradley and Ron Powers published Flags of Our Fathers. The volume recounted the role of Pharmacist's Mate Second Class John H. Bradley in the flag raisings, the photograph, the bond tour, and subsequent events. After spending 46 weeks as a New York Times bestseller, 6 of which were spent at number one, the events of 23 February 1945 saw a significant resurgence of interest.<sup>9</sup>

Soon thereafter, however, a dissenting version of what transpired emerged. In August 2001, Coast Guard Quartermaster Robert L. Resnick, who had served at Iwo Jima on board the Coast Guard-manned *LST-758*, attended the 5th Marine Division Reunion at West Palm Beach, Florida, and identified himself as the individual who had provided the flag for the raising photographed by Rosenthal and filmed by Genaust (figure 10.1). His claim was accepted as fact by many of the attendees and the president of the 5th Marine Division Association, who later made Resnick an honorary member of the reunion group. In a 2004 interview with Coast Guard Public Affairs Specialist Second



FIGURE 10.1 LST-758. Official U.S. Coast Guard photograph, U.S. Coast Guard Historian's Office

Class Judy L. Silverstein for the July 2004 issue of the Reservist Magazine, the former quartermaster stated, "'It never occurred to me to seek glory for Bob Resnick,' he said. 'But the (LST-) 779 kept receiving credit for supplying the flag and I wanted to set things right'."10 Resnick's claim to have provided the flag for the second raising, which was recognized by the U.S. Coast Guard, caused considerable consternation among Marine Corps veterans. It even prompted the Marine Corps History Division to make a request to the U.S. Coast Guard Historian's Office to disavow Resnick's assertions and to remove material related to his claims from their website.<sup>11</sup> The contention between the two Services was even reported in the Army Times.<sup>12</sup> Despite the Marine Corps' request, the Coast Guard did not withdraw its support for Resnick's claims. In the succeeding years, the intensity of the dispute subsided though was never fully resolved. To further muddy the waters, Marion Noel, a member of LST-779's crew, was interviewed by the Roanoke Times on the 60th anniversary of the Mount Suribachi flag raisings. In the interview, Noel stated, "The ship's log says that our commanding officer, Alan Wood, furnished the flag."<sup>13</sup> Further, he recalled that he and Donald W. Noel, his Navy veteran son, had "obtained the ship's log from *LST-779*, which contained an entry from Feb. 23, 1945, stating that the ship supplied the flag for the raising."<sup>14</sup>

It was Noel's interview that prompted further consultation of *LST-779*'s logbooks for more information on the subject. In the interest of diligence and to ensure corroboration of the historical record, the relevant primary documentation found in archived logbooks, war diaries, action reports also required attention for not just information on *LST-779* but also that for *LST-758*; the 2d Battalion, 28th Marines; the 5th Marine Division; and the *Haskell*-class attack transport *Talladega* (APA 208). In the course of conducting this research, the author intends to lay the matter to rest.

# *LST-779* AND *LST-758*

Historians often claim that the landing craft, vehicle and personnel (LCVP) or "Higgins Boat" "won the war" because of its integral role in transferring men and materiel from ship to shore.<sup>15</sup> The versatile landing ship, tank (LST), however, was no less important in the conduct of amphibious operations. The Allies classified four types of vessels as LSTs. The Prototype (British conversion), Type I, and Type III LST designs were built in Commonwealth shipyards in England, Ireland, or Canada, while only the Type II was exclusively built in U.S. shipyards. Originally conceived in the United Kingdom and known as a tank landing craft (TLC), the design was brought to the United States by a delegation from the Admiralty and submitted to the Navy's Bureau of Ships in November 1941. After some design modifications, and with the concurrence of the Allies, the design was approved and the type designator was changed to landing ship, tank (LST, Allied Type II). Of the 1,052 Type II vessels built during World War II, 117 were transferred to either the Royal Navy or the Royal Hellenic Navy under the Lend-Lease Act of 1941.<sup>16</sup> Still other LSTs were commissioned in the U.S. Coast Guard and crewed by their servicemembers. According to the Naval Vessel Register, the official inventory of ships and service craft titled to the U.S. Navy, there were seven classes of Type II LSTs. The first three classes of the Type II built during the war years were all of the same design and built simultaneously on both coasts and in shipyards along the Ohio and Mississippi River systems. The *LST-542*-class was essentially similar to the *LST-1* and *LST-491*-classes.<sup>17</sup>

As members of the LST-542-class, both LST-758 and LST-779 displaced 1,625 tons light and 4,080 tons under full load.<sup>18</sup> With a speed of 11.6 knots, they had a complement of 117 sailors and could accommodate 163 troops. Their equipment included two LCVPs and they were armed at commissioning with eight 40mm guns and twelve 20mm guns. Aside from their type and class, these ships were further linked. Both were built in Pennsylvania, along the Ohio River, within miles and weeks of each other. LST-779 was laid down on 21 May 1944 at Neville Island, Pittsburgh, by the Dravo Corporation, while LST-758 was laid down on 5 June 1944, 10 miles downriver, at Ambridge by the American Bridge Company. The former was launched on 1 July 1944, while the latter launched on 25 July 1944.<sup>19</sup> LST-779 was commissioned into the Navy on 3 August 1944 with Reserve Lieutenant (Junior Grade) Joseph A. Hopkins in command, while LST-758 was placed into commission in the Coast Guard, then under the Navy Department, on 19 August 1944, with Coast Guard Lieutenant Felix J. Molenda in command (figure 10.2).<sup>20</sup>

Continuing in parallel, both ships made

their way down the Ohio and Mississippi rivers to the Gulf Coast, where they conducted shakedown training and final fitting out. After loading the tank deck with heavy construction materials earmarked for forward areas and five sections of landing craft, tank (LCT) on the main deck, LST-779 made final checkups and departed New Orleans, Louisiana, on 7 September for the Pacific Fleet. After transiting the Panama Canal on 18 September 1944, the ship steamed to San Diego, California, visiting Acapulco, Mexico, en route. On 8 October, LST-779 departed San Diego unescorted and arrived at Pearl Harbor, Oahu, Hawaiian Territory, on 18 October. During that time, LST-758 departed Gulfport, Mississippi, on 11 September, loaded with equipment for deployment in forward areas and proceeded via the Canal Zone and arrived at Pearl Harbor on 21 October. Having unloaded their materiel, both ships undertook a period of intensive training with units from the Army and Marine Corps in Hawaiian waters.

It was not until January 1945 that both LSTs embarked their combat loads of men and materiel in preparation for the Iwo Jima assault. LST-779 was loaded with ammunition, gasoline, equipment, the Marines of the 2d 155mm Howitzer Battalion, and eight amphibious trucks (DUKW) from the Army's 473d Amphibian Truck Company. On 22 January, assigned to Task Group 53.3 (Tractor Flotilla), LST-779 departed Hawaii, setting a course for the Marianas.<sup>21</sup> LST-758 also was assigned to Task Group 53.3 (Tractor Flotilla) with 12 other Coast Guard-manned tank landing ships and was underway by 1 February 1945 en route to Saipan, Marianas, via Eniwetok, Marshall Islands.<sup>22</sup> The ship arrived at Tanapag Harbor, Saipan, on 10 February and after anchoring "began transfer of troops and exchange of



FIGURE 10.2 LST-779's side launch into the Ohio River, 1 July 1944. Official U.S. Navy Bureau of Ships photograph, National Archives and Records Administration, Still Pictures Branch, 19-N-67843

personnel and cargo. Loaded provisions and supplies. Landing teams, serial 128 and 227, Marines of the Fifth Marine Division."<sup>23</sup> Both LSTs conducted landing rehearsals off Tinian on 13 February, and then upon return to Saipan, they conducted logistics operations until departing on 15 February in convoy bound for Iwo Jima.

## 19–22 FEBRUARY

After uneventful passages, each ship arrived in its designated area off the island on 19 February 1945 [D-day]. *LST-779* reached Area Charlie at 0702, and *LST-758* arrived in Area Able at 0712.<sup>24</sup> *LST-779* lay off the beach during that day and part of the next while the initial assault waves landed in smaller craft (map 3). Meanwhile, LST-758 lowered LCVPs into the water after 0730 and opened the bow doors to launch the landing vehicles, tracked (LVTs). By 0744, all seven had launched and were heading toward the beach, which was reached at 0900. During these launching operations, the port bow door was cut away and had to be removed. After landing their Marines, the LVTs returned to LST-758 to load supplies. By 1211, 10 LVTs were on board and the bow doors were closed to enable the LST to maintain its position on the LST line. Between 1427 and 1530, the ship launched the LVTs for a return to the beach. At 1615, it was hit by a shell starboard amidships that punctured the pontoon



MAP 3 Map of Iwo Jima identifying the landing beaches. John C. Chapin, The Fifth Marine Division in World War II (Washington, DC: Historical Division, Headquarters Marine Corps, 1945)

causeways but did not puncture the hull. By 1840, the vessel had received 11 LVTs and hoisted the ramps. The next day *LST-758* remained on the LST line in Area Able, picking up and launching LVTs transiting to and from

the beach with supplies. Responding to various air raid alarms, LST-758 remained on the LST line for the remainder of the night. Through this period, the landing ship had unloaded 85 percent of its supplies.<sup>25</sup>

In the meantime on 20 February [D+1], LST-779 moved in close to the beach and around 1400 launched eight General Motors DUKW amphibious trucks (or ducks), which proceeded to Yellow Beach 1. With the DUKWs unable to land because of crowded conditions on the beach, LST-779 maneuvered toward Yellow Beach 2 to re-embark the landing craft. As she was maneuvering, Rear Admiral Harry W. Hill, commander, attack force, Task Force 53, ordered the tank landing ship to beach on Red Beach 1. After maneuvering with difficulty through the small craft, the ship beached on the right flank of Red Beach 1 at 1634, the first LST to land on Iwo Jima and began unloading at 1640 in response to a call by forces ashore for heavy artillery. At 1650, the ship's 40mm guns engaged targets on Mount Suribachi. Five minutes later, at 1655, the 40mm battery ceased firing having suppressed the target.<sup>26</sup>

By 0400 on 21 February [D+2], the Marines had unloaded all the heavy artillery on board together with part of the ammunition and gasoline. At 0425, LST-779 was straddled by heavy enemy fire. A Japanese mortar round hit a gasoline-laden LVT within 10 feet of the ship's bow, and the resulting explosion produced fragments that pierced the hull. At 0443, the tank landing ship began to withdraw from the beach. Afterward, Lieutenant Hopkins, LST-779's commanding officer, reported on board the amphibious command ship USS Auburn (AGC 10) and conferred with Rear Admiral Hill and his staff, who questioned him regarding beaching conditions, traction for vehicles on the beach, and the amount of cargo unloaded by his ship. Rear Admiral Hill also complimented LST-779's efforts as a job well done and ordered her not to re-beach until notified. From 0800 to 1800, the ship lay off Iwo Jima near the line of departure taking LVTs and DUKWs on board to unload propellant and shells. During that time, at 1500, the ship's commanding officer received orders to launch the pontoon barges. At 1604, the first barge (No. 16) was launched and secured alongside, followed by No. 14, which was secured forward of No. 16 at 1706. At 1923, sea swells and fresh wind caused No. 16 to puncture *LST-779*'s hull just above the water line, allowing cresting waves to enter the hull. Conditions prevented them from reloading the barges, which were in danger of breaking loose as the lines and cables kept parting.<sup>27</sup>

That same day, *LST-758* moved into the new line of departure 2,000 yards from the beach. The LST continued to pick up and launch LVTs and pontoon causeways in preparation of towing them to the beach. The causeways were beached on Red Beach 1, but were later broached by the heavy surf. Despite this, cargo unloading continued until midnight.

On 22 February [D+3], the line of departure had moved in to 1,000 yards and LST-758 took up position there. In this position at 0915, the bow doors were opened to lower the ramp to launch two maintenance LVTs. These launchings completed "the disembarkation of all Marine officers, Navy officers and C. B. [construction battalion or Seabees] officers and personnel of the Marine Corps, Navy, Construction Battalions and All [sic] LVTs." The vessel was then beached on the left flank of "red beach one" at 1112.28 The bow ramp was lowered upon landing and LVTs came on board to remove the remaining cargo (figure 10.3). By 1345, the ship was completely unloaded and the crew made preparations to retract from the beach at 1607. When the engines were reversed, however, the port engine was reported to be disabled. The starboard propeller had what "appeared to be a



FIGURE 10.3 LST-758 unloading supplies on Red Beach. Official U.S. Coast Guard photo, Coast Guard Historian's Office

section of an LVT ramp, the wire of which was wrapped around the propeller." Eventually, the starboard engine had to be stopped too. The salvage tug USS *Shackle* (ARS 9) was signaled to come to the LST's assistance. With the tow cable secured, *LST-758* was under tow at 1830 and remained in tow of *Shackle* to seaward of the line of departure. A heavy sea made it impracticable for divers to inspect or clear the ship's propellers.<sup>29</sup>

LST-779, conversely, had both barges break loose at 0103 on 22 February, and although the ship's crew attempted to recover them, their efforts proved unsuccessful. Close to the line of departure at 0933, the ship launched another barge (No. 13) and secured it to the starboard side. DUKW crews began unloading ammunition off the bow ramp at 1000. The barge put a small hole in the starboard side at 1320. After being told to close in on Red Beach 1, the ship was anchored 400 yards offshore to await orders. After shifting anchorage to 800 yards off Green Beach, the anchor dragged and the ship remained underway the remainder of the evening to maintain position off the beach.

CONFIDENTIA BEER LOG-BEMARKS SHEET Friday 23 Fel 107 0775 Fins, A. E. Higgins, Unit.

FIGURE 10.4 LST-779 logbook page for 23 February 1945. Author's collection

#### 23 FEBRUARY [D+4]

At 0830 on 23 February, *LST-779*'s commanding officer received orders to beach on the left flank of Green Beach 1 and did so at 0842. Throughout the early part of the day, the beach party continued unloading the remainder of the 2d Howitzer Battalion's ammunition and other cargo.<sup>30</sup> Meanwhile, units from the 2d Battalion, 28th Marines, took the summit of Mount Suribachi and men from the battalion reserve, Company E, 2d Battalion, 28th Marines, raised a flag. This first flag, which was tied to a pipe found on the height, had been brought ashore from the attack transport USS *Missoula* (APA 211). Shortly afterward, Lieutenant Tuttle, at the battalion commander's direction, went to the nearest vessel on the beach, *LST-779*, in search of a larger flag.<sup>31</sup>

That *LST*-779 was the source of the flag that Tuttle transferred to Private First Class Gagnon, who was headed up the hill with replacement batteries, is corroborated by *LST*-779's logbook for 23 February (figure 10.4). The log entry for 1100 states, "Supplied flag to Marines to fly from Mt. Suribachi" and was signed by Navy Reserve Ensign Alan S. Wood, the ship's communications officer.<sup>32</sup>

Ensign Wood recounted that a "marine came on board asking for a larger flag, so I gave him our only large flag.<sup>33</sup> Later, for the 55th anniversary of the flag raising, Alan Wood stated in an article in *World War II* magazine:

A battle-weary Marine appeared aboard LST-779, which was beached closest to the mountain in a long line of LSTs. As Wood recalled, the Marine asked to borrow a large flag. Wood asked him, "What for?" and the Marine responded, "Don't worry. You won't regret it." Wood got approval from his skipper for the loan, which, of course, became a donation.

"I barely remember the Marine who came aboard to get the flag," Wood said later, "and I don't know if he was one of the group which raised the flag or not. He was dirty and looked tired, and had several days' growth of beard on his face... Even though he couldn't have been more than 18 or 19, he looked like an old man... I have looked carefully at the pictures of the men who raised the flag, but I recognized none of them."

Wood's assertion that *LST-779* was beached closest to the mountain in a long line of LSTs gives further credence to the notion that this particular LST provided the colors. After all, it stands to reason that, given the dangerous environment that existed on Iwo Jima that morning, with Japanese soldiers emerging from unseen locations and snipers firing on Marines, it is unlikely that anybody would go beyond the closest ship to try to obtain a flag, unless one was not available from there.

Curiously, while the *LST-779*'s War Diary for February 1945 documented the ship's actions for 23 February and each of the days prior and subsequent, there is no mention of the ship's role in providing the flag for the raising on Mount Suribachi. The ship's Iwo Jima Action Report likewise made no mention of the part played by the ship as the provider of the flag. In the case of the latter, having documented Lieutenant Hopkin's meeting with Rear Admiral Hill and his staff, the report stated:

This ship remained in the area around the east coast beach of Iwo Jima until 28 February 1945. During this period the remainder of the 2nd 155mm Howitzer Battalion, FMF [Fleet Marine Force], V Amphibious Corps Pacific and its equipment was successfully unloaded on the beach. In addition we launched three of our four side-carried pontoon barges and unloaded APA's; successfully unloading three more complete LST cargos [sic].<sup>35</sup>

Given this evidence supporting *LST-779*'s claim to having provided the flag, what then of *LST-758*? Any consideration of this ship's role must begin with Judy Silverstein's article based on her interview with Robert Resnick. Silverstein noted that Resnick was on the bridge on the morning of 23 February and that, just after 1115 that morning, a Marine identified as Rene Gagnon came on board the LST. Resnick recalled climbing to the signal bridge and rummaging through a wooden bunting box where he found a large flag. After being confronted by

a signalman, Resnick said, he climbed up to the flying bridge, "his nose aligned with the heels of the ship's commanding officer, Lieutenant Felix J. Molenda, as he got to the top rung. It was from there he presented his case. Preoccupied with reprimanding a junior officer, the skipper stammered out, 'Uh, very well'." Resnick "scampered down the ladder to the signal bridge and then back down to the bridge, where he handed the Marine the flag. Gagnon then asked for a 20-30-foot pipe as a substitute. Gagnon headed down to the Tank Deck, where he was given a 21-foot galvanized steel steamfitter's pipe." Resnick recalled Gagnon slinging the pipe weighing more than 150 pounds over his left shoulder and tucking the flag under his right arm. After which, he began his trek up Suribachi. He said, "Gagnon barely made any headway" in the island's soft sand. Resnick continued to report that Gagnon, "dropped the pole and pulled it by its nose. Evidently, he called up to the summit and two other Marines shouldered the pipe and Gagnon carried the flag the rest of the way up." By his estimate, Resnick said it was probably a 20-minute journey. The article then stated that, as LST-758 was "beached under the precipice of Mt. Suribachi," so the ship lost track of the men as the hill obstructed their view.<sup>36</sup>

In the article, Resnick also claimed to have interacted with another of the flag raisers, Private First Class Ira Hayes. He recalled that he had met Hayes on Saipan about a week prior to the Iwo Jima landings and that the two had breakfast together one day after Resnick came off his watch.<sup>37</sup> Resnick stated that he and Hayes "became good friends in the week it took to transit the Pacific Ocean toward Iwo Jima. 'And as he left the vessel, he gave me his rain poncho'."<sup>38</sup>

There are very significant problems with



FIGURE 10.5 LST-758 logbook page for 23 February 1945. Author's collection

Resnick's recollections as they were related to Silverstein. At the time that *LST-779*'s logbook states that the ship supplied the flag, *LST-758*'s logbook indicates that it was still under tow with *Shackle* (figure 10.5). This nullifies Resnick's assertion that *LST-758* was beached at the base of Mount Suribachi. His LST would remain underway under tow throughout much of the day and finally anchored with *Shackle* in the lee of Iwo Jima at 1920 that evening, after which divers from the salvage ship entered the water to inspect the LST's propellers (figure 10.6).<sup>39</sup>

In light of this, Resnick could have provided neither flag nor pipe to Rene Gagnon as he claimed. Also, given his contention that



FIGURE 10.6 LST-758 (background right) underway off Iwo Jima. National Archives and Records Administration, Still Pictures Division, RG 80-G 304838

he and Hayes became friends in the transit to Iwo Jima, that too could not possibly have been true. First, the transit from Saipan to Iwo Jima took a little more than three days, not the week stated. While the mention of a week's time might be a simple misstatement of the duration of the transit in light of the years since the event, his second assertion that Hayes gave him his poncho before disembarking from the LST is even more dubious. Hayes and the other members of Company E, 2d Battalion, 28th Marines, were not embarked on LST-758. As stated above, the units embarked on that ship were elements of 1st Battalion, 28th Marines, and 2d Battalion, 27th Marines. Hayes and the other members of Company E, 2d Battalion, 28th Marines, who constituted the flag raisers, approached their landing on Green Beach on board the attack transport USS Talladega (APA 208) (figure 10.7). The unit had embarked on the ship at Hilo, Hawaiian Territory, on 7 January 1945.40 As such, Resnick and Hayes could never have interacted on Saipan as the former asserts. While Robert Resnick may have re-



FIGURE 10.7 Talladega (APA 208), ca. 1945. Naval History and Heritage Command photo, NH 74306, courtesy of Donald M. McPherson

ceived a poncho from a Marine, that Marine was not Ira Hayes.

In light of the documentary evidence, it is impossible to conclude that LST-758 provided any materials for either of the flag raisings on the summit of Mount Suribachi as claimed by Robert Resnick. It is not the intent of the author to discredit Resnick or the U.S. Coast Guard. Both undoubtedly were present at Iwo Jima as part of Operation Detachment, but neither had any connection, direct or otherwise, to what transpired atop that hill on 23 February 1945. Having landed at Red Beach 1, but not on D+4, LST-758 was never at the base of Suribachi and, more important, was under tow off the island that particular morning. LST-779, however, was clearly in position on Green Beach closest to the extinct volcano's base, as indicated by both the textual record and the associated imagery (figures 10.8–11).

Some readers may say that settling this question, even within historical circles, is of little importance. They might see it simply as arcane trivia that serves as fodder for wagers between the veterans of the different Services in VFW and American Legion halls. The reality, however, is that this could not be further from the truth. Given the position of imagery in the American pantheon, as discussed above, its constituent components are of importance to a good many people, as verified by the response of veterans and historical offices regarding Resnick's claims. It was because of this contention that the author undertook this investigation. Only by conducting archival research and consulting the relevant documentation can this



FIGURE 10.8 A Marine in a prone position atop Mount Suribachi. LST-779 is visible in the background, closest to the base of the hill. National Archives and Records Administration, Still Pictures Division, 127-GR-14-93-A419741



FIGURE 10.9 Marines use a flamethrower on Japanese still concealed in a cave under rocks. LST-779 is visible in the background, ca. 24–25 February 1945. Official U.S. Marine Corps photo, courtesy Sgt T. R. Robbins, National Archives and Records Administration, Still Pictures Division, 127-GW-320-110646



#### FIGURE 10.10

Shortly after the second flag was raised and secured atop Mount Suribachi. The stern of LST-779 is visible. Official U.S. Coast Guard photo, courtesy PHOM3 John Papsun, National Archives and Records Administration, Still Pictures Division, 26-G-4140



#### **FIGURE 10.11**

Green Beach 1 with Mount Suribachi in the background on 24 February 1945. The small wrecked ship in the foreground is Japanese. The landing ships include (from bottom to center): LSM-264, LST-724, LST-760, LST-788, LST-808 (with a LCT embarked), and LST-779 (carrying a pontoon causeway). Original photo from RAdm Samuel Eliot Morison, History of United States Naval Operations in World War II, vol. 14, Victory in the Pacific, courtesy of E. J. Long, official U.S. Navy photo, Naval History and Heritage Command, NH 65314

"SUPPLIED FLAG TO MARINES TO FLY FROM MT. SURIBACHI" 181 contentious matter be resolved. The detective work to draw the appropriate conclusions required the consideration of not just those records that confirmed the role of *LST-779*, but those that, in the end, disproved that role assigned to *LST-758* by Robert Resnick. Having done so, it is the author's hope that as the 75th anniversary approaches, the matter of which ship provided the flag seen in Rosenthal's photograph and Genaust's film has finally been laid to rest.

### ENDNOTES

The author previously published an article related to USS *LST*-779 (landing ship, tank) in the January/February 2018 issue of *Naval History* entitled "In the Right Spot, Twice." This chapter constitutes a further investigation of the roles of *LST*-779 and the U.S. Coast Guard-manned USS *LST*-758 in the second flag raising on Mount Suribachi on 23 February 1945. The quoted portion of the title comes from *LST*-779's logbook entry on 23 February 1945.

- John C. Chapin, *The Fifth Marine Division in World War* II (Washington, DC: Historical Division, U.S. Marine Corps, 1945), 10. Many sources cite a time frame between 1020 and 1037 that morning; however, the after action report of Combat Team 28, 2d Battalion, provides an official timestamp of 1020 for the first flag raising.
- Samuel Eliot Morison, *History of United States Naval Operations in World War II*, vol. 14, *Victory in the Pacific, 1945* (Boston, MA: Little, Brown, 1947), 61–62. See also Walter Millis, ed., *The Forrestal Diaries* (New York: Viking Press, 1951), 29–30.
- Hal Buell, ed., "The Longest Image," in World War II Album: The Complete Chronicle of the World's Greatest Conflict (New York: Black Dog & Leventhal, 2006), 52–55.
- James Bradley with Ron Powers, *Flags of Our Fathers* (New York: Bantam, 2000), 212. See also 2d Battalion, 28th Marines, Iwo Jima Action Report, 10 April 1945 (Declassified by Authority: E.O. 13526, by NDC, 31 December 2012), Fold3, Ancestry.com, accessed 10 April 2018, 6, hereafter 2d Battalion, 28th Marines Action Report.
- 5. The vastness of the literature on the topic is indicated by a subject search for "Iwo Jima, Battle of, Japan, 1945" in OCLC WorldCat, which identified 409 nonfiction books in English. While Rosenthal's photograph established the visual parameters of the recollection of the battle for Iwo Jima, the battle's narrative arose contemporaneously. Initially, the wire service reports of war correspondents on the island shaped the nascent historical record. Almost immediately, however, the official narrative emerged in the battle's aftermath, as the units involved submitted their action reports, logbooks,

and war diaries. It was these primary documents from which the official histories were fashioned. The first of these, Chapin's The Fifth Marine Division in World War II, was published in August 1945, before the Japanese signed the articles of capitulation and the war's official end on 2 September 1945. In subsequent decades, additional official Marine Corps publications chronicled and commemorated the events of Operation Detachment and the exploits of the Corps. See LtCol Whitman S. Bartley, Iwo Jima: Amphibious Epic (Washington, DC: Historical Branch, G-3 Division, Headquarters Marine Corps, 1954); Clifford P. Morehouse, The Iwo Jima Operation (Washington, DC: Historical Branch, G-3 Division, Headquarters Marine Corps, 1960); LtCol Whitman S. Bartley, The Battle for Iwo Jima (Washington, DC: Historical Branch, G-3 Division, Headquarters Marine Corps, 1962); Bernard C. Nalty and Danny J. Crawford, The United States Marines on Iwo 7ima: The Battle and the Flag Raisings (Washington, DC: History and Museums Division, 1967); George W. Garand and Truman R. Strobridge, History of U.S. Marine Corps Operations in World War II: Western Pacific Operations, vol. 4 (Washington, DC: Historical Division, Headquarters Marine Corps, 1971); and Col Joseph H. Alexander, Closing In: Marines in the Seizure of Iwo Jima, Marines in World War II Commemorative Series (Washington, DC: History and Museums Division, Headquarters Marine Corps, 1994).

- 6. Joel D. Thacker, History of the Iwo Jima Flag Raising (Washington, DC: Historical Branch, G-3 Division, Headquarters Marine Corps, 1951); The Iwo Jima Flag Raising (Washington, DC: Historical Branch, G-3 Division, Headquarters Marine Corps, 1962); Nalty and Crawford, The United States Marines on Iwo Jima; and Parker B. Albee Jr. and Keller C. Freeman, Shadow of Suribachi: Raising the Flags on Iwo Jima (Westport, CT: Praeger, 1995).
- 7. Nalty and Crawford, *The United States Marines on Iwo Jima*, 5.
- R. C. House, "Battle of Iwo Jima: Alan Wood and the Famous Flag on Mount Suribachi," *World War II*, January 2000.
- 9. See, for example, Rick Marin, "Raising a Flag for Generation W. W. II," *New York Times*, 22 April 2001.
- Judy L. Silverstein, "Iwo Jima: The Coast Guard Connection," *Reservist Magazine* 51, no. 6, July 2004, 25.
- 11. The author was a historian with the U.S. Coast Guard Historian's Office at the time.
- Patricia Kime, "Iwo Jima Flag Legend Puts Services at Odds," *Army Times*, 12 December 2005.
- 13. Noel misspoke in the interview. Alan S. Wood was the ship's communications officer as mentioned above. Lt (JG) Joseph A. Hopkins, USNR, was LST-779's commanding officer. Wood just happened to sign that particular log entry. "LST-779: 1944–1946," Naval History and Heritage Command, 30 August 2017. Entry drafted by author.
- Ralph Barrier Jr., "Eagle Rock Navy Veteran Remembers Iwo Jima Flag Raising, Battle," *Roanoke (VA) Times*, 23 February 2015.

- See Jerry E. Strahan, Andrew Jackson Higgins and the Boats that Won World War II, rev. ed. (Baton Rouge, LA: LSU Press, 1998); and Charles C. Roberts Jr., The Boat that Won the War: An Illustrated History of the Higgins LCVP (Annapolis: Naval Institute Press, 2017).
- The Lend-Lease Act of 1941, H. R. 1776, 77 Cong. (10 January 1941).
- "Tank Landing Ship (LST) Index," NavSource.org, accessed 9 August 2017.
- 18. They were built at a length of 328 feet, abeam of beam 50 feet and drafts of 2 feet 4 inches forward, 7 feet 6 inches aft (light); 8 feet 3 inches forward, 14 feet 1 inch aft (seagoing); and 3 feet 11 inches forward and 9 feet 10 inches aft (landing with a 500-ton load). For more on their build specifications, see NavSource.
- See "LST-779, 1944–1946," and "LST-758," Naval History and Heritage Command, 30 August 2007; and James L. Mooney, ed., *Dictionary of American Naval Fighting Ships*, vol. VII (Washington, DC: Government Printing Office, 1981), 671.
- The Coast Guard at War: Transports and Escorts, vol. II, Transports (Washington, DC: Historical Section, Public Information Division, U.S. Coast Guard Headquarters, 1946), 92.
- LST-779 Action Report, Invasion of Iwo Jima, 19–28 February 1945, RG 38, Entry A 351, Box 1205, National Archives and Records Administration (NARA), Archives II, College Park, MD, hereafter LST-779 Iwo Jima Action Report.
- These included LST-70, LST-761, LST-787, LST-789, LST-760, LST-763, LST-764, LST-792, LST-784, LST-782, LST-785, and LST-795. The Coast Guard at War, vol. VI, Pacific Landings (Washington, DC: Historical Section, Public Information Division, U.S. Coast Guard Headquarters, 1946), 175.
- 23. These units were from the 1st Battalion, 28th Marines, and 2d Battalion, 27th Marines, also referred to as Landing Team (LT) 128 and LT 227. *LST-758* War Diary, February 1945 (Declassified by NDC, Authority: Executive Order 13526, on 31 December 2012), Ancestry. com, II, hereafter *LST-758* War Diary, February 1945.
- 24. LST-779 War Diary, 3; and LST-758 War Diary, IV.
- 25. LST-758 War Diary, 3.

- 26. LST-779 Iwo Jima Action Report, 2-3.
- 27. LST-779 Iwo Jima Action Report, 2-3.
- 28. LST-758 Iwo Jima Action Report, V-VI.
- 29. LST-758 Iwo Jima Action Report, V-VI.
- 30. Though the maps of the invasion and operational graphics identified the landing area as simply "Green Beach," *LST-779*'s logbook refers to the beaching location as "beach Green 1," therefore, the reference as "Green Beach 1." See Deck Log, 23 February 1945, RG 24, Entry 118, NARA (Declassified by NND927605 and NND803052), hereafter *LST-779* Deck Log.
- 31. Nalty and Crawford, *The United States Marines on Iwo Jima*, 5–8. Bradley and Powers assert in *Flags of Our Fathers*, that it was Johnson's opposition to the expressed interest of Secretary Forrestal to obtain the flag as a souvenir that prompted the former to dispatch Tuttle to get another, larger flag. Bradley and Powers, *Flags of Our Fathers*, 207.
- 32. LST-779 Deck Log.
- Parker Bishop Albee Jr. and Keller Cushing Freeman, Shadow of Suribachi: Raising the Flags on Iwo Jima (Westport, CT: Praeger, 1995), 49.
- 34. This article was written by R. C. House and originally published in the January 2000 issue of *World War II* magazine. See House, "Iwo Jima." It is understandable that Wood did not recognize the flag raisers. He had given the flag to 2dLt Albert T. Tuttle. The assistant operations officer of 28th Marines was not among those atop Mount Suribachi.
- LST-779 War Diary, 4–5; and LST-779 Iwo Jima Action Report, 3. APA is the designator for an attack transport ship.
- 36. Silverstein, "Iwo Jima," 24. The text in this excerpt was edited by the author to correct the spelling of Gagnon's first name and the spelling of Suribachi. The date and time format also were modified to remain uniform with the rest of the text.
- 37. Silverstein, "Iwo Jima," 25.
- 38. Silverstein, "Iwo Jima."
- 39. LST-758 Deck Log, 23 February 1945, RG 26, NARA.
- 40. 2d Battalion, 28th Marines, Action Report, Section V-Embarkation and Movement to the Objective.

# CHAPTER **T**

# GENAUST'S MOTION PICTURE FOOTAGE Lost in the Line of Duty

by Criss Austin

Since 2013, the National Archives and Records Administration (NARA) has been called upon to preserve, restore, and digitize documentaries, training films, cartoons, newsreels, and raw footage shot by combat cameramen for events commemorating the 75th anniversary of World War II. Among the historical events included in NARA's motion picture holdings are the flag raisings at Iwo Jima. On the morning of 23 February 1945, Sergeant William Homer Genaust raised his Bell & Howell camera to capture one of the most iconic moments in American military history. While Associated Press photographer Joseph Rosenthal recorded the now-famous second flag raising on Iwo Jima as a single image in black and white, Genaust documented both the first and second flags in real time, in full color, and on motion picture film. When General Robert B. Neller, Commandant of the Marine Corps, called for an official review in 2016 to investigate issues regarding the identities of the flag raisers, the Genaust film became crucial evidence for retired Lieutenant General Jan C. Huly and other members of the review panel (figure 11.1). Concurrently, the Smithsonian Channel and Lucky 8 television requested that NARA provide high-resolution digital scans of the Genaust flag-raising footage for a production titled *The Unknown Flag Raiser of Iwo Jima* (2016), which summarized the Huly Panel's findings.<sup>1</sup> Yet like all of the visual evidence related to the Iwo Jima flag raisings—whether still photography or motion picture—the historical record was incomplete.

NARA carefully preserves, records, and maintains resources such as the footage taken by Genaust at Iwo Jima, but the physical difficulties faced by combat cameramen and the technological obstacles of shooting, developing, and disseminating combat footage during World War II has meant that the visual record is neither as consistent nor as informative as modern researchers, including Huly Panel members, would hope. By the time the motion picture entered the collection on 7 November 1975, all of the primary information about its duplication and dissemination had been lost.<sup>2</sup>



FIGURE 11.1 Still frame taken from the motion picture film shot by Sgt William H. Genaust atop Mount Suribachi on 23 February 1945. Official U.S. Marine Corps photo, courtesy Sgt William H. Genaust, National Archives and Records Administration

Because the U.S. Marine Corps processed combat photography at various locations and reconstructed footage to generate wartime narratives suited to diverse educational and entertainment purposes, archivists and preservationists working on the motion picture were left with numerous unanswered questions about when and how each copy in the collection was made. In 2016, NARA partnered with the U.S. Marine Corps and the Smithsonian Channel/ Lucky 8 to study and digitize the footage.

This chapter outlines what we know about the Genaust film's origins, its life after creation, and how the digitization request from the Smithsonian Channel/Lucky 8 brought to light the challenge of determining provenance for the multiple versions within NARA's collection. The Genaust footage provides an important visual record of the flag-raising events in a way that still photos cannot; however, like all historical records, it still needed to be verified and contextualized with corroborating evidence. In this case, NARA staff, the producers at the Smithsonian Channel/Lucky 8, and the Huly Panel have done much of that work. Their research took a two-pronged approach, combining scientific investigation and historical research to better understand the path the original film may have taken; its assembly at the Navy Photographic Science Laboratory (NPSL) in Anacostia, Maryland; and its repurposing for study and dissemination to troops and the general public to determine how the original was used and why it never arrived at the National Archives. Their findings have, in turn, shed new light on the provenance of the most original copy and the critical interpretation of Genaust's motion picture, with the aim of making it a reliable source of evidence for the Huly Panel (and, subsequently, the Bowers Board) and an accessible historical document for viewers of the Smithsonian Channel's documentary, NARA patrons, and the general public.<sup>3</sup>

# GENAUST'S FILM FROM COMBAT TO HOLLYWOOD: THE ORIGINAL FOOTAGE

During World War II, the Marine Corps sent cameramen along with their troops to document the battles for operational and promotional purposes. The war effort demanded the entire nation's support, especially in 1945 when the country had been at war for four years. The term *combat camera* refers to both the people and equipment sent by the Marine Corps; these servicemembers arrived with military ranks and gear not only for taking photos or motion pictures, but also for surviving in combat since they often deployed to locations before they were secure. For the men capturing moving pictures on color film, they generally carried the hefty six-pound Bell & Howell 70DA Filmo cameras and 16mm Kodak Kodachrome film. Combat cameramen were not fully armed; they were often issued only a revolver, rather than rifles, as the film equipment was heavy, and filming and changing out rolls of film was the primary focus of their duties.

Sergeant William Genaust was one of many combat cameramen serving with the Marine Corps on Iwo Jima during World War II.4 Genaust was born on 12 October 1906 in Sioux Falls, South Dakota, where he studied dentistry, business administration, and photography and worked as a stock control clerk with the Ford Motor Company until enlisting with the Marine Corps on 11 February 1943 to be a combat cameraman. After graduating from the Marine Corps Photographic Section's School of Cinematography at Quantico, Virginia, he was sent to Saipan, Northern Mariana Islands, on 15 May 1944. Wounded by a sniper on 9 July, Genaust earned a reputation for bravery and a steady hand while filming during combat and as "The Old Man" for having enlisted at age 36. Genaust filmed the approach and landing on Iwo Jima with the 4th Marine Division on 19 February 1945 and continued filming the activities of the Marine Corps, including reconnaissance missions, recovery of wounded soldiers, disposal of dead Japanese soldiers, Marines at rest, and the flag raisings throughout the campaign (figure 11.2). Genaust was killed by Japanese small arms fire on 3 March 1945 while investigating a cave on Hill 362A on the northern end of Iwo Jima.

The film that Genaust and other combat photographers shot in the field was then sent to one of several labs. Still photography went to a lab in Guam; aerial and reconnaissance film was processed by Kodak in Waikiki, Hawaiian Territory, for the Pacific front; and motion picture film went to the United States, where the staff at the NPSL would process it. Once at the lab, the 100-foot reels—equivalent to more



FIGURE 11.2 William H. Genaust enlisted in the Marine Corps on 11 February 1943. As a war photographer, he was wounded in the Battle of Saipan and later fought in the Battle of Iwo Jima, where he captured the second raising of the American flag on color motion picture film. Official U.S. Marine Corps photo

than two minutes of run time-were developed and loosely assembled into longer rolls of about 400 feet based on dates on the slates that cameramen filmed as part of the roll.<sup>5</sup> A roll could contain footage from one or more combat cameramen, depending on what was sent from the field. The NPSL staff then reviewed the film and possibly recut it for purposes of intelligence gathering, training, and documenting historical events. This information is very important in the context of understanding the Genaust footage as the flag-raising scenes were spliced together at the NPSL out of order. The first 35 seconds are actually of the second flag raising, and the last 19 seconds are of the first flag after it had been raised (figure 11.3). The lab personnel in 1945 would have had no way



FIGURE 11.3 A still frame taken from 428 NPC 2429 shows the slate Genaust used to designate the scenes he filmed on Mount Suribachi. Official U.S. Marine Corps photo, courtesy Sgt William H. Genaust, National Archives and Records Administration

of knowing in what order the footage occurred without the direct input of the cameraman or his superiors. Since Genaust was killed in action on Iwo Jima, he was unable to supply additional information to guide NPSL in processing his combat footage.

The military had its reasons for sending film to different labs based on proximity and operational demands. For example, aerial reconnaissance provided vital information for battle planning and enemy locations, while motion picture film tended to be used for postbattle analysis and documentation. According to Marine Corps photographic officer Major Norman T. Hatch, prior to Iwo Jima in "all the previous engagements, little or no coordinated effort, at a senior command level, ensured specific assignments would be accomplished or that duplicate photo coverage, both still and motion, would be held to a minimum. In addition, plans were laid for the quick pickup of military and press photography for delivery on a daily basis."6

Motion picture film had an added layer of complexity in that multiple iterations were often required to create a completed production, such as a training film, documentary, or feature-length presentation. A single title may be assembled from discrete elements, such as a reel of film with only the image on it and a reel of film with only the soundtrack on it, that are then combined onto another complete reel. In some cases, anywhere from 20 pieces of film to hundreds are used to make up one production. In the case of the Genaust film, given the high interest in the content during the spring of 1945, it was reprinted multiple times and for multiple purposes, including intelligence gathering, newsreels for the troops, newsreels for the public, war loan drives, and a joint Marine Corps-Hollywood studio documentary short film titled To the Shores of Iwo 7ima (1945).7

Before the film could be used, it had to be taken off the island and processed, which involved then-Warrant Officer Hatch who was in charge of the 5th Marine Division Photographic Section on Iwo Jima. Though young, Hatch had on-the-ground experience. Just two years before Iwo Jima, he had been a staff sergeant running onto the beaches of Tarawa to shoot footage that was later used to gain support for the American war effort in the Pacific. The film, With the Marines at Tarawa (1944), helped to bolster the U.S. war effort at a time when the balance of power was tipped toward the Japanese. By 1945, Hatch had been promoted to the rank of warrant officer, and it was his job to order Sergeant Genaust and Private Robert R. Campbell to film the Marines heading up Mount Suribachi with the second flag.8 Division photographic officers, such as Hatch and his staff, rotated from their duty station to deliver the raw film that had been shot each week since landing (e.g., D+7, D+14, D+21) for



FIGURE 11.4 WO1 Norman T. Hatch (left) rests his elbows on a D-2 (intelligence) box while talking to 1stLt Herbert Schlosberg, photographic officer for the 4th Marine Division. Official U.S. Marine Corps photo

processing at the NPSL. On D+8, Hatch sent First Lieutenant Herbert B. Schlosberg, photographic officer for the 4th Marine Division, to take film, including the Genaust footage, to NPSL to be developed. As the commanding officer of the 5th Division Photographic Section, Hatch later received orders from Vice Admiral J. H. Towers, deputy commander in chief, Pacific Fleet, under Admiral Chester W. Nimitz, commander in chief for operations in the Pacific theater, and General Alexander A. Vandegrift, Commandant of the Marine Corps, to take the next batch of material off of Iwo Jima.<sup>9</sup> By the time of Hatch's departure for the states on 8 March (D+18), Genaust had been dead for five days, and Hatch knew that the film Schlosberg had couriered to the United States contained the flag raising, already made famous by Rosenthal's still photograph of the event (figure 11.4).<sup>10</sup>

# GENAUST'S FILM ON THE HOME FRONT: COPIES AND DISTRIBUTION

Hatch flew out on 13 March, making stops at Pearl Harbor and San Francisco to receive additional temporary orders. Having been the photographic officer to order the cameramen up Mount Suribachi, he was directed to fly to Washington, DC, where he arrived on 17 March, to meet with the Commandant of the



#### FIGURE 11.5

Nominated for an Academy Award, To the Shores of Iwo Jima is a 20-minute Technicolor production relating the preparation and combat of Marines during the long battle for the Japanese island. U.S. Office of War Information

Marine Corps. Hatch needed to vouch for the authenticity of Rosenthal's photograph due to the debate over whether or not the photograph was staged.<sup>11</sup> During this meeting, Hatch reported to his superiors that the photograph captured a candid moment, which Genaust's motion picture footage verified. Further complicating the matter, he told a small white lie he hoped would turn out to be true: that Genaust's footage could stand in for Rosenthal's photograph in Marine Corps publicity materials. Also on 17 March, Vandegrift and Hatch met with executives from the Associated Press and Time Life. The Marine Corps wanted to use the flag-raising image for recruitment and bond drives, but would have been stymied if the Associated Press charged the inflated sum of a dollar per use, which is equivalent to approximately \$14 in 2019.12 Unlike the Rosenthal photo, combat camera film is owned by the Marine Corps as work-for-hire and so available for use by it and the U.S. government without payment or attribution. Thus, Hatch knew there were 24 images per second of motion picture film, and he gambled that one of those frames could stand in for the photograph.<sup>13</sup>

The civilian and military leadership directed Genaust's raw footage to be used in a variety of formats, including in *To the Shores of Iwo Jima* (figure 11.5).<sup>14</sup> Short films, such as this one, were shown in theaters along with feature-length films. Since the Great Depression, Americans who were short on cash in the 1930s and 1940s could get good value for the 35 cents it cost them to enter the theater. Double features often were broken up by newsreels, cartoons, and other shorts. In an era without television, the 20-minute short brought the war to Americans in vivid Technicolor. Upon Vandegrift's orders, Hatch headed from Washington to the Naval Photographic Studio (NPS) Depot in Hollywood, arriving on 27 March. While at NPS, he finally reviewed the footage that had been shot by Genaust in preparation for the documentary short, To the Shores of Iwo Jima. At this point, it was unclear if the footage was the camera original brought back by Schlosberg or a copy. From Hollywood, Hatch traveled back to the NPSL in Anacostia to craft the public release details of the footage before being widely shown to the public. As the primary cameraman during the Battle of Tarawa, and integral to crafting the Academy Award-winning documentary, With the Marines at Tarawa, Hatch understood the power of moving images to impact public opinion. On 30 April, he returned to NPS to work on the material for To the Shores of Iwo Jima, which was coproduced by the Navy, Marine Corps, Coast Guard, Warner Brothers, and United Artists. Much like With the Marines at Tarawa, To the Shores of Iwo Jima was used to depict the true realities of warfare, as the public had only been provided with sanitized versions of battles prior to the release of With the Marines at Tarawa. To the Shores of Iwo Jima was intended to depict war with authenticity and engender more financial support from the public to end the war, as Japan was the only Axis power left fighting after Germany's surrender on 7 May 1945.

To the Shores of Iwo Jima was released on 7 June 1945 and received an Academy Award nomination for best documentary short. The combat camera footage also was used in black and white newsreels, such as Universal News, for release to the public, and in United Newsreels, which were shown only to armed forces personnel. Black and white footage was included as part of the Seventh War Loan campaign. For this particular bond drive, the surviving Marines identified as flag raisers toured the country to encourage further financial contributions for the ongoing war effort. By 1945, the nation was weary. Victory in Europe had been achieved, but America was confronted with a lonely and possibly long fight in the Pacific still to endure. Military leaders were preparing for a costly invasion of the Japanese home islands that worried even the most stalwart general officers. The photographs and moving images from Iwo Jima, including Genaust's film, documented the costs paid by the Navy and Marines in the Pacific and reminded Americans to stay committed to the war.<sup>15</sup>

# UNDERSTANDING THE ARCHIVAL RECORD: PROVENANCE AND PRESERVATION

The footage, indeed, served its purpose during the war, but the life of the film did not end in 1945. As a part of the information dissemination and public campaign processes in 1945, the Genaust film had been reprinted multiple times. Additional 16mm copies and 35mm blow-ups were made then and during the course of several years thereafter. Several of these copies made their way into NARA's collection along with hundreds of thousands of other reels of film related to the war. After being contacted by the producers in charge of the Smithsonian Channel/Lucky 8 project, NARA archivists attempted to hunt down the original Genaust camera footage. They found a mix of 16mm and 35mm film located within three collections: Film of Marine Corps Activities, Unedited Motion Picture Films, and Department of the Navy-Moving Images Related to Military Activities. The archival unit sent 12 copies of the footage to the Motion Picture Preservation Lab at NARA with a request to definitively identify the original and provide high-resolution digital scans for the Smithsonian Channel production.

As the nation's recordkeeper, it is the responsibility of NARA to preserve and assist researchers and scholars in contextualizing the events that make up the lexicon of U.S. history. Home to the second-largest motion picture, audio, and video collection in the United States, NARA has full intellectual and physical control over 495,000 reels of film, 242,500 audio recordings, and 127,300 video recordings. The nation's 14 Presidential Libraries, also under NARA's purview, hold approximately 91,000 dynamic media records between them, and there are more than 200,000 items across the agency waiting to be formally accessioned into the collection. World War II content accounts for approximately one-fifth (96,000 reels) of the moving image footage at the National Archives.

One of NARA's larger and frequently used collections is the collection of the 17,000 reels of motion picture film in the Marine Corps's holdings. The collection is predominantly unedited and covers the full spectrum of Marine Corps activities at home and abroad. There are approximately 12,000 reels of color 16mm film spanning from World War II through the 1980s and 4,500 reels of black and white and color 35mm film of footage for World War II and the Korean War era. A smaller percentage of material is made up of edited training and documentary films, though far more training and documentary films of Marine Corps content are held within NARA's U.S. Navy Record Groups, including 428 NPC, the record group and series that holds copies of the Genaust footage.16

The Motion Picture Preservation Lab is responsible for identifying film copies of titles for permanent retention of incoming accessions, evaluating the physical condition of the collection, and preserving the records and digital conversion for access.<sup>17</sup> Its fundamental mission is to identify and preserve the most original copy that arrives at the archives, which can range from the camera original, to a faded scratched print shown in training rooms, or a duplicate that has been reprinted over several generations. Selection of appropriate preservation actions, including reformatting, is a collaborative process between the archival branch and the preservation lab staff. To ensure that NARA's preservation masters and digital copies accurately reflect the period in which they were shot, the staff adheres to the goal of preserving and digitizing collections in a historically accurate manner. All the staff must, therefore, be familiar with film stock types and processes during the last century, such as nitrate film shot in the early twentieth century; Technicolor prints; and 16mm Kodachrome, as in the case of Genaust's flag-raising footage. For films of significant interest and value, additional staff time and research is required to help contextualize film content. Much of this work is done when records are preserved or digitized for anniversaries, events, or when records of interest are brought into the collection. Some examples of these events, in addition to the Iwo Jima flag raising, have been activities related to the March on Washington for Jobs and Freedom in 1963, to the death of former Marine, astronaut, and senator John Glenn in 2016, or to the discovery of the earliest known color home movie footage of Yellowstone National Park from 1930.

Upon full inspection and analysis, it became apparent that NARA lacks the original reversal film stock that was in Genaust's camera on Iwo Jima, 23 February 1945.<sup>18</sup> Many of the film collections at NARA are accompanied by shot list cards that include a history of how many times a film was copied. Item 127 R 3224 within the Film of Marine Corps Activities col-



FIGURE 11.6 The index card (front and back) for 127 R 3224 reveals that the film did not contain the original flag-raising footage. National Archives and Records Administration

lection was thought to be the original Genaust flag-raising footage segment that had been excerpted out of item 127 R 2438 (figure 11.6).<sup>19</sup> However, the index card for 127 R 3224 includes a note from December 1968 stating, "We do not have any of this. We only have 35mm #4077 interneg blow-up." The term interneg refers to an intermediate negative copied from an original or another source; in this instance, all three copies of the film in NARA's custody with this item number were created sometime after 1958 from very poor color reproduction (figure 11.7). Moreover, the film record listed on the reverse of the index card shows that the film was copied on seven different occasions between 1968 and 1980.

In the search for the original film, item 127 G 4077 from the Unedited Motion Picture Films collection was not considered within the framework of this project as it consisted of 35mm blow-ups known to be poor reproductions from 16mm copies. The next item number to be evaluated was 127 R 2438, or the reel that the flag-raising footage had been excerpted. The index card for this item notes that a new master copy was made in May 1972 and then refers back to item 127 R 3224, stating: "For Flag Raising Scene - See Index #3224. There is no 16mm Flag Raising scene left—all missing—We have 35mm blow-up Inter-neg & inter-pos." The term *interpos* refers to an intermediate negative with a positive image. All three copies of the film in NARA's custody with this item number were created after 1971 and did not contain any of the flag-raising footage.

Finally, item 428 NPC 2924 from the Department of the Navy collection was evaluated and this reel was deemed complete, containing all of the material from 127 R 2438 as well as the flag-raising footage from 127 R 3224, but none of the six copies were the original. The oldest copy in the best condition was printed around 1951, while the other five copies were printed sometime between 1964 and 2004. The 1951 Kodachrome copy is NARA's most original source.

In circumstances such as this, the staff at NARA makes every effort to bring the most historically significant asset it holds to the public. For this particular footage, the Kodachrome copy from 1951 was scanned in 4K resolution, which offers twice the resolution as high definition and four times as many pixels. In addition



#### FIGURE 11.7

This motion picture film duplicate is an example of an internegative, a specialized type of film stock that is part of the intermediate process that converts footage from an original negative to a release element. National Archives and Records Administration

to the U.S. Marine Corps and the Smithsonian Channel/Lucky 8 collaboration, NARA has provided elements containing material from the Genaust film for the Academy Film Archive's forthcoming restoration of *To the Shores of Iwo Jima* as part of their preservation efforts for that film.<sup>20</sup>

The life of a film, and often its contributors, particularly related to combat and especially if taken out of context, experiences a circuitous existence. Despite having more information about where the original film went, and where it may have gone, the whereabouts of Genaust's original camera footage is still a mystery. Film is both robust and fragile; it has the capacity to outlive the memory of the images it captures, but repeated handling or copying and poor storage environments can make it unusable or unsalvageable. The original Genaust film may be lost entirely, it may still be in another repository, or it may be hidden in one of the many locations it traveled to in the course of its multiple uses. Wherever the original may be, NARA remains faithful to all the film in its custody in perpetuity.

## ENDNOTES

- This one-hour television special from producer Marine LtCol Matthew W. Morgan first aired on the Smithsonian Channel on 3 July 2016. It remains popular and has been nominated for several awards. Executive Producer Tim Evans, Smithsonian Channel, email to Breanne Robertson, 22 June 2017.
- 2. A well-described collection will include shot lists with locations, names of subjects if known, equipment identification, and additional information about the cameraman, director, and agency. Rarely does the information include much about the film stock used, camera equipment, or printing generation history.

- 3. In archival film practice, the most original copy refers to the *camera original* or the copy that is generationally closest to the camera original. Much like photographs, motion picture film is copied from a camera original; one copy can be made at a time, or multiple copies can be made at once, then additional copies can be made from those copies. Each successive copy is referred to as a *generation*.
- 4. Most Marine divisions had approximately 15–20 combat cameramen on the muster rolls; however, the total number of cameramen, civilian and military, on Iwo Jima is poorly documented and therefore difficult to verify. At the time of the Battle of Iwo Jima, the 4th Marine Division was staffed as follows: one public relations officer, 13 combat correspondents, two combat photographers (one from the G-3 operations section), one artist/photographer, and one clerk. It is likely that the other two divisions involved in the battle were staffed the same way. Jack Paxton, executive director of the Combat Correspondents Association, email to Breanne Robertson, 7 December 2017.
- Due to the nature of their work in the field, these were often written on whatever was available—notebooks, scraps of paper, chalked on helmets. So, for our purposes, the archival term is *slates*.
- Norm Hatch, "Two Flags," *Leatherneck*, February 1995, 24–29.
- The Naval Photographic Studio (NPS) in Hollywood, CA, was specifically set up for the Eleventh Naval District as the headquarters for naval photographic activities and to distribute training films. The NPS contracted directly with Hollywood studios to produce more than 200 training and documentary films in 1944–45.
- 8. Hatch later recalled his order to Genaust and Campbell: "My boss, Lieutenant Colonel George A. Roll [5th Marine Division intelligence officer], came to me about 1100 and said that Major General Keller Rockey [commanding general of 5th Marine Division] had requested that a larger flag be flown that could be easily seen by all combat troops. The larger flag was considered to be a morale booster. Lieutenant Colonel Roll advised that I had better get my photographers up on the mountain to photograph the second flag raising as it would be considered the official flag raising for the island. Fortunately, Genaust and Campbell were in my command post replenishing their film supplies, so I sent them right away." Norman T. Hatch, "Flags Over Mount Suribachi," *Marine Corps Gazette* 88, no. 2 (February 2004).
- J. H. Towers to Norman T. Hatch, "Additional Temporary Duty," 13 March 1945; and Alexander A. Vandegrift to Norman T. Hatch, "Modification of Orders," 26 March 1945, private collection.
- 10. Rosenthal's photograph had already been widely circu-

lated in newspapers and magazines in the United States. See Melissa Renn, "'The Famous Iwo Flag-Raising': Iwo Jima Revisited," *History of Photography* 39, no. 3 (August 2015): 253–62, https://doi.org/10.1080/0308729 8.2014.995957.

- For a detailed discussion of this debate, see Melissa Renn's essay in this volume. Hatch also reflected on this controversy in his 1995 *Leatherneck* article "Two Flags."
- 12. This number was calculated using the Bureau of Labor Statistics's CPI Inflation Calculator.
- 13. At that point, Hatch had no idea whether Genaust's footage was good or not as 1stLt Schlosberg had arrived in the United States just a week before Hatch did and the film needed to be developed, assembled, and reviewed, which could take several days. See Hatch, "Two Flags," 24–29; and Paul Farhi, "The Iwo Jima Photo and the Man Who Helped Saved It," Washington Post, 21 February 2013.
- 14. The film was crafted after the battle and included footage from multiple combat cameramen. It went into production in May for release in June. The Services frequently produced a film after major battles (e.g., Tarawa, Guadalcanal, Midway, Tunisia, San Pietro, Aleutians), so it was not unusual for a photographic officer to go to Hollywood, which also was where the First Motion Picture Unit was located.
- 15. For a nuanced analysis of the Iwo Jima flag raising and its role in the Seventh War Loan drive, see Austin Porter's chapter in this volume.
- 16. The number 428 refers to the record group from the Department of the Navy; and NPC is the series designator for Naval Photographic Center.
- 17. NARA treats, preserves, and digitizes more than 3,000 reels of film each year. The lab is one of less than a dozen fully operational film labs left in the United States, and NARA is committed to film-to-film preservation for as long as film stock and equipment are available. In addition to photochemical preservation, the lab digitizes approximately 800 reels per year for direct access to the public and is capable of scanning in footage at high definition (HD) or with a horizontal resolution of 2,000 (2K) or 4,000 (4K) pixels.
- Unlike negative film, reversal film produces a positive image on a transparent base, which was the standard for the Bell & Howard camera Genaust used on Iwo Jima.
- 19. This item contains all of the other footage in 428 NPC 2924 except the flag-raising material. We will return to this film reel later in the chapter.
- 20. As part of the Academy of Motion Picture Arts & Science, which was founded in 1927, the Academy Film Archive now holds more than 190,000 items since it began collecting in 1991.

# $I^{\text{CHAPTER}}$

# CORRECTING THE RECORD The Huly Panel Looks at the Iwo Jima Flag Raisings

by Colonel Mary H. Reinwald, USMC (Ret)

A simple click of the camera's shutter preserved a moment of Marine Corps action on Iwo Jima. Associated Press cameraman Joseph Rosenthal's flag-raising photograph captured one event during the incredible battle for this small island. Yet, circumstances made this moment different; the photograph took on a life of its own, immortalizing its subjects, both human and not. The time, place, and dire straits in which the free world found itself contributed to the popularity of the image. The United States, after several years in a cataclysmic twofront war, was desperate for something positive. The photograph embodied so much for the American people that the men in the picture, regardless of what else they had done on Iwo Jima or in other battles throughout the Pacific, were viewed as heroes not just for raising a flag but for raising the spirits of the nation.

American officials, recognizing the photograph's popularity, seized the opportunity and sent the surviving Marines and corpsman on a war bond tour throughout the country. The men became celebrities, whether they liked it or not, and their names became a part of Marine Corps history.<sup>1</sup> Thanks in large part to the photograph, the flag raising evolved into an iconic image for Marines and was used as the basis for the Marine Corps War Memorial, second only to the Eagle, Globe, and Anchor as a symbol of the United States Marine Corps.

Still viewed as heroes by many today, Sergeant Michael Strank, Private First Class Rene A. Gagnon, Corporal Harlon H. Block, Private First Class Franklin R. Sousley, Private First Class Ira H. Hayes, and especially Pharmacist's Mate Second Class John H. Bradley, the Navy corpsman, became known to generations of Marines who value the contributions of those who came before them. Countless Marines memorized the names of the Marines and sailor in Rosenthal's photograph from their earliest days in the Corps. But what if the Marine Corps got it wrong and the men in the photograph were not the ones identified decades ago? What if a mistake, however inadvertent, had been made? And what about the other flag raisers, the ones who had hoisted a smaller flag atop Mount Suribachi earlier that day? For these reasons, in early 2016, the Commandant of the Marine Corps directed that an impartial group investigate claims regarding mistaken or overlooked participants in the Iwo Jima flag raisings. General Robert B. Neller's orders brought together the team, known now as the Huly Panel, which has made its best effort to correct the record obscured by the fog of war, poor memories, and other challenges to reconstructing the past.<sup>2</sup>

# TWO FLAGS, ONE MOMENT

American servicemembers landed on Iwo Jima on 19 February 1945, and a short four days later, the commanding officer of 2d Battalion, 28th Marines, Lieutenant Colonel Chandler W. Johnson, sent a patrol to secure Mount Suribachi, an extinct volcano at the southern tip of the island. Sergeant Henry O. Hansen and Pharmacist's Mate Second Class John H. Bradley were part of the patrol headed by First Lieutenant Harold G. Schrier, the executive officer of Company E. An American flag was raised that morning at approximately 1020.3 Staff Sergeant Louis R. Lowery, a photographer for Leatherneck, captured the event on his Rolleiflex twin lens reflex camera. Schrier, Bradley, and others are clearly evident in these photographs (figure 12.1).<sup>4</sup>

A few hours later, a resupply patrol, tasked with replacing the first flag with a larger one, was sent to the top of Mount Suribachi. Johnson sent the replacement flag with the runner from Company E, Private First Class Rene Gagnon, who also was carrying fresh batteries for Schrier's SCR-300 radio. Prior to departing the battalion command post, he joined four Marines from Company E's 2d Platoon—Sergeant Michael Strank, Corporal Harlon H. Block, Private First Class Ira H. Hayes, and Private First Class Franklin R. Sousley—whom Captain Dave E. Severance had dispatched to lay communications wire on the volcano.<sup>5</sup> Joe Rosenthal, an Associated Press photographer, along with Sergeant William H. Genaust and Private Robert R. Campbell, 5th Marine Division combat cameramen, soon followed.<sup>6</sup>

The second flag was raised at approximately 1220 as the first flag was lowered. Genaust filmed the preparation and raising of the second flag, but there is a break of undetermined length in his footage between the time the raisers hold the flag in a horizontal position and when the flag stands almost fully upright.<sup>7</sup> Campbell photographed the first flag as it was lowered, but did not capture the second flag as it ascended. Rosenthal photographed the second flag raising, as one of his shots would become the iconic photograph, *Old Glory Goes Up on Mount Suribachi, Iwo Jima* (1945).<sup>8</sup>

The fighting on the island took a huge toll on the Marines, including those involved in the second flag raising. Both Block and Strank were killed in action on 1 March 1945, as was Hansen. On 12 March, Bradley was wounded and evacuated the next day. Sousley was killed on 21 March. In the end, Gagnon and Hayes were the only ones believed to be in Rosenthal's photograph who were left alive and uninjured.

When Rosenthal's photograph made its way to the home front, the sensation it created prompted President Franklin D. Roosevelt to recall the flag raisers from battle to take part in the Seventh War Loan drive.<sup>9</sup> Gagnon returned in April 1945 and identified his fellow flag raisers as Hansen, Bradley, Strank, Sousley, and Hayes. Shortly thereafter, Bradley and Hayes were ordered to Washington, DC, to confirm Gagnon's identification.<sup>10</sup> During these late stages of the global conflict, leadership tasked the survivors with participating in the war bond tour to boost financial and popular support for



#### FIGURE 12.1

SSgt Louis R. Lowery, a staff photographer for Leatherneck, shot numerous photographs before and after the first flag raising. PhM2c John H. Bradley (third from the left) can be seen holding the flagpole while Pvt Philip L. Ward places rocks at its base. Official U.S. Marine Corps photo, courtesy SSgt Louis R. Lowrey, Louis R. Lowery Collection, Archives Branch, Marine Corps History Division

the war effort. At this point, decision making centered on finishing the war rather than documenting history.

# CLAIMS

During the last 70 years, various individuals have claimed, and continue to claim, that men

other than those identified were the ones who actually raised the American flag atop Mount Suribachi. Many of these claims, often made by relatives, friends, and even other Marines, have quickly been disproved through examinations of historical records, command chronologies, photographs, and eyewitness accounts. The official historians of the Marine Corps History Division have taken all of these claims seriously, but they also have had to deal with faulty recordkeeping dating back to the flag raising on 23 February 1945 and events soon after.<sup>11</sup>

Among the earliest claims that sparked an official response from the Marine Corps came from one of the surviving flag raisers who had participated in the Seventh War Loan drive. In July 1946, in response to a letter from Belle Block, mother of deceased Marine Corporal Harlon Block, Hayes admitted that Block, not Hansen, was the Marine at the base of the flagpole in Rosenthal's photograph.<sup>12</sup> A board convened at Headquarters Marine Corps in December 1946 to investigate the matter. With Major General Pedro A. del Valle as the president, the panel worked to determine the identities of the raisers in the famous flag-raising image (figure 12.2). The del Valle Board released its findings in January 1947. The opinion of the board was that Corporal Harlon Block, Private First Class Rene A. Gagnon, Pharmacist's Mate Second Class John Bradley, Sergeant Michael Strank, Private First Class Franklin Sousley, and Private First Class Ira Hayes raised the second flag on Mount Suribachi. Then-Commandant of the Marine Corps, General Alexander A. Vandegrift, approved the board's results (appendix A).

Since this official correction to the roster of flag raisers in Rosenthal's photograph in 1947, the Marine Corps History Division has continued to field public inquiries seeking to modify further the list of servicemen atop Mount Suribachi. Editors at *Leatherneck* magazine also have received numerous requests to assist the claimants in proving their presence. The staff of *Leatherneck* has consistently adhered to a policy of following the Marine Corps' lead and, when presented with a claim, often refers the individual to the History Division, where the histori-



#### FIGURE 12.2

MajGen Pedro del Valle, who led the 1st Marine Division through the Okinawa operation in the closing months of World War II, served as president of the official Marine Corps investigation that corrected the identification of Cpl Harlon Block in Rosenthal's flag-raising photograph in 1947. Official U.S. Marine Corps photo, Robert O. Bare Collection, Archives Branch, Marine Corps History Division

ans have ready access to reference and archival sources as well as the authority to address Marine Corps history in an official capacity. While most of the claims have been debunked, a more serious claim, backed by compelling visual evidence, was made in 2014.

On 23 November 2014, the *Omaha World-Herald* published a story by Matthew Hansen entitled "New Mystery Arises from Iconic Iwo Jima Image." The story detailed the efforts of two history buffs, Stephen Foley and Eric Krelle, to prove that Bradley, the corpsman awarded the Navy Cross for his actions during the Battle of Iwo Jima, was not actually present in Rosen-thal's photograph as had been believed for almost 70 years.<sup>13</sup> They presented persuasive evidence that a mistake may have been made, and other media outlets expressed interest, including producers from Lucky 8 television pro-



#### FIGURE 12.3

Members of the Huly Panel assemble for a group portrait alongside a portrait of Gen Robert B. Neller, 37th Commandant of the Marine Corps, to mark the conclusion of the board's proceedings in April 2016. They are, from left to right, BGen Jason Q. Bohm, SgtMaj Justin D. Lehew, Col Keil R. Gentry, SgtMaj David L. Maddux, LtGen Jan C. Huly (Ret), Dr. Breanne Robertson, Dr. Charles P. Neimeyer, Col Mary H. Reinwald (Ret), SgtMaj Richard A. Hawkins (Ret), and Dr. Randy Papadopoulos. Courtesy Col Keil R. Gentry (Ret)

duction company, who commenced plans for a documentary with the Smithsonian Channel. In 2015, the Marine Corps was notified of the new evidence, and after an initial review, decided to conduct a more thorough analysis.<sup>14</sup>

# THE HULY PANEL AND THE SECOND FLAG RAISING

At the direction of the Commandant, a panel convened to "accurately identify and appropriately credit" the flag raisers seen in the Rosenthal photograph.<sup>15</sup> On 22 April 2016, the panel, consisting of both active duty and retired Marines and civilian historians, assembled at the Alfred M. Gray Research Center on Marine Corps Base Quantico, Virginia, to review the newly discovered evidence alongside extant photographs, eyewitness statements, and motion picture film (figure 12.3). Board members initially focused on just the second flag raising, but in the process of answering certain questions, uncovered issues related to the first flag raising that required further scrutiny.

#### **Panel Participants**

Lieutenant General Jan C. Huly (Ret), a former deputy commandant for Plans, Policies and Operations, served as president of the panel. Other members included then-Brigadier General (select) Jason Q. Bohm, director of Marine Corps University's Expeditionary Warfare School; Colonel Keil R. Gentry, director of the Marine Corps War College; and Sergeant Major Justin D. LeHew, Training and Education Command's senior enlisted advisor. The sergeant major for the Marine Corps University, Sergeant Major David L. Maddux, and Dr. Charles P. Neimeyer, director of History Division, also were members.<sup>16</sup> Retired Marines Sergeant Major Richard A. Hawkins, mentor/ instructor of the Marine Air-Ground Task Force Instructional Group, and the author of this chapter also served as panel members with Dr. Randy Papadopoulos, secretariat historian for the Department of the Navy. The History Division offered administrative and research support throughout both reviews. Dr. Breanne Robertson provided the bulk of this effort.

#### **Panel Protocols**

Lieutenant General Huly ran the panel in a manner similar to Marine Corps selection boards, including a precept signed by the Commandant of the Marine Corps to start the panel's work and the swearing in of its members. Everyone took the following oath:

Do you solemnly swear (or affirm) that you will perform your duties as a member of this board without prejudice or partiality, that you will not disclose the proceedings or recommendations except as authorized or required by the Commandant of the Marine Corps or higher authority, so help you God?

Thus, the mission of the panel was taken se-

riously and solemnly, but participants also had the secure space necessary to allow for an earnest and robust debate.

The mission of the panel as stated in the precept was to review newly discovered photographic evidence, initiated by Foley and Krelle and provided to the Marine Corps by Lieutenant Colonel Matthew W. Morgan (Ret), producer of the Smithsonian Channel documentary, and the proposed corrections related to the participants in the second flag raising. The panel was further directed to review all available evidence before making a recommendation to the Commandant in the form of a written report. Therefore, the Huly Panel members had a specific task couched in institutional protocols appropriate to the Marine Corps as a Service branch, including treating all of the Marines who fought on Iwo Jima, regardless of their connection to the flag raising (see appendix B).

The Marine Corps History Division took the lead in preparing resources for consideration. Compiling previous reports, documents, personal correspondence, unit rosters, books, articles, and, most important, photographs, the staff provided each panel member with binders of information. Initial references included then-current official history and commemorative publications, book-length studies, and selected articles.<sup>17</sup> Primary source documents from the del Valle Board, including a memorandum from Lieutenant Colonel Edward R. Hagenah, the executive officer of the Division of Public Information, Headquarters Marine Corps, who shepherded the servicemembers initially identified as flag raisers upon their return to the United States, also were reviewed.<sup>18</sup> Other documents in the initial assessment included forensic analyses of digitally enhanced images and correspondence drawn from pre-



#### FIGURE 12.4

This 1945 newspaper clipping was included in a scrapbook from the Chester Born Collection. Archival documents such as this one, which contains period identifications of the Marines and sailors pictured in Joseph Rosenthal's Gung Ho photograph, informed the Huly Panel's deliberations. Due to the proposed identification of Cpl Harlon Block, the Gung Ho image underwent greater scrutiny during the 2019 Bowers Board investigation. Corrections to the 1945 newspaper caption include PFC Graydon Dyce in PFC Clarence Garrett's position, PhM2c Gerald Ziehme in Dyce's position, and Cpl Harlon H. Block standing behind Sgt Henry Hansen. Forensic image analyses have not been able to confirm the identity of the individual at far left, standing behind PFC Ira Hayes. Chester Born Collection, Archives Branch, Marine Corps History Division

vious flag-raising inquiries and investigations.<sup>19</sup> Several panel members contributed additional reference material, including authoritative books and articles on the battle and relevant archival photographs, such as those published in *Leatherneck* (figure 12.4).<sup>20</sup> Motion picture footage from Sergeant William H. Genaust's film also was available for review. In other words, the assembled members had historical sources as well as secondary analyses provided by historians, enthusiasts, and scientists to use during the investigation.

With orders in hand, staff in place, and resources ready, the panel commenced with its duties. As president of the panel, Lieutenant General Huly ensured that all members were given the freedom to talk openly throughout the proceedings. While some individuals were more verbose than others, all consistently had the opportunity to provide negative or positive input and to ask questions. At specific points, Huly would canvass the panel to confirm that all agreed with a conclusion and, if not, to work toward a consensus. Although he recognized that 100-percent certainty on all questions might not be possible, the general did an admirable job ensuring that each of us felt comfortable with the decisions made. By frequently polling for opinions, Huly guaranteed that any doubts that could be addressed were discussed and adjudicated, as needed.

As might be expected, significant discussion ensued during every session. Although the readahead materials helped streamline the panel's efforts, remaining gaps in the historical record required substantial research and deliberation. Debate often resulted in the need to review additional material, including unit rosters, casualty cards, and other official documents, and the staff of the History Division was on call to provide whatever was needed from their archives.

## Sense of Responsibility

Each panel member had a clear understanding and appreciation for the responsibility with which he or she had been tasked. Marines generally have an interest in military history, but they also maintain a special appreciation for Marine Corps heritage and recognize both the accomplishments and sacrifices during the Battle of Iwo Jima. Comprised entirely of Marines, save Dr. Papadopoulos, the panel understood the significance of the flag raising from their earliest days in the Corps. Rosenthal's photograph of the second flag raising was the inspiration for the Marine Corps War Memorial, sculpted by Felix de Weldon, which figures prominently in the lives of Marines past and present.<sup>21</sup> It serves as the location of Marine Corps Sunset Parades, the finish line of the annual Marine Corps Marathon, and the site of countless ceremonies (figure 12.5). Some Marines choose this place to imbue the most important moments in their lives-promotions, retirements, and appointments-with the memory of past Marines. Because de Weldon's monument to the Corps has become one of its most identifiable symbols, the need to ensure the accurate identification of those who raised the flag was understandable. The necessity to "get it right" was mentioned several times throughout deliberations and none on the panel shied away from that responsibility.

Although it did not influence the board's final recommendations or sway decisions throughout the board's deliberations, the hope that Bradley could be confirmed as a flag raiser was evident from the beginning as the board's initial discussions centered around the corpsman. Each panel member was cognizant of the ramifications of removing him from the heralded ranks of the flag raisers and the impact it would have on the Corps and his family.<sup>22</sup> No Hollywood producer could have scripted the scene any better than having five Marines and a corpsman raise the flag. Given every Marine's deep affection, respect, and appreciation for their corpsmen, and knowing full well their long and illustrious record of taking care of Marines, often at the risk of their own lives, it seemed especially appropriate that a corpsman was there yet again with his Marines at one of the Corps' most significant moments.

Since most of the new assertions as to the identity of the flag raisers centered around Bradley, the Huly Panel spent a large amount of time focused on his presence or absence from both flag raisings. Even when it became



#### FIGURE 12.5

Marines from Combat Logistics Battalion 26, 26th Marine Expeditionary Unit (26th MEU), participate in a reenlistment and promotion ceremony on 4 October 2006 at the Marine Corps War Memorial in Arlington, VA. The Marines took advantage of the proximity of the 26th MEU's training at Fort Pickett, VA, to travel to the nation's capital and hold the ceremony there. Official U.S. Marine Corps photo, courtesy of LCpl Aaron J. Rock

abundantly clear that Bradley could not have been the man in position three during the second flag raising, panel members worked hard to determine if there was even the remotest possibility that Bradley could have been in any of the other positions. At one point during discussions, a panel member remarked that "he's just not there. And we have to stop trying to 'force' him there." The Huly Panel adhered diligently to the facts when finalizing its report, but later, when the members reconvened to consider the first flag raising, they experienced a palpable sense of relief as it became evident that Bradley was, in fact, involved in the first flag raising.

While no one doubted the importance of the panel's actions, some initial discussion lingered on the potential impact the results might have when announced. One member remarked that he did not expect the report to garner much attention. Several other members disagreed vehemently and related anecdotes about public interest. Any changes made to accounts of battles or operations would draw interest; a change, regardless of how seemingly minor, to not only one of the key battles but also one of the most important symbols of the Corps would draw significant attention. And that view proved to be correct.<sup>23</sup>

#### Challenges

Historical events cannot be reconstructed; memories fade, sources are lost, and other obstacles occur that make finding the truth of history elusive. The Huly Panel members faced many of the same challenges as full-time historians. In this case, the investigators were frustrated because there seemed to be so much evidence of who was present at both flag raisings, but there also remained gaps in the documentation that had to be explained, annotated, or verified using other sources.

#### **The Genaust Film**

One of the most challenging yet fascinating panel sessions came with the review of the Genaust film. The motion picture shot by Sergeant Genaust, a combat cameraman who filmed the only footage of the second flag raising, was both informative and exasperating. The portion of the film devoted to the actual flag raising was reviewed multiple times, with each frame given close scrutiny. The film was usable but not of the sharpest quality.<sup>24</sup> For the panel members accustomed to the technology of the digital age, it was frustrating to view the film without the ability to zoom in on particular features.

Viewing the Genaust film was especially challenging due to one significant problem: the film provides neither continuous action nor chronologically arranged scenes. Numerous breaks of undetermined length can be seen in the film. The most important break comes between the raisers grasping the pole horizontally and the actual raising of the flag. This disruption in the film's time sequence raises many questions: How long was the break? What did the raisers do during that time? Could Marines have joined or left the group during the break? Could Marines have swapped positions? Was there time to put on or take off clothing or equipment? The break created uncertainty in the minds of the panel members, and the film's secrets could be neither reconciled nor ignored.25

An especially interesting element of the film was noticed by one sharp-eyed board member. While slowing the speed of the film and attempting to track the movements of the men using their gear, stance, and physical characteristics as individual markers, it became apparent that one of the raisers looked like he wore a helmet in one frame but, in the next, he seemed to be wearing a soft cover (figure 12.6). Was this a trick of light or was it another break in the film where a new Marine took the place of the previous one? Ultimately, this uncertainty could not be completely resolved, but the panel decided with a reasonable degree of certainty that the same Marines who picked up the flagpole initially also lifted the banner to its zenith without changing positions or being relieved by anyone else.

#### **The Problems of Memory**

Photographic evidence was given greater weight than just about every other piece of evidence, including eyewitness accounts. Many police officers can attest to how notoriously unreliable eyewitnesses are, and the panelists saw examples of this in several instances.<sup>26</sup> The testimonies by witnesses were especially unreliable when accounts were given years or decades after the battle. Panel members quickly learned to ask about the context of these accounts, especially the dates of their recording. Time and again, the panel determined that witnesses who became "experts" on the flag raising in later years, and whose testimony was used to support the original identifications, were not actually present on Mount Suribachi during the flag raisings. While they may have been on Iwo Jima, their descriptions of the flag raising often were based on secondhand accounts, assumptions, and hearsay. This additional information made a difference as much of their testimony directly conflicted with other evidence.

Interestingly enough, some of the worst confusion resulted from conflicting accounts from the flag raisers themselves. Both Hayes and Bradley confirmed Gagnon's initial identification of the original men who raised the second flag in spring 1945, and both changed their minds in December 1946 after Hayes wrote to Block's mother.<sup>27</sup> Bradley also later contradicted himself as to where he was during both flag raisings. In a letter written a few days after the event, Bradley told his parents that he was involved in the flag raising, although he was not specific as to which one. In a subsequent interview, he denied being involved in the first flag raising even though photographic evidence proves his participation.<sup>28</sup> In the end, it became clear that historical memory is not static, but rather an interplay of what was remembered,



FIGURE 12.6 This film still, taken from the motion picture shot by Sgt William H. Genaust on 23 February 1945, shows Marines preparing to raise the second flag. The individual on the far side of the pole appears to be wearing only a soft cover. Official U.S. Marine Corps photo, courtesy Sgt William H.

Genaust, National Archives and Records Administration

forgotten, and constructed over time to serve the purpose of the person recounting events. Hindsight, perspective, and self-interest can combine to build what seems to be a vivid memory that can, at times, be corroborated or rejected as fact. At other times, stories take on lives of their own.<sup>29</sup>

# THE RESULTS OF THE HULY PANEL

After reviewing evidence and debating the merits of each perspective on it, the panel had to produce a report summarizing their findings for the Commandant. Panel members grew more deliberate in their choice of words as they finalized their report. Could someone be definitively identified as a raiser if the evidence shows him before the flag was raised and later with his hands on the pole when it was vertical even if there was no photographic evidence showing him actually *raising* the flag? How much certainty is required to declare someone a "true" flag raiser? Must the standard be 100 percent—
even if it is unachievable in most cases—or is the "beyond a reasonable doubt" standard enough?

In making their recommendations, the panel members accepted the futility of achieving 100-percent certainty about the identity of the flag raisers except for Private First Class Ira Hayes. All agreed that the preponderance of evidence proved unequivocally that he is shown raising the American flag in Rosenthal's photograph. The group was satisfied with "beyond a reasonable doubt" certainty when the board compiled the results of their work. In addition to Hayes, the Huly Panel affirmed the prior identifications of Sergeant Michael Strank and Private First Class Rene Gagnon. Private First Class Franklin Sousley also was confirmed as a flag raiser, but his attribution in the photograph shifted from the Marine in position five to the one in position three. Finally, the Huly Panel determined that Pharmacist's Mate Second Class Bradley was not present in the second flag raising. Due to the distinctive rifle sling attachment, broken helmet liner strap, and bulging pocket of the individual in the images, the Huly Panel members recommended that the Commandant of the Marine Corps accept the proposed designation of Private First Class Harold Schultz as the Marine in position five (see sidebar of findings).

# AFTER THE FIRST PANEL

The panel concluded at 1600 on 27 April 2016, and General Huly briefed the results of the board and its recommendations to General Robert B. Neller, Commandant of the Marine Corps, on 4 May 2016. Representatives of Headquarters Marine Corps notified the families of the raisers and others with a significant involvement in the flag raisings of the results.

The Office of U.S. Marine Corps Communications offered information distribution guidance to public affairs offices throughout the Corps on two significant points of emphasis: first, that previous identification efforts had been done in good faith based on the information and resources available at the time, though proving inaccurate; and second, Bradley and all of the men involved at Iwo Jima were heroes, and their participation in the flag raising, or lack therein, does not define their service.<sup>30</sup> The Rosenthal photograph stands as an important symbol of the bravery and sacrifice of more than 70,000 servicemembers who participated in that battle.

After the press releases went out, journalists interviewed panel members, including Dr. Neimeyer and myself. The article I wrote covering the results of the panel, published in the August 2016 issue of *Marine Corps Gazette*, likewise elicited a large volume of letters and emails from readers who had strong feelings on the flag raising and the efforts of the panel.<sup>31</sup> The Huly Panel members' belief that the raisers were still of great interest to the American people proved to be true.

# THE HULY PANEL RECONVENES

After confirming the identity of the Marines who raised the second flag on Mount Suribachi, General Neller ordered a similar review of the first flag raising to confirm the identity of those involved, since it was clear there had been some prior misidentifications. The Commandant stated the bottom line clearly: "Our history is important, and we owe it to our Marines and their families to ensure it is as accurate as possible."<sup>32</sup>

Before the panel reconvened on 5 July 2016, the official Marine Corps record listed First Lieutenant Harold G. Schrier, Platoon



# SUMMARY OF FINDINGS

# Position 1. Corporal Harlon H. Block

No new evidence or recent allegations contradicted Block being the man in position 1. A comparison of photos taken by Joseph Rosenthal throughout the actual flag raising with the film shot by Sergeant William H. Genaust shows the person in position 1 with equipment and a facial profile consistent with Block. Coupled with Private First Class Ira H. Hayes' identification of Block as a flag raiser in 1946 and confirmation by the del Valle board, no evidence suggests that Block is not the Marine in position 1.

# Position 2. Private First Class Rene A. Gagnon

Similar to Block's identification, no new evidence called into question Gagnon's identification as of 2016. Upon his return to the states in 1945, Gagnon identified himself as the Marine in position 2; this identification was later corroborated by both Pharmacist's Mate Second Class John H. Bradley and Hayes. Although his face is obscured throughout most of the film and photographs, a brief glimpse appears to be Gagnon, and the gear he wore in other clearly identifiable photos is consistent with the gear worn by the Marine in position 2. As did the del Valle Board, the Huly Panel concluded that Gagnon helped to raise the second flag.

### Position 3. Pharmacist's Mate Second Class John Bradley to Private First Class Franklin R. Sousley

In addition to Gagnon's initial identification of Bradley as the individual in position 3, Bradley confirmed this according to a memorandum to the director of the Division of Public Information, Headquarters Marine Corps on 24 September 1946 from Lieutenant Colonel Edward R. Hagenah for the del Valle Board. In his own letter to General del Valle on 26 December 1946, Bradley stated, "I was on top of the hill already and when the flag was raised I just jumped up and gave the group a hand." In a letter to the same board on 16 December 1946, Captain Dave Severance also agreed that, to the best of his knowledge, Bradley was one of the flag raisers. The photographic evidence, however, does not support this (see appendix B).

If Bradley is not in position 3, then who is? Surprisingly, determining the individual in position 3 was relatively easy after closely analyzing photographs for specific equipment and gear. Private First Class Sousley, originally identified as the Marine in position 5, is seen in photographs atop Suribachi wearing an empty canteen cover, a cartridge belt without suspenders, wire cutters, and a soft cover under his helmet. He is not seen wearing a field jacket, and his trousers are not cuffed; his gear is identical to that worn by the individual in position 3. In addition, there is a moment in the Genaust film and in a Rosenthal photograph where the face of the individual is briefly seen. The individual looks like Sousley. In the Huly Panel's opinion, Sousley was in position 3, not position 5, in Rosenthal's image.



### Position 4. Sergeant Michael Strank

As was the case with Block and Gagnon, no new evidence was discovered to call into question Strank's participation in the second flag raising. Although the del Valle Board determined that the Marine in position 4 was Sergeant Strank, the Huly Panel worked to confirm this since position 4 was the most obscured in both the photograph and the film. But it was both the film and the Rosenthal photographs that once again helped to confirm what was already known. The Huly Panel, after thorough review, ruled out the possibility that the obscured individual in position 4 could have been Bradley. The individual in position 4 is not wearing medical unit 3s or any other gear that Bradley was. Before the break in the Genaust film, it appears the Marine in position 4 was wearing a soft cover. The clarity of the film is not such that it is absolute, but one thing is certain based on other photographic evidence-Bradley only wore a helmet. Strank, however, is seen in several photographs wearing a soft cover beneath his helmet.

In addition, in the Genaust film, the ring finger on the left hand of the individual in position 4 is clear; the finger is bare. Photographs clearly identifiable as Strank show that he was not wearing a ring on that finger. Bradley's left hand, however, clearly shows a ring on his ring finger in images.

### Position 5. Private First Class Franklin Sousley to Private First Class Harold H. Schultz

If Sousley is in position 3, who is in position 5? The equipment, or lack thereof, indicates that it cannot be Bradley. Again, Genaust's film and the photographs taken by Lowery, Campbell, and Rosenthal were thoroughly reviewed and two key pieces of evidence helped to greatly simplify the identity: a broken helmet liner strap and the right front pocket. Only one Marine that fateful day on Mount Suribachi had a broken helmet liner strap hanging from the left side of his helmet-Private First Class Harold Schultz, another member of Company E. And, just as significantly, the individual in position 5 had a distinctive rifle. The sling of that Marine's rifle was attached to the stacking swivel, not to the upper hand guard sling swivel as was appropriate. Again, photographs and motion picture showed that the only Marine with his sling attached in that manner was Schultz. Further analysis showed that both Schultz and the Marine in position 5 had a bulge in the right front pocket of his field jacket. However, and very puzzling, no previous identification or claim that Schultz was a flag raiser had been found as of spring 2016.

# Position 6.

# **Private First Class Ira Hayes**

Hayes was the easiest of all to identify. In addition to Gagnon and Bradley identifying Hayes during the spring of 1945, Hayes admitted that he was a flag raiser and the photographic evidence strongly supports these claims. Sergeant Ernest I. Thomas Jr., Sergeant Henry O. Hansen, Corporal Charles W. Lindberg, Private First Class Louis C. Charlo, and Private First Class James R. Michels as the Marines who raised the first flag. As with the second flag raising, the identity of the first flag raisers also had been called into question over the years; Leatherneck even ran a feature article in its October 2006 issue in which filmmaker and amateur historian Dustin Spence asserted that Charlo was not a member of this specific patrol, but that Private Philip L. Ward was.<sup>33</sup> Thus, the panel members began investigating the lesser known, but tactically more important, initial flag raising on 23 February 1945.<sup>34</sup> The members of the panel remained the same with one exception; Sergeant Major Gary Smith, sergeant major of Marine Corps Systems Command replaced Sergeant Major Justin LeHew, who was no longer able to participate.

The conduct of the panel mirrored their first session in many ways as the panel again reviewed photographs, historical documents, and eyewitness statements. Benefiting greatly from lessons learned the first time around, the members also were more knowledgeable about the events of 23 February 1945 on Iwo Jima that allowed the review of the first flag raising to proceed in a quicker, more efficient manner. Additional sources were needed, but the panelists had the basic information in hand.

# **Raising the First Flag**

Early in the morning of 23 February 1945, Lieutenant Colonel Chandler W. Johnson, the commanding officer of 2d Battalion, 28th Marines, ordered that a route reconnaissance be conducted up Mount Suribachi to determine the presence of enemy forces. Marines from Company F were chosen for the task, and Sergeant Sherman B. Watson, Private First Class George Mercer, Private First Class Theodore White, and Private First Class Louis Charlo set out. They reported the absence of enemy forces, so Lieutenant Colonel Johnson ordered the executive officer of Company E, Lieutenant Harold Schrier, to lead a patrol to secure the top of Mount Suribachi and raise the American flag. First Lieutenant G. Greeley Wells, the battalion adjutant, provided the flag.

Marines from 3d Platoon, Company E, 2d Battalion, 28th Marines, made up the majority of Schrier's patrol, but other 2d Battalion Marines also participated. Staff Sergeant Louis Lowery, a *Leatherneck* photographer assigned to the 5th Marine Division, accompanied the patrol. His photographs of the flag raising would later provide critical evidence as to the identity of the raisers and others present on Mount Suribachi. As Schrier's patrol made its way up the mountain, they passed the initial reconnaissance team returning to the beach. Upon reaching the summit, Marines from Schrier's patrol dispersed to provide security while others scouted the area for an appropriate place to hoist the flag. Two Marines-Corporal Robert A. Leader and Private First Class Leo J. Rozek-found a piece of pipe that served as the flagstaff.35 Schrier and four other Marines-Thomas, Hansen, Lindberg, and Wardworked to attach the flag to the makeshift pole while Lowery photographed their efforts (figure 12.7).

After firmly securing the flag to the pipe, the Marines selected a high-visibility location and carried the flag to the designated site. Photographic evidence shows the same five Marines either touching the flagpole or within its reach at this time, though one more person appeared with them—Pharmacist's Mate Second Class John Bradley (figures 12.8 and 12.9). The flag was raised at approximately 1020; however,



FIGURE 12.7 SSgt Louis R. Lowery took several photographs of Marines affixing the American flag to the makeshift flagpole. From left to right: 1stLt Harold G. Schrier, PltSgt Ernest Thomas Jr., Sgt Henry Hansen (bare helmet visible), and Cpl Charles Lindberg. Leatherneck, courtesy of SSgt Louis R. Lowery

no photographs exist of the actual flag raising. Lowery was still present, but he was in the process of reloading his camera when the flag went up. Unlike the second flag raising a few hours later, no one filmed the first flag's elevation over the battle-ravaged mountain. Genaust, who captured most of the second flag raising on motion picture film, had not yet made it to the summit at that time.

# **Correcting the Official Record**

Originally, the official Headquarters Marine Corps' records included Charlo and Michels as flag raisers. While both were present on Mount Suribachi, no evidence exists to indicate that they raised the flag. Charlo was a member of the initial reconnaissance team who left the summit before anyone else arrived, and while he later returned between the flag raisings and provided security, he was not present for the first event. Similarly, Michels also provided security, and despite his proximity to the flag in one of Lowery's photographs, no evidence exists that shows him touching the flag at any time during the raising.

The second Huly Panel concluded at 1600 on 8 July 2016, and the Commandant agreed with its members' recommendation to change the official Marine Corps historical record. It now reflects that the following Marines and sailor raised the first flag on Iwo Jima on 23 February 1945: First Lieutenant Harold G. Schrier, Platoon Sergeant Ernest I. Thomas Jr., Sergeant Henry O. Hansen, Pharmacist's Mate Second Class John H. Bradley, Corporal Charles W. Lindberg, and Private Philip L. Ward. It is somehow fitting that Hansen and Bradley, whose names were removed as second flag raisers, helped raise the first banner that those fighting on Iwo Jima considered the more important of the two.

While the Huly Panel strove for factual accuracy, further forensic analysis of the images should be conducted to confirm its results. Given today's advanced technology, such analysis is entirely possible. Neller recommended that such analysis be conducted with the hope that the flag raisers' identities may one day be confirmed with as much certainty as possible.<sup>36</sup>

# QUESTIONS REMAIN

Seventy years later and with very few veterans alive who served on Iwo Jima, some questions may never be completely answered. The Huly Panel devoted significant time to address such puzzling questions as the break in Genaust's footage. And yet, questions remain:

- Why were the flag raisers not identified clearly from the beginning?
- Why did Hayes, Gagnon, and Bradley collectively identify Bradley as the individual in position three?
- Why did neither Hayes nor Bradley

# THE FIRST FLAG RAISING



### FIGURE 12.8

Marines and a Navy corpsman surround the makeshift flagpole as Cpl Charles Lindberg stomps the ground in preparation for the raising of the first flag on the summit. From left to right: Cpl Charles W. Lindberg, 1stLt Harold G. Schrier, PhM2c John H. Bradley, PttSgt Ernest I. Thomas Jr., Sgt Henry O. Hansen, and Pvt Philip L. Ward. Official U.S. Marine Corps photo, courtesy SSgt Louis R. Lowery, Louis Lowery Collection, Archives Branch, Marine Corps History Division

There is no comparable photograph of the raising in-progress, so the before and after shown here provide the best view of the servicemembers who participated in the event.

> correct the record when the Hansen-Block mistake came to light in 1946?

- Why did it take well into the twentyfirst century for someone to conduct forensic analysis of the photographs?
- Why did no one notice the absence of a corpsman's gear on anyone depicted in the photograph or the memorial?
- And perhaps most puzzling, why did neither Schultz nor Bradley correct the record?

While no one may ever truly know why a mistake of this magnitude was made, the panel developed some plausible explanations. The



FIGURE 12.9 Sgt Hansen and PFC Raymond Jacobs, a radioman borrowed from Company F, gaze at the American flag as PhM2c Bradley and Pot Ward attempt to stabilize the flagpole. 1stLt Schrier, Cpl Lindberg, Sgt Howard Snyder, PltSgt Thomas, and PFC Harold H. Schultz look on. Leatherneck, courtesy SSgt Louis R. Lowery

flag itself, understandably so, was the focus of Rosenthal's photograph not the individual Marines. And therein lies the beauty of the image; it symbolized the United States and its triumph over fascism, the continued march to victory, and the impending defeat of a determined and brutal foe that resonated not only with Marines at Iwo Jima and other servicemen in theater but also with civilians at home. The men were the instruments who raised the flag and the fact that they could not be individually identified strictly by the photograph itself added to the heft and symbolism. It was not their identities but rather whom they represented-the thousands of Marines and their corpsmen fighting their way through the Pacific-that gave the photograph, and later the monument, such meaning and historical significance.

In addition, to everyone present on Mount Suribachi that day, the second flag raising was not necessarily memorable. When the first flag rose over the island, shouts and celebrations were heard from the Marines on the beach as ships in the surrounding waters sounded their horns. Little attention was paid to the second flag as it went up; it was a replacement, not a significant event compared to the morale-boosting first flag. Even Schrier, the patrol leader, was not looking: "At the time the picture was taken, I was busy taking down the original flag, and can not definitely identify any member."<sup>37</sup>

A third significant factor adding to the confusion surrounding the identities of the flag raisers is that the battle for the island of Iwo Jima still raged for weeks after the original event. The flag was not raised on the last day of the 36-day battle. It went up on day five, and there was still much fighting to be done.

And the fight was a costly one; by the time Iwo Jima was secured, 6,140 Marines had been killed in action and another 17,913 were wounded. The dead included four of the Marines identified as flag raisers: Strank, Sousley, Block, and Hansen. Bradley was among the seriously wounded, leaving only Gagnon and Hayes to emerge from their time on Iwo Jima physically unscathed. The casualties among the flag raisers must be considered another possible reason for the misidentification.

There may have been another reason, however, that creates a disturbing picture of what happened when the surviving flag raisers returned to Washington, DC. From the letter Hayes wrote to Belle Block in 1946, we find hints to wartime exigencies that are harder to grasp in the peace that followed: I tried my darnedest to stay overseas but couldn't, all because they had a man in there that really wasn't, and beside [sic] that had Sousley and myself switched around. And when I did arrive in Washington D.C. I tried to set things right but some colonel told me to not say another word as two men were dead, meaning Harlan [sic] and Hansen. And besides the public knew who was who in the picture at the time I didn't want no last minute commotion.<sup>38</sup>

After the initial identification was made, right or wrong, were the remaining three under pressure not to make waves?

Members of the Huly Panel engaged in much speculation, especially on the motives of both Bradley and Schultz. Several plausible rationales for the silence of both men in the years after they left Iwo Jima were developed that helped provide at least a few possible answers.

There is no record of any claims made by Schultz indicating he was a flag raiser (figure 12.10). From what little is known about him, Schultz was a solitary man both in the Corps and in civilian life. He did not marry until he was in his 60s and never mentioned the flag raising to anyone in his new family.<sup>39</sup> After he died, his stepdaughter found a copy of Rosenthal's Gung Ho photograph in his desk drawer (see figure 0.5). He had written his name and the names of other Marines on the back. He made no mention of the flag raising. In today's fame-at-all-costs culture, Schultz is especially hard to understand. But given his personality and the times, his actions (or lack thereof) may be easier to comprehend. A low key, deliberate man, Schultz may have thought he had simply done what was expected of him and recognized the event for what it was: putting a flag up, not some courageous action. In a war in which so many acts of courage, bravery, and selfsacrifice were common, he may have believed that his participation in raising the flag that day was not worthy of adulation or recognition, let alone fame.

There are good reasons for the assumptions made by the board, drawing from other sources. In the case of Schultz, he may have been on the other side of the event from Marines but heard their gripes as many others did. During the passing years, the Marines who raised the first flag on Iwo Jima felt resentment and jealousy about the subsequent fame that the Marines of the second flag raising experienced. While countless Americans know of the second flag raising, most assume that it was the only one. Some of the first flag raisers felt ignored, one stating that "we did the dirty work and they got the credit."40 Another plausible reason might be that Schultz did not appreciate the fame in the immediate aftermath of the battle, and when he finally did, proving his presence would be too problematic given the distance, time passed, and death of so many others who were there. He also may have wanted no further reminder of that day, that battle, or that war nor did he want to constantly relive it either on a war bond tour or during interviews or whenever he met other Marines. His refusal to acknowledge his participation could have been a coping mechanism. Or it could be that he was not interested in the fame.

But what about Bradley? He had to know at some point that a mistake had been made. Why did he not say something, especially after the del Valle Board reported the first mistaken flag raisers. He confirmed Hayes's assertion that it was Block vice Hansen in Rosenthal's famous photograph; so, why did he not take the same opportunity to admit that he was not in the second flag raising either? While no one



FIGURE 12.10 The Huly Panel determined that PFC Harold H. Schultz, a previously unidentified Marine, is present in Rosenthal's iconic image of the second flag raising. Schultz joined the Marine Corps Reserve on 23 December 1943. When his company was activated in 1944, Schultz began training at Camp Pendleton, CA, and Camp Tarawa, HI, in preparation for the invasion of Iwo Jima. He was wounded in action during the Battle of Iwo Jima and later honorably discharged with the rank of corporal in October 1945. Official U.S. Marine Corps photo, courtesy Smithsonian Channel

can know for sure, two important points must be considered in any speculation about what Bradley did or what his possible motivations were. First and foremost, Bradley was a true hero and his heroism had nothing to do with the flag raising. On 21 February 1945, D+2, he saved a wounded Marine at great personal risk to himself (see appendix G).

In addition, Bradley was later wounded in action and left the island on 12 March after being hit with shrapnel in both legs. It is entirely plausible, given his wounded status, that he was

initially confused about which flag raising he partook. Or maybe he, like Hayes, was "pressured" by public information officers before the war bond tour to simply go along with the program; after all, he did raise a flag on Iwo Jima. He may have thought that the mistake was not that noteworthy, and he would simply participate in the war bond tour and that would be the end of it. He had no way of knowing in the summer of 1945 that the flag raising would become such a significant part of Marine Corps history. Bradley's actions after the war support all of these possibilities. According to his son, James Bradley, his father refused all interviews and instructed his family to tell reporters when they called that he was fishing. He had no desire to discuss the flag raising or even the battle.<sup>41</sup> Was this out of a sense of guilt or shame? Or was it a desire to downplay what may have started as a misunderstanding but spun out of control? One can only speculate as to Bradley's motivations, but given the manner in which he led his life both before and after 23 February 1945, he deserves the benefit of the doubt.

# THE "GOODNESS" IN THE MISTAKEN IDENTIFICATIONS

One panel member made an astute observation about the benefit of the previous misidentification of the flag raisers. Bradley's son wrote *Flags* of our Fathers in tribute to his father and those who served on Iwo Jima. The odds are very good that he would not have written the book if his father had not been identified as one of the flag raisers. James Bradley's book became a best seller and was later made into a movie directed by Clint Eastwood. A companion movie, *Letters from Iwo Jima*, showing the Japanese side of the battle, also was produced by Eastwood in 2006. Millions of people around the world saw these movies and learned of the heroism, sacrifice, and courage of those who fought in one of World War II's most costly battles. Many, especially those born decades after World War II, would not have known about the battle, the island-hopping campaign, or the incredible sacrifices, valor, and devotion of the Marines and sailors fighting in the Pacific in the 1940s had the book not been written. Bradley's mistaken identification helped ensure the Marines he worked so hard to save were not forgotten, but rather were celebrated by future generations of Americans.

The irony of the need to identify those who raised a flag made famous by a photograph in which identities were obscured was not lost on the panel members. Several sidebar discussions ensued about the importance of what the flag raisers symbolized vice who actually participated in the event. While by no means being disrespectful to the Marines on Mount Suribachi that fateful day, many of the panel members recognized that the subsequent fame the raisers experienced was primarily for their presence in the photograph not their participation in the actual flag raising or, ironically, their actions during the battle. Had Rosenthal not taken the picture, the identity of the men in the photograph would, in all likelihood, have become the stuff of sea stories and memories shared years later. The subsequent attention that the image received created the need for the identification.

Like so many Marines throughout the Corps' history, those who raised both flags were in fact working parties. They had no idea they would play such a significant role in Marine Corps history that their names would be forever remembered or that they would be memorialized on a statue at Arlington Ridge (figure 12.11). They were simply doing what they were told, affixing a flag to a pipe and



FIGURE 12.11 Sculptor Felix de Weldon talks to Gagnon, Hayes, and Bradley alongside his plaster design for the Marine Corps War Memorial in June 1950. Defense Department photo (Marine Corps) 314140, Marine Corps History Division

readying themselves to return to the battle in which their brothers-in-arms were still deeply engaged. While they must have experienced their own joy at seeing the Stars and Stripes fly over what had already been an incredibly costly and vicious battlefield, they were probably only thinking about the morale boost their action would bring to the Marines in the thick of the fight. They had no way of knowing the impact of their actions. In all likelihood, at the time of the flag raising, they considered the event a minor highlight with no inkling about what was to come. Their immediate concerns were winning the fight and surviving the war; half of the raisers did not achieve their goal.

Ironically, the significance of Rosenthal's photograph and the Marine Corps War Memorial that it inspired remains not who raised the flag but rather whom and what they represented. While our desire to correct the historical record is both understandable and necessary, there also were secondary benefits. In an email responding to an article on the Huly Panel's findings in the October 2016 issue of *Leatherneck*, Nancy Jacobs, the daughter of Raymond Jacobs, wrote: Thank you for the article clarifying the identities of the men in the First Flag Raising. My father, Raymond Jacobs, never claimed to be a flag raiser, he only claimed to be the radioman in the photos during the flag raising. It took a long time for people to believe him and he would be very happy with the results of the investigation.<sup>42</sup>

Her email is a poignant reminder of the true spirit of the flag raisers and the others who fought on Iwo Jima; they were not looking for fame or attention. They were simply serving their Corps and their country, and that moment on top of Mount Suribachi will still hold a special place in the hearts of Marines regardless of who raised the flags.

# ENDNOTES

- Hayes and Bradley felt uneasy about the public accolades that accompanied their participation in the Seventh War Loan tour. See Albert Hemingway, *Ira Hayes, Pima Marine* (Lanham, MD: University Press of America, 1988); and James Bradley with Ron Powers, *Flags* of Our Fathers: Heroes of Iwo Jima (New York: Delacorte Press, 2001).
- 2. See appendices B and C (Precepts and Huly Panel Reports). During the second meeting of the Huly Panel, the members made a conscious decision to refer to itself as an investigative panel, since the term *board* carries legal implications due to its military usage in promotion boards and Judge Advocate General's (JAG) investigations.
- 3. Most sources list the time of the first flag raising as having occurred sometime between 1020 and 1037. This was a point of discussion during the Huly Panel's second iteration, but the members were unable to come to a satisfactory conclusion. Consequently, the first Huly Panel report gives 1020 as the approximate time of the event; the second report records the event at 1030. Both are estimates based on a review of historical records, eyewitness testimony, and secondary literature. In 2019, the Bowers Board determined that the after action report of Combat Team 28 was the most official document to record the time of the first flag raising and hence, concluded that the event occurred at approximately 1020.
- See R. R. Keene, "Louis Lowery Captured Leatherneck History on Film," *Leatherneck*, October 2006, 32–33; and Dustin Spence, "Unraveling the Mysteries of the

First Flag Raising," Leatherneck, October 2006, 34-43.

- MajGen Fred Haynes, USMC (Ret), and James A. Warren, The Lions of Iwo Jima: The Story of Combat Team 28 and the Bloodiest Battle in Marine Corps History (New York: Henry Holt, 2008), 129.
- 6. Genaust and Campbell received orders to photograph the replacement flag raising from WO1 Norman T. Hatch, photographic officer of the 5th Marine Division. The photographers did not accompany the resupply patrol as stated in the Huly Panel report, but rather scaled the mountain on their own shortly thereafter. Historians Karal Ann Marling and John Wetenhall incorrectly place William Hipple, *Newsweek* correspondent, on the summit; however, as Parker Bishop Albee and Keller Cushing Freeman have noted, Hipple departed Rosenthal's company at the base of Suribachi to pursue another lead. See Parker Bishop Albee Jr. and Keller Cushing Freeman, *Shadow of Suribachi: Raising the Flags on Iwo Jima* (Westport, CT: Praeger, 1995), 146.
- 7. Witness accounts and secondary literature are inconsistent in their estimates of what time the replacement flag was raised. Whereas Capt Dave Severance, commander of Company E, posits that the larger flag went up around noon, other sources contend that the event occurred as late as 1400 that afternoon. The challenge of pinning down an exact time arises from the fact that there are no official entries recording the event in the battlefield journals of the 2d Battalion, 28th Regiment, or 5th Marine Division. Members of the Huly Panel agreed on 1220 as the probable time of the second flag raising based on their review of available primary and secondary sources.
- 8. In addition to Rosenthal, other still photographers present at the second flag raising included Marines Sgt Louis R. Burmeister and SSgt Meyers A. Cornelius and Army PFC George Burns.
- Roosevelt's decision to bring home the Marines and corpsman in the photograph and assign them to a public relations detail came at the suggestion of Louis Ruppel, executive editor of the *Chicago Herald-American*. See Albee and Freeman, *Shadow of Suribachi*, 98–99.
- Edward R. Hagenah memo to William E. Riley, 24 September 1946, Reference Branch, Marine Corps History Division, Quantico, VA, hereafter Hagenah memo.
- 11. There are several branches within the History Division, and this hierarchy allows the staff to focus on various functions. As part of its regular duties, the Reference Branch provides historical research and reference services for Headquarters Marine Corps, Marine Corps University, Marine Corps units, other military organizations and government agencies, and the general public. It receives numerous inquiries related to the Iwo Jima flag raising and provides the most current official information. Marine Corps History Division is unable to instigate full investigations such as the one undertaken by the Huly Panel.
- Ira Hayes letter to Belle Block, 12 July 1946, enclosure, del Valle Report, Reference Branch, Marine Corps History Division, Quantico, VA, hereafter Hayes letter to Block.

- Matthew Hansen, "New Mystery Arises from Iconic Iwo Jima Image," Omaha (NE) World-Herald, 23 November 2014.
- 14. The Marine Corps History Division received reports detailing the forensic image analysis undertaken by two independent firms, Combs Forensic Services and Forensic Video Consulting, in fall 2015 and winter 2016, respectively. For more on the History Division's response to public queries related to the Iwo Jima flag raisings, see Breanne Robertson's essay in this volume.
- Robert B. Neller to Jan Huly, "Precept Convening the Huly Board to Review New Information Regarding the Identity of the Second Flag Raisers atop Mount Suribachi, Iwo Jima," 19 April 2016 (see appendix B).
- Neimeyer served as recorder for the board as well. Ranks and titles are listed as of time of service on the panel.
- 17. The read-ahead materials prepared for Huly Panel members included the History Division's official history monograph by Bernard C. Nalty and Danny J. Crawford, The United States Marines on Iwo Jima: The Battle and the Flag Raisings (Washington, DC: History and Museums Division, Headquarters Marine Corps, 1995); reports on forensic image enhancement and comparison by Michael Plaxton of Forensic Video Consulting and Allen R. Combs of Combs Forensic Services; articles and chapter excerpts from secondary publications; and eyewitness testimony from Iwo Jima veterans. These materials were supplemented with primary source documentation, such as casualty cards, muster rolls, and combat photography from History Division's Reference and Archives Branches and the National Archives and Records Administration.
- 18. Material related to the del Valle Board investigation are housed at Reference Branch, Marine Corps History Division, Quantico, VA. Some of the documents in this file are in the form of copies or typed transcripts, not originals.
- 19. Correspondence from an Iwo Jima veteran, Cpl Joseph J. Kobylski, was of particular interest to the Huly Panel, since he contacted the History Division and the Marine Corps Heritage Foundation to question the inclusion of John Bradley as a flag raiser in Rosenthal's iconic photograph. Although some of his observations about equipment coincide with the visual evidence later brought forward by Stephen Foley and Eric Krelle, Kobylski's central aim to insert another veteran in the photograph could not be substantiated. See the Iwo Jima Flag Raising subject files, Reference Branch, Marine Corps History Division, Quantico, VA.
- 20. An official Marine Corps publication until 1976, *Leatherneck* possesses a treasure trove of photographs from World War II, including many from the battle for Iwo Jima. The famous photographer, Louis Lowery, was on the *Leatherneck* staff during the battle and was the principal photographer during the first flag raising.
- 21. Kate Clarke Lemay provides an in-depth history of the memorial in chapter 6 of this volume.
- 22. The esteemed military service of PhM2c Bradley first came to national attention during the Seventh War

Loan drive in 1945. The corpsman's remarkable life story would recapture the public's imagination in 2000, when his posthumous biography, *Flags of Our Fathers* by James Bradley and Ron Powers, became a *New York Times* bestseller and a blockbuster movie of the same title, directed by Clint Eastwood.

- The official Marine Corps investigation into the Iwo 23. Jima flag raisings generated worldwide interest in the media as well as in personal blog posts, discussion threads, and reunions. See, for example, Michael S. Schmidt, "'Flags of Our Fathers' Author Now Doubts His Father Was in Iwo Photo," New York Times, 3 May 2016; "La Complicatissima Storia della Foto di Iwo Jima," Il Post (Italy), 4 May 2016; Sarah Pruitt, "Marine Corps Will Investigate Identity of Flag Raisers at Iwo Jima," History.com, 6 May 2016; Jim Michaels, "Marines Misidentified One Man in Iconic 1945 Iwo Jima Photo," USA Today, 23 June 2016; Adrian Humphreys, "Frame by Frame: Canadian Video Analyst Corrects History of Iconic Second World War Photo of Iwo Jima Flag Raising," National Post (Canada), 1 July 2016; and Von Christian Seidl, "Historische Aufnahme: Der Falsche Flaggenhisser von Iwojima," Berliner Zeitung (Germany), 23 February 2017.
- 24. The degraded quality of the film hampered forensic photographic analyses during the 2019 Bowers Board investigation as well. For a detailed account of the quality and number of copies of Sgt William Genaust's motion picture film at the National Archives, see Criss Austin's chapter in this volume.
- 25. Further examination of the motion picture footage in conjunction with still photographs permitted the FBI Digital Evidence Laboratory to match individual frames in Genaust's film before and after the breaks with still photographs during the 2019 Bowers Board investigation. See Keil Gentry's chapter in this volume.
- National Research Council, *Identifying the Culprit: Assessing Eyewitness Identification* (Washington, DC: National Academies, 2014).
- 27. Bradley initially expressed surprise at Hayes's assertion regarding Block's presence in the photograph, which had been published in the press, but later supported the proposed update in identification. See Hayes letter to Block; Hagenah memo; and John Bradley to Pedro del Valle, 26 December 1946, Reference Branch, Marine Corps History Division, Quantico, VA.
- 28. Bradley and Powers, *Flags of Our Fathers*, 216; and PhM2c John Bradley interview with U.S. Navy Oral History Program, 1985, World War II Interviews, Box 3, Operational Archives Branch, Naval History and Heritage Command, Washington Navy Yard, DC.
- 29. Oral historians and scholars studying public or collective memory have had to broach this issue throughout their careers. See Todd Brewster, "Remembrance (More or Less) of Things Past," *Civilization* 6, no. 4 (August/September 1999); and the special issue of *Journal of American History* 75, no. 4 (March 1989), which examines the challenges of memory in the study of American history.
- 30. The Office of U.S. Marine Corps Communication is-

sued a memorandum detailing the Huly Panel findings and providing public affairs guidance in August 2016.

- 31. Col Mary H. Reinwald, USMC (Ret), "Seventy Years Later—Was a Mistake Made?," *Marine Corps Gazette* 100, no. 8 (August 2016). Two additional articles by Reinwald can be seen at "Examining the Evidence: USMC Reviews Iwo Jima Flag-Raising Photo," *Leatherneck*, July 2016; and "Confirming the First Flag Raisers," *Leatherneck*, October 2016.
- Headquarters Marine Corps, "Marine Corps Updates Its Official Records of the First Flag Raising over Iwo Jima," press release, Marines.mil, 24 August 2016.
- 33. Spence, "Unraveling the Mysteries," 34–43.
- 34. While most Americans know the Rosenthal photograph, that first flag raised was celebrated by Marines and sailors at the time, serving as a morale booster after an initially hard landing and the big fight ahead. For the operational significance, see chapters by Charles P. Neimeyer and by Stephen Foley and Dustin Spence in this volume.
- 35. Richard Wheeler, *The Bloody Battle for Suribachi* (New York: Thomas Y. Crowell Co, 1965), 132.

- 36. In 2019, the Marine Corps received assistance from the FBI's Digital Evidence Laboratory in performing additional forensic photographic analyses of still imagery and motion picture film of the second flag raising.
- Harold G. Schrier, letter to MajGen Pedro del Valle, 10 December 1946, Reference Branch, Marine Corps History Division, Quantico, VA.
- 38. Hayes letter to Block.
- 39. Harold Schultz's stepdaughter Dezreen McDowell recalls him mentioning the flag raising only once and in passing. Schultz clearly preferred to remain discreet about his participation, and the conversation was only brought to light after the 2016 Huly Panel findings were made public. See Tom Bowman, "Marine Corps Misidentified Man in Iconic Iwo Jima Photo," *All Things Considered*, NPR, 24 June 2016.
- Steve Share, "Local Union Retiree Gains New Recognition for Iwo Jima Flag-Raising," *Minneapolis Labor Review*, 26 May 2005.
- 41. Bradley and Powers, Flags of Our Fathers.
- 42. Nancy Jacobs, email to author, 4 October 2016.

# CHAPTER I 3

# "IN FAIRNESS TO ALL PARTIES" *The Marine Corps Corrects the Historical Record*

by Colonel Keil R. Gentry, USMC (Ret)

In many ways, it would have been better to have never identified the men in Joseph Rosenthal's iconic photograph of the second flag raising on Mount Suribachi. As nameless figures, the servicemembers would represent everyone who fought on Iwo Jima. Yet, anonymity ceased to be an option when President Franklin D. Roosevelt decided the men in the photograph should participate in the Seventh War Loan drive. On 30 March 1945, Headquarters Marine Corps sent a confidential telegram stating:

TRANSFER IMMEDIATELY TO US BY AIR . . . 6 ENLISTED MEN AND/OR OFFICERS WHO ACTUALLY APPEAR IN RO-SENTHAL PHOTOGRAPH OF FLAG RAISING AT MOUNT SURIBACHI.<sup>1</sup>

This order set in motion a protracted effort to officially identify the flag raisers that would culminate 74 years later when the Marine Corps revised the historical record for the third time. In 2019, a board led by Brigadier General William J. Bowers determined that Corporal Harold P. Keller is the Marine pictured on the far side, near the base of the flagpole, and that Private First Class Rene A. Gagnon, previously believed to be in that position, contributed to the flag raising but is not pictured in the photograph.

Why is it important to identify six men raising a replacement flag so long after the fact? Part of the answer is that when the Marine Corps associated names with the faceless figures in Rosenthal's photograph, it assumed the responsibility to get it right. General Alexander A. Vandegrift, 18th Commandant of the Marine Corps, articulated that duty in a letter to Sergeant Henry O. Hansen's father following the del Valle Board's initial revision to the flagraising roster. In 1947, the Marine Corps formally accepted the board's positive identification of Corporal Harlon H. Block in the position at the base of the flagpole, which had been assigned previously to Hansen. Informing the deceased sergeant's family of the change, Vandegrift wrote, "I hope you will agree that, in fairness to all parties, the Marine Corps was obligated to correct the mistaken identification."<sup>2</sup> That sentiment rang equally true in 2016, when the Huly Panel undertook a second investigation and corrected the placement and identification of Privates First Class Harold H. Schultz and Franklin R. Sousley on the near side of the flagpole.<sup>3</sup> The mandate for historical accuracy and integrity asserted itself again just two years later, when compelling visual evidence suggesting another possible correction was brought to the attention of the U.S. Marine Corps.

This chapter traces the most recent effort of the Marine Corps to evaluate the claims submitted for official review, which entailed performing an independent investigation to gather and analyze as much information as is currently available about the second flag raising and ultimately adjudicating the evidence to either confirm or revise the official Marine Corps record. In addition to giving transparency to the Bowers Board proceedings, it highlights the assistance of numerous organizations and individuals who aided the Marine Corps in its third—and hopefully final—examination of Rosenthal's iconic photograph.

# NEW CLAIMS ABOUT THE SECOND FLAG RAISING

I first became involved with the official effort to identify the Iwo Jima flag raisers in December 2015, when Dr. Charles P. Neimeyer, thendirector of the Marine Corps History Division, asked me to take a look at some photographs that external researchers had submitted with the claim that the visual evidence disputed the nearly 70-year-old historical record. The material made a persuasive argument that an error may have been made and, as Colonel Mary H. Reinwald (Ret) describes earlier in this volume, led to the formation of the Huly Panel in the spring of 2016, which recommended a revised roster of raisers for both the first and second flag raisings. Most notably for the current discussion, the panel concluded that Pharmacist's Mate Second Class John H. Bradley was not pictured in Rosenthal's photograph but that a previously unidentified Marine, Private First Class Harold H. Schultz, had helped raise the second flag instead.

The potential impact of these changes weighed heavily on the minds of panel members. As the Huly Panel formulated its conclusions, there was robust discussion around the possibility of future changes to the identifications pending new evidence and advances in photographic analysis. Additionally, there was considerable speculation as to why Private First Class Schultz had remained mostly, if not completely, silent on his presence in Rosenthal's photograph.<sup>4</sup> At the conclusion of the panel's deliberations, I remained bothered by the apparent fact that only four of the six flag raisers were present in the Gung Ho photograph, a group portrait Rosenthal captured soon after the second flag was raised (see figure 0.5). Specifically, why were Corporal Harlon H. Block and Private First Class Rene A. Gagnon absent from the picture? Two years later, these concerns would lay at the heart of another investigation.

On 17 July 2018, amateur historian Dustin Spence sent a 102-slide PowerPoint presentation of historical photographs in support of four new claims to retired Major General Orlo K. Steele. Because the Huly Panel considered not only the participation of Private First Class Schultz but also confirmed the presence of the five previously identified flag raisers in Rosenthal's photograph, the slides offered compelling evidence that potentially overturned the board's results. Specifically, Spence and his fellow researchers, Stephen Foley and Brent Westemeyer, asserted: 1) that Corporal Harold P. Keller is the Marine pictured in the position long associated with Private First Class Gagnon; 2) that Sergeant Michael Strank's role as a second flag raiser could be confirmed through photographic evidence; 3) that Private First Class Gagnon is the Marine in the foreground of Private Robert R. Campbell's photograph capturing the lowering of the first flag; and 4) that the Marine standing behind Sergeant Hansen in Rosenthal's *Gung Ho* photograph is Corporal Block.

Spence, Foley, and Westemeyer's assertions rested largely on photographic evidence, some of which the Huly Panel reviewed in 2016. The imagery submitted in the slide deck included still frames from the motion picture footage Sergeant William H. Genaust captured. Isolating early moments in the film sequence as the Marines begin lifting the flagpole, the researchers claimed that Sergeant Michael Strank was recognizable in position 4, on the far side of the pole across from Private First Class Ira H. Hayes.<sup>5</sup> Although the individual in question is partially blocked by Hayes and the motion picture, even as a still frame, is somewhat blurry, the researchers claimed that Strank's soft cap and jaw were identifiable characteristics that could confirm his presence in Rosenthal's photograph. When the Huly Panel analyzed this portion of Genaust's film, the members had observed the soft cap of the Marine in position 4 but determined that the poor image quality and undefined gaps in time precluded more definitive conclusions.

Whereas the image package aimed to strengthen the identification of Sergeant Strank in Rosenthal's photograph, the other proposed identification disputed the presence of Private First Class Gagnon. Two photographs by Private Robert R. Campbell formed the centerpiece of this argument. Although multiple photographers were present on the summit of Mount Suribachi during the second flag raising, Private Campbell was the only one to capture the lowering of the first flag and the raising of the second flag in a single frame (figure 13.1). This photograph is familiar to veterans, civilians, and researchers alike and has subsequently appeared as the cover image for numerous publications about the Battle of Iwo Jima.<sup>6</sup> Significantly, the image provides a distinct, if diminutive, view of the Marine in position 2. Another Campbell photograph shows First Lieutenant Harold G. Schrier and Platoon Sergeant Ernest I. Thomas Jr. saluting the second flag after the Marines raised it to a vertical position (figure 13.2). Like the flaglowering photograph, this image provides a frontal view of the Marine on the far side of the flagpole. Because the face in both images is cast in shadow, these photographs appeared to lack discernible detail to prove or disprove the attribution of Private First Class Gagnon. Enlarged details of both photographs submitted by the researchers purported to show a clear view of the face, uniform, and weapon of the Marine in position 2. Arguing that the individual closely resembles Corporal Harold P. Keller, the brief further theorized that the slender Marine positioned at the top of the first flagpole, nearest to the viewer in Campbell's photograph of both flags, is Private First Class Gagnon.

In addition to the archival photographs the Huly Panel previously reviewed, the brief introduced several images from private collections and from the George Burns Collection at the U.S. Army Heritage and Education Center. To support their identification of Corporal Keller, Spence, Foley, and Westemeyer supplied a photograph captured by Army Private First Class George Burns, who was a combat cameraman working for *Yank* magazine during the



In this well-timed photograph, Marine combat cameraman Pvt Robert R. Campbell captured the lowering the first flag while the raising of the second flag is visible in the background. 1stLt Harold G. Schrier made sure that the raising and lowering occurred simultaneously so that the American flag would never be absent from view for the Marines fighting below.

Official U.S. Marine Corps photo, courtesy Private Robert R. Campbell, National Archives and Records Administration



Moments after the second flag raising, Pvt Robert R. Campbell snapped this photograph of 1stLt Harold G. Schrier and PlSgt Ernest I. Thomas Jr. saluting the American banner. The original flagpole is visible in the lower left corner of the picture, where the Marines who lowered the first flag are now removing the pipe from the high ground of the summit. A close-up of Marines supporting the second flag offers a frontal view of the individual in position 2.

Official U.S. Marine Corps photo, courtesy Private Robert R. Campbell, National Archives and Records Administration

Battle of Iwo Jima. The image, taken between the first and second flag raisings, shows Corporal Keller shaking hands with Sergeant Howard M. Snyder on the edge of the crater (figure 13.3). Burns' caption list for the film roll annotates the photograph with identifications of both Marines and explains that the pair were the first to reach the summit. This photograph was supplemented with several personal snapshots of Corporal Keller during and after his military service. Additional versions of the *Gung Ho* photograph enlarged the visual archive further. While Genaust's film reveals that the Marines had waved and cheered for several seconds while posing for the group photograph, the fame of Rosenthal's still photograph has eclipsed other copies in the historical record. Two images, taken by Burns, provide partial views of the individual standing behind Sergeant Hansen. In Rosenthal's *Gung Ho* photograph, this Marine is almost entirely obscured by Sergeant Hansen;



Army PFC George Burns asked Sgt Howard M. Snyder (left) and Cpl Harold P. Keller (right) to pose for this shot between the first and second flag raisings. In the caption list he prepared for Yank editors in Honolulu, Burns provided the names and hometowns for both Marines, along with details of their achievement in being among the first of 1stLt Harold G. Schrier's platoon to reach the summit.
Official U.S. Army photo, courtesy PFC George Burns, George Burns Collection, U.S. Army Heritage and Education Center

only a tuft of hair is visible. Consequently, most reproductions of the *Gung Ho* photograph do not even note that an individual is present (see, for example, figure 12.4). The pair of *Gung Ho* portraits in the Burns Collection, the researchers asserted, provided sufficient detail of the Marine for a favorable comparison to Corporal Block.

Recognizing the potential impact this evidence would have on the findings of the Huly Panel, Major General Steele forwarded the email to Lieutenant General Jan Huly, who had overseen the previous investigation.<sup>7</sup> On 9 August 2018, General Huly shared the file with members of the Huly Panel and Brigadier General William J. Bowers, commanding general of Education Command and president of Marine Corps University. Upon review, General Bowers directed a research effort to evaluate, corroborate, and determine the authenticity of the evidence presented, followed by recommendations for further action based on this assessment. As former members of the Huly Panel assigned to Marine Corps University, the task fell to Dr. Breanne Robertson and me.

# VERIFYING AND CORROBORATING THE VISUAL EVIDENCE

Robertson and I determined that the first step was to verify the authenticity of the photographic imagery submitted for consideration. Because the researchers provided a PowerPoint presentation rather than raw digital image files, we had no way of knowing how closely the images approximated the originals. Had they been modified to sharpen detail or reduce shadows? Was the image represented in its entirety or had it been cropped? Was the file compressed and, if so, did this degrade the overall resolution?

The initial appraisal of photographs fell to Robertson. Trained as an art historian, she painstakingly reviewed the images included in the PowerPoint presentation and then developed a parallel version using high resolution scans taken directly from the print or negative, as available, during repeated visits to the National Archives in College Park, Maryland, and the U.S. Army Heritage and Education Center at Carlisle Barracks, Pennsylvania. Robertson also liaised with the Associated Press to obtain high resolution digital image files of Rosenthal's photographs. These included details of the Associated Press photographer's Pulitzer Prize-winning photograph, the *Gung Ho* group portrait, and a candid shot of the raisers immediately after the second flag had been raised (figure 13.4).

Working in the Still Picture Research Room at the National Archives, Robertson viewed photographs Coast Guard Photographer's Mate Third Class John Papsun took as well as the myriad images Marine Corps combat cameramen took of the event. In the Marine Corps' holdings, these images are filed under the "flag raising" subject heading and include not only the first and second flags as they appeared on 23 February 1945, but also photographs taken on the summit of Mount Suribachi in subsequent days as the elevated vantage point became a key position for 3d and 4th Marine Division's artillery spotters. Robertson also searched for images depicting Private First Class Gagnon elsewhere on the island, since any photograph of him during the battle would provide insight into the particularities of his uniform and equipment and would offer a point of comparison for analyzing the flag-raising photographs. Because Gagnon served as a runner for Company E, Robertson hoped to glimpse the Marine in images of the 5th Marine Division command post, to no avail.

Through conversation with the still picture archivists in College Park, Robertson learned that the National Archives' photograph collection did not necessarily correspond to the original negatives preserved in cold storage. To cross-reference the print and negative holdings, Robertson consulted several volumes of logbooks, which the Marine Corps used to record every negative from the Pacific theater. Because the logbooks were maintained in the photographic laboratory on Guam, the entries are organized by the date a roll of film was developed, not by the original date of exposure. As



After the second flag raising, PFC Harold Schultz and the Marine in position 2 stepped away to gather rocks for placement at the base of the flagpole. This photograph, taken by Associated Press photographer Joe Rosenthal, shows Cpl Harlon H. Block and PFCs Franklin R. Sousley and Ira H. Hayes stabilizing the flagpole against the wind raking across the summit. The Marine in position 4 is largely obscured, but his hand grasping the pole and his uniform configuration provided key details that aided the Bowers Board in its deliberations.

Joseph J. Rosenthal photograph, courtesy the Associated Press

a result, the only way to search for entries related to the flag raisings was to browse the bound volumes page by page. This inconvenience was more than compensated by the value of the information obtained. Robertson successfully generated a complete inventory of official Marine Corps photographs taken on Mount Suribachi on 23 February 1945 and requested any negative that did not appear in the print collection. Unfortunately, many of the photographs could not be found in either repository. Because the Marine Corps did not transfer the photographs and negatives to the National Archives until the 1970s, it is not clear when or why certain images were missing; however, the stamped word "deleted" over a negative's assigned number in the logbook did accurately indicate when an original had been destroyed, perhaps because of visual defects (such as blurriness) or because the image approximated another photograph and so was considered a duplicate. Her diligence ensured the Bowers Board would have the best possible imagery with unquestioned provenance to review.

Meanwhile, the first step I took was to reach out to Corporal Keller's daughter, Kay Keller Maurer, by phone. She shared memories of her father after the war and verified that she had several scrapbooks containing photographs along with other memorabilia related to his military service. She told me that her father never claimed to be a flag raiser to her or any of her siblings. Maurer did not recall her mother mentioning Keller's participation in the flag raising either; however, she went on to say that if the information was meant to remain a secret, then her mother would have kept silent. She then related a story of her father recording reminiscences of his time on Iwo Jima on audiocassette for fellow Marine and author Richard Wheeler, who had served with Keller in Company E, 2d Battalion, 28th Marine Regiment. She was not sure what her father had said on the tape, she explained, because no matter how hard she had tried to eavesdrop, her father made sure she was out of earshot during his recordings.<sup>8</sup> When I related this story to my colleague, Master Sergeant Stacy Patzman, USMC (Ret), she immediately became intrigued and volunteered to track down Wheeler. Within an hour, she determined that Wheeler had passed away in 2008, that he had resided with his sister at the end of his life, and that his sister continued to maintain his room and basement study just as he had left it. I wondered whether we might find the recording of Keller's oral history among Wheeler's belongings. We reached out to Wheeler's sister, Margery Wheeler Mattox, who invited us to visit her home in Pine Grove, Pennsylvania.<sup>9</sup>

# IN THEIR OWN WORDS: ORAL HISTORIES AS EVIDENCE

Corporal Richard Wheeler served alongside Keller as a member of Company E's 3d Platoon during the Battle of Iwo Jima. Although Wheeler did not make it to the summit of Mount Suribachi with his fellow Marines on 23 February due to being medically evacuated on D+2, he became the de facto historian for his platoon after the war. In addition to numerous articles on the battle and the flag raisings, he published two books on the subject, Iwo (1980) and The Bloody Battle for Suribachi (originally published in 1965 and updated in 2007). Wheeler's veteran status and personal connections gave him unparalleled access and insight into the actions taken by Company E on 23 February 1945. His research files included audiocassette tapes, interview transcripts, and letters from the men who fought with him on Iwo Jima. Due to the potential treasure trove of information to be found among his personal effects, Master Sergeant Patzman and I gladly took Mattox up on her offer and made a two-day research trip to Pennsylvania.

With the assistance of Mattox and her neighbor, Louise Miller, we spent the first afternoon reviewing and cataloging the large volume of material in the house. Meanwhile, Robertson conducted research nearby at the U.S. Army Heritage and Education Center, where she made high resolution scans from photographs in the George Burns Collection. Robertson joined us the following day to photograph and collect material related to the Battle of Iwo Jima, including a stack of audiocassette tapes for analysis and eventual accession into the Marine Corps History Division's Oral History collection.

Due to the advanced age and fragile condition of the tapes, History Division arranged for them to be digitized and transferred to compact disc after our return to Quantico. With the hope of hearing a firsthand account of the second flag raising, I eagerly listened to the audio file containing Keller's experiences on Iwo Jima. After all, Keller is pictured in the *Gung Ho* group photograph taken only moments after the second flag was raised. Even if he did not profess to be a raiser himself, he was an eyewitness to the event and so might shed light on who was. To my chagrin, his narrative began *after* his platoon had left its position on Mount Suribachi.<sup>10</sup>

Next, I arranged to visit the home of Corporal Keller's daughter in Clarence, Iowa. In preparation for my trip, I made several phone calls to follow up on information Maurer and Westemeyer had provided. Since Keller grew up in Brooklyn, Iowa, and returned there after the war, the Brooklyn Historical Society seemed like a logical place to start. I contacted Mary Jo Thompson, director of the society, to determine if the collection's holdings included any material on Keller. She confirmed that they had a small display covering his service in its museum, and she agreed to help me view the artifacts via Facetime on 24 September 2018. Unfortunately, the display did not contain any new information.11

I then reached out to James G. Zigler, adjutant of the Francis Gallagher American Legion Post 294, to determine if Keller had ever discussed his participation in the flag raising with fellow veterans. Zigler provided me with the names and phone numbers of four post members who were veterans of World War II, though none recalled Keller claiming to be a flag raiser. To the contrary, one veteran, Stanley Walford, told me that Keller was busy mopping-up Japanese resistance on the crater of Mount Suribachi when the flag raising occurred. Dale Lippincott revealed that he was not well acquainted with Keller and so declined to offer further comment, while Darrel Dyer and Dean Montgomery stated that Keller did not talk much about his experiences on Iwo Jima, so they could not offer an opinion about his proximity to the flag raising. In addition to being fellow legionnaires, Keller had worked for Montgomery at Surge, a dairy equipment company, after the war.<sup>12</sup>

It seemed likely that Keller, if he were a flag raiser, would have left some record of his participation in that famous event among his personal effects. Upon my arrival in Iowa in late September 2018, I met with Kay Keller Maurer, who graciously permitted me access to her father's memorabilia. I was quickly able to verify the provenance of the personal photographs of Keller presented by Spence, Foley, and Westemeyer in their PowerPoint presentation to the Marine Corps (figure 13.5).

In addition to photographic evidence, I hoped to find some mention of Keller's participation in the flag raising among the stack of letters saved by his loved ones, similar to the letter Pharmacist's Mate Second Class Bradley wrote to his parents describing his role in raising the first flag. An article from the Surge company newsletter, published circa 1977 and preserved in Keller's scrapbook, provided a cryptic but potentially meaningful clue. It stated, "Harold rarely talks about his service days in World War II and practically never mentions Iwo Jima where he happened to be one of that group of Marines who raised the American flag on Mount Suribachi." The article goes on to say, "At 12:15 p.m. a Joe Rosenthal of the Associated Press came by for a picture. . . . The photographer climbed upon a cairn of rocks as Harold Keller and his comrades lunged forward and drove the flag home." Based on the clear identification of "Harold Keller and his comrades" as having their hands on the flagpole in this article, Keller must have told someone that he had a hand in raising the flag (figure 13.6).

A missive dated 17 September 1945 from the commander of Marine Barracks Quantico, Major General P. H. Torrey, was also pasted in his scrapbook that stated, "Any unproved and malicious gossip about any member of our Marine Corps is a direct reflection on you as a member or former member of our Corps. Nothing is more malicious and indecent than the tearing down of characters and lives through the spreading of untruths."13 It seemed to me that this order must have held personal significance for Keller for him to save it. Could it have caused him to remain publicly silent regarding his participation in the flag raising? Unfortunately, I found no further reference to the flag raising in Keller's personal correspondence. Little did I know that a wartime letter describing the corporal's participation in that storied event would come to light from an unexpected source eight months later.

After completing the search for primary evidence related to Keller, I contacted Private First Class Gagnon's son, Rene Gagnon Jr., on 9 October 2018 to determine if he or other members of his family had any material in their possession that would confirm their father's place in the Rosenthal photograph. My inquiry also aimed to test the theory that Gagnon was the individual seen assisting the first flag lowering in Campbell's photograph of both flags. Because the unidentified Marine



FIGURE 13.5 Cpl Harold P. Keller, ca. 1945. Courtesy Kay Keller Maurer

in the foreground of Campbell's image is also pictured smoking a cigarette and wearing a Ka-Bar fighting knife in another photograph, I inquired whether these aspects were consistent with what the younger Gagnon knew about his father's wartime experience (figure 13.7). Gagnon confirmed that his father was a smoker and that he carried a Ka-Bar on Iwo Jima. He also stated that he had seen a battlefield photograph of an individual whom he identified as his father. I then emailed Gagnon two cropped details of Campbell's photograph for his review along with the message, "Attached are two versions of the photo with the Marine smoking. Is the smoking Marine PFC Rene Gagnon?" He responded, "Neither of these two photos [is of Rene Gagnon] . . . the one I have is with [the] flag still being tied to pole prior to raising . . .



HAROLD KELLER, who has been with Surge Dealer DEAN MONT-GOMERY for 12 years in Brooklyn, Iowa is an ex-Marine.

Harold rarely talks about his service days in World War II and practically never mentions Iwo Jima where he happened to be one of that group of Marines who raised the American flag on Mount Suribachi.

It was on February 23, 1945, the morning of the fifth day. Before it was over, 31 days later, there would be 6,821 Americans killed and 19,217 wounded in the bloodiest single battle of the Pacific. All for a miserable piece of volcanic ash called Iwo Jima – an island 5 miles long by 2 miles wide. It was tiny but crucial in the grand arc of island-hopping that began in Australia and ended within 700 miles of Tokyo.

At 10:15 a.m. that day, Mt. Suribachi seemed secure. The 550 foot peak appeared still, with enemy caves empty and smoking. The Marines put up a small flag as two Japanese darted out with gernades. They were shot down ... and Suribachi was now secure.

At 12:15 p.m. a Joe Rosenthal of the Associated Press came by for a picture. The Marines wanted no doubts; they decided to establish clear title by putting up a larger flag. The photographer climbed upon a cairn of rocks as Harold Keller and his comrades lunge forward and drove the flag home.

That photo went on to become a Pulitzer Prize Winner for 1945 and has been widely publicized.

Nonetheless, Harold Keller would just as soon forget Iwo Jima. He seems to prefer working with Surge in the peace of the Iowa countryside. will print and forward tonight!"<sup>14</sup> Despite this initial exchange, Gagnon's son declined to assist further with the investigation.<sup>15</sup> Although I never received the promised photograph, it is extremely unlikely that any such image would have depicted Private First Class Gagnon. The only photographs showing the American flag being tied to a length of pipe on 23 February 1945 are those taken by Staff Sergeant Louis R. Lowery in preparation for the first flag raising, hours before Gagnon arrived at the summit.

# EXPANDING OUR SEARCH

In addition to verifying independently the photographic evidence submitted by Spence, Foley,

### FIGURE 13.6 (left)

Although friends and family members do not recall Cpl Harold Keller ever claiming to be a flag raiser, the Marine's personal scrapbook contained a company newsletter clipping that proclaimed his presence in Joe Rosenthal's famous photograph. Photo courtesy of Kay Keller Maurer



# FIGURE 13.7 (above)

In a photograph of the first flag flying on the summit, Pvt Robert R. Campbell captured a Marine smoking a cigarette. The individual's slight build combined with similarities of helmet camouflage pattern, the tear in his service shirt, and the presence of a haversack and Ka-Bar indicate that he is the same individual pictured at the top of the flagpole in Campbell's photograph of the first flag being lowered.

Official U.S. Marine Corps photo, courtesy Private Robert R. Campbell, National Archives and Records Administration

"IN FAIRNESS TO ALL PARTIES" 229

and Westemeyer, we conducted a thorough review of secondary sources that suggested other lines of inquiry to include research notes and oral history interviews scholars collected on the subject. We reached out to museums and historical societies to request their assistance in locating previously overlooked artifacts and documents related to our search. Robertson and I also worked with outside researchers, especially with Foley, Westemeyer, and Spence.

In our quest to be thorough and review firsthand source material to the greatest extent possible, Robertson engaged Dr. Parker Bishop Albee Jr., professor emeritus at the University of Southern Maine in Portland, and obtained nearly a dozen audiocassette tapes and transcripts of oral history interviews that he and coauthor Keller Cushing Freeman had conducted in the early 1990s for their book, Shadow of Suribachi (1995). Of particular relevance to our investigation were interviews with and letters from the former commander of Company E, Captain Dave E. Severance; former commander of 3d Platoon, Company E, First Lieutenant John Keith Wells; First Sergeant John A. Daskalakis of Company E; former adjutant for 2d Battalion, 28th Marines, Second Lieutenant G. Greeley Wells; former assistant operations officer for 28th Marines, Captain Fred E. Haynes; and Marine combat cameraman, Sergeant Louis R. Burmeister. The source material contained one surprise. In his interview with Albee and Freeman, G. Greeley Wells talked about First Sergeant Daskalakis' efforts to identify the flag raisers in Rosenthal's photograph and that the Marines were reluctant to come forward. At one point, Wells describes Daskalakis' frustration with the identification process and, later, his realization that "this knucklehead, hell he was there, he just didn't say anything." In response, Freeman suggests that the reticent Marine was Private First Class Ira Hayes, to which Wells responds, "Well it might have been Ira, but there was also another guy." He does not name the other Marine in the interview, but he goes on to say that the person did not want publicity for the flag raising.<sup>16</sup> This passing remark may be a clue as to why Corporal Keller did not come forward at the time. Unfortunately, with Wells' death on 22 September 2014, we were not able to ask him for clarification on the other individual, and Daskalakis made no mention of "another guy," such as Wells described, in his interview either. Was Wells referring to another member of the flag-raising party or merely an eyewitness who knew more than he had admitted previously?

Taking advantage of the Marine Corps' rich collection of oral histories at History Division, I also reviewed the official career interviews of Major General Pedro del Valle, who oversaw the 1947 investigation that corrected the identification of Corporal Block in the Rosenthal photograph, and Brigadier General Robert L. Denig, who served as director of the Marine Corps Division of Public Information during the Seventh War Loan drive. Oral history interviews with Marine correspondent Technical Sergeant W. Keyes Beech and civilian photographer Joseph Rosenthal also promised to yield details about the flag raising and the official U.S. Marine Corps effort to assign names to the raisers soon thereafter. None provided new insight into the process by which the Marine Corps initially identified the flag raisers.<sup>17</sup>

Seeking additional first-person accounts of the Iwo Jima flag raisings, the research team successfully located a videotaped interview with Private Philip L. Ward, a participant in the first flag raising and platoon mate of Corporal Keller. Conducted by the Montgomery County Historical Society, Indiana, on 17 April 1991, the oral history describes actions atop Mount Suribachi. Ward's account largely reinforces the accepted narrative of events as it has been presented in the scholarly literature. During the interview, the former Marine is asked to identify the men in a photograph taken by Staff Sergeant Louis Lowery. The image depicts four Marines patrolling the crater of Mount Suribachi after the first flag raising (figure 13.8). Although analysis of the helmet camouflage pattern and rifle sling attachment confirms that the Marine on the far right of the group is Private First Class Harold Schultz, Ward mistakenly identifies the individual as Private First Class Manuel Panizo.<sup>18</sup> Interestingly, Keith Wells misidentified Schultz as Private First Class James R. Michels in the same photograph.<sup>19</sup> Ward and Wells' errors in identification highlighted the challenge of relying on eyewitness testimony provided so many years after the action. As a result, the research team had the unenviable task of attempting to reconcile contradictory narratives provided through myriad sources during the past 75 years.

The contradictions are not surprising. The stress of combat, the passage of time, and differences of perspective all contributed to the differing accounts of the events on 23 February 1945. Moreover, the second flag was a replacement banner; its raising was so inconsequential to the Marines present that no one bothered to note the time, resulting in estimates ranging from 1200 to 1400, with an approximate time of 1200 being more likely. Because Rosenthal arrived just prior to the second flag raising and departed the summit soon thereafter, his oral history offers a precise timeline not found in most accounts. After taking a handful of pictures after the second flag raising, the Associated Press photographer returned to the 28th Marines' command post to grab a bite to eat. There, he remembers noting the time as 1305, which puts the time of the second flag raising closer to noon.<sup>20</sup>

In the course of the investigation, we consulted with the National Museum of the Marine Corps in Quantico, Virginia; the Wright Museum of World War II in Wolfeboro, New Hampshire; and the Manchester Historic Association in Manchester, New Hampshire, in search of uniform articles worn by Private First Class Gagnon during the Battle of Iwo Jima. From our experience on the Huly Panel, we understood that idiosyncrasies of uniform could provide identifying characteristics. Specifically, we noted a tear in the service shirt worn by the unidentified Marine for whom Spence, Foley, and Westemeyer had proposed was Private First Class Gagnon. None of the museums possessed Gagnon's combat utilities, although the Wright Museum of World War II does hold his dress blue uniform. Robertson also made telephone inquiries to the Marine Military Academy in Harlingen, Texas, and the Weslaco Independent School District in Weslaco, Texas, to obtain additional portraits of Corporal Block for comparison to Burns' Gung Ho photographs, which unfortunately did not yield any new visual evidence.

# PARTNERING WITH THE FEDERAL BUREAU OF INVESTIGATION

With the initial research phase of collecting and authenticating evidence related to the claims now complete, the next step was to seek professional evaluation of the images. Following the recommendation of the Huly Panel to seek forensic photographic analysis, the Marine Corps made an official request on 31 October 2018 to the Federal Bureau of Investigation (FBI) for assistance. The initial request focused on the



One of the challenges of identifying the flag raisers is establishing known photographs of individuals for comparison. Even for Marines who witnessed the events of 23 February 1945 firsthand, this is a difficult task. As a result, various names have been assigned to the Marines from Company E, seen here in a photograph by SSgt Louis R. Lowery patrolling the rim of the crater after the first flag raising. From left to right: Sgt Henry O. Hansen, PFC James A. Robeson, Pvt Philip L. Ward, and PFC Harold H. Schultz. Cpl Charles W. Lindberg and Pvt Robert D. Goode have their backs to the camera.
 Official U.S. Marine Corps photo, courtesy Staff Sergeant Louis R. Lowery, Louis R. Lowery Collection, Archives Branch, Marine Corps History Division

proposed identifications and new image comparisons put forth in the 102-slide PowerPoint brief Spence, Foley, and Westemeyer submitted to the Marine Corps. In a subsequent request, we asked the FBI to analyze all six positions. Robertson supplied the FBI with an external hard drive with high resolution digital image files. Scanned at varying resolutions ranging



Army PFC George Burns was standing near Associated Press photographer Joe Rosenthal and Marine combat cameraman Sgt William H. Genaust after the second flag raising His collection of photographs includes two snapshots of the group portrait now known as the Gung Ho picture. Because the servicemen were actively cheering and waving their helmets when the photograph was taken, Burns' version provides a glimpse of the Marine standing behind Sgt Henry Hansen. Cropped detail of official U.S. Army photo, courtesy PFC George Burns, George Burns Collection, U.S. Army Heritage and Education Center

from 4800 to 12,800 dots per inch, the images comprised both complete photographs and cropped details showing individuals of interest to the investigation. The package also included known images of Sergeant Strank, Corporal Keller, Corporal Block, Private First Class Gagnon, and other Marines as a baseline for physiognomic analyses (or determining the characteristics of facial features), as well as a reference glossary of uniform items and weapons to assist the scientists in their manual comparison of these elements.

The FBI's Digital Evidence Laboratory analyzed the best quality images Robertson could produce. The FBI used a combination of facial recognition software, to include beta testing new software, and manual comparisons. Analysts painstakingly traced the movements of individuals in the Genaust film to establish their positions in the still photographs. By comparing fluctuating elements, such as the American flag flapping in the breeze, the FBI was able to establish the precise timing of the still photographs in relation to the motion picture footage. Images were processed to improve the visibility of facial features, as well as details of clothing, footwear, gear, and weapons.<sup>21</sup>

Camouflage patterns of uniforms were key in identifying individuals. Although camouflage patterns repeat themselves in bolts of material, once they are sewn into clothing and helmet covers, the camouflage pattern location and fabric creases become as distinct as a fingerprint. The restricted candidate pool aided the analysis. The total number of individuals on the summit of Mount Suribachi around the time of the second flag raising is estimated to be approximately 100.<sup>22</sup> This is a considerably smaller set of potential candidates than is normal for most forensic image analyses, which amplifies the significance of discrete characteristics as described in the FBI's findings below.

The FBI confirmed that the Marine in position 1, Corporal Block, is also the Marine pictured behind Sergeant Hansen in the *Gung Ho* photograph (figure 13.9). The conclusion was based on the match between the camouflage pattern and creases in the helmet cover in Burns' versions of the *Gung Ho* photograph and those of Block in Rosenthal's photograph of the raisers stabilizing the second flagpole.

For position 2, the FBI compared facial, helmet, clothing, gear, and weapon characteristics in Campbell's photographs, Burns' photographs, Rosenthal's *Gung Ho* photograph, and personal photographs. Facial similarities com-



High resolution digital scans, taken directly from the negative of Pvt Robert R. Campbell's photograph depicting 1stLt Harold G. Schrier and PlSgt Ernest I. Thomas Jr. saluting the second flag, reveal remarkable detail of the Marine in position 2. Facial similarities combined with the creases formed by the double bandoleers in the Marine's utility coat and the distinctive folds and camouflage pattern of his M1 helmet cover permitted the FBI to make a positive identification of Cpl Harold Keller. Cropped detail of official U.S. Marine Corps photo, courtesy Pvt Robert R. Campbell,

National Archives and Records Administration

bined with the creases formed by the double bandoleers in Corporal Keller's utility coat in combination with the distinctive folds and camouflage pattern of his M1 helmet cover formed individual characteristics that permitted his positive identification as a second flag raiser in Campbell's photographs (figure 13.10). For position 3, the FBI was able to confirm the identity of Private First Class Sousley based on the camouflage pattern on his helmet cover; the positioning of his soft cap under his helmet; creases in his clothing; and his equipment, especially the telephone lineman's pouch hooked to his utility belt. These characteristics



Although Sgt Michael Strank's face is partially, if not completely, obscured in all known photographs of the second flag raising, his particular uniform layering assisted the Bowers Board in confirming his presence in AP photographer Joe Rosenthal's famous photograph of that event. Cropped detail of Joseph J. Rosenthal photograph, courtesy the Associated Press are clearly visible in the *Gung Ho* photograph, where he was previously identified and in Rosenthal's flag-raising and flagpole-steadying photographs.

For position 4, the FBI was not able to make a definitive identification. The primary challenge is that the Marine is mostly obscured in both flag-raising and flagpole-steadying photographs. Although more of the individual's face is visible in the Genaust film, the low resolution does not allow for a positive identification. The FBI determined limited support for the proposition that the serviceman is Sergeant Strank based on the distinctive manner in which he wears his utility coat over his field jacket, a uniform configuration also visible in Rosenthal's flagpole-steadying image and the multiple Gung Ho photographs, and the pronounced curvature of the bill of his soft cap, which is discernible in Genaust's motion picture footage and in the Gung Ho photographs (figure 13.11).

The FBI was able to determine strong support for the proposition that Private First Class Schultz is the individual in position 5. This conclusion was based on the camouflage pattern on his helmet cover and the broken helmet liner strap that dangles on the left side. These characteristics are clearly visible in the *Gung Ho* photograph, where he was identified as the Marine kneeling next to Corporal Keller, and in both Rosenthal's iconic photograph and Genaust's film.

The FBI positively identified Private First Class Hayes as the individual in position 6. Their conclusion was based on multiple similarities in the camouflage pattern on his helmet cover as well as the difference in his weapon an M1 carbine—as opposed the more prevalent M1 Garand rifle carried by most other Marines on the summit. Furthermore, as one of the few Native Americans on Mount Suribachi that day, Private First Class Hayes was distinguishable in still photographs and motion picture footage for his skin tone.

The final claim requiring formal examination was the hypothesis that the individual in the foreground of Campbell's flag-lowering photograph is Private First Class Gagnon. Obviously, if the FBI was to determine that the Marine pictured therein is Gagnon, then the messenger could not possibly be present in Rosenthal's flag-raising photograph, which was taken simultaneously. Unfortunately, the forensic photographic analysis was limited in scope, as the Marine Corps' research team was unable to furnish the FBI with any archival or personal photographs wherein Gagnon is identified either atop Mount Suribachi or elsewhere on Iwo Jima during the battle. The lack of a contemporaneous photograph for comparison narrowed the FBI evaluation to images of Gagnon taken during the Seventh War Loan drive in late spring 1945, as he was posing for sculptor Felix de Weldon in 1950 and as he attended other postwar occasions (see figure 6.6).<sup>23</sup> The FBI successfully determined that the slender Marine in Campbell's flag-lowering photograph is the same person seen smoking a cigarette in Campbell's photograph of the first flag. Could this individual be confirmed as Private First Class Gagnon? Although the scientists noted some facial similarities between the Marine in Campbell's photographs and later images of Gagnon, they could not clearly discern whether a mole was present on the individual's right cheek-a distinguishing characteristic of Gagnon's physiognomy—since the perceptible mottling of skin tone in the flag-raising photographs is on scale with the film grain. As a result, the FBI could neither confirm nor deny that the individual in question is Private First Class Gagnon.

# THE BOWERS BOARD DELIBERATIONS

On 4 February 2019, the Marine Corps convened a panel to review the new claims regarding the identity of the second flag raisers atop Mount Suribachi, Iwo Jima. The board was composed of Brigadier General William J. Bowers, commanding general, Education Command; Colonel Robert C. Fulford, director, Expeditionary Warfare School; Colonel Keil R. Gentry (Ret), Education Command; Sergeant Major William J. Grigsby, sergeant major, Training and Education Command; Sergeant Major Douglas F. Cutsail, sergeant major, Education Command; Master Sergeant Stacy M. Patzman (Ret), Education Command; and Dr. Breanne Robertson, Marine Corps History Division. Armed with the FBI's findings, which were based on professional forensic analyses of the photographic evidence, the Bowers Board was tasked with applying its collective knowledge and experience of the Marine Corps to determine the identification of the Iwo Jima flag raisers with as much certainty as possible. Key to this process was placing the photographic evidence in its historical context.

Shortly after the first flag was raised on the morning of 23 February 1945, the decision was made to replace it with a larger flag.<sup>24</sup> At approximately the same time this mission was handed down, Sergeant Michael Strank received orders to form a patrol to lay communications wire from the Landing Team, 2d Battalion, 28th Marine Regiment (LT228), command post to the top of Mount Suribachi. He selected three members of his squad to accompany him—Corporal Harlon Block and Privates First Class Ira Hayes and Franklin Sousley. Private First Class Rene Gagnon, a battalion runner from Company E, was at the command post getting ready to take fresh radio batteries to the top of Mount Suribachi when Second Lieutenant Albert T. Tuttle arrived with a larger flag from *LST-779*. The battalion commander, Lieutenant Colonel Chandler Johnson, directed Gagnon to carry the larger flag to the summit. Gagnon joined Strank's patrol for the trek up the volcano.

When they arrived at the summit, Sergeant Strank reported to First Lieutenant Harold G. Schrier, telling him that "Colonel Johnson wants this big flag run up high so every son of a bitch on this cruddy island can see it" or words to that effect.25 Since Schrier and his men were already busy mopping-up Japanese resistance, it is likely that he ordered Strank and his patrol to prepare the second flag. That this assignment fell to Strank, Block, Hayes, and Sousley is consistent with the photographic record, since all four Marines are seen holding the makeshift flagpole prior to the second flag being raised. Roughly 20-30 minutes after their arrival at the crest, Associated Press photographer Joe Rosenthal, motion picture cameraman Sergeant William Genaust, and combat cameraman Private Robert Campbell reached the summit hoping to take pictures of the American flag that had been planted earlier that morning. However, when the first flag came into view, the photographers realized that a replacement banner would soon go up in its place. Genaust filmed four individuals holding the flagpole in a horizontal position, getting ready to raise the second flag. Based on the military importance of retaining squad integrity as well as the positions held by these men in subsequent photographs, the four Marines are (from left to right): Sergeant Strank on the far side of the pipe with Private First Class Hayes, Private First Class Sousley, and Corporal Block on the near side (figure 13.12). With a high wind atop Suribachi catching the large banner measuring 96 by 56 inches and attached to a 150-pound pipe, it is not surprising to see two additional Marines enter the picture frame to lend a hand in lifting the pole to an upright position. The late addition of these servicemen brings the flag-raising party to six members, which corresponds to the presence of Corporal Harold Keller and Private First Class Harold Schultz in historical photographs of that storied event.<sup>26</sup>

The FBI had already found strong support for the proposition that Private First Class Schultz is the Marine in position 5 based primarily on the camouflage pattern on his helmet cover and his broken helmet liner strap. The Bowers Board combined this scientific visual analysis with the fact that Schultz's rifle sling is attached to the stacking swivel instead of the sling swivel, causing the rifle to hang lower on his shoulder. To assess whether this characteristic was unique to Schultz, the panel reviewed the Genaust film and approximately 100 photographs known to have been taken on Suribachi that day and did not find another Marine exhibiting both a broken helmet liner strap and a rifle sling attached to the stacking swivel (figure 13.13). This led the board to conclude that the individual in position 5 is positively identified as Private First Class Harold Schultz.

To be sure, the most difficult flag raiser to identify was in position 4. The serviceman's face and most of his clothing and equipment are obscured in all of Rosenthal and Campbell's photographs. Furthermore, the brief glimpses of his face in Genaust's film are not sufficient for identification due to the low resolution; howev-



This still frame, taken from the motion picture footage captured by Sgt William H. Genaust, shows four Marines holding the makeshift flagpole just prior to raising the second flag Although the degraded quality of the film does not permit fine detail of camouflage patterns or facial features, the FBI confirmed that the individual on the far side, nearest to the flag, is wearing a soft cap. The Bowers Board subsequently determined that the group comprised members of the wire-laying squad led by Sgt Michael Strank. From left to right: Sgt Michael Strank, PFC Ira H. Hayes, PFC Franklin R. Sousley, and Cpl Harlon H. Block. Passing in front of PFC Sousley and Cpl Block is PFC Harold H. Schultz, who approaches the flagpole to lend a hand. Official U.S. Marine Corps motion picture by Sgt William H. Genaust, National Archives and Records Administration

er, the person in position 4 is wearing a soft cap, which is consistent with oral histories from other Marines who have remarked on Strank's tendency not to wear his helmet.<sup>27</sup> With degraded motion picture footage being the only photographic evidence available for the rear position on the far side of the flagpole, the FBI offered only limited support that Strank is the Marine in that position.

Until Spence, Foley, and Westemeyer submitted their 102-slide presentation for the Bowers Board's consideration, Strank's iden-

### FIGURE 13.13 (opposite)

PFC Harold Schultz is pictured here kneeling beside Cpl Harold Keller beneath the second flag. The dangling helmet liner strap and camouflage pattern of his M1 helmet are clearly visible, which assisted the FBI in confirming the identification of PFC Schultz in position 5. Cropped detail of Joseph J. Rosenthal photograph, courtesy the Associated Press

tification had been rooted in the eyewitness statements of Pharmacist's Mate Second Class Bradley and Privates First Class Gagnon and Hayes. As alluded to above, the crucial piece of information that permitted the panel to identi-



fy Strank as a second flag raiser was the atypical style in which the sergeant layered his utility coat over his field jacket, the latter of which was normally worn as an outer garment. Upon closer examination of Rosenthal's photograph of four men steadying the second flagpole, the clothing of the individual associated with position 4 reveals the metallic glint of an open zipper beneath an unbuttoned utility coat, whose left patch pocket is discernible due to bulging caused by its contents (figure 13.14). Other identifying features include the presence of a watch on his left wrist, the absence of a ring on his left hand, and stains or discoloration on his trousers. To assist with its deliberations on this topic, the Bowers Board enlisted the aid of Owen L. Conner, senior curator of uniforms and heraldry at the National Museum of the Marine Corps, to offer his expert opinion on the type and configuration of uniform pieces in the historical photograph. Upon careful scrutiny of the image, Conner determined that the Marine was indeed wearing a utility coat over his field jacket. He prepared a mannequin with the same garment configuration for the panel members to assess in person.

Concurring with Conner's uniform analysis, the board then reviewed more than 100 historical photographs to determine whether any other individuals exhibited this same manner of dress. In all the photographs taken atop Mount Suribachi on 23 February 1945 that were available to the board, only two people are seen wearing a utility coat over a field jacket. One of these men is an unidentified individual standing next to Pharmacist's Mate Second Class Bradley near the first flagpole; however, that person is also wearing a ring on his left ring finger, excluding him from further consideration (see figure 13.7). The only other serviceman wearing a utility coat over his field jacket is Sergeant Strank, who can be seen sporting this unorthodox layering in the *Gung Ho* photographs.

In Rosenthal's group portrait, Strank's utility coat is buttoned and he is not wearing a ring. His sleeve covers his left wrist, so the presence of a watch cannot be confirmed or refuted based on photographic evidence. Nevertheless, the habit of wearing a wristwatch during battle would be consistent with Strank's role as a squad leader, as fellow Iwo Jima veteran John Keith Wells notes in his memoir, "Give Me 50 Marines Not Afraid to Die".28 There remains, however, a discrepancy between Strank's appearance in the Gung Ho image and the individual in the flag-stabilizing photograph, since the sergeant has fastened both the field jacket and utility coat (see figure 13.11). Only a few minutes had passed between the second flag raising and the group photograph. Had Strank closed his jacket while others were securing the flagpole with guy wires? The members of the Bowers Board discussed this question at length and agreed that such a change was not only possible, but likely under the circumstances. It is reasonable to assume that Strank would have unbuttoned his utility coat and unzipped his field jacket to cool off after the steep climb up Suribachi, and later rezipped and buttoned his clothing to shield himself from the sharp breeze. The FBI's forensic photographic analysis combined with the contextual evidence outlined above led the Bowers Board to conclude some-to-strong support that Sergeant Michael Strank is the individual in position 4.

Historical context is also important when considering whether Private First Class Gagnon is pictured at the head of the first flagpole as it is being lowered. To be sure, the lack of a contemporaneous photograph of Gagnon in combat utilities hampers a positive identifi-


#### FIGURE 13.14

A close-up detail of Rosenthal's flagpole-steadying photograph shows that the Marine in position 4 has layered his combat uniform in an unusual manner. Through consultation with National Museum of the Marine Corps uniform curator Owen L. Conner, the Bowers Board and the FBI determined that the pictured individual is wearing his utility jacket over his field jacket. Cropped detail of Joseph J. Rosenthal photograph, courtesy the Associated Press cation. Fortunately, Gagnon's assigned duty as the battalion runner for Company E augments the photographic record by providing valuable clues into his movements and actions on Mount Suribachi that day. Former 2d Battalion, 28th Marines' adjutant G. Greeley Wells emphasized this aspect of Gagnon's battlefield experience in a letter to the New York Times, published 17 October 1991: "Rene Gagnon was in the [Rosenthal] picture because of his mission and returned the first flag to me. It was put in our company safe and we all went about the grim business of securing Iwo."29 Despite Wells' assertion that the New Hampshire Marine is "in the picture," his statement indicates that Gagnon, as a messenger, would have shifted his focus to the mission of retrieving and returning the first flag immediately following the successful delivery of the second. This shift in priorities is wholly consistent with his participation in lowering the first flagpole and reaching for the smaller banner as depicted in Campbell's photograph. Additionally, the equipment worn by the Marine in question is in keeping with a battalion runner, whose dangerous and repeated crossings to the front lines necessitated a lighter load. Notably, the individual is carrying a Ka-Bar fighting knife on his utility belt, as Gagnon was known to have done. Gagnon's absence in the Gung Ho photograph further suggests that he already may have been on his way back to the command post with the first flag in hand. Moreover, the individual bears a striking resemblance to Gagnon. In the photographic evidence supplied to the Marine Corps, Foley, Spence, and Westemeyer observed that the mole on Gagnon's right cheek appears to be in the exact position near the Marine's cheekbone and nose in the Campbell photograph. Although the FBI was not able to verify the presence of a mole due to the lack of resolution at the film's grain level, a visual comparison of the smoking Marine and Gagnon posing for sculptor Felix de Weldon show remarkable similarities of the nose and chin in profile. For these reasons, the Bowers Board determined limited-to-strong support that the flag-lowering subject in Campbell's photograph is Private First Class Rene Gagnon.

In June 2019, the Bowers Board briefed its findings to senior Marine Corps leadership. Striving for the utmost historical accuracy and thoroughness in the investigation, Headquarters Marine Corps directed an external review of the panel's conclusions. Robertson packaged the board's report and all supporting evidence for delivery to Jon Hoffman, chief historian at the U.S. Army Center of Military History, who performed a meticulous peer review on behalf of his organization. On 12 July 2019, the Center of Military History validated the findings of the board.

#### CONCLUSION

With the historical and photographic analyses and corresponding identification of the flag raisers complete, the remaining mystery is why Corporal Keller and Private First Class Schultz, both of whom survived the war, chose to remain mostly silent about their presence in Rosenthal's photograph. The reasons are elusive. We do know, however, that reticence among the flag raisers was the norm. Perhaps the best-known anecdote in this regard is the allegation that Hayes threatened Gagnon with bodily harm in an effort to keep his participation a secret.<sup>30</sup>

Harold Schultz was severely wounded on 13 March 1945 and medically evacuated from the island. As a result, he was not on the ship USS *Winged Arrow* (AP 170) when First Sergeant Daskalakis tried to identify the flag raisers to send back to the United States. Originally from

#### SUMMARY OF FINDINGS



#### Position 1 Corporal Harlon H. Block

No new evidence or recent allegations contradict Block being the Marine in position 1. To the contrary, the FBI's identification of Block in the *Gung Ho* photograph reinforced the conclusions of the 1947 del Valle Board and 2016 Huly Panel. Furthermore, his presence in the Joseph Rosenthal photograph is consistent with being part of the same squad as Sergeant Michael Strank and Privates First Class Ira Hayes and Franklin Sousley. No evidence suggests that Block is not the individual pictured at the base of the flagpole.

#### Position 2 Corporal Harold P. Keller

When Private Robert R. Campbell's photographs of the second flag were enlarged, startling detail emerged. But detail alone does not result in identification as attribution requires comparison to a known person. In this case, a visual comparison with Army Private First Class George Burns' photographs and AP photographer Joe Rosenthal's *Gung Ho* photograph, in which Corporal Keller is identified, proved crucial to the Bowers Board's deliberations. Facial similarities combined with the creases formed by the double bandoleers in the Marine's utility coat, along with the distinctive folds and camouflage pattern of his M1 helmet cover, formed individual characteristics that permitted a positive identification of Corporal Harold Keller as the Marine in position 2. His presence in the photograph was further reinforced in a letter postmarked 31 March 1945 that stated: "Had a letter from Ruby Keller [Keller's wife]. She said Harold helped plant the flag on Mt. Suribachi, so he felt quite a thrill over that."

#### Position 3 Private First Class Franklin R. Sousley

No new evidence or recent allegations contradict the Huly Panel's conclusion that Private First Class Sousley is the Marine in position 3. The camouflage pattern on his helmet cover, the positioning of his soft cap under his helmet, creases in his clothing, and his equipment, especially the telephone lineman's pouch hooked to his utility belt, can be seen in both the *Gung Ho* photograph, where he has been previously identified, and in Rosenthal's flag-raising and flagpole-steadying photographs. Moreover, his presence in the iconic photograph is consistent with being a member of the same squad as Sergeant Strank, Corporal Block, and Private First Class Hayes.

#### Position 4 Sergeant Michael Strank

Strank's participation in the second flag raising has long been rooted in the eyewitness statements of Pharmacist's Mate Second Class John H. Bradley and Privates First Class Rene A. Gagnon and Ira H. Hayes. The primary challenge of identifying the Marine in position 4 is that he is mostly hidden from view in both Rosenthal's flag-raising and flagpole-steadying photographs. Although some of the individual's face is visible in Sergeant William H. Genaust's film, the low resolution does not allow for a positive identification. The motion picture footage does reveal that the person is wearing a soft cap with a distinct curve to the bill, however. For the Bowers Board, the key to identifying the individual was the atypical way he is wearing his utility coat over his field jacket. Other identifying features included a watch on his left wrist, the absence of a ring on his left hand, and discoloration on his trousers. Strank can be seen exhibiting these particularities of uniform and appearance in the Gung Ho photographs, although the presence of a wristwatch cannot be confirmed due to his sleeve length. The sergeant's presence in the Rosenthal photograph is consistent with his role as the squad leader of the patrol whose other members included Corporal Block and Privates First Class Hayes and Sousley.

#### Position 5 Private First Class Harold H. Schultz No new evidence or recent allegations contradict Schultz be-

Detroit, Schultz moved to Los Angeles after the war and joined the U.S. Postal Service, eventually retiring in 1981. He lived a quiet life and married Rita Reyes sometime in his sixties. His stepdaughter, Dezreen MacDowell, later recounted to *Time* magazine that, several years before his death in 1995, he mentioned in passing that he "was one of the flag-raisers on Mt. Suribachi." She replied, "My God, Harold, you were a hero." To which he said, "No, not really, I was a Marine."<sup>31</sup>

Harold Keller likewise maintained a low profile with regard to the flag raising. He mentioned his participation to loved ones shortly after the event but kept silent later in life. In late May 2019, after the Bowers Board had concluded its deliberations, Keller's daughter ing the Marine in position 5. The Bowers Board's conclusion, which confirmed Schultz's role as a second flag raiser, was based on the camouflage pattern of his helmet cover, the broken helmet liner strap that dangles on the left side of his head, and the fact that his rifle sling is attached to the stacking swivel instead of the sling swivel. These characteristics are clearly visible in the *Gung Ho* photographs, where Schultz is identified as the Marine kneeling next to Corporal Keller, as well as in Genaust's motion picture footage and Rosenthal's iconic photograph. In its review of all of the photographs known to have been taken on Mount Suribachi that day, the board did not find any other Marine exhibiting both a broken helmet liner strap and a rifle sling attached to the stacking swivel.

#### Position 6 Private First Class Ira H. Hayes

The FBI positively identified Private First Class Hayes as the individual in position 6. The conclusion was based on multiple similarities in the camouflage pattern on his helmet cover. Hayes also carried an M1 carbine as opposed the more prevalent M1 Garand rifle used by Marines on the summit. Additionally, as one of the few Native Americans on Mount Suribachi that day, Hayes is distinguishable in still photographs and motion picture footage based on his skin tone. Moreover, his presence in the Rosenthal photograph is consistent with being part of the same squad as Sergeant Strank, Corporal Block, and Private First Class Sousley.

discovered a letter written by a family friend postmarked 31 March 1945 that said, "Had a letter from Ruby Keller [Keller's wife]. She said Harold helped plant the flag on Mt. Suribachi, so he felt quite a thrill over that" (figure 13.15). Keller had apparently written to his wife Ruby from Iwo Jima and mentioned his participation in the flag raising. He never shared this information with his children, however.<sup>32</sup> Additionally, there is no record that he shared this information when First Sergeant Daskalakis tried to identify the flag raisers while embarked on the Winged Arrow. After leaving Iwo Jima, Keller turned down an officer's commission and returned to his hometown of Brooklyn, Iowa, where he resided until his death on 13 March 1979.

t 1120, Z b To the U. Z op è do Ybe Z l it it b 20 11 to

#### FIGURE 13.15

After the Bowers Board concluded its deliberations, the author received a phone call from Kay Keller Maurer about correspondence written by a family friend during the war. The letter, dated 31 March 1945, states that Cpl Harold Keller had recently written to his wife and mentioned his participation in the Iwo Jima flag raising Courtesy Kay Keller Maurer

Neither Schultz nor Keller publicly disputed the official Marine Corps record nor did they seek fame. As veterans of the battle who understood the context of the flag raising, it could be that they did not want to be lionized for raising a replacement flag. Indeed, the answer may lie in the words of former Corporal Charles W. Lindberg, who manned a flamethrower and helped raise the first flag atop Mount Suribachi on 23 February 1945. Lindberg explained, "Every man that went ashore at Iwo, and every man at sea, raised that flag—every one of us. We carried it up there, and we had our hands on the pole, but all of you here raised it, and most of all, the men who didn't come back they all raised it."<sup>33</sup>

#### ENDNOTES

- Telegraph, 30 March 1945, as quoted in Parker Bishop Albee Jr. and Keller Cushing Freeman, *Shadow of Suribachi: Raising the Flags on Iwo Jima* (Westport, CT: Praeger, 1995), 96. For a transcript of the del Valle Board's report, see appendix A.
- Gen Alexander A. Vandegrift to Henry T. Hansen, dated 15 January 1947, del Valle Board Report, Marine Corps History Division, Quantico, VA.
- 3. For a detailed overview of the Huly Panel proceedings, see Mary Reinwald's chapter in this volume. The panel's reports can be found in appendices B and C.
- 4. At the time of the Huly Panel proceedings, there was no indication that PFC Schultz had ever divulged his participation in the second flag raising to a friend or family member; however, after the Marine Corps released the findings of the board, Schultz's stepdaughter Dezreen McDowell stated that he had mentioned it to her once in passing. See Tom Bowman, "Marine Corps Misidentified Man in Iconic Photo," *All Things Considered*, NPR, 24 June 2016.
- The Bowers Board retained the position numbers used by the Huly Panel in its identification of Marines in Rosenthal's photograph.
- 6. See, for example, Eric Hammel, Two Flags over Iwo Jima: Solving the Mystery of the U.S. Marine Corps' Proudest Moment (Philadelphia, PA: Casemate, 2018); Richard Wheeler, The Bloody Battle of Suribachi: The Amazing Story of Iwo Jima that Inspired Flags of Our Fathers (New York: Skyhorse Publishing, 2007); Derrick Wright, The Battle for Iwo Jima, 1945 (Gloucestershire, UK: Sutton Publishing, 2003); and Lt John Keith Wells, "Give Me 50 Marines Not Afraid to Die": Iwo Jima (Abilene, TX: Ka-Well Enterprises, 1995).
- 7. MajGen Orlo K. Steele, USMC (Ret), to LtGen Jan Huly, USMC (Ret), email correspondence, 20 July 2018.
- Kay Keller Maurer, telephone conversation with the author, August 2018.
- 9. Margery Wheeler Mattox, telephone conversation with the author, August 2018.
- 10. Harold P. Keller, oral history recording, 1978, Richard Wheeler Papers, private collection.
- 11. Mary Jo Thompson, telephone and Facetime communication with the author, 24 September 2018.
- James G. Zigler, Stanley Walfor, Dale Lippincott, Darrel Dyer, and Dean Montgomery, phone conversations with the author, September 2018.

- MajGen P. H. Torrey, commanding general, Marine Barracks Quantico, VA, directive dated 17 September 1945, Harold P. Keller Scrapbook, private collection.
- Rene Gagnon Jr., email correspondence with author, 9 October 2018.
- Despite repeated attempts to reach him, Rene Gagnon Jr. did not respond to follow-up emails or phone calls from myself or other representatives of the U.S. Marine Corps.
- G. Greeley Wells, interview with Parker Bishop Albee Jr. and Keller Cushing Freeman, 15 October 1992.
- Oral History Collection, Marine Corps History Division, Quantico, VA.
- Phil Ward, "Phil Ward Interview, WWII," interviewed by Robert Wernle, Montgomery County Historical Society, 17 April 1991.
- 19. Wells, "Give Me 50 Marines Not Afraid to Die."
- Joseph Rosenthal with W. C. Heinz, "The Picture that Will Live Forever," *Collier's*, 18 February1955, 6.
- Brian K. Brooks, "Iwo Jima Flag Raising Analyses" (unpublished report, Digital Evidence Laboratory, FBI, 1 February 2019), 7.
- 22. This calculation includes the Company E patrol led by 1stLt Harold G. Schrier, the Company F patrol led by Capt Arthur H. Naylor Jr., combat cameramen, the Navy chaplain, and his assistant.
- 23. This image is actually printed in reverse, as the mole appears to be on Gagnon's left check in the photograph.
- 24. The scholarly literature records two possible motivations for the replacement flag: 1) to install a larger flag that would be more readily visible to troops fighting elsewhere on the island, and 2) to return the first flag to Secretary Forrestal, who allegedly desired the banner as a personal souvenir.
- James Bradley with Ron Powers, *Flags of Our Fathers* (New York: Bantam, 2000), 209.
- Bernard C. Nalty and Danny J. Crawford, *The United States Marines on Iwo Jima: The Battle and the Flag Raisings* (Washington, DC: History and Museums Division, Headquarters Marine Corps, 1995), 8.
- The Oath, directed by Dusan Hudec, aired at Embassy of the Slovak Republic in Washington, DC, on 8 November 2018, 58:30 min.
- 28. Wells, "Give Me 50 Marines Not Afraid to Die," 158.
- G. Greeley Wells, "The Man Who Carried the Flag at Iwo Jima," *New York Times*, 17 October 1991.
- 30. Albee and Parker, Shadow of Suribachi, 99.
- 31. Olivia B. Waxman, "The Man Who's Really in that Iconic Iwo Jima Photo," *Time*, 24 June 2016.
- Albert and Velma Ward to PFC Albert E. Ward Jr., 31 March 1945, private collection, Michel Ward, Gilman, IA.
- 33. Cpl Charles Lindberg as quoted in Fred Haynes and James A. Warren, *The Lions of Iwo Jima: The Story of Com*bat Team 28 and the Bloodiest Battle in Marine Corps History (New York: Henry Holt, 2008), 134.

## PART FOUR Legacy

A wounded Marine seeks out graves of his dead comrades after the dedication of the 4th Marine Division cemetery on Iwo Jima, 15 March 1945.

Official U.S. Marine Corps photo, courtesy Kress, Library of Congress



# CHAPTER I

### EVERY MARINE A FLAG RAISER The Legacy and Meaning of the Iwo Jima Flag Raisings

by Breanne Robertson, PhD, and Paul Westermeyer

On 23 February 1945, Associated Press photographer Joseph Rosenthal snapped a photograph of six Marines raising the American flag during the Battle of Iwo Jima. The image circulated in magazines and newspapers, became the signature image on war bond posters and postage stamps, and was even awarded the Pulitzer Prize. Rosenthal's photograph retained its iconic status after the war through a continuous process of reproduction and satire. From sculptor Felix de Weldon's monumental rendition of the scene in the Marine Corps War Memorial to modern graphic T-shirt designs and searing political cartoons, the flag raising at Iwo Jima has served as a cultural model upon which Marines and U.S. citizens alike have inscribed, revised, and debated the performance of patriotic citizenship.

Yet, an inherent tension resides between the image's malleable agency as a cultural model and its historical specificity as a visual artifact of war. In 2016, the U.S. Marine Corps undertook an official review of the evidence and concluded that the long-accepted roster of flag-raising participants was incorrect. Pharmacist's Mate Second Class John H. Bradley had been erroneously identified in Rosenthal's photograph. The investigation determined that a previously unidentified Marine, Private First Class Harold H. Schultz, was pictured in the iconic scene instead. Three years later, the Corps conducted another investigation into the identification of the flag raisers. Photographic evidence again revealed an error in attribution. Private First Class Rene A. Gagnon, long believed to be depicted on the far side of the flagpole, was absent from Rosenthal's famous image. The Marine Corps, with assistance from the FBI's Digital Evidence Laboratory, recognized another Marine, Corporal Harold P. Keller, as a key participant in the storied event. To what extent have these factual corrections undermined or rewritten the symbolic capital assigned to Rosenthal's famous image? By foregrounding empirical evidence after decades of accumulated lore and meaning, has the recent scrutiny given to the individual flag raisers diminished the scene's emotional and rhetorical resonance?

#### A PROMISE OF VICTORY

Although it may sound odd, given the stature of Rosenthal's photograph in the history of American war imagery, the flag raising atop Mount Suribachi was not a heroic act in itself. It was a minor event during a fierce battle, and the Marines who carried the flag up that hill and attached it to a piece of discarded Japanese pipe were merely fulfilling an assigned task, doing a duty. A duty that was, by the standards of the Pacific War, mundane and unremarkable.<sup>1</sup> Mere days into the month-long fight for the Japanese island of Iwo Jima, U.S. commanders ordered a platoon of Marines to ascend Mount Suribachi, the highest point on the island, and plant the American flag on its summit. Such a visible marker of American progress was intended to lift morale and harden resolve of the men on the ground, where the most difficult fighting lay in the days and weeks ahead. The Marines had anticipated a treacherous climb-Mount Suribachi remained a live threat-but the patrol encountered little resistance during their ascent. Upon reaching the crest of the volcano, they established a security perimeter, stuck a couple of flags on a prominent point, and returned to the battle (figure 14.1).

The likelihood of any patrol being enshrined in the historical memory of the Corps let alone the entire nation—is exceedingly small. And yet, this is exactly what happened for a group of Marines on 23 February 1945, as their simple act of raising aloft the American flag found purchase in Rosenthal's remarkable photograph. Within days, the image became a media sensation on the home front. In a matter of weeks, the scene transcended its battlefield context to embody the will and hope of the nation.<sup>2</sup> But the power of the photograph does not come from any unique bravery exhibited on the hill that day or from the presumed strategic importance of the event; its visual and emotional impact derives instead from its framing, its composition, and the anonymity of the six figures, whose faces turn away from the viewer so that they stand not for themselves or for individual glory but for every soldier, sailor, airman, and Marine who struggled, sweated, and bled during the Pacific War.

In contrast to the triumphant tenor of Rosenthal's photograph, the flag raising scarcely denoted the pacification of Mount Suribachi, let alone the entire island. Public perceptions of the image as an emblem of ultimate victory emerged on the U.S. home front, far from the remote Pacific island where the flag raising took place and long before the outcome of the battle had been decided. It is practically guaranteed that, even as that flag was being raised, servicemen locked in deadly strife were going beyond the call of duty elsewhere on Iwo Jima. Some were dying; men whose names we will never know were making the supreme sacrifice. Even on the summit, the battle went on. As the chapters in this volume by Stephen Foley, Dustin Spence, and Melissa Renn make clear, the prize-winning photograph did not capture the only or even the first American flag to be raised on the summit that day.3 Earlier that morning, First Lieutenant Harold G. Schrier and five members of his patrol had forged a makeshift flagpole from Japanese pipe and embedded the heavy staff in the volcanic soil. The American flag whipping in the breeze was an impressive sight for the servicemen fighting on Iwo Jima, apparently triggering an emotional response from Americans and Japanese alike. Within minutes of planting the first flag, the Marines encountered enemy resistance from Japanese soldiers who had been concealed in nearby caves. The Americans swiftly put down the attack, but the skirmish demonstrated the



#### FIGURE 14.1

SSgt Meyers A. Cornelius captured a photograph of Marines looking over the entrance to a Japanese cave as part of the mopping-up operations that occurred after the first flag raising on Mount Suribachi. The American flag can be seen flying on the high ground of the summit in the distance. Official U.S. Marine Corps photo, courtesy of SSgt Meyers A. Cornelius, National Archives and Records Administration

need for constant vigilance and a more thorough operation of mopping-up. Yet, even after *Life* magazine published Staff Sergeant Louis R. Lowery's picture of the first flag-raising event alongside Rosenthal's image in March 1945, the formal precision and emotional weight of the latter eclipsed the circumstances surrounding its capture. For a war-weary public in the states, it did not matter that the Marines were raising a replacement banner; the scene resonated with Americans far from the Pacific battleground, supplying in concrete visual terms the promise of Allied victory and an ultimate end to the war.

Interpretation and framing of its message began almost immediately, as the U.S. government leveraged the popularity and visual power of the photograph to bolster public morale. Deployed strategically in the public sphere, the flag-raising imagery performed a rhetorical function that imbued it with symbolic associations extending well beyond the historical constraints of the battlefield. The citizenry embraced the snapshot, filtered through mass-media and government news outlets, as an embodiment of soldierly unity and valor. The dramatic image represented the long struggle of the Pacific War, and the surviving Marines presumed to be in Rosenthal's photograph were sent on the Seventh War Loan drive. Reinforcing long-held mythologies about American warfare, the flag raising ostensibly confirmed an idealized national self-image and rekindled expectations for an approaching victorious end to the war. Additionally, its projected heroism confirmed for viewers their belief that U.S. servicemen always fight for a just cause and in a virtuous manner. This culturally preferred mode of interpreting U.S. warfare provided a particular framework for seeing the image. It also came with predetermined notions of heroism and valor.

#### THE RAISERS AS ROLE MODELS

The Iwo Jima flag-raising image derives power from more than its formal beauty; it conveys the struggle and ultimate victory of U.S. Marines who would play a critical role in bringing the war to an end less than six months later. As incidental heroes-that is, ordinary Americans whose collective effort produced a specific moment of national achievement-the men provide a malleable surface for the articulation of these ideals. The instant celebrity and veneration given to the flag raisers illustrates the immense emotional need Rosenthal's photograph fulfilled for anxious civilians at home. Touted as heroes, the flag raisers commenced a nationwide tour as living embodiments of Admiral Chester W. Nimitz's tribute to those who served on Iwo Jima: "uncommon valor was a common virtue" (figure 14.2).<sup>4</sup> Privates First Class Rene A. Gagnon and Ira H. Hayes and Pharmacist's Mate Second Class John H. Bradley became household names, as did those of their fallen comrades Sergeants Michael Strank and Henry O. Hansen and Private First Class Franklin R. Sousley, whose gold-star mothers made public appearances in support of the loan drive.

Pulled from battle and thrust into the limelight, each man was elevated to the status of a cultural figure, a model worthy of admiration and emulation. The public demand was not easy for the men, especially Hayes, who felt tremendous guilt about leaving his brothers-in-arms while the battle still raged.<sup>5</sup> But it is important to recognize that the cultural import of these men was derived from their ability to embody a set of abstracted values in pictorial form, not from their personal actions on or off the battlefield.

Arising from an actual historical event, the Iwo Jima photograph and its roster of participants became subjected to mass-mediated modes of remembering and understanding the war. In 1949, the event was dramatized in a film starring John Wayne, and in 1954, it was cast in bronze as a colossal statue for the United States Marine Corps War Memorial next to Arlington National Cemetery.<sup>6</sup> The combination of visual attributes and symbolic connotations transmuted the historical referents within the picture frame, causing the anecdotal qualities of the scene to become subsumed by its rhetorical fiction.

The visual tableau—featuring servicemembers from all corners of the United States and of varying ethnic backgrounds—enacts a slippage of meaning in which the figures become abstracted embodiments of the national body politic through their collective action.<sup>7</sup> With faces obscured, the anonymous Marines permit an interpretive elision that substitutes the common soldier in place of the specific individuals. Additionally, because they are en-



#### FIGURE 14.2

In this promotional image for the Seventh War Loan drive, PhM2c John H. Bradley poses with the campaign poster bearing C. C. Beall's rendering of Joe Rosenthal's famous picture of the second flag raising. Bradley sustained shrapnel wounds in both legs during the Battle of Iwo Jima and was evacuated for medical care. Still undergoing treatment at the Bethesda Naval Hospital in April 1945, Bradley can be seen using crutches for support. Official U.S. Marine Corps photo, courtesy of Sgt Mario Woodallen, National Archives and Records Administration

gaged in civic ritual—a flag raising—rather than combat, these ordinary actors provide a rhetorical bridge uniting military and civilian, battlefield and home front. As models for ideal civic behavior—a connection made explicit as Marines and civilians appeared interchangeably during the war loan drive—the men transcend their denotative representation in the photograph and emerge as free-floating signifiers within this larger cultural discourse.<sup>8</sup> Consequently, during the war, the flagmen came to stand for the Greatest Generation, a fictional construct of the American body politic whose attendant associations of unity, resolve, and ultimate victory have served as a touchstone for subsequent generations.

If the Iwo Jima flag raising looms large in American cultural memory writ large, it holds particular potency as an emblem of patriotism and heroism among military personnel. As the primary motif driving the Seventh War Loan campaign, the Marine Corps War Memorial, and the National Museum of the Marine Corps, the multifigure scene has become nearly synonymous with the U.S. Marine Corps. More than offering a universally admired and recognizable brand image for the Service, the flag raising has become integral to Marine Corps identity to such a degree that generations of Marines have striven to emulate the iconic moment in nearly every clime and place.

Even before the Second World War ended, the Marine Corps-much like the nation for which it fought-recognized the enduring power of Rosenthal's flag-raising image. Chapters in this volume by scholars Kate Clarke Lemay and David W. Mills demonstrate two instances in the immediate postwar period when the Corps leveraged the fame and popularity of the photograph to advance its cause in remaining an autonomous military Service.9 While the very midcentury survival of the Marine Corps depended on the effective deployment of evocative battlefield imagery to civilians and government officials, military leaders also crafted a cultural curriculum around the flag raising for dissemination among its own ranks. Many recruits arrived at boot camp with images of the Iwo Jima flag raising dancing in their heads, and the Marine Corps obliged by adding the event to the canon of inspirational legends and myths taught during Basic Training. Once the flag raisers entered Marine Corps lore, they, too, became battlefield heroes worthy of emulation.

In 1954, shortly after the Korean War ended, the U.S. Marine Corps War Memorial was dedicated in Arlington Ridge, Virginia. The monumental statue garnered national attention, serving as a prominent and permanent reminder of one of the Corps' proudest events. Enshrined in bronze, the Iwo Jima flag raising assumed its place alongside hallowed battles such as Belleau Wood as a defining moment for



#### FIGURE 14.3

The Battle of Iwo Jima has often surfaced in unexpected corners of American culture. This toy solider set depicting the battle was produced in the early 1960s by Louis Marx and Company. Similar sets were produced into the late 1970s, and even today, the battle and its iconic flag raising remain a popular subject for toy soldier enthusiasts and war gamers alike. Courtesy Hakes.com

the Corps. Moreover, Marines continued to be influenced by *Sands of Iwo Jima* (1949), which not only featured cameo appearances of the surviving flag raisers but also enjoyed a long shelf life, playing beyond its initial release and existing in numerous television reruns. Reverence for the flag raising persisted well into the 1960s, when aspiring Marines played with Marx Miniature "Sands of Iwo Jima" toy sets long before they embarked on their formal military careers and ventured off to boot camp (figure 14.3). With the iconic scene at the forefront of Marine Corps identity, both imagined and real, it was only natural that subsequent generations of Marines would aspire to recreate the flag-raising event and potentially elevate their own names to the pantheon of Marine Corps lore.<sup>10</sup>

Recreating the iconic flag-raising moment required a set of circumstances that were difficult to duplicate, however. The Battle of Iwo Jima took place near the end of a long, hardfought campaign across the Pacific Ocean and against a determined foe. In December 1941, Imperial Japanese forces had initiated the fight against the United States by attacking Pearl Harbor without first declaring war. As a conventional conflict carried out on a large scale and against a peer nation, the Second World War elicited little moral ambiguity among either deployed combatants or civilians in the states. In contrast, the global conflicts in which Marines fought after World War II appeared disproportionately one-sided, against opponents whose military forces could not accurately be considered on par with the U.S. military. Rather than conducting offensive actions against a dangerous foe, as it had in the Pacific theater, the United States regularly performed defensive actions and counterinsurgency campaigns against guerrillas and terrorist organizations in territories belonging to our allies. A triumphant raising of the American flag over regions governed by friendly nations, even in the context of a coordinated battle, simply looked bad.

The Marine propensity for emulating the Iwo Jima flag raising was amply illustrated in the landing at Inchon and the Battle of Seoul during the Korean War. To the American servicemen on the ground, the circumstances of the campaign closely mirrored Iwo Jima and its signature flag raising. Months earlier, North Korean forces had invaded South Korea with no warning. The ensuing war was a conventional conflict, with professional soldiers fighting one another, and the North Korean Army was a credible foe. Under United Nations Supreme Commander Douglas MacArthur, the U.S.-led United Nations force successfully executed a surprise amphibious landing at Inchon on the west coast of Korea and pressed inland to recover the South Korean capital of Seoul, which had fallen to the North Koreans earlier in the summer during a string of humiliating defeats pushing the Allies to the Pusan Perimeter, a defensive line in the southeastern corner of the peninsula.<sup>11</sup>

With its dramatic coastal invasion and seizure of the capital, Marines envisioned this campaign as the dramatic climax of the peninsular conflict and, hence, an opportunity ripe for a Suribachi-esque flag raising. In fact, Colonel Lewis B. Puller, then-commander of the 1st Marine Regiment, ordered that the first of his units to seize an objective within the city limits of Seoul raise an American flag. Fulfilling Puller's directive, Captain Robert H. Barrow's Company A, 1st Battalion, 1st Marines, dutifully planted the U.S. banner atop Hill 79. The event was meaningful for the servicemen, who had endured a tense river crossing to reach the site, and legendary Life magazine photographer David Douglas Duncan captured the scene for posterity (figure 14.4). Even so, the symbolic claim staking was premature. As even Captain Barrow admitted, "Putting the flag on a bamboo pole over a peasant's house on the edge of Seoul does not constitute retaking the city."12

Appropriate or not, the feat established the 1st Marines in Corps memory. It also launched a friendly rivalry to see which regiment—the 1st Marines or the 5th Marines—would ultimately raise the flag marking the true liberation of Seoul. Two days later, the 5th Marines tore down the North Korean flags flying over the Seoul government compound and raised the American flag in their stead. Meanwhile, the 1st Marines fought its way into the French, Soviet Union, and United States embassies and prominently displayed U.S. flags therein to signify their recovery from North Korean control.<sup>13</sup> The diplomatic faux pas of mounting the American colors on buildings belonging to sovereign, allied nations requires no further explanation, and indeed, the exuberance and single-mindedness of the Marines who carried out these actions inspired one of the many apocryphal tales attached to Puller. Reacting to the spate of flag raisings in Seoul, an Army officer from X Corps headquarters reportedly growled at Puller, "Ever since that flag-raising on Iwo Jima, I'm convinced that a Marine had rather carry a flag than a weapon." In reply, the legendary Marine officer quipped: "Not a bad idea. A man with a flag in his pack and a desire to put it on an enemy strongpoint isn't likely to bug out."14 His was a pointed response; the U.S. Army was still smarting over allegations that soldiers had fled or surrendered too easily during the initial North Korean invasion across the 38th parallel.<sup>15</sup>

More than merely being an opportune jab at a sister Service, Puller's remark also provides insight into the standing order that had instigated the "flag race." The commander rightly anticipated that the prospect of another famous raising would inspire his Marines to fight harder and faster in pursuit of the legendary status awarded to the Iwo Jima event and its patrol members. Despite their best efforts, none of flag-raising events during the Battle of Seoul produced an image as memorable as the Rosenthal photograph. And while the Inchon/Seoul campaign remains an important episode in



#### FIGURE 14.4

David Douglas Duncan's photograph of the flag raising at Hill 79 appeared in This Is War!: A Photo-Narrative in Three Parts (1951), a compilation of the documentary war imagery he produced in the first few months of the Korean War while working as a war correspondent for Life. The caption accompanying the photograph reads: "Men of Captain [Robert H.] Bob Barrow's company raised a small American flag over the highest rooftop upon the highest hill [in Seoul] but even as it was tied into place the sound of firing down the hill attracted their attention . . . and the flag-raising became just a statement of fact—a minor incident in another day [in Korea, September 1950.]" David Douglas Duncan © Photography Collection,

Harry Ransom Center, University of Texas at Austin

Marine Corps history, the iconic, reputationmaking moment of the Korean War emerged not through a triumphant flag raising over newly liberated territory, but rather through the dogged advance of frozen Marines—refusing to give in to superior odds, carrying their dead and wounded to safety—as they fought through the Chinese and North Korean forces encircling them in Changjin (Chosin) Reservoir's snowy mountain passes.

In subsequent decades, the World War



#### FIGURE 14.5

Troops pass in formation past the Marine Corps War Memorial during ceremonies marking the 183d birthday of the Marine Corps, 10 November 1958. The Marine Corps has hosted a weekly Sunset Parade at the memorial every summer since 1956. The parade is always extremely well attended. Official U.S. Marine Corps photo, courtesy of SSgt Shkymba, National Archives and Records Administration

II flag raising remained an iconic emblem in Marine Corps history and culture. Following a tradition began in September 1956, the Marine Corps Drum & Bugle Corps and the Silent Drill Platoon delivered weekly musical and marching performances on the grounds of the Marine Corps War Memorial. The Sunset Parades took place at dusk in the summer months and further elevated the flag-raising scene as a sacred backdrop for ritual performance in the civil religion of the Corps (figure 14.5).<sup>16</sup> Beyond the nation's capital, Marines enjoyed few opportunities to reenact Iwo Jima's dramatic flag raising. Perhaps in response to the unchecked practice of displaying the American flag during the Korean conflict, the Marine Corps issued a standing order forbidding dramatic raisings in Vietnam.<sup>17</sup> U.S. forces had deployed to Indochina to provide aid to the South Vietnamese people, not to claim portions of the beleaguered peninsula on behalf of the United States as planting American flags on local mountain tops would suggest. When U.S. commanders felt that a ceremonial flag raising was required, they ordered the South Vietnamese colors be hoisted as the multilateral engagement was taking place in that country's jurisdiction. The majority of fighting did not encourage such symbolic acts, however. Characterized by brief, fierce ambushes, sniper attacks, and random shelling, the day-to-day tactical experience of counterinsurgency was neither as clearly defined nor as dramatic as the capture of Mount Suribachi during the Battle of Iwo Jima.

Throughout the 1970s and 1980s, peacekeeping and humanitarian relief operations precluded nationalist displays of territorial conquest. Combat engagements, meanwhile, were generally of short duration and hardly approached the renown of such fabled battles as Guadalcanal, Chosin, or Iwo Jima. The loss of the Iranian embassy in the spring of 1980 and the fatal bombing of Marine barracks in Beirut during the Lebanese Civil War represented the confusing, unconventional warscape the Corps now operated in; triumphant flag raisings were obsolete.<sup>18</sup>

During the Gulf War in 1990–91, many in the United States tried to recapture World War II-era feelings and symbolism. The Iraqi conflict represented the first time in decades that U.S. forces had deployed for a conventional combat engagement against regular armies, and the heavily televised war inspired a surge of patriotic euphoria on the home front. Following the quick, decisive victory of Operation Desert Storm, President George H. W. Bush declared that the "specter of Vietnam has been buried forever in the desert sands of the Arabian Peninsula."<sup>19</sup> Such self-congratulatory statements lost their luster, however, as live reporting revealed how severely lopsided the campaign proved to be. Masses of surrendering Iraqi soldiers did not present a muscular backdrop for history making.<sup>20</sup>

On 11 September 2001 (9/11), the method and scope of modern American warfare changed forever. The devastating terrorist attacks on the World Trade Center in New York City and the Pentagon in Washington, DC, shocked and mobilized the American citizenry, which had not experienced a foreign attack on domestic soil since World War II. United through grief and a fierce resolve for retribution, the nation was once again in need of an emotional salve. Standing amid the wreckage of the twin towers, a trio of first responders raised the American flag-a demonstrable act of patriotism, hope, and defiance in the wake of tragedy. The resulting photograph resonated with viewers and circulated widely in the weeks following the attacks (figure 14.6). With its small group of uniformed men working together to hoist the American colors, the scene bears more than a passing resemblance to Rosenthal's battlefield image.<sup>21</sup>

The 9/11 terrorist attacks incited a widespread call for justice, which many defined as military retribution against al-Qaeda and other nongovernment actors who had plotted the event. Within days, Congress passed a resolution authorizing the use of military force against various terrorist factions, including the Taliban and al-Qaeda. Marines were more determined than ever to manufacture their own piece of history, but the ensuing wars in Afghanistan and Iraq were unsuited to dramatic raisings of the American flag. Such displays only served to alienate the Afghan and Iraqi peoples, whom the United States was struggling to win over during its counterterrorist operations. In Iraq, where the United States was attempting to overthrow the government of Saddam Hussein



FIGURE 14.6 First published in The Record (Bergen County, NJ) on 12 September 2001, Thomas Franklin's photograph "Raising the Flag at Ground Zero" shows three firefighters raising the American flag at Ground Zero following the terrorist attacks on 11 September 2001. Thomas E. Franklin © 2001, The Record (Bergen County, NJ)

without provoking a mass uprising of the Iraqi people, American troops were forbidden from making displays of triumphalism, especially involving the U.S. flag.

It happened anyway. On 9 April 2003, when Marines advanced into Baghdad and were ordered to secure buildings in the center of downtown, they encountered a large crowd of Iraqi civilians at the Firdos Square traffic circle where a large statue of Hussein had been erected. The Marines and Iraqis worked together to bring the statue down, eventually using an M88A2 Hercules armored recovery vehicle.<sup>22</sup> One of the American crew climbed the vehicle's A-frame boom and draped an American flag over the fallen statue's head, a disrespectful gesture captured on film by the many journal-



FIGURE 14.7 A U.S. Marine covers the face of a statue depicting Iraqi President Saddam Hussein with an American flag in Baghdad, Iraq, on 9 April 2003. The gesture was quickly reversed and an Iraqi flag replaced the American flag instead. Courtesy Tim McLaughlin, 1st Marine Division

ists present for the event (figure 14.7). When the Iraqi civilians called for an Iraqi flag to be displayed instead, the Marines swiftly corrected course and replaced the U.S. flag with the Iraqi banner.<sup>23</sup> Unfortunately for the American servicemembers, the damage was already done. Photograph after photograph showed Marines committing political iconoclasm as well as a nationalist claim staked on foreign soil. Long after the widely publicized event, some of the Iraqi participants would even express regret for the toppling.<sup>24</sup>

#### LEGACY AND MEANING

Despite the periodic controversy surrounding international incidents like the Firdos Square flag raising, the iconic scene of six Marines



FIGURE 14.8

The most distinctive feature of the National Museum of the Marine Corps is its skylight; the long-span roof and the mast that extends above it recall the 45-degree angle of the flagpole, famously captured by Associated Press photographer Joe Rosenthal, as six Marines raised aloft the American flag during the Battle of Iwo Jima, 23 February 1945.

Nick Merrick © Hedrich Blessing with overlay of historic Iwo Jima photo by Joe Rosenthal, courtesy of Fentress Architects

hoisting the American flag atop Mount Suribachi remains a potent one in the cultural mythology of both nation and Corps. As historians Robert Hariman and John Louis Lucaites have argued, the well-known image provides a platform for cultural reflection. Whether in the favorable comparison of first responders in the wake of the 9/11 terrorist attacks or in the sharp-edged critique of current events, the scene supplies an ideological scaffolding through which arguments about a variety of contemporary subjects can be made.<sup>25</sup> It comes as little surprise, then, that the architectural design for the National Museum of the Marine Corps in Triangle, Virginia, intended to conjure the 45-degree angle and overall silhouette of the second flag raising (figure 14.8).<sup>26</sup> In its most prominent embodiments—the former entrusted with the preservation of its heritage, the latter with its corporeal sacrifice—the Marine Corps fully embraced the multifigural motif as both a venerable reminder of the Service's distinguished past and an aspirational emblem to inspire a noble future.

Political cartoons, conversely, employ subversive mimicry to communicate their message. In their analysis of such manipulations of the Iwo Jima flag raising, scholars Janis L. Edwards and Carol K. Winkler note that it is precisely the perceived symmetry or lack thereof in



#### FIGURE 14.9

In 2017, the Alt National Park Service generated an internet meme by superimposing the word "Resist" on artist Robert Bissell's Blowdown! (2012), a painting inspired by Joe Rosenthal's photograph of the second flag raising that features six bears raising a fallen tree amid a clear-cut forest. Alt National Park Service

which social criticism is forged.<sup>27</sup> For instance, political activists in the #RESIST movement recently criticized President Donald J. Trump's adversarial relationship with the National Park Service through the humorous substitution of wild animals—specifically, bears—propping up a pine tree amid a desolate landscape ravaged by commercial logging (figure 14.9). While the evocation of the battlefield conjures Rosenthal's familiar composition, the replacement of the U.S. military and the American flag underscores the current administration's seemingly lackluster commitment to national parks and conservation efforts.

For such parodies to successfully communicate their message, contemporary viewers must possess a strong familiarity with the original. Rich in association and running deep with myth and experience, Rosenthal's photograph has become a national icon; its persistent appeal and continuing reproduction have made it a fixed moment in the collective memory of many Americans-even if they were not alive during World War II. As Paul Messaris has demonstrated in his study on visual literacy, many viewers cannot identify the battle but, as with previous generations, they interpret the picture as a victorious scene of American military might. This discrepancy in accumulated knowledge suggests that their exposure to the imagery derives from its current circulation in reproductions and parodies, divorced from the original prototype.<sup>28</sup> To what extent, if any, has the Marine Corps' recent correction to the historical record impacted the emotional and rhetorical resonance of the flag-raising photograph among audiences in the present day?

The emotional resonance and popular fervor surrounding Rosenthal's photograph during the Second World War prompted a series of errors and misunderstandings whose legacy historians have spent decades trying to unravel. For example, when wartime publications ran the second flag-raising photograph alongside articles naming members of the first flag-raising party, the combination of text and image conflated the two events and relegated other combat photographers' work to the sidelines—a consequence that has since prompted some to suspect the active suppression of competing flag-raising imagery. Scholarship provides ample evidence to show that this was not the case, but the persistence of such theories reveals an essential truth: the history of this image-captured in the midst of war-is a messy one.29

In 2015, Stephen Foley approached the Marine Corps with compelling evidence that there had been an error in attribution for the flag-raising party in Rosenthal's iconic image. As Mary Reinwald describes earlier in this volume, Foley and fellow military enthusiast Eric Krelle had observed equipment and uniform discrepancies for the individual presumed to be Pharmacist's Mate Second Class John H. Bradley. The questions raised from such careful attention to visual detail eventually led General Robert B. Neller, then Commandant of the Marine Corps, to convene a panel to reevaluate the evidence. Thus, in the spring of 2016, an official Marine Corps investigation recovered the contributions of a previously unknown Marine, Private First Class Harold H. Schultz, and revised the official roster for those pictured in Rosenthal's iconic image.

Remarkably, the 2016 identification of Schultz was neither the first nor the last time the Marine Corps would mandate a correction to the historical record. Soon after the flag-raising photograph became famous, the visual strength of the image propelled the hasty identification and recall of its participants in support of the Seventh War Loan drive. Although the financial campaign had been a success and the United States ultimately won the war, Marine Corps expediency had caused an error in attribution. In 1946, General Alexander A. Vandegrift, Commandant of the Marine Corps, tasked the del Valle Board (named after Major General Pedro A. del Valle) to assess the likeness of the individual pictured at the base of the flagpole. Using eyewitness statements and photographs of the event, the board determined that Corporal Harlon H. Block, rather than Sergeant Henry O. Hansen, had participated in the second flag raising atop Mount Suribachi.

In 2018, the Marine Corps again received a challenge to the historical record regarding the second flag raising. Whereas the 1947 and 2016 investigations focused on the Marines positioned nearest to the photographer, the most recent effort hinged on the identification of the two men positioned on the far side of the flagpole. High-resolution scans taken directly from the film negatives of two additional combat photographers, Army Private First Class George Burns and Marine Private Robert R. Campbell, revealed that the facial features, uniform, and equipment for the position attributed to Private First Class Rene A. Gagnon bore a notable resemblance to Corporal Harold P. Keller. Forensic photographic analyses from the FBI's Digital Evidence Laboratory validated this supposition, and in May 2019, the Bowers Board, led by Brigadier General William J. Bowers, corrected the record a third and, it is hoped, final time.<sup>30</sup>

The making and remaking of history with each successive challenge to the roster of flag raisers holds the potential for undermining the particular appeal that Rosenthal's iconic image maintains in American culture. And yet, in each of the above instances, the distinctive identity and life story of the individual has had no measurable impact on the iconic status or cultural meaning assigned to the event. Rather, the recent corrections to the official record serve as a reminder that the photograph, despite its iconic status, remains an artifact of war, a material object whose surface interaction of light and chemicals produced a visual imprint of an actual historical moment.

In a process that began with media distribution of the image during the war and evolved through countless manipulations and recontextualizations thereafter, the flag-raising photograph has coalesced cultural attitudes about communal effort, militarism, and heroism that defy the facts of the actual event. On an island where uncommon valor was a common virtue, the flagmen were heroes not for raising the American flag on a barren volcanic peak, but for doggedly and skillfully fighting a determined foe, for their willingness to make the ultimate sacrifice in service to the nation. But the specific individuals do not instill meaning in the photograph or add to its rhetorical force. Rather, the strength of the photograph abstracted these men, obscuring their individual identities with a patriotic pastiche of national attributes.

#### ENDNOTES

- 1. See Charles P. Neimeyer's chapter, "Black Sand and Blood," in this volume.
- See Austin Porter's chapter, "Raising Flags, Raising Funds," in this volume.
- Rosenthal's image was one of more than 100 photographs taken by combat cameramen atop Mount Suribachi that day.
- 4. Adm Nimitz reflected on the Battle of Iwo Jima in a Pacific Fleet communiqué dated 16 March 1945: "By their victory, the 3rd, 4th, and 5th Marine Divisions and other units of the Fifth Amphibious Corps have made an accounting to their country which only history will be able to value fully. Among the Americans who served on Iwo island, uncommon valor was a common virtue." Less than a decade later, an excerpt from this speech would be inscribed on the U.S. Marine Corps War Memorial. See CINCPOA Communiqué No. 300, 16 March 1945, in *Navy Department Communiqués 301–600 and Pacific Fleet Communiqués March 6, 1943 to May 24, 1945*, vol. II (Washington, DC: Office of Public Information, U.S. Navy, 1945).
- Albert Hemingway, Ira Hayes, Pima Marine (Lanham, MD: University Press of America, 1988).
- Karal Ann Marling and John Wetenhall, *Iwo Jima: Mon*uments, Memories, and the American Hero (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1991), 102–21; and Harry Brown and James Edward Grant, *Sands of Iwo Jima*, directed by Allan Dwan (Los Angeles, CA: Republic Pictures, 1949).
- Hayes was often singled out for his Native American ancestry, which the media praised as being "truly" American.
- Robert Hariman and John Louis Lucaites, No Caption Needed: Iconic Photographs, Public Culture, and Liberal Democracy (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2007), 98.
- 9. See Kate Clarke Lemay and David W. Mills's chapters in this volume.
- Marling and Wetenhall, Iwo Jima, 102-21; and Brown and Grant, Sands of Iwo Jima; and Wish Book for the 1979 Holiday Season (Chicago: Sears & Roebuck, 1979), 613.
- Col Joseph H. Alexander, "Battle of the Barricades: U.S. Marines in the Recapture of Seoul," in U.S. Marines in the Korean War, ed. Charles R. Smith (Washington, DC: History Division, Headquarters Marine Corps, 2007), 143–208.

- 12. Alexander, "Battle of the Barricades," 143.
- Alexander, "Battle of the Barricades," 143, 186; Lynn Montross and Capt Nicholas A. Canzona, U.S. Marines in Korea: The Inchon-Seoul Operation: 1950–1953, vol. 2 (Washington, DC: Historical Branch, G-3 Division, Headquarters Marine Corps, 1955), 251–52; Col Jon T. Hoffman, USMCR, Chesty: The Story of Lieutenant General Lewis B. Puller, USMC (New York: Random House, 2001), 355–56; and Burke Davis, Marine!: The Life of Chesty Puller (New York: Bantam Books, 1962), 255–56.
- Davis, Marine!, 256. A similar tale is recounted in Hoffman, Chesty, 356.
- For more on the early days of the Korean War, see Roy E. Appleman, United States Army in the Korean War: South to the Naktong, North to the Yalu (June to November 1950) (Washington, DC: U.S. Army Center of Military History, 2000), 49–262; and Allan R. Millett, The War for Korea, 1950–1951: They Came from the North (Lawrence: University Press of Kansas, 2010).
- See Peter Gardella, American Civil Religion: What Americans Hold Sacred (New York: Oxford University Press, 2014), 270–77.
- Jack Shulimson et al., U.S. Marines in Vietnam: The Defining Year, 1968 (Washington, DC: History and Museums Division, Headquarters Marine Corps, 1997), 190.
- For more on the Iranian embassy siege, see Leo J. Daugherty III, *The Marine Corps and the State Department: Enduring Partners in United States Foreign Policy*, 1798–2007 (Jefferson, NC: MacFarland, 2009). On the Beirut bombing, see Benis M. Frank, U.S. Marines in Lebanon, 1982–1984 (Washington, DC: History and Museums Division, Headquarters Marine Corps, 1987).
- Arnold R. Isaacs, Vietnam Shadows: The War, Its Ghosts, and Its Legacy (Baltimore, MD: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1997), 65.
- 20. After the Gulf War, the Corps continued its short duration mission, most often still as peacekeepers or providing humanitarian support following national disasters. Occasionally, Marines evacuated noncombatants from trouble spots, but dramatic flag moments were again unusual.
- 21. Hariman and Lucaites, No Caption Needed, 128-36.
- 22. *Hercules* refers to the acronym created by the term heavy equipment recovery combat utility lift and evacuation system.
- Aaron Fels, "The Marine Who Shoved America in Saddam's Face—15 Years Later," *New York Post*, 8 April 2018.
- LtCol Michael S. Groen et al., With the 1st Marine Division in Iraq, 2003: No Greater Friend, No Worse Enemy (Quantico, VA: History Division, Headquarters Marine Corps, 2006), 307; Col Nicholas E. Reynolds, U.S. Marines in Iraq, 2003: Basrah, Baghdad and Beyond (Washington, DC: History Division, Headquarters Marine Corps, 2007), 101–2, 183; Col Gregory Fontenot, USA (Ret) et al., On Point: The U.S. Army in Operation Iraqi Freedom (Fort Leavenworth, KS: Office of the Chief of Staff, U.S. Army, Combat Studies Institute Press, 2004), 337–38; and Jane Arraf, "Iraqi Who Toppled Saddam Hussein

Statue 15 Years Ago Regrets His Action," *Morning Edition*, NPR, 9 April 2018.

- Hariman and Lucaites, No Caption Needed, 115–28. See also Janis L. Edwards and Carol K. Winkler, "Representative Form and the Visual Ideograph: The Iwo Jima Image in Editorial Cartoons," Quarterly Journal of Speech 83, no. 3 (1997): 289–310, https://doi.org/10.1080 /00335639709384187.
- 26. For a detailed history of the National Museum of the Marine Corps, see Jerome Rasgus et al., "Proud Witness," *Civil Engineering* 77, no. 4 (2006): 56–65, https:// doi.org/10.1061/ciegag.0000116; and Jessica del Pilar, ed., *Portal to the Corps: Chronicling the National Museum of the Marine Corps* (Mulgrave, AU: Images Publishing, 2007).
- 27. Edwards and Winkler, "Representative Form and the Visual Ideograph," 289–310.
- Paul Messaris, "Visual Literacy and Visual Culture," in Imagery and Visual Literacy, ed. D. G. Beauchamp et al. (Blacksburg, VA: International Visual Literacy Association, 1995), 51–56.
- Melissa Renn, " 'The Famous Iwo Flag-Raising': Iwo Jima Revisited," *History of Photography* 39, no. 3 (August 2015):253–62,https://doi.org/10.1080/03087298.2014 .995957; and Parker Bishop Albee Jr. and Keller Cushing Freeman, *Shadow of Suribachi: Raising the Flags on Iwo Jima* (Westport, CT: Praeger, 1995).
- 30. See Keil Gentry's chapter in this volume.

# APPENDIX

## OFFICIAL REPORT OF THE DEL VALLE BOARD

In Replying Refer to No: AT-1282-tew



Headquarters U.S. Marine Corps Washington 25, DC

15 January 1947

From:	The board appointed to determine the identity of personnel who participated in
	the Mount Suribachi flag raising
To:	Commandant of the Marine Corps
Subject:	The identity of personnel who participated in the Mount Suribachi flag raising
	as photographed by Mr. Joe Rosenthal of the Associated Press <sup>1</sup>
Reference:	(a) CMC letter dated 4 December 1946, 1240-10, DGA-1153-jg
Enclosure:	(A) Report of the board appointed to determine the identity of personnel who
	participated in the Mount Suribachi flag raising as photographed by Mr. Joe
	Rosenthal of the Associated Press

1. In compliance with reference (a), the board's report, Enclosure (A), is submitted herewith. Enclosure (A) includes all correspondence pertaining to the investigation.

[signature] P. A. DEL VALLE, Major General, U.S. Marine Corps President

A. A. VANDEGRIFT General, U.S. Marine Corps Commandant Approved: Disapproved [signature]

#### REPORT OF THE BOARD

Appointed to determine the identity of personnel who participated in the Mount Suribachi flag raising as photographed by Mr. Joe Rosenthal of the Associated Press

- I. Authority
  - 2. The board was convened by [Commandant of the Marine Corps] CMC letter dated 4 December 1946, 1240-10, DGA-1153-jg.
- II. Matter Investigated
  - 3. The board met at 1300, 4 December 1946, all members being present.
  - 4. The convening order, hereto prefixed, was read and the board decided upon following the usual procedure for an investigation.
  - 5. The board examined the following documents, attached as exhibits:
    - A. Copy of photograph taken by Mr. Joe Rosenthal of the Suribachi flag raising on 23 February  $1945.^2$
    - B. Memorandum for Commandant of the Marine Corps from director, Division of Public Information, dated 18 November 1946, with Enclosures (A) to (L).
    - C. Memorandum for Commandant of the Marine Corps from director, Division of Public Information, dated 27 November 1946, with one enclosure.
  - 6. Consideration of all these documents, especially Enclosures A and B of Exhibit B (sworn statements of Pharmacist's Mate Second Class John H. Bradley and Private First Class Rene A. Gagnon), supported a conclusion that the following men were the participants in the historical flag raising atop Mount Suribachi photographed by Mr. Joe Rosenthal on 23 February 1945:<sup>3</sup>

Private First Class Franklin R. Sousley

Sergeant Michael Strank

Private First Class Ira H. Hayes

Private First Class Rene A. Gagnon

Pharmacist's Mate Second Class John H. Bradley

Sergeant Henry O. Hansen

- 7. In order to clear up the point as to whether or not the late Corporal Harlon H. Block was a participant as alleged in Enclosure (I) to Exhibit B (copy of letter from former Private First Class Ira H. Hayes to Mrs. Block) the board decided to submit written questionnaires to the following persons:
  - Captain Dave Elliott Severence, USMC, commanding officer of Company E, 2d Battalion, 28th Marines, 5th Marine Division, from March 1944 to August 1945.
  - (2) Captain Harold G. Schrier, USMC, reported patrol leader [who] participated in subject flag raising.
- 8. In addition, the board decided that a member of the board should interview former Private First Class Ira H. Hayes, confronting him with the conflicting affidavits of the other two surviving participants of the flag raising. The board then adjourned.
- 9. The board met at 1300, 13 December 1946, and all members of the board were present. Lieutenant Colonel Allan Sutter presented a statement concerning his interview of former Private

First Class Ira H. Hayes, along with two affidavits, an annotated photograph, and an annotated pamphlet obtained from Hayes—all attached hereto, and marked as Exhibit D.

- 10. The board examined the documents constituting Exhibit D and decided upon the following actions:
  - (1) That Lieutenant Colonel E. Hagenah should be interviewed by the board as soon as practicable.
  - (2) That Bradley and Gagnon should be informed of the contents of Exhibit D (contradictory affidavits from Private First Class Ira H. Hayes) and be requested to comment.
  - (3) That a questionnaire be mailed to former Sergeant Thomas J. Hermanek Jr. in order to verify statements made by Private First Class Ira H. Hayes.
  - (4) That no contact with former Corporal Donald J. Short or Private First Class William F. Cotter was necessary because identification of Sergeant Henry O. Hansen in the Suribachi group picture was verified to the satisfaction of the board using Sergeant Hansen's official record.
- 11. Several informal meetings were held between 13 December 1946 and 12 January 1947 in order to evaluate incoming correspondence and determine necessity for originating further inquiry.
- 12. The board met at 1030 on 13 January 1947 to consider all evidence recently obtained, including letters newly received from former Private First Class Gagnon, former Pharmacist's Mate Second Class Bradley, and former Corporal Thomas J. Hermanek Jr.—all enclosed and marked Exhibit E.
- 13. After exhaustive analysis of all the evidence available, the board decided that the investigation was complete, and that the evidence supported certain conclusions.

#### III. Conclusions

- 14. That the figure shown on the extreme right (at foot of flagpole) in Mr. Joe Rosenthal's photograph of the Mount Suribachi flag raising has been incorrectly identified since 8 April 1945 as being Sergeant Henry O. Hansen, now deceased.
- 15. That, to the best of the ability of the board to determine at this time, the above-mentioned figure is that of Corporal Harlon H. Block, also deceased.
- 16. That the incorrect identification was caused by a combination of factors, which include:
  - (a) Mr. Joe Rosenthal's failure to take names of the participants because he believed the photograph to have been blurred by movement and consequently ruined.
  - (b) The fact that three of the six actual participants were killed in action prior to the initiation of inquiry into the identity of the participants.
  - (c) The reluctance of former Private First Class Ira H. Hayes to be identified as a participant or to return to the United States at the time the first inquiry was made at Iwo Jima in early April 1945.
  - (d) That the original official identification was made in Washington [DC] with the help of Bradley and Gagnon, both of whom were bystanders who merely helped the four-man patrol raise the flag.
  - (e) The need for haste in identifying the participants (in order that they be present for the Seventh War Loan campaign) precluded a more thorough investigation originally.

#### IV. Opinion.

- 17. The board unanimously agrees that as a result of its investigation the following named men participated in the Mount Suribachi flag raising shown in the photograph taken by Mr. Joe Rosenthal of the Associated Press and that they appear as revealed on the accompanying annotated print:
  - 1. Corporal Harlon H. Block, deceased
  - 2. Private First Class Rene A. Gagnon
  - 3. Pharmacist's Mate Second Class John H. Bradley
  - 4. Sergeant Michael Strank, deceased
  - 5. Private First Class Ira H. Hayes
  - 6. Private First Class Franklin R. Sousley, deceased
- V. Recommendations.
  - 18. That the records of Headquarters, U.S. Marine Corps be corrected to agree with the opinion of this board—namely, that the name of Corporal Harlon H. Block, deceased, be substituted for that of Sergeant Henry O. Hansen, deceased, as identifying the figure of the extreme right (at the foot of the flagpole) in the subject photograph taken by Mr. Rosenthal.
  - 19. That Enclosures A, B, and C, letters informing certain interested parties of this change in identification of one figure in the photograph, be signed by the Commandant of the Marine Corps and mailed prior to any public release of the information.
  - 20. That no official blame be assessed any individual in the naval Service because of the number and diversity of factors found to have been contributory to the original error.

[signature] P. A. DEL VALLE, Major General, U.S. Marine Corps, President

[signature] W. T. CLEMENT, Brigadier General, U.S. Marine Corps, Member

[signature] ALLAN SUTTER, Lieutenant Colonel, U.S. Marine Corps, Member and Recorder

#### ENDNOTES

- 1. This printing represents as closely as possible the original document, with minor alterations to the text based on current standards for style, grammar, punctuation, and spelling and to accommodate for readability and this publication's format.
- 2. This document refers to Old Glory Goes Up on Mt. Suriba-

*chi, Iwo Jima*, the famous flag-raising photograph at the center of the investigation.

3. At the time these statements were made, Bradley, Hayes, and Gagnon were no longer active service; however, for consistency and clarity, their ranks at the time of the flag raising are used.

# APPENDIX B

## OFFICIAL REPORT OF THE HULY PANEL INVESTIGATION, PART I

In reply refer to: 19 April 2016

 From:
 Commandant of the Marine Corps

 To:
 Lieutenant General Jan Huly, USMC (Ret)

 Subj:
 Precept Convening the Huly Board to Review New Information Regarding the Identity of the Second Flag Raisers atop Mount Suribachi, Iwo Jima<sup>1</sup>

1. **Members**. The Huly Panel is appointed, consisting of you as president and the following additional members, to review new information regarding the identity of the second flag raisers atop Mount Suribachi, Iwo Jima, as depicted in the iconic photograph taken by Joe Rosenthal:

Colonel Keil Gentry, USMC, Director, MCWAR Colonel Jason Bohm, USMC, Director, EWS Colonel Mary Reinwald, USMC (Ret), Editor, *Leatherneck* Sergeant Major Justin LeHew, USMC, SgtMaj, TECOM Sergeant Major David L. Maddux, USMC, SgtMaj, EDCOM Sergeant Major Richard A. Hawkins, USMC (Ret) Dr. Randy Papadopoulos, Historian, Navy Secretariat Dr. Charles P. Neimeyer, Director, USMC HD/GRC

- 2. Recorder. Dr. Charles P. Neimeyer will also act as recorder.
- 3. Administrative Support Personnel. Administrative support personnel will be provided by Education Command as required.

- 4. **Date and Location**. The Huly Panel is ordered to convene at the Gray Research Center, Quantico, VA, on 19 April 2016, or as soon thereafter as practicable.
- 5. **Mission**. The Huly Panel will review newly discovered photographic evidence provided by the Lucky 8 television group, in association with [Smithsonian Channel] television, and their claim related to the identity of participants in the second flag raising on Iwo Jima. The board will also review photographs, video, eyewitness statements, and other available evidence related to the flag raising. The board will provide opinions and recommendations to the Commandant of the Marine Corps in the form of a written report, which can be made public as soon as possible, in order to accurately identify and appropriately credit the flag raisers depicted in the Rosenthal photograph.
- 6. Guidance. The board will proceed in accordance with the following specific guidelines.
  - a. The board should keep the following in mind as they deliberate. All Marines and sailors on Iwo Jima served with dedication and valor and we as a Corps are proud of the legacy of "uncommon courage" that they established and embody. Those Marines atop Mount Suribachi were still embroiled in the heat of battle at great personal risk, and accomplishing a mission to raise our national ensign to show resolve and to motivate others who might see it. The photographs were spontaneous and involved those in proximity. No one had a reasonable expectation of associated fame or immortality. With the fluidity and risk of battle, individuals moved in and out of the multiple flag raisings, many "trying to help" and without clear memories of who was where and when. The del Valle investigation highlighted the challenges of memory under stress. Despite the increased use and value of [forensic photographic analysis], with the death of many Marines and corpsmen involved and the passage of seven decades, we may never know for sure who did what, from where, and when.
  - b. The board will be as objective as possible with available data when making identifications.
  - c. The board must not presume identifications beyond what can be authenticated or corroborated.
  - d. Although the board may find photographic evidence and individual statements in conflict, the board shall not impugn the reputation or diminish the contributions of any individual, team, or unit.
  - e. The director of the Marine Corps History Division shall furnish the board with all available material for review.
- 7. **Confidentiality of Panel Proceedings**. Unless expressly authorized or required by me, neither you nor any member of the board, recorder, or administrative support personnel may disclose the proceedings, deliberations, or recommendations of the board. Upon completion of the board, you will receive further guidance on what information may be made public.
  - a. The following oath or affirmation shall be administered to the recorder by the president of the board:

Do you solemnly swear (or affirm) that you will keep a true record of the proceedings of this board and, further, that you will not disclose the proceedings or recommendations except as authorized or required by the Commandant of the Marine Corps or higher authority, so help you God? b. The following oath or affirmation shall then be administered by the recorder to each member of the board including the president:

Do you solemnly swear (or affirm) that you will perform your duties as a member of this board without prejudice or partiality, that you will not disclose the proceedings or recommendations except as authorized or required by the Commandant of the Marine Corps or higher authority, so help you God?

c. The following oath or affirmation shall then be administered to the administrative support personnel:

Do you solemnly swear (or affirm) that you will not disclose the proceedings or recommendations except as authorized or required by the Commandant of the Marine Corps or higher authority, so help you God?

[signature] R. B. NELLER

#### ENDNOTE

1. This printing represents as closely as possible the original document, with minor alterations to the text based on current standards for style, grammar, punctuation, and spelling and to accommodate for readability and this publication's format.

From:	Lieutenant General Jan Huly, USMC (Ret)
To:	Commandant of the Marine Corps
Subj:	Report of the Huly Panel to Review New Information Regarding the Identity of the
	Second Flag Raisers atop Mount Suribachi, Iwo Jima <sup>1</sup>
Ref:	(a) CMC letter Huly Panel Precept of 19 April 2016
Encl:	(1) Report of the Huly Panel Review of New Information Regarding the Identity of the
	Second Flag Raisers atop Mount Suribachi, Iwo Jima

- In accordance with reference (a), the board's report, enclosure (1) is submitted. The enclosure includes the reference material and key photographs reviewed by the board in furtherance of its requirement to review new information regarding the identity of the second flag raisers atop Mount Suribachi, Iwo Jima.
- 2. The references used by the board in the course of its deliberations were cross-checked with extant published sources related to the flag raising, historical division photographs, and the forensic material provided by the Lucky 8 television group.

[signature] JAN C. HULY

#### ENDNOTE

1. This printing represents as closely as possible the original document, with minor alterations to the text based on current standards for style, grammar, punctuation, and spelling and to accommodate for readability and this publication's format.



#### UNITED STATES MARINE CORPS

Marine Corps University Marine Corps History Division 3078 Upshur Avenue Quantico, VA 22134-5100<sup>1</sup>

Report of the Huly Panel Review of New Information Regarding the Identity of the Second Flag Raisers atop Mount Suribachi, Iwo Jima<sup>2</sup>

Ref:

- (a) Wells, John Keith. "Give Me Fifty Marines Not Afraid to Die": Iwo Jima. Abilene, TX: Ka-Well Enterprises, 1995.
- (b) Nalty, Bernard C., and Danny J. Crawford. *The United States Marines on Iwo Jima: The Battle and the Flag Raisings*. Washington, DC: History and Museums Division, Headquarters Marine Corps, 1995.
- (c) Spence, Dustin. "Unraveling the Mysteries of the First Flag Raising." Leatherneck 89, no. 10, October 2006, 34–43.
- (d) Marling, Karal Ann, and John Wetenhall. *Iwo Jima: Monuments, Memories, and the American Hero.* Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1991.
- (e) Keene, R. R. "Louis Lowery Captured Leatherneck History on Film." *Leatherneck* 89, no. 10, October 2006, 32–33.
- (f) Albee Jr., Parker Bishop, and Keller Cushing Freeman. Shadow of Suribachi: Raising the Flags on Iwo Jima. Westport, CT: Praeger Publishers, 1995.
- (g) Rosenthal, Joe. Gung Ho. 23 February 1945. Photograph. Defense Media Activity. Accessed 21 April 2016.
- (h) Bradley, James, with Ron Powers. Flags of Our Fathers. New York: Bantam Books, 2000.
- (i) Buell, Hal, ed. Uncommon Valor, Common Virtue: Iwo Jima and the Photograph that Captured America. New York: Penguin, 2006.

Encl:

- CMC letter dated 19 April 2016, Precept Convening the Huly Panel to Review New Information Regarding the Identity of the Second Flag Raisers atop Mount Suribachi, Iwo Jima [Cover Letter Ref (a)]
- (2) Report of the Panel Appointed to Determine the Identity of Personnel Who Participated in the
Mount Suribachi Flag Raising as Photographed by Mr. Joe Rosenthal of the Associated Press [Del Valle Board Report]

- Excerpts, Muster Roll of 2d Battalion, 28th Marines (April 1944; October 1944; January 1945;
  February 1945); Casualty Card of Private First Class Harold H. Schultz
- (4) Excerpts, Muster Roll of Headquarters Battalion, 5th Marine Division (January 1945)
- (5) Casualty Card of Sergeant William H. Genaust
- (6) Genaust, "Iwo Jima D+4," Roll 13
- (7) Casualty Card of Corporal Harlon H. Block
- (8) Casualty Card of Sergeant Michael Strank
- (9) Casualty Card of Private First Class Franklin R. Sousley
- (10) Hansen, Matthew. "New Mystery Arises from Iconic Iwo Jima Image." Omaha (NE) World-Herald. 23 November 2014.
- (11) Plaxton, Michael. Analysis of Digital Images for Lucky 8 TV. Crystal Beach Ontario: Forensic Video Consulting, 2015.

#### AUTHORITY

The panel was convened by CMC Precept letter dated 19 April 2016. [Encl (1)]

#### PANEL COMPOSITION

President	Lieutenant General Jan C. Huly, USMC (Ret)
Member	Colonel Keil R. Gentry, USMC, Director, MCWAR
Member	Colonel Jason Q. Bohm, USMC, Director, EWS
Member	Colonel Mary H. Reinwald, USMC (Ret), Editor, Leatherneck
Member	Sergeant Major Justin D. LeHew, USMC, SgtMaj, TECOM
Member	Sergeant Major David L. Maddux, USMC, SgtMaj, EDCOM
Member	Sergeant Major Richard A. Hawkins, USMC (Ret)
Member	Dr. Randy Papadopoulos, Navy Department Secretariat Historian
Member/Recorder	Dr. Charles P. Neimeyer, Director, History Division

Administrative Support Dr. Breanne Robertson, History Division

#### DATE AND LOCATION

The Huly Panel convened at the Gray Research Center, Quantico, VA, at 0900 on 19 April 2016. The board concluded at 1600 on 27 April 2016.

#### PRELIMINARY STATEMENT

In accordance with the enclosure, the Huly Panel reviewed enhanced forensic photographic evidence, photographs, film, eyewitness statements, and other available evidence related to the flag raising. The evidence reviewed by the board represents an aggregation of years of painstaking research by numerous historians, authors, forensics experts, and others.

On 23 February 1945, as part of the operation to take Iwo Jima, 2d Battalion, 28th Marine Regiment, was

OFFICIAL REPORT OF THE HULY PANEL INVESTIGATION 277

assigned the mission of securing Mount Suribachi. As planned once the Marines secured the summit, they raised the American flag. As that first flag snapped in the wind, cheers rose from the beach, ships sounded their horns, and Secretary of the Navy James V. Forrestal turned to Major General Holland M. Smith and said, "Holland, the raising of that flag on Suribachi means a Marine Corps for the next five hundred years." At the time, the first flag raising was the more significant of the two flag raisings to those present. The second flag raising would likely have been lost to history if it were not for Mr. Joseph "Joe" J. Rosenthal's iconic photograph. Given this context, the stress of combat, and the passage of time, it is not surprising that facts surrounding the second flag raising have been difficult to determine.

The 1947 del Valle Board focused primarily on correcting the identification of the individual in position number 1. That board determined the identities of the six flag raisers in Mr. Rosenthal's photograph of the second flag raising atop Mount Suribachi as shown in the figure on p. 206. The del Valle Board relied on witness statements and the iconic photograph to identify the flag raisers. Since 1947, additional evidence has come to light and there have been significant advances in photographic forensics.

Identifying personnel in specific locations and times based upon the positioning of visible combat gear and clothing is difficult. People may reposition their gear and clothing, thereby changing their appearance in photographs and film. Nevertheless, physical recognition of faces, body positions, and combat gear present the strongest corroborative evidence this board had to consider at this time.

The Huly Panel used the position numbers indicated in the figure on page 207 to reference individual locations.

#### FINDINGS OF FACT

- On 23 February 1945, Sergeant Michael Strank, Corporal Harlon H. Block, Private First Class Ira H. Hayes, and Private First Class Franklin R. Sousley were members of the same squad in Company E, 2d Battalion, 28th Marines. [Encl (2)]
- On 23 February 1945, Private First Class Harold H. Schultz was a mortarman with Company E, 2d Battalion, 28th Marines. [Encl (3)]
- 3. On 23 February 1945, Pharmacist's Mate Second Class John H. Bradley was a corpsman with Headquarters, 2d Battalion, 28th Marines. [Encl (3)]
- 4. On 23 February 1945, Private First Class Rene A. Gagnon was the battalion commander's runner from Company E, 2d Battalion, 28th Marines. [Ref (b), p. 8]
- 5. On 23 February 1945, Staff Sergeant Louis R. Lowery was a *Leatherneck* photographer assigned as a combat cameraman to 5th Marine Division. [Encl (4)]
- On 23 February 1945, Sergeant William H. Genaust was assigned as a combat cameraman to 5th Marine Division. [Encl (4), Encl (5)]
- 7. On 23 February 1945, Private Robert R. Campbell was assigned as a combat cameraman to 5th Marine Division. [Encl (4)]
- 8. On 23 February 1945, commanding officer of 2d Battalion, 28th Marines, Lieutenant Colonel Chandler W. Johnson, ordered executive officer of Company E, 2d Battalion, 28th Marines, First Lieutenant Harold G. Schrier, to lead a platoon-size patrol with the mission to secure the top of Mount Suribachi and raise the American flag. [Ref (b), p. 5]
- 9. Staff Sergeant Lowery and Pharmacist's Mate Second Class Bradley were members of the patrol. [Ref (d), p. 45]
- The first flag was raised at approximately 1020 on 23 February 1945 atop Mount Suribachi. [Ref (b), p. 5)]
- 11. Staff Sergeant Lowery took photographs of members in the vicinity before and after the first flag raising. [Ref (c), pp. 34–43)]
- 12. Pharmacist's Mate Second Class Bradley participated in the raising of the first flag atop Mount Suribachi. [(Ref (c), pp. 34–43)]
- 13. Private First Class Schultz was in the immediate vicinity of the first flag raising atop Mount Suribachi. [Ref (c), pp. 34–43)]
- On 23 February 1945, commanding officer of 2d Battalion, 28th Marines, Lieutenant Colonel Johnson, ordered a resupply patrol to carry a second, larger flag to replace the first flag. [Ref (b), p. 8]
- 15. On 23 February 1945, Mr. Rosenthal was a photographer with the Associated Press (AP). [Encl (2)]
- 16. On 23 February 1945, Sergeant Strank, Corporal Block, Private First Class Hayes, Private First Class Sousley, and Private First Class Gagnon were members of the resupply patrol, accompanied by Mr. Rosenthal, Sergeant Genaust, and Private Campbell, that carried the second flag to the top of Mount Suribachi.<sup>3</sup> [Ref (d), pp. 64–67, and Encl (2)]
- 17. The second flag was raised at approximately 1300 on 23 February 1945 as the first flag was simultaneously lowered. [Ref (e), p. 32]

- 18. Sergeant Genaust filmed the preparation and raising of the second flag. [Encl (6)]
- 19. Sergeant Genaust stopped filming the preparation of the second flag prior to it being raised, and he moved to a new position. [Ref (d), p. 67, and Encl (6)]
- 20. Before the break in filming, the Genaust film shows four individuals focused on getting into position on the flagpole. [Encl (6)]
- 21. Sergeant Genaust resumed filming after an undetermined period of time. [Encl (6)]
- 22. After the break in filming and just prior to the raising of the flag, the Genaust film shows that the second flag raisers were focused in the direction of the first flag and not on each other. [Encl (6)]
- Sergeant Genaust continued filming and captured six individuals raising the second flag. [Encl (6)]
- 24. Mr. Rosenthal photographed the second flag being raised. [Encl (2)]
- 25. Private Campbell photographed the first flag being lowered, while the second flag was being raised (figure 13.1). [Ref (f)]
- 26. Shortly after the second flag was raised, Mr. Rosenthal took a group photograph around the second flag, which became known as the *Gung Ho* photograph (figure 0.5). [Ref (f)]
- 27. Corporal Block was killed in action (KIA) on Iwo Jima on 1 March 1945. [Encl (7)]
- 28. Sergeant Strank was KIA on Iwo Jima on 1 March 1945. [Encl (8)]
- 29. Pharmacist's Mate Second Class Bradley was wounded on 12 March 1945 and evacuated by air on 13 March 1945. [Ref (b), p. 11]
- 30. Private First Class Sousley was KIA on Iwo Jima on or about 21 March 1945. [Encl (9)]
- 31. Private First Class Gagnon made the original identification of the second flag raisers in Mr. Rosenthal's iconic photograph upon his return to the United States. [Encl (2)]
- 32. Pharmacist's Mate Second Class Bradley, Sergeant Strank, Private First Class Sousley, Private First Class Hayes, and Private First Class Schultz are identified in Mr. Rosenthal's *Gung Ho* photograph (figure 0.5). [Ref (g), Ref (h), and Ref (f)]
- 33. At some later time, Private First Class Schultz identified himself as the fifth individual from the right in an inscription on the *Gung Ho* photograph. [Encl (10)]
- The 1947 del Valle Board determined the individual in position 1 is Corporal Harlon Block. [Encl (2)]
- 35. No known evidence contradicts the findings of the del Valle Board as to the identification of the individual in position 1. [Ref (a)-(i), and Encl (1)-(11)]
- 36. The individual in position 1 is wearing a strap across his back that is consistent with a bandoleer (see figure 0.2). [Encl (2)]
- 37. The Genaust film shows all six flag raisers positioned around the upright pole. [Encl (6)]
- 38. Sergeant Genaust stopped filming for a second time. [Encl (6)]
- 39. Sergeant Genaust resumed filming after an indeterminate number of seconds. The gear worn on the individuals holding the flagpole is consistent with the persons from positions 1, 3, 4, and 6 shown before the second break in filming. [Encl (6)]
- 40. During the break, Mr. Rosenthal moved slightly to the right of his original position. In this way, he was able to capture a profile view of the individual in position 1, a frontal view of the individual in position 3, and a partial view of the individual in position 6 (figure 13.4). [Ref (i)]

- Sergeant Genaust continued filming and captured the individuals in positions 1, 3, 4, and 6, who are shown stabilizing the flagpole, while the individual in position 5 is walking away from the flag.
  [Encl (6)]
- 42. Mr. Rosenthal took a contemporaneous photograph of the individual from position 1 shown in the Genaust film, where his face and equipment are clearly seen (see figure 13.4). [Ref (i)]
- 43. The face of the individual in position 1 in the contemporaneous photograph by Mr. Rosenthal resembles the service photograph of Corporal Harlon Block (see figure 13.4). [Ref (i)]
- 44. The 1947 del Valle Board determined the individual in position 2 is Private First Class Gagnon. [Encl (2)]
- 45. Private First Class Gagnon identified himself as the individual in position 2. [Encl (2)]
- 46. The Genaust film and Private Campbell's photograph of the two flags show the individual in position 2 with a rifle slung over his shoulder, which is consistent with Private First Class Gagnon's table of organization weapon. [Encl (6)]
- 47. The momentary glimpse of the face in position 2 appears to be Private First Class Gagnon. [Encl (6)]
- 48. The 1947 del Valle Board determined the individual in position 3 is Pharmacist's Mate Second Class Bradley. [Encl (2)]
- Pharmacist's Mate Second Class Bradley identified himself as the individual in position 3. [Encl (2)]
- 50. The individual in position 3 is wearing an empty canteen cover, a cartridge belt without suspenders, wire cutters, soft cover under helmet, but is not carrying a rifle or wearing a field jacket. Additionally, his trousers are not cuffed. [Encl (11)]
- 51. Photographs show Private First Class Sousley wearing an empty canteen cover, a cartridge belt without suspenders, wire cutters, soft cover under helmet, but he is not wearing a field jacket. Additionally, Private First Class Sousley's trousers are not cuffed. [Encl (11)]
- 52. Photographs show Pharmacist's Mate Second Class Bradley not wearing an empty canteen cover, wire cutters, or a soft cover under his helmet. He is shown wearing a field jacket, two medical unit 3 bags, first aid pack, Ka-bar, full canteen cover, and suspenders. Additionally, his trousers are cuffed, and he is wearing leggings. [Encl (11)]
- 53. The Genaust film shows the individual in position 3 moving into a subsequent position where his face and his equipment are clearly seen. [Encl (6)]
- 54. Mr. Rosenthal took a contemporaneous photograph of the individual from position 3 shown in the Genaust film, where his face and equipment are clearly seen (see figure 13.4 or the detail in figure 13.14). [Encl (11)]
- 55. Photographic analysis of Mr. Rosenthal's photograph identifies the individual from position 3 as Private First Class Sousley. [Encl (11)]
- 56. The 1947 del Valle Board determined the individual in position 4 is Sergeant Strank. [Encl (2)]
- 57. The Genaust film shows the individual in position 4 moving into a subsequent position where a portion of his left hand is visible. [Encl (6)]
- 58. Mr. Rosenthal took a contemporaneous photograph of the individual, who is shown in the Genaust film in position 4, where the bare ring finger of his left hand is clearly visible. [Encl (11)]

- 59. A ring is clearly visible on the ring finger of the left hand of Pharmacist's Mate Second Class Bradley in photographs Private Campbell and Staff Sergeant Lowery shot prior to the second flag raising. [Encl (11)]
- 60. No ring is visible on the ring finger of the left hand of Sergeant Strank in the *Gung Ho* photograph. [Ref (g)]
- 61. No medical unit 3 bags, or other gear worn on the torso, are visible on the individual in position4. [Encl (6) and (10)]
- 62. Sergeant Strank is not wearing any gear other than a helmet over a soft cover in the *Gung Ho* photograph. [Ref (g)]
- 63. In the Genaust film before the break, the individual in position 4 appears to be wearing a soft cover. [Encl (6)]
- 64. In the Genaust film after the break, the individual in position 4 appears to be wearing a helmet. [Encl (6)]
- 65. Of the photographs available to and reviewed by this board, none show Pharmacist's Mate Second Class Bradley wearing a soft cover on Mount Suribachi. [Ref (a)-(i), and Encl (1)-(11)]
- 66. Sergeant Strank was wearing a soft cover under his helmet in the *Gung Ho* photograph. [Ref (g)]
- 67. The 1947 del Valle Board determined the individual in position 5 is Private First Class Sousley. [Encl (2)]
- 68. The individual in position 5 has a broken helmet liner strap hanging from the left side of his helmet. [Encl (11)]
- 69. Private First Class Schultz has been identified in photographs as having a broken helmet liner strap hanging from the left side of his helmet. [Encl (11)]
- 70. From the photographs and film footage examined, no one else has been identified atop Mount Suribachi with a broken helmet liner strap hanging from the left side of his helmet. [Ref (a)-(i), and Encl (1)-(11)]
- 71. The individual in position 5 has a sling attached to the stacking swivel instead of being properly attached to the upper hand guard sling swivel of his rifle. [Encl (11)]
- 72. Private First Class Schultz has been identified in photographs as having a sling attached to the stacking swivel of his rifle. [Encl (11)]
- 73. From the photographs and film footage examined, no one else has been identified atop Mount Suribachi carrying a rifle with a sling attached to the stacking swivel of his rifle. [Ref (a)-(i), and Encl (1)-(11)]
- 74. The individual in position 5 has a bulging right front field jacket pocket. [Encl (11)]
- 75. Private First Class Schultz has been identified in photographs as having a bulging right front field jacket pocket. [Encl (11)]
- 76. There is no indication Private First Class Schultz or anyone else ever mentioned him as raising the flag on Iwo Jima. [Encl (10)]
- 77. The 1947 del Valle Board determined the individual in position 6 is Private First Class Hayes. [Encl (2)]
- 78. Private First Class Hayes identified himself as the individual in position 6. [Encl (2)]
- 79. The Genaust film and the Rosenthal photograph taken after the flag raisers have raised the flag

to a perpendicular position clearly indicate the individual in position 6 is Private First Class Hayes (see figure 13.4 or the detail in figure 13.14). [Encl (6)]

- 80. The del Valle report concluded that "the need for haste in identifying the participants (in order that they be present for the Seventh War Loan campaign) precluded a more thorough investigation originally." This haste caused confusion as to the identity of the flag raisers. [Encl (2)]
- 81. Pharmacist's Mate Second Class Bradley wrote to his parents on 26 February 1945: "I had a little to do with raising the American flag and it was the happiest moment of my life." [Ref (h), p. 216)]
- 82. Pharmacist's Mate Second Class Bradley wrote to Major General del Valle on 26 December 1946: "Things happened so fast I didn't think much of this flag raising until we returned to the U.S. from Iwo Jima." [Encl (2)]

#### **OPINIONS**

- Previous attempts to accurately identify the flag raisers in Mr. Rosenthal's iconic photograph were complicated by the death of key participants, the stress of combat, the lack of recognition as to the significance of the second flag raising at the time of its occurrence, the haste to include the flag raisers in the Seventh War Loan campaign, and the subsequent passage of time. [FF 29, 80, 82]
- 2. The April 1945 effort to comply with the directive to immediately return the flag raisers in Mr. Rosenthal's iconic photograph and have them participate in the Seventh War Loan campaign resulted in Marine Corps officials incorrectly identifying some of the second flag raisers. [FF 80]
- 3. Pharmacist's Mate Second Class Bradley, Private First Class Hayes, and Private First Class Gagnon may have felt pressured to maintain Private First Class Gagnon's original identification of the flag raisers in support of the Seventh War Loan campaign. [FF 80]
- 4. The traumatic injuries Pharmacist's Mate Second Class Bradley sustained in combat on 12 March 1945 may have resulted in him not thinking further about the flag raising or his role in it until after his return to the United States. [FF 29]
- 5. Pharmacist's Mate Second Class Bradley may have conflated his participation in the first flag raising with the second flag raising. [FF 29, 81, 82]
- 6. The individual in position 1 is Corporal Harlon Block. [FF 1, 16, 34, 35]
- 7. The individual in position 2 is Private First Class Rene Gagnon. [FF 4, 16, 31, 44, 45, 46, 47]
- The individual in position 3 is not Pharmacist's Mate Second Class John Bradley. [FF 50, 52, 53, 54, 55]
- 9. The individual in position 3 is Private First Class Franklin R. Sousley. [FF 1, 16, 32, 50, 51, 53, 54, 55]
- The individual in position 4 is not Pharmacist's Mate Second Class Bradley. [FF 56, 58, 59, 61, 63, 65]
- The individual associated with position 4 in the Genaust film is Sergeant Strank. [FF 1, 16, 32, 57, 58, 60, 61, 62, 63, 66]
- 12. During the first break in the Genaust film, Sergeant Strank placed a helmet on top of the soft cover on his head. [FF 63, 64, 66]
- 13. The individual in position 4 is Sergeant Strank. [FF 1, 16, 32, 56, 57, 58, 60, 61, 62, 63, 64, 66]

- 14. The individual in position 5 is not Private First Class Franklin Sousley. [FF 50, 51, 53, 54, 55]
- The individual in position 5 is Private First Class Harold Schultz. [FF 2, 13, 32, 33, 68, 69, 70, 71, 72, 73, 74, 75]
- 16. The board has no opinion as to why Private First Class Schultz never identified himself as a flag raiser.
- 17. The individual in position 6 is Private First Class Ira Hayes. [FF 1, 16, 32, 77, 78, 79]
- 18. Pharmacist's Mate Second Class Bradley participated in the first flag raising and remained atop Mount Suribachi throughout the second flag raising. [FF 8, 9, 12, 32, 81]
- 19. The opinion of the board is that the identification of the second flag raisers is as depicted in the figure on p. 207. [FF 1-82]

#### RECOMMENDATIONS

- 1. That the records of Headquarters U.S. Marine Corps reflect the identification of the individuals in the photograph as follows:
  - a. Position 1 Corporal Harlon Block
  - b. Position 2 Private First Class Rene Gagnon
  - c. Position 3 Private First Class Franklin Sousley
  - d. Position 4 Sergeant Michael Strank
  - e. Position 5 Private First Class Harold Schultz
  - f. Position 6 Private First Class Ira Hayes
- 2. That the Commandant of the Marine Corps should inform the Secretary of the Navy, Chief of Naval Operations, and Medical Officer of the Marine Corps of the results of this board before they are made public.
- 3. That the Commandant of the Marine Corps should inform the appropriate relatives of Corporal Harlon Block, Private First Class Rene Gagnon, Private First Class Franklin Sousley, Sergeant Michael Strank, Private First Class Harold Schultz, Private First Class Ira Hayes, and Pharmacist's Mate Second Class John Bradley of the results of this board before they are made public.
- 4. That the Commandant of the Marine Corps should issue a public statement regarding the correct identification of the second flag raisers. This statement should include acknowledgment of the collective efforts of all who contributed to telling the story of the sacrifices and heroic achievements of all Marines, sailors, and Coast Guardsmen during the battle of Iwo Jima.
- 5. That the Commandant of the Marine Corps recognize that all previous efforts at identification were conducted in good faith and that no official blame be assessed for previous inaccuracies in the historical record.
- 6. That the Commandant of the Marine Corps direct that this board report and associated records be deposited in the Marine Corps History Division's archives.
- 7. That the Office of Legislative Affairs should inform appropriate members of Congress and congressional staff of the results of this board before they are made public.
- 8. That Headquarters U.S. Marine Corps should make public the findings of this board.
- 9. That the Commandant of the Marine Corps should coordinate the public release of the findings of this board with the Office of U.S. Marine Corps Communication.

 That the National Museum of the Marine Corps and other Marine Corps monuments, displays, and educational programs should be updated to reflect the correct identification of the second flag raisers.

> JAN C. HULY Lieutenant General, USMC (Ret) President of the Board

KEIL R. GENTRY Colonel, USMC

MARY H. REINWALD Colonel, USMC (Ret)

DAVID L. MADDUX Sergeant Major, USMC

RANDY PAPADOPOULOS

PhD, Navy Department Secretariat Historian

JASON Q. BOHM Colonel, USMC

JUSTIN D. LEHEW Sergeant Major, USMC

RICHARD A. HAWKINS Sergeant Major, USMC (Ret)

CHARLES P. NEIMEYER Lieutenant Colonel, USMC (Ret) PhD, Director, History Division

#### ENDNOTES

- 1. At the time the board met, History Division had not yet moved into the Brigadier General Edwin H. Simmons Marine Corps History Center.
- 2. This printing represents as closely as possible the original document, with minor alterations to the text based on current standards for style, grammar, punctuation, and spelling and to accommodate for readability and this publication's format.
- 3. According to Rosenthal, the photographers ascended the mountain separately from the resupply patrol. This timeline was compressed in earlier publications such as Nalty and Crawford, leading to this inaccurate characterization in the Huly Panel report.

# APPENDIX

### OFFICIAL REPORT OF THE HULY PANEL INVESTIGATION, PART II

In reply refer to: 1000 CMC 5 July 2016



From:	Commandant of the Marine Corps
To:	Lieutenant General Jan Huly, USMC (Ret)
Subj:	Precept Convening the Huly Panel to Review the Identity of the First Flag Raisers atop
	Mount Suribachi, Iwo Jima <sup>1</sup>

 Members. The Huly Panel is appointed, consisting of you as president and the following additional members, to review the identity of those involved in the first flag raising atop Mount Suribachi, Iwo Jima:

Brigadier General Jason Bohm, USMC, Commanding General, Training Command Colonel Keil Gentry, USMC (Ret) Colonel Mary Reinwald, USMC (Ret) Sergeant Major Gary Smith, USMC, Sergeant Major, Marine Corps Systems Command Sergeant Major David L. Maddux, USMC, Sergeant Major, Marine Corps University Sergeant Major Richard A. Hawkins, USMC (Ret) Dr. Randy Papadopoulos, Historian, Navy Secretariat Dr. Charles P. Neimeyer, Director, USMC HD/GRC

2. **Recorder**. Dr. Charles P. Neimeyer will also act as recorder. The recorder will make all reasonable efforts to keep a true record of the proceedings of the board.

- 3. Administrative Support Personnel. Administrative support personnel will be provided by Education Command as required.
- 4. **Date and Location**. The Huly Panel is ordered to convene at the Gray Research Center, Quantico, VA, on 5 July 2016, or as soon thereafter as practicable.
- 5. **Mission**. In an extension of its analysis of the second flag raising, the Huly Panel will review photographic evidence and claims related to the identity of participants in the first flag raising on Iwo Jima. The board will also review eyewitness statements and other available evidence related to the flag raising in order to accurately identify the flag raisers.
- 6. Guidance. The board will proceed in accordance with the following specific guidelines:
  - a. It is my intent that the deliberations and findings of the board be conducted with integrity and be free from external influence, pressure, or prejudice to the process. Accordingly, the board, and all those participating, will refrain from any disclosures outside of the board until after I have reviewed and accepted its report. Any requests for disclosure outside of the board prior to that point shall be referred to me. This does not supersede, conflict with, or otherwise alter the employee obligations, rights, or liabilities created by existing statute or executive order relating to communications to Congress, an inspector general, or any other whistleblower protection.
  - b. Further, the board should keep the following in mind as they deliberate. All Marines and corpsmen on Iwo Jima served with dedication and valor and we as a Corps are proud of the legacy of "uncommon courage" that they established and embody. Those Marines atop Mount Suribachi were still embroiled in the heat of battle, at great personal risk, and accomplishing a mission to raise our national ensign to show resolve and to motivate others who might see it. The photographs were spontaneous and involved those in proximity. No one had a reasonable expectation of associated fame or immortality. With the fluidity and risk of battle, individuals moved in and out of the multiple flag raisings, many "trying to help" and without clear memories of who was where and when. Despite the increased use and value of [forensic photographic analysis], with the death of many Marines and corpsmen involved and the passage of seven decades, we may never know for sure who did what, from where, and when.
  - c. The board will provide opinions and recommendations to the Commandant of the Marine Corps in the form of a written report, which can be made public as soon as possible.
  - d. The board will be as objective as possible with available data when making identifications.
  - e. The board must not presume identifications beyond what can be authenticated or corroborated.
  - f. Although the board may find photographic evidence and individual statements in conflict, the

board shall not impugn the reputation nor diminish the contributions of any individual, team, or unit.

- g. The director of the Marine Corps History Division shall furnish the board with all available material for review.
- h. Until the completion of proceedings, this board's location shall be the appointed place of duty for all active duty Marines assigned to the board or in support thereof.

[signature] ROBERT B. NELLER

#### ENDNOTE

1. This printing represents as closely as possible the original document, with minor alterations to the text based on current standards for style, grammar, punctuation, and spelling and to accommodate for readability and this publication's format.

From:	Lieutenant General Jan Huly, USMC (Ret)
To:	Commandant of the Marine Corps
Subj:	Report of the Huly Panel Review of Information Regarding the Identity of the First Flag Raisers atop Mount Suribachi, Iwo Jima
Ref:	(a) CMC letter Huly Panel Precept of 5 July 2016
Encl	(1) Report of the Huly Panel Review of Information Regarding the Identity of the First Flag Raisers atop Mount Suribachi, Iwo Jima <sup>1</sup>

- 1. In accordance with reference (a), the board's report, enclosure (1) is submitted. The enclosure includes the reference material and key photographs reviewed by the board in furtherance of its requirement to review information regarding the identity of the first flag raisers atop Mount Suribachi, Iwo Jima.
- 2. The references used by the board in the course of its deliberations were cross-checked with extant published sources related to the flag raising, historical division photographs, and forensic and other primary source materials in the collections of the Gray Research Center and History Division.

[signature] JAN C. HULY

#### ENDNOTE

<sup>1.</sup> This printing represents as closely as possible the original document, with minor alterations to the text based on current standards for style, grammar, punctuation, and spelling and to accommodate for readability and this publication's format.



#### UNITED STATES MARINE CORPS Marine Corps University

Marine Corps History Division 3078 Upshur Avenue Quantico, VA 22134-5100

Report of the Huly Panel Review of Information Regarding the Identity of the First Flag Raisers atop Mount Suribachi, Iwo Jima<sup>1</sup>

Ref:

- (a) Nalty, Bernard C., and Danny J. Crawford. *The United States Marines on Iwo Jima: The Battle and the Flag Raisings*. Washington, DC: History and Museums Division, Headquarters, U.S. Marine Corps, 1995.
- (b) Alexander, Col Joseph H., USMC (Ret). Closing In: Marines in the Seizure of Iwo Jima. Washington, DC: History and Museums Division, Headquarters, U.S. Marine Corps, 1994.
- (c) Miller, Bill. "The Whine of Snipers' Bullets Comprised the Only Opposition." *Leatherneck* 30, no. 9, September 1947, 10–11.
- (d) Marling, Karal Ann, and John Wetenhall. *Iwo Jima: Monuments, Memories, and the American Hero*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1991.
- (e) Albee Jr., Parker Bishop, and Keller Cushing Freeman. *Shadow of Suribachi: Raising the Flags on Iwo Jima*. Westport, CT: Praeger Publishers, 1995.
- (f) Keene, R. R. "Louis Lowery Captured Leatherneck History on Film." *Leatherneck* 89, no. 10, October 2006, 32–33.
- (g) Spence, Dustin. "Unraveling the Mysteries of the First Flag Raising." *Leatherneck* 89, no. 10, October 2006, 34–43.
- (h) Thomey, Tedd. Immortal Images: A Personal History of Two Photographers and the Flag Raising on Iwo Jima. Annapolis: Naval Institute Press, 1996.
- (i) Bradley, James, with Ron Powers. Flags of Our Fathers. New York: Bantam Books, 2000.
- (j) Wheeler, Richard. The Bloody Battle for Suribachi. New York: Thomas Y. Crowell, 1965.
- (k) Conner, Howard M. The Spearhead: The World War II History of the 5th Marine Division. Washington, DC: Infantry Journal Press, 1950.
- Wells, John Keith. "Give Me Fifty Men Not Afraid to Die": Iwo Jima. Abilene, TX: Ka-Well Enterprises, 1995.

Encl:

- (1) CMC letter dated 5 July 2016, Precept Convening the Huly Panel to Review Information Regarding the Identity of the First Flag Raisers atop Mount Suribachi, Iwo Jima [Cover Letter Ref (a)]
- (2) Reference Photographs of the First Flag Raising on Iwo Jima, 23 February 1945, with Annotations Determined by History Division on 1 July 2016
- (3) Excerpts from "Report of the Huly Panel Review of New Information Regarding the Identity of the Second Flag Raisers atop Mount Suribachi, Iwo Jima"
- (4) Personnel Determined by History Division on 23 June 2003 to have been Members of the Patrol that Occupied Mount Suribachi on 23 February 1945
- (5) Annotated Gung Ho photograph taken by Joe Rosenthal of the Associated Press (AP), 23 February 1945. Defense Media Activity
- (6) Excerpts, Muster Roll of 2d Battalion, 28th Marines (April 1944; October 1944; January 1945; February 1945)
- (7) Excerpts, Muster Roll of Headquarters Battalion, 5th Marine Division (January 1945)
- (8) Evaluation of Casualty Cards for Company E, 2d Battalion, 28th Marines, 5th Division, determined by History Division on 1 July 2016; Casualty Cards for Company E, 2d Battalion, 28th Marines, 5th Division, based on February 1945 Muster Roll
- (9) Eyewitness account by Private First Class Raymond Jacobs
- (10) Excerpts, Muster Roll of 2d Battalion, 27th Marines (February 1945)

#### AUTHORITY

The board was convened by CMC Precept letter dated 5 July 2016. [Encl (1)]

#### BOARD COMPOSITION

President	Lieutenant General Jan C. Huly, USMC (Ret)
Member	Brigadier General Jason Q. Bohm, USMC, CG, TECOM
Member	Colonel Keil R. Gentry, USMC (Ret)
Member	Colonel Mary H. Reinwald, USMC (Ret), Editor, Leatherneck
Member	Sergeant Major Gary Smith, USMC, SgtMaj, SYSCOM
Member	Sergeant Major David L. Maddux, USMC, SgtMaj, EDCOM
Member	Sergeant Major Richard A. Hawkins, USMC (Ret)
Member	Dr. Randy Papadopoulos, Navy Department Secretariat Historian
Member/Recorder	Dr. Charles P. Neimeyer, Director, History Division

Administrative Support Dr. Breanne Robertson, History Division

#### DATE AND LOCATION

The Huly Panel convened at the Gray Research Center, Quantico, VA, at 0900 on 5 July 2016. The board concluded at 1600 on 8 July 2016.

#### PRELIMINARY STATEMENT

At the direction of the Commandant of the Marine Corps the Huly Panel that analyzed the second flag raising on Mount Suribachi, Iwo Jima, 23 February 1945, reconvened in order to review the photographic evidence and claims related to the identity of the participants in the first flag raising.

In accordance with enclosure (1), the panel reviewed forensic photographic evidence, photographs, eyewitness statements, and other available evidence related to the first flag raising. To the individuals participating in the Battle of Iwo Jima, the first flag raising was the more significant of the two flag raisings on Mount Suribachi; however, AP photographer Joseph Rosenthal's iconic photograph caused the second flag raising to overshadow the first flag-raising event, resulting in less publicity and documentation related to the individuals involved in the first flag raising.

Previous attempts to accurately identify individuals involved in the first flag raising were complicated by the stress of combat, the lack of popular recognition as to the significance of the first flag raising, and the subsequent passage of time. The evidence reviewed by the panel represents an aggregation of years of painstaking research by numerous historians, authors, forensics experts, and others.

#### FINDINGS OF FACT

- 1. Current official Marine Corps records identify the first flag raisers as:
  - a. First Lieutenant Harold G. Schrier [Ref (a), (b)]
  - b. Platoon Sergeant Ernest I. Thomas Jr. [Ref (a), (b)]
  - c. Sergeant Henry O. Hansen [Ref (a), (b)]
  - d. Corporal Charles W. Lindberg [Ref (a), (b)]
  - e. Private First Class Louis C. Charlo [Ref (a), (b)]
  - f. Private First Class James R. Michels [Ref (a), (b)]
- 2. Early on the morning of 23 February 1945, Lieutenant Colonel Chandler W. Johnson, commanding officer, 2d Battalion, 28th Marines, ordered a team to ascend Mount Suribachi to conduct route reconnaissance and determine enemy disposition on the summit. [Ref (c), p. 11]
- 3. The individuals who comprised the reconnaissance team on Mount Suribachi were Sergeant Sherman B. Watson, [Private First Class] George Mercer [misidentified as corporal in original report], Private First Class Theodore White, and Private First Class Louis C. Charlo, all members of Company F, 2d Battalion, 28th Marines. [Ref (c), (e), and Encl (2), p. 2]
- 4. The reconnaissance team encountered no enemy activity on the summit of Mount Suribachi. [Ref (e), p. 41]
- 5. On 23 February 1945, commanding officer, 2d Battalion, 28th Marines, Lieutenant Colonel Johnson, ordered executive officer, Company E, 2d Battalion, 28th Marines, First Lieutenant Harold G. Schrier, to lead a platoon-size patrol with the mission to secure the top of Mount Suribachi and raise the American flag. [Ref (a)–(b), (d), (j)]
- 6. At the base of Mount Suribachi, First Lieutenant G. Greeley Wells, battalion adjutant for 2d Battalion, 28th Marines, provided an American flag to First Lieutenant Schrier on orders from the battalion commander prior to the patrol's ascent. [Ref (a), (c), (j)]

- 7. The patrol led by First Lieutenant Schrier consisted of 3d Platoon, Company E, 2d Battalion, 28th Marines, reinforced by other elements of 2d Battalion, 28th Marines, and Staff Sergeant Louis R. Lowery, a *Leatherneck* photographer assigned to the 5th Marine Division. [Ref (a)-(b), (f)–(g), and Encl (6)–(8)]
- 8. First Lieutenant Schrier's patrol departed the base of Mount Suribachi at approximately 0830 and passed the reconnaissance team descending from the summit. [Ref (b), (d), (f), and Encl (2), p. 3]
- 9. The reconnaissance team returned to Company F, 2d Battalion, 28th Marines, at the base of Mount Suribachi shortly after they passed the Schrier patrol proceeding up the mountain. [Ref (d), p. 41]
- 10. The following individuals have been identified as members of the patrol led by First Lieutenant Schrier that occupied the summit of Mount Suribachi at approximately 1000:
  - a. First Lieutenant Harold G. Schrier [Ref (a), (d), (f), (g), (j), (l)]
  - b. Platoon Sergeant Ernest I. Thomas Jr. [Ref (a), (d), (f), (g), and Encl (6), (8)]
  - c. Staff Sergeant Louis R. Lowery  $[Ref \ (a), (d), (f), (g)]$
  - d. Sergeant Henry O. Hansen [Ref (a), (d), (g) and Encl (6), (8)]
  - e. Sergeant Kenneth D. Midkiff [Ref (d), (j), and Encl (6), (8)]
  - f. Sergeant Howard M. Snyder [Ref (d), (g), (l), and Encl (6), (8)]
  - g. Pharmacist's Mate Second Class John H. Bradley [Ref (d), (g), and Encl (6)]
  - h. Private First Class Raymond E. Jacobs [Ref (g), (l), and Encl (6)]
  - i. Corporal Harold P. Keller [Ref (c)-(d), (j), (l), and Encl (6)]
  - j. Corporal Robert A. Leader [Ref (d), (f), (j), (l), and Encl (6), (8)]
  - k. Corporal Charles W. Lindberg [Ref (a), (d), (f)–(g), (j), (l), and Encl (6), (8)]
  - 1. Private First Class Graydon W. Dyce [Ref (j), pp. 140, 143, and Encl (6)]
  - m. Private First Class Clarence H. Garrett [Ref (c)-(d), (j), (l), and Encl (6)]
  - n. Private First Class Thomas J. Hermanek Jr. [Ref (l), p. 241, and Encl (6)]
  - o. Private First Class Donald S. Howell [Ref (i), p. 203, and Encl (6)]
  - p. Private First Class Raymond H. Larsen [Encl (5), (6)]
  - q. Private First Class James R. Michels [Ref (a), (c)–(d), (f)–(h), (j), and Encl (6), (8)]
  - r. Private First Class Manuel Panizo [Ref (d), (j), (l), and Encl (6), (8)]
  - s. Private First Class James A. Robeson [Ref (c)–(d), (f), (j), (l), and Encl (6), (8)]
  - t. Private First Class Leo J. Rozek [Ref (d), (f), (j), (l), and Encl (6)]
  - u. Private First Class John T. Schmitt [Ref (l), p. 241, and Encl (6), (8)]
  - v. Private First Class Harold H. Schultz [Ref (g), p. 37, and Encl (6)]
  - w. Private First Class Fred J. Walcsak [Encl (5), (6)]
  - x. Private Kenneth S. Espenes [Ref (j), p. 143, and Encl (6)]
  - y. Private Robert D. Goode [Ref (d), (l), and Encl (6), (8)]
  - z. Private Philip L. Ward [Ref (d), (g), (i), and Encl (6)]
- 11. The following individuals were assigned to 3d Platoon, Company E, 2d Battalion, 28th Marines, as of 23 February 1945, but cannot be confirmed as being members of the Schrier patrol:
  - a. Corporal James E. Hagstrom [Ref (j), p. 143, and Encl (6), (8)]
  - b. Private First Class Clarence R. Hipp [Ref (j), p. 143, and Encl (6), (8)]
  - c. Private First Class William J. McNulty [Ref (j), p. 143, and Encl (6), (8)]

- d. Private Clark L. Gaylord [Ref (j), p. 143, and Encl (6), (8)]
- e. Private James D. Breitenstein [Ref (j), p. 143, and Encl (6), (8)]
- f. Private Charles E. Schott [Ref (j), p. 143, and Encl (6), (8)]
- 12. All of the members in the patrol led by First Lieutenant Schrier cannot be identified due to insufficient evidence. [Ref (a)–(l), and Encl (6)–(8)]
- 13. When the patrol reached the top of the mountain, its members dispersed along the crest of the crater to occupy security positions while the headquarters element looked for a suitable place to raise the flag. [Ref (d), (j)]
- 14. Corporal Robert A. Leader and Private First Class Leo J. Rozek found the pipe to which the first flag was affixed. [Ref (d)–(f), (j), (l)]
- 15. Staff Sergeant Lowery photographed the preparation of the first flag. [Ref (d), (e), (f), (l), and Encl (2), pp. 4–8]
- 16. The following individuals affixed the first flag to the pipe:
  - a. First Lieutenant Harold G. Schrier [Ref (d)–(f), (j), and Encl (2), pp. 4–7]
  - b. Platoon Sergeant Ernest I. Thomas Jr. [Ref (d)–(f), (j), and Encl (2), pp. 4–7]
  - c. Sergeant Henry O. Hansen [Ref (d)–(e), (j), and Encl (2), pp. 4–7]
  - d. Corporal Charles W. Lindberg [Ref (d)–(e), (j), and Encl (2), pp. 4–7]
  - e. Private Philip L. Ward [Ref (g), p. 35, and Encl (2), pp. 4, 7]
- 17. The flagpole was carried horizontally for a short distance from the place where it was prepared to the location where it was raised. [Ref (e), p. 39]
- 18. The following individuals were either touching or within reach of the flagpole just prior to the first flag being raised:
  - a. First Lieutenant Harold G. Schrier [Encl (2), p. 8]
  - b. Platoon Sergeant Ernest I. Thomas Jr. [Encl (2), p. 8]
  - c. Sergeant Henry O. Hansen [Encl (2), p. 8]
  - d. Pharmacist's Mate Second Class John H. Bradley [Encl (2), p. 8]
  - e. Corporal Charles W. Lindberg [Encl (2), p. 8]
  - f. Private Philip L. Ward [Encl (2), p. 8]
- 19. The first flag was raised on the summit of Mount Suribachi at approximately 1030.<sup>2</sup> [Ref (a–l)]
- 20. Staff Sergeant Lowery was reloading the film in his camera as the first flag was being raised. [Ref (d), (e)]
- 21. No photographs or film are known to exist that depict the actual raising of the first flag. [Ref (a)–(l), and Encl (2)]
- 22. Staff Sergeant Lowery resumed taking photographs of the first flag immediately after it was raised. [Ref (d)–(f), (g), and Encl (2), pp. 9–15]
- 23. The following individuals were in contact with the flagpole on the summit of Mount Suribachi immediately after the first flag was raised:
  - a. Platoon Sergeant Ernest I. Thomas Jr. [Encl (2), pp. 9-10, 15]
  - b. Sergeant Henry O. Hansen [Encl (2), pp. 9–13, 15]
  - c. Pharmacist's Mate Second Class John H. Bradley [Ref (g), and Encl (2), pp. 9-15]
  - d. Private Philip L. Ward [Ref (g), and [Encl (2), pp. 9-15]

- 24. Immediately after the event, Lieutenant Colonel Johnson and First Lieutenant Schrier communicated via radio regarding the first flag raising. [Encl (2), pp. 11, 13–15, and Encl (9)]
- 25. The following individuals provided support in the immediate vicinity of the first flag raising:
  - a. Sergeant Howard M. Snyder, security [Ref (g), (j), and Encl (2), pp. 9-10, 13-15]
  - b. Corporal Raymond E. Jacobs, radio operator [Ref (g), (l), and Encl (2), pp. 9-15]
  - c. Private First Class James R. Michels, security [Ref (g)-(h), (j), and Encl (2), pp. 12]
  - d. Private First Class Harold H. Schultz, security [Ref (g), p. 37, and Encl (2), pp. 9-14]
  - e. Private First Class James A. Robeson, security [Ref (c), (f), (l)]
- 26. Of the photographic evidence available to and reviewed by this panel, none show Private First Class Charlo in the vicinity of the first flag as it was being raised. [Encl (2)]
- 27. A patrol led by Captain Arthur H. Naylor Jr., commanding officer, Company F, 2d Battalion, 28th Marines, and consisting of members of Company F, 2d Battalion, 28th Marines, ascended the summit to reinforce security after the first flag raising and prior to the second flag raising at approximately 1300. [Ref (e), p. 46]
- 28. All of the members in the patrol led by Captain Naylor cannot be identified due to insufficient evidence. [Ref (a)–(l)]
- 29. Navy Reserve Chaplain Lieutenant Charles F. Suver and his assistant, Sergeant James E. Fisk, ascended the mountain after the first flag raising and prior to the second flag raising. [Ref (d), pp. 42, 53, and Encl (2)]
- 30. In addition to the above, the following individuals were present on the summit after the first flag raising and prior to the *Gung Ho* photograph taken immediately after the second flag raising by AP photographer Joseph Rosenthal:
  - a. Sergeant William H. Genaust [Encl (2), p. 16, (3), (7)]
  - b. Sergeant Michael Strank [Encl (3), (5)]
  - c. Sergeant Sherman B. Watson [Ref (d), p. 41]
  - d. Corporal Harlon H. Block [Encl (3)]
  - e. Private First Class Louis R. Burmeister [Ref (e), pp. 62-66, and Encl (2), p. 18]
  - f. Private First Class George Burns, USA [Ref (e), pp. 62-66, and Encl (2), p. 16]
  - g. Private First Class Louis C. Charlo [Ref (d), p. 41, and Encl (2), p. 18]
  - h. Private First Class Rene A. Gagnon [Encl (3)]
  - i. Private First Class Ira H. Hayes [Encl (3), (5)]
  - j. Private First Class Franklin R. Sousley [Encl (3), (5)]
  - k. Private First Class John R. Thurman [Encl (5), (10)]
  - 1. Private First Class Theodore White [Ref (d), p. 41]
  - m. Private Robert R. Campbell [Encl (2), p. 16, (3), (7)]
  - n. Civilian Joseph J. Rosenthal [Encl (2), p. 16, (3)]

#### **OPINIONS**

- 1. The following six individuals raised the first flag (FF):
  - a. First Lieutenant Harold G. Schrier [FF 1, 5, 6-8, 10, 12, 15-19, 22]
  - b. Platoon Sergeant Ernest I. Thomas Jr. [FF 1, 7–8, 10, 15–19, 22-23]

- c. Sergeant Henry O. Hansen [FF 1, 7–8, 10, 15–19, 22-23]
- d. Pharmacist's Mate Second Class John H. Bradley [FF 7-8, 10, 17-19, 22-23]
- e. Corporal Charles W. Lindberg [FF 1, 7–8, 10, 15–19, 22]
- f. Private Philip L. Ward [FF 7–8, 10, 15–19, 22–23]
- 2. The following individuals did not raise the first flag as previously indicated in the official historical record of the Marine Corps:
  - a. Private First Class Louis C. Charlo [FF 1-3, 8-9, 13, 20-22, 26]
  - b. Private First Class James R. Michels [FF 1, 7-8, 10, 13, 20-22, 25]
- 3. Although Private First Class Charlo did not raise the first flag, he was a member of the reconnaissance team prior to the first flag raising and later returned to the summit as security reinforcement prior to the raising of the second flag raising. [FF 2–4, 8–9, 13, 20–22, 26]
- 4. Although Private First Class Michels did not raise the first flag, he provided security in the immediate vicinity of the event. [FF 5, 7–8, 10, 13, 20–22, 25]
- 5. Private First Class Michels was previously identified as a participant in the first flag raising due to his prominent positioning in the photograph taken by Staff Sergeant Lowery immediately after the event (see figure 0.3). [FF 1, 13, 20–22, 25]
- 6. There may be additional members of the patrol led by First Lieutenant Schrier, but they cannot be identified due to insufficient evidence. [FF 5, 7–8, 10–12, 30]
- 7. There may be additional members of the patrol led by Captain Naylor, but they cannot be identified due to insufficient evidence. [FF 27–28, 30]
- 8. Additional individuals may have been present on the summit during the flag-raising events on 23 February 1945, but they cannot be identified due to insufficient evidence. [FF 1–30]

#### RECOMMENDATIONS

- 1. That the records of Headquarters Marine Corps reflect the identification of the individuals in the first flag raising as follows:
  - a. First Lieutenant Harold G. Schrier
  - b. Platoon Sergeant Ernest I. Thomas Jr.
  - c. Sergeant Henry O. Hansen
  - d. Pharmacist's Mate Second Class John H. Bradley
  - e. Corporal Charles W. Lindberg
  - f. Private Philip L. Ward
- 2. That the Commandant of the Marine Corps should inform the Secretary of the Navy, Chief of Naval Operations, and Medical Officer of the Marine Corps of the results of this panel before they are made public.
- 3. That the Commandant of the Marine Corps should inform the appropriate relatives of First Lieutenant Harold G. Schrier, Platoon Sergeant Ernest I. Thomas Jr., Sergeant Henry O. Hansen, Corporal Charles W. Lindberg, Private First Class Louis C. Charlo, Private First Class James R. Michels, Private Philip L. Ward, and Pharmacist's Mate Second Class John H. Bradley of the results of this panel before they are made public.
- 4. That the Commandant of the Marine Corps should issue a public statement regarding the correct

identification of the first flag raisers. This statement should include acknowledgment of the collective efforts of all who contributed to telling the story of the sacrifices and heroic achievements of all Marines, sailors, and Coast Guardsmen during the battle of Iwo Jima.

- 5. That the Commandant of the Marine Corps recognize that all previous efforts at identification were conducted in good faith and that no official blame be assessed for previous inaccuracies in the historical record.
- 6. That the Commandant of the Marine Corps direct that this panel report and associated records be deposited in the Marine Corps History Division's archives.
- 7. That the Office of Legislative Affairs should inform appropriate members of Congress and congressional staff of the results of this panel before they are made public.
- 8. That Headquarters Marine Corps should make public the findings of this panel.
- 9. That the Commandant of the Marine Corps should coordinate the public release of the findings of this panel with the Office of U.S. Marine Corps Communication.

JAN C. HULY Lieutenant General, USMC (Ret) President of the Board

JASON Q. BOHM Brigadier General, USMC

MARY H. REINWALD Colonel, USMC (Ret)

DAVID L. MADDUX Sergeant Major, USMC

RANDY PAPADOPOULOS PhD, Navy Department Secretariat Historian KEIL R. GENTRY Colonel, USMC (Ret)

GARY SMITH Sergeant Major, USMC

RICHARD A. HAWKINS Sergeant Major, USMC (Ret)

CHARLES P. NEIMEYER Lieutenant Colonel, USMC (Ret) PhD, Director, History Division

#### ENDNOTE

 This printing represents as closely as possible the original document, with minor alterations to the text based on current standards for style, grammar, punctuation, and spelling and to accommodate for readability and this publication's format.
 The time for this grant was established as 1020

2. The time for this event was established as 1020.

## OFFICIAL REPORT OF THE BOWERS BOARD INVESTIGATION

APPENDIX



Report of the Board's Review of New Claims Regarding the Identity of the Second Flag Raisers atop Mount Suribachi, Iwo Jima<sup>1</sup>

Ref:

- (a) Wells, Lt John Keith. "Give Me Fifty Marines Not Afraid to Die": Iwo Jima. Abilene, TX: Ka-Well Enterprises, 1995.
- (b) Wheeler, Richard. The Bloody Battle for Suribachi. 1965. New York: Skyhorse Publishing, 2007.
- (c) Heinz, W. C., and Joe Rosenthal. "The Picture that Will Live Forever." *Collier's Weekly*, 18 February 1955, 62–67.
- (d) Albee Jr., Parker Bishop, and Keller Cushing Freeman. Shadow of Suribachi: Raising the Flags on Iwo Jima. Westport, CT: Praeger, 1995.
- (e) Brooks, Brian K. "Iwo Jima Flag Raising Analyses." Unpublished reports. Quantico, VA: Digital Evidence Laboratory, Federal Bureau of Investigation, 1 February 2019 and 23 April 2019.
- (f) Nalty, Bernard C., and Danny J. Crawford. *The United States Marines on Iwo Jima: The Battle and the Flag Raisings*. Washington, DC: History and Museums Division, Headquarters Marine Corps, 1995.
- (g) Wells, G. Greeley. "The Man Who Carried the Flag at Iwo Jima." *New York Times*, 17 October 1991, A26.

Encl:

- (1) CMC letter dated 4 February 2019, Precept Convening the Board to Review New Claims Regarding the Identity of the Second Flag Raisers atop Mount Suribachi, Iwo Jima
- (2) Report of the Huly Panel Review of New Information Regarding the Identity of the Second Flag Raisers atop Mount Suribachi, Iwo Jima, dated 26 April 2016; Report of the Huly Panel Review of Information Regarding the Identity of the First Flag Raisers atop Mount Suribachi, Iwo Jima, dat-

ed 11 July 2016; Memorandum for the Record: Errata, dated 31 August 2016; and Memorandum for the Record: *Gung Ho* Photo Identification, dated 22 March 2017 [Huly Panel Report]

- (3) Report of the Board Appointed to Determine the Identity of Personnel Who Participated in the Mount Suribachi Flag Raising as Photographed by Mr. Joe Rosenthal of the Associated Press, dated 15 January 1947 [del Valle Board Report]
- (4) Excerpts, Muster Roll of 2d Battalion, 28th Marines (February 1945); Excerpts, Muster Roll of Headquarters Battalion, 5th Marine Division (February 1945); Photograph of Company E, 2d Battalion, 28th Marines, at Camp Pendleton, Oceanside, California (Spring 1944)
- (5) Possible Complement of the Patrol led by First Lieutenant Harold G. Schrier on 23 February 1945, as determined by Mr. Stephen Foley and Colonel Keil R. Gentry, USMC (Ret), on 1 February 2019
- (6) Excerpts, After Action Report from Combat Team 28
- (7) Timeline of Archival Photographs depicting the First and Second Flag Raisings on Iwo Jima, 23
  February 1945, as determined by Dr. Breanne Robertson on 1 February 2019
- (8) Excerpts, D+4 Foreword and Photograph Captions written by Private First Class George Burns
- (9) Memorandum of Iwo Jima Uniform Analyses by Owen L. Conner, dated 6 February 2019
- (10) Casualty Cards for Sergeant Michael Strank, Corporal Harlon H. Block, Private First Class Franklin R. Sousley, and Private First Class Harold H. Schultz

#### AUTHORITY

The board was convened by CMC precept letter dated 4 February 2019. [Encl (1)]

#### BOARD COMPOSITION

President	Brigadier General William J. Bowers, USMC,
	Commanding General, EDCOM
Member	Colonel Robert C. Fulford, USMC, Director, EWS
Member	Colonel Keil R. Gentry, USMC (Ret), EDCOM
Member	Sergeant Major William J. Grigsby, Sergeant Major, TECOM
Member	Sergeant Major Douglas F. Cutsail, USMC, Sergeant Major, EDCOM
Member	Master Sergeant Stacy M. Patzman, USMC (Ret), EDCOM
Member/Recorder	Dr. Breanne Robertson, History Division

#### DATE AND LOCATION

The board convened at the Brigadier General Edwin H. Simmons Marine Corps History Center, Quantico, Virginia, at 0900 on 4 February 2019. The board concluded at 1700 on 6 May 2019.

#### PRELIMINARY STATEMENT

On 17 July 2018, Mr. Dustin Spence sent an email with a 102-slide PowerPoint presentation to Major General Orlo K. Steele, USMC (Ret). The brief, based on the diligent research of Mr. Stephen Foley and Mr. Brent Westemeyer, asserted multiple claims: (1) that Corporal Harold P. Keller of Company E, 2d Battalion, 28th Marine Regiment, is pictured in Associated Press photographer Joseph J. Rosenthal's famous flag-raising photograph in the position currently associated with Private First Class Rene A. Gagnon

[Rosenthal/4502230115], (2) that Sergeant Michael Strank's role as a second flag raiser can be confirmed through photographic evidence [Rosenthal/4502230115], (3) that Private First Class Gagnon is pictured in Private Robert R. Campbell's image of both flags as the first flag lowerer at the head of the flagpole [Campbell/112718], and (4) that the Marine standing behind Sergeant Henry O. Hansen in Rosenthal's *Gung Ho* photograph [Rosenthal/4502230131] is Corporal Harlon H. Block.

Many of the photographs included in the brief were reviewed as evidence during the 2016 Huly Panel investigation, convened by the Commandant on 19 April 2016, which determined the participation of Private First Class Harold H. Schultz in the second flag raising [Encl (2)]. However, Mr. Spence, Mr. Foley, and Mr. Westemeyer also introduced historical photographs from the private collection of Corporal Keller and from the George Burns Collection, U.S. Army Heritage and Education Center, Carlisle, Pennsylvania, that were not available to the Huly Panel members. These additional photographs provided perspectives and camera angles not available to the Huly Panel.

Because this brief presented new and compelling evidence that countered the official U.S. Marine Corps roster of second flag raisers, Major General Steele forwarded Mr. Spence's email to Lieutenant General Jan C. Huly, USMC (Ret), on 20 July 2018. On 9 August 2018, Lieutenant General Huly shared the PowerPoint presentation with members of the 2016 Huly Panel, as well as Marine Corps University's Commanding General, Education Command/President, Brigadier General William J. Bowers. The consensus among the Huly Panel members and Brigadier General Bowers was that the photographic evidence was persuasive enough to merit further investigation. The Commandant of the Marine Corps was informed of this development.

A research team consisting of Dr. Breanne Robertson and Colonel Keil Gentry, USMC (Ret), with assistance from Master Sergeant Stacy M. Patzman, USMC (Ret), undertook a detailed assessment of the claims put forward in the brief. These three individuals work at Marine Corps University. This small team expanded on prior source materials to include written correspondence; oral history interviews; and photographic negatives, prints, and motion picture footage held in public and private collections across the country. Dr. Robertson and Colonel Gentry further multiplied their efforts through collaboration with Mr. Foley, Mr. Westemeyer, and Mr. Spence.

The historical evidence assembled for this board's review reflects contributions from several individuals and institutions. As such, the cumulative data exceeds the quality and depth of research previously considered by the 1947 del Valle Board or 2016 Huly Panel [Encl (3), Encl (2)]. Of particular note:

- To evaluate the integrity of the photographs included in the Spence/Foley/Westemeyer slide deck, Dr. Robertson consulted the U.S. Marine Corps Pacific Negative Logbook and developed a parallel version using high-resolution scans taken directly from the archival print or negative, as available, from collections at the National Archives, Archives Branch, Marine Corps History Division, U.S. Army Heritage and Education Center, and Associated Press.
- Based on a formal request dated 31 October 2018 from the director of Marine Corps Staff, the Federal Bureau of Investigation's (FBI) Digital Evidence Laboratory undertook manual and automated analyses to assist with corroboration of the individuals associated with the second flag raising, first

flag lowering, and *Gung Ho* photographs across multiple visual media; equipment and clothing comparisons; and facial comparison examinations of subjects under review.

- The team examined Marine Corps veteran and author Richard Wheeler's personal papers, which served as the basis for two historical monographs on the Battle of Iwo Jima: *Iwo* and *The Bloody Battle for Suribachi*. Wheeler was a member of 3d Platoon, Company E, 2d Battalion, 28th Marine Regiment, during the Battle of Iwo Jima. His research files included audio-taped recordings of oral history interviews and letters from Wheeler's platoon-mates who fought on Iwo Jima, including Corporal Keller.
- The team reviewed Corporal Keller's personal effects and collected pertinent items, including historical photographs, letters, and newspaper clippings maintained in a family scrapbook.
- The team interviewed Mr. Rene Gagnon Jr. (Private First Class Gagnon's son) via telephone and email. The team also contacted the Wright Museum of World War II, Wolfeboro, New Hampshire; the Manchester Historic Association, New Hampshire; and the National Museum of the Marine Corps, Triangle, Virginia, to obtain battlefield photographs or personal effects of Private First Class Rene A. Gagnon for comparison to the flag-raising photographs, to no avail.
- The team consulted with the Marine Military Academy, Harlingen, Texas, and Weslaco Independent School District, Texas, to obtain additional photographs of Corporal Harlon H. Block for comparison to the *Gung Ho* photographs, to no avail.
- The team conducted telephone interviews with the four remaining World War II veterans who are members of the Brooklyn, Iowa, chapter of the American Legion, an organization to which Corporal Keller also belonged.
- In addition to revisiting official service record books and personal photographs of Sergeant Strank and Corporal Block, the team viewed *The Oath*, a documentary about Michael Strank.
- The team compiled material from a variety of other sources, including but not limited to: a 1991 video interview with first flag raiser and eyewitness to the second flag raising Private Philip L. Ward, maintained by the Carnegie Museum of Montgomery County and the Crawfordsville District Public Library, both in Crawfordsville, Indiana; artifacts held at the Brooklyn Historical Museum, Iowa; and the research files amassed by Dr. Parker Bishop Albee Jr. and Ms. Keller Cushing Freeman for their book, *Shadow of Suribachi*.

Once the initial research was complete, the board reviewed forensic photographic analyses, historical photographs and film, eyewitness statements, period uniform items presented by National Museum of the Marine Corps Uniforms and Heraldry Curator Owen L. Conner, and other available primary and secondary source materials related to the flag raising. The evidence reviewed by the board represents an aggregation of years of painstaking research by numerous historians, authors, forensics experts, and others.

The board adopted the position numbers previously assigned by the Huly Panel, as indicated in Mary Reinwald's chapter, to refer to individual locations within Rosenthal's photograph.

To build and reinforce objectivity of analysis and deliberation, the board also took the step of leveraging the latest technology and resources of the federal government, most notably by engaging the Federal Bureau of Investigation, to assist in identification of the participants. This board benefited from the FBI's assistance

in many ways. The FBI produced a report for the board using a seven-point scale ranging from +3 to -3 [see Reference (e)] to determine the degree of certainty for identifying individuals on Iwo Jima. The board adopted this scale for its deliberations on the four claims identified above. This method allows and accounts for inevitable improvements in technology that may, in time, strengthen our ability to authenticate and corroborate the individuals involved on Iwo Jima. In fact, the Marine Corps submitted a secondary request for the FBI's Digital Evidence Laboratory to perform the same forensic analyses to corroborate the previous identifications of Corporal Harlon H. Block, Private First Class Ira H. Hayes, Private First Class Franklin R. Sousley, and Private First Class Harold H. Schultz, as second flag raisers.

Finally, this board did not operate under time constraints or exigencies, anchoring its deliberations and findings on use of the most current technology, proven forensic photographic analysis methods of the FBI, examination of all available evidence, and the use of a common grading scale for authentication and corroboration of identities. The accuracy of the board's conclusions is based on the evidence, analyses, and technology available at this time. The board acknowledges that inevitable advances in technology and/or the introduction of additional photographic evidence may offer further context or clarity to this board's conclusions.

#### FINDINGS OF FACTS RELATED TO CLAIM ONE

#### Is Corporal Harold P. Keller in Position 2?

- 1. Corporal Harold P. Keller was a member of 3d platoon, Company E, 2d Battalion, 28th Marine Regiment (E/2/28). [Encl (2), (4); Ref (a), p. 182]
- 2. On the morning of 23 February 1945, Corporal Keller was a member of First Lieutenant Harold G. Schrier's patrol, which was tasked with securing the summit of Mount Suribachi and raising the first American flag. [Encl (5), (9); Ref (b), p. 115]
- 3. At 1020, Lieutenant Schrier and five members of his patrol (Platoon Sergeant Ernest I. Thomas Jr., Sergeant Henry O. Hansen, Pharmacist's Mate Second Class John H. Bradley, Corporal Charles Lindberg, Private Philip L. Ward) raised the first American flag on the summit. [Encl (2), (6)]
- 4. After the first flag raising but prior to the second flag raising, Army Private First Class George Burns of *Yank* magazine arrived at the summit and captured two photographs of Corporal Keller and Sergeant Howard M. Snyder shaking hands. [Encl (7), (8)]
- 5. Sergeant William H. Genaust and Private Robert R. Campbell, combat cameramen assigned to 5th Marine Division, and Associated Press photographer Joseph J. Rosenthal arrived at the summit shortly before the second flag raising. [Encl (4); Ref (c), p. 65]
- 6. The historical record indicates the second flag raising occurred between 1145 and 1230. A variety of times are provided across multiple first-hand accounts for the second flag raising, making it difficult to specify the precise minute the flag raised. [Ref (c), p. 65; Ref (d), p. 51]
- 7. Mr. Rosenthal captured a photograph of the second flag as it was being raised. [Encl (7); Ref (c), p. 65; (e)]
- 8. Private Campbell took a contemporaneous photograph of the first flag being lowered while the second flag was being raised [Campbell/112718]. This photograph shows a frontal view of the individual in position 2. The camouflage pattern and configuration of his clothing and equipment are clearly visible. [Encl (7); Ref (e)]
- Subsequently, Private Campbell captured a photograph of two Marines saluting the second flag [Campbell/112719]. This photograph shows a frontal view of the individual in position 2. The camouflage pattern and configuration of his clothing and equipment are clearly visible. [Encl (7); Ref (e)]
- 10. In the photographs taken by Private Campbell, the subject in position 2 is wearing a camouflage-patterned helmet cover and two bandoleers slung over one shoulder, which causes distinctive creases in his utility coat. [Encl (7); Ref (e)]
- 11. Private First Class Burns and Mr. Rosenthal took photographs of a large group posing beneath the second flag that later became known as the *Gung Ho* image. [Encl (7)]
- 12. In Private First Class Burns' photographs depicting Sergeant Snyder and Corporal Keller and in the *Gung Ho* photographs, Corporal Keller is wearing a camouflage-patterned helmet cover and two bandoleers slung over one shoulder, which causes distinctive creases in his utility coat. [Encl (7), (8)]
- In 2019, the FBI's Digital Evidence Laboratory determined extremely strong support (+3, i.e., the highest possible level of support) for the proposition that Corporal Keller is the subject in position 2, further stating, "In other words, Cpl Keller can be identified as the subject in Position #2 in the 2nd Flag Raising Photograph." [Ref (e)]

14. The FBI report determined some support for exclusion of Private First Class Rene A. Gagnon as the subject in position 2. [Ref (e)]

#### CONCLUSIONS RELATED TO CLAIM ONE

- 1. With extremely strong support for identification, the board determined that the subject in position 2 is Corporal Harold P. Keller.
- 2. With extremely strong support for exclusion, the board determined that the subject in position 2 is not Private First Class Rene A. Gagnon.

#### FINDING OF FACTS RELATED TO CLAIM TWO

Is Sergeant Michael Strank in Position 4?

- 1. Sergeant Michael Strank was a member of 2d Platoon, E/2/28. [Ref (d), p. 50; (e)]
- Sergeant Strank received orders from Captain Dave Severance, commanding officer of E Company, to collect a small patrol and lay communications wire to the summit of Mount Suribachi. [Ref (d), p. 50]
- 3. Sergeant Strank led a four-man squad that included himself, Corporal Harlon H. Block, Private First Class Ira H. Hayes, and Private First Class Franklin R. Sousley. [Encl (2); Ref (d), p. 51]
- 4. When Sergeant Strank arrived at the summit, he relayed to Lieutenant Schrier the order from Lieutenant Colonel Chandler W. Johnson, commanding officer of Landing Team, 2d Battalion, 28th Marine Regiment (LT228), to raise the second flag. [Ref (d), p. 51]
- 5. Sergeant Genaust filmed the preparation and raising of the second flag. [Encl (7); Ref (e)]
- 6. Sergeant Genaust captured four individuals holding the flagpole prior to it being raised. [Encl (7); Ref (e)]
- 7. Sergeant Genaust stopped filming and resumed again after an indeterminate length of time. [Encl (7); Ref (e)]
- 8. After the break in filming, the Genaust film shows six Marines holding the flagpole prior to it being raised. The Marine in position 4 is wearing a soft cap. [Encl (7); Ref (e)]
- 9. Mr. Rosenthal took a photograph of the second flag as it was being raised. [Encl (7); Ref (c), p. 65]
- Mr. Rosenthal took a subsequent photograph showing four individuals supporting the flagpole after it has been raised [Rosenthal/4502230123]. These individuals correspond to positions 1, 3, 4, and 6. [Encl (7); Ref (e)]
- In Rosenthal/4502230123, the Marine in position 4 is wearing an unbuttoned utility coat over an unzipped M1941 field jacket. He is wearing a watch on his left wrist. There is no ring on his left hand. [Encl (9); Ref (e)]
- After the second flag raising, Mr. Rosenthal and Private First Class Burns took a group photograph of Marines standing beneath the second flag that became known as the *Gung Ho* photograph. [Encl (7)]
- In the *Gung Ho* photographs, Sergeant Strank is wearing a helmet with a soft cap underneath and a buttoned utility coat over a M1941 field jacket. He is not wearing a ring on his left hand. [Encl (9); Ref (e)]
- 14. More than 100 photographs depicting the approximately 100 Marines and sailors ascending and atop Mount Suribachi were taken by Staff Sergeant Louis R. Lowery, Sergeant Louis R. Burmeister,

Staff Sergeant Meyers A. Cornelius, Sergeant William H. Genaust, Private Robert R. Campbell, Army Private First Class George Burns, Coast Guard Photographer's Mate 3d Class John Papsun, and Associated Press photographer Joseph J. Rosenthal on 23 February 1945. [Encl (7)]

- 15. Of the photographs reviewed by the board, only one other individual, who has not been previously identified, can be seen wearing a utility coat over a M1941 field jacket. He is wearing a ring on his left hand. [Encl (7)]
- 16. Sergeant Strank was killed in action on Iwo Jima on 1 March 1945. [Encl (10)]
- 17. Eyewitness statements identify Sergeant Strank in position 4. [Encl (3)]
- 18. In 2019, the FBI's Digital Evidence Laboratory determined limited support (+1) for the proposition that Sergeant Michael Strank is the subject in position 4. [Ref (e)]

#### CONCLUSION RELATED TO CLAIM TWO

1. The board determined some-to-strong support for the proposition that the subject in position 4 is Sergeant Michael Strank.

#### FINDING OF FACTS RELATED TO CLAIM THREE

Is Private First Class Rene A. Gagnon at the Head of the First Flag as It Is Being Lowered?

- 1. Private First Class Rene A. Gagnon was a member of E/2/28. [Encl (4)]
- The military occupational specialty of Private First Class Gagnon was messenger. On 23 February 1945, Private First Glass Gagnon was the battalion commander's runner from E/2/28. [Encl (4); Ref (f), p. 8]
- 3. After the first flag raising, Private First Class Gagnon received an order to courier radio batteries and a larger American flag to the summit of Mount Suribachi and return the first, smaller flag to the LT228 command post. [Encl (3); Ref (d), pp. 49–50.]
- 4. At some point, Private First Class Gagnon joined the wire-laying detail led by Sergeant Strank. [Ref (d), p. 51]
- 5. After Private First Class Gagnon arrived at the summit, the second flag was raised as the first flag was simultaneously lowered. [Encl (7)]
- 6. Eyewitness statements place Private First Class Gagnon on the summit during the second flag raising. [Encl (3)]
- 7. There is a lack of verifiable contemporaneous photographs of Private First Class Gagnon on the summit during the second flag raising. [Encl (7)]
- 8. Private Campbell took a photograph of the first flag being lowered [Campbell/112718]. [Encl (7)]
- 9. The individual at the head of the first flagpole in Private Campbell's photograph is wearing a camouflage-patterned helmet cover, a small pack or haversack on his back, an M1936 pistol belt with Marine utility knife or "Ka-Bar," and leggings over his boots. There is a hole beneath the right armpit of his service shirt, and he is wearing a watch on his left wrist. [Encl (7); Ref (e)]
- 10. Prior to the first flag being lowered, Private Campbell captured a photograph of an individual smoking a cigarette [Campbell/112715]. This individual is wearing a camouflage-patterned helmet cover, a small pack or haversack on his back, an M1936 pistol belt with a Marine utility knife or Ka-Bar, and leggings over his boots. There is a hole beneath the right armpit of his service shirt, and he is wearing a watch on his left wrist. [Encl (7); Ref (e)]

- 11. After the second flag raising, Mr. Rosenthal and Private First Class Burns took group photographs that became known as the *Gung Ho* image. [Encl (7)]
- 12. Private First Class Gagnon is not depicted in the Gung Ho photograph. [Encl (2), (7); Ref (e)]
- 13. The individual pictured at the head of the first flagpole in Private Campbell's photograph is not in the *Gung Ho* photograph. [Encl (7)]
- 14. The individual smoking a cigarette in Private Campbell's photograph is not in the *Gung Ho* photograph. [Encl (7)]
- 15. In 2019, the FBI's Digital Evidence Laboratory determined with extremely strong support (+3) that the individual at the head of the first flagpole in the flag-lowering photograph and the individual smoking the cigarette is the same person. [Ref (e)]
- 16. Due to a lack of fine detail in Private Campbell's photographs and a lack of contemporaneous photographs clearly showing the face, uniform, and equipment of Private First Class Gagnon from the summit, the FBI's Digital Evidence Laboratory determined no conclusion regarding the comparison between Private First Class Gagnon and the flag-lowering individual [Campbell/112718]/ smoking subject [Campbell/112715]. [Ref (e)]
- 17. Sometime after the second flag raising, Private First Class Gagnon returned the first flag to the LT228 command post. [Ref (g), p. A26]
- 18. While still on Iwo Jima, Technical Sergeant Keyes Beech, in conversation with Lieutenant Schrier and Private First Class Gagnon, identified the men pictured in Mr. Rosenthal's photograph as: Sergeant Michael Strank, Sergeant Henry O. Hansen, Pharmacist's Mate Second Class John H. Bradley, Private First Class Franklin R. Sousley, and Private First Class Rene A. Gagnon. [Encl (3)]
- After their return to the United States in April 1945, Pharmacist's Mate Second Class Bradley and Privates First Class Gagnon and Hayes served on temporary assigned duty in support of the Seventh War Loan drive. [Ref (d), pp. 95–124]

#### CONCLUSION RELATED TO CLAIM THREE

1. The board determined limited-to-strong support for the proposition that the flag-lowering subject in Private Campbell's photograph is Private First Class Rene A. Gagnon.

#### FINDING OF FACTS RELATED TO CLAIM FOUR

Is Corporal Harlon H. Block in the Gung Ho photograph?

- 1. Corporal Harlon H. Block was a member of 2d Platoon, E/2/28. [Encl (4); Ref (d), p. 50]
- 2. Corporal Block was a member of the wire-laying detail led by Sergeant Strank. [Encl (3); Ref (d), p. 50]
- 3. Corporal Block arrived at the summit prior to the second flag being raised. [Encl (3); Ref (d), p. 51]
- 4. Mr. Rosenthal took a photograph of the second flag as it was being raised. The individual in position 1 is wearing a helmet with a camouflage-patterned helmet cover. He also wears a bandoleer, stretching from his right shoulder to his left abdomen, over his M1941 field jacket. [Encl (7); Ref (c), p. 65]
- 5. Private Campbell took a contemporaneous photograph of the first flag being lowered while the second flag was being raised [Campbell/112718]. This photograph shows a profile view of the

individual in position 1 standing closest to the camera to the left of the second flag pole. The camouflage-patterned helmet cover worn by this individual is clearly visible. [Encl (7); Ref (e)]

- Subsequently, Private Campbell captured a photograph of two Marines saluting the second flag [Campbell/112719]. A partial view of the subject in position 1 and the camouflage-patterned helmet cover on his headgear is discernible behind and to the right of the individual in position 2. [Encl (7); Ref (e)]
- 7. Moments later, Mr. Rosenthal took a photograph showing four individuals supporting the flagpole after it has been raised [Rosenthal/4502230123]. These individuals correspond to positions 1, 3, 4, and 6. [Ref (e)]
- 8. In Rosenthal/4502230123, the individual in position 1 is wearing a helmet with a camouflage-patterned helmet cover. He also wears a bandoleer, stretching from his right shoulder to his left abdomen, over his M1941 field jacket. [Encl (7); Ref (e)]
- 9. After the second flag raising, Mr. Rosenthal took a group portrait that became known as the *Gung Ho* photograph. [Encl (7); Ref (c), p. 66]
- 10. The individual standing directly behind Sergeant Henry O. Hansen is almost entirely obscured in Mr. Rosenthal's photograph. The subject has heretofore never been identified. [Encl (2), (7)]
- 11. Contemporaneous with Mr. Rosenthal's *Gung Ho* photograph, Private First Class Burns took two nearly identical photographs of the same group of Marines. The face and helmet of the individual standing directly behind Sergeant Hansen are partially visible in these photographs. [Encl (7), (8)]
- 12. In 2019, the FBI's Digital Evidence Laboratory determined extremely strong support (+3) that the Marine in position 1 and the partially obscured individual in the *Gung Ho* photograph are the same person. [Ref (e)]
- 13. Eyewitness statements place Corporal Block in proximity to the second flag as it was being raised. [Encl (3)].
- 14. Corporal Block was killed in action on Iwo Jima on or about 1 March 1945. [Encl (10)]
- 15. In 1947, the del Valle Board identified Corporal Block as the Marine in position 1. [Encl (3)]
- 16. In 2019, the FBI's Digital Evidence Laboratory determined limited support (+1) for the proposition that Corporal Block is the subject depicted just to the left of the flagpole and in the back row of subjects depicted in the *Gung Ho* photograph. [Ref (e)]

#### CONCLUSIONS RELATED TO CLAIM FOUR

- 1. With extremely strong support for identification, the board determined that the subject in position 1 is Corporal Harlon H. Block.
- 2. With strong-to-extremely strong support for identification, the board determined that the previously unidentified individual behind Sergeant Henry O. Hansen in the *Gung Ho* photograph is Corporal Block.

#### FINDING OF FACTS RELATED TO POSITION 3 Is Private First Class Franklin R. Sousley in Position 3?

 Private First Class Franklin R. Sousley was a member of 2d Platoon, E/2/28. [Encl (4); Ref (d), p. 50]

- 2. Private First Class Sousley was a member of the wire-laying detail led by Sergeant Strank. [Encl (3); Ref (d), p. 50]
- 3. Private First Class Sousley arrived at the summit prior to the second flag being raised. [Encl (3); Ref (d), p. 51]
- 4. Mr. Rosenthal took a photograph of the second flag as it was being raised. The subject in position 3 is wearing a camouflage-patterned helmet cover and an ammunition belt featuring an empty canteen pouch and sheathed TL pliers (steel-gray, with nonslip handles). [Encl (2), (7); Ref (d), p. 65; (e)]
- Subsequently, Private Campbell captured a photograph of two Marines saluting the second flag [Campbell/112719]. The subject in position 3, who is closest to the camera and to the immediate left of the flagpole, shows a frontal view of the camouflage-patterned helmet cover and face. [Encl (7); Ref (e)]
- 6. Moments later, Mr. Rosenthal took a photograph showing four individuals supporting the flagpole after it has been raised [Rosenthal/4502230123]. These individuals correspond to positions 1, 3, 4, and 6. [Ref (e)]
- 7. In Rosenthal/4502230123, the individual in position 3 is wearing a helmet with a camouflage-patterned helmet cover. He also wears a soft cap under the helmet, which tilts down to the left of the subject's face, and an ammunition belt featuring an empty canteen pouch and sheathed TL pliers. A wire reel handle dangling from the belt over the left leg is also clearly visible. [Encl (2), (7); Ref (e)]
- 8. After the second flag raising, Mr. Rosenthal and Private First Class Burns took a group portrait that became known as the *Gung Ho* photograph. [Encl (7), (8)]
- 9. In the *Gung Ho* photograph, Private First Class Sousley is wearing a helmet with a camouflage-patterned helmet cover. Also visible is a soft cap under the helmet, which tilts down to the left of the subject's face. [Encl (7); Ref (e)]
- 10. Eyewitness statements place Private First Class Sousley in proximity to the second flag as it was being raised. [Encl (3)].
- 11. Private First Class Sousley was killed in action on Iwo Jima on or about 21 March 1945. [Encl (10)]
- 12. In 2016, the Huly Panel identified Private First Class Sousley as the Marine in position 3. [Encl (2)]
- 13. In 2019, the FBI's Digital Evidence Laboratory determined extremely strong support (+3, i.e., the highest possible level of support) for the proposition that Private First Class Sousley is the subject in position 3, further stating, "In other words, PFC Sousley can be identified as the subject in Position #3 in the 2nd Flag Raising Photograph." [Ref (e)]

#### **CONCLUSION RELATED TO POSITION 3**

 With extremely strong support for identification, the board determined that the subject in position 3 is Private First Class Franklin R. Sousley.

#### FINDING OF FACTS RELATED TO POSITION 5

Is Private First Class Harold H. Schultz in Position 5?

- 1. Private First Class Harold H. Schultz was a mortarman with E/2/28. [Encl (4)]
- 2. On the morning of 23 February 1945, Private First Class Schultz was a member of First Lieutenant Harold G. Schrier's patrol, which was tasked with securing the summit of Mount Suribachi and raising the first American flag. [Encl (2), (8)]

- 3. At 1020, Lieutenant Schrier and five members of his patrol (Platoon Sergeant Ernest I. Thomas Jr., Sergeant Henry O. Hansen, Pharmacist's Mate Second Class John H. Bradley, Corporal Charles Lindberg, Private Philip L. Ward) raised the first American flag on the summit. [Encl (2), (6)]
- 4. Staff Sergeant Louis R. Lowery, a combat cameraman for *Leatherneck* assigned to 5th Marine Division, accompanied Lieutenant Schrier's patrol and captured photographs of the mission to secure the summit of Mount Suribachi and raise the first American flag. [Encl (4), (7)]
- After the first flag raising but prior to the second flag raising, Staff Sergeant Lowery captured photographs of Private First Class Schultz providing security in the vicinity of the first flag raising. [Encl (2), (7)]
- 6. In a subsequent photograph, Staff Sergeant Lowery captured a photograph of Private First Class Schultz walking alongside Sergeant Henry O. Hansen and Private First Class James A. Robeson atop the summit of Mount Suribachi [Lowery/Coll2575.19]. This photograph provides a frontal view of Private First Class Schultz in which the camouflage-patterned helmet cover and rifle sling attached to the stacking swivel are clearly visible. [Encl (7); Ref (e)]
- Sergeant William H. Genaust and Private Robert R. Campbell, combat cameramen assigned to 5th Marine Division, and Associated Press photographer Joseph J. Rosenthal arrived at the summit shortly before the second flag raising. [Encl (4); Ref (c), p. 65]
- 8. Mr. Rosenthal took a photograph of the second flag as it was being raised. The camouflage-patterned helmet cover is visible on the subject in position 5. [Encl (7); Ref (c), p. 65; (e)]
- 9. Sergeant Genaust captured motion picture of the second flag raising and the events immediately following, when Marines are stabilizing the flagpole. The individual in position 5 can be seen wearing a helmet with a camouflage-patterned helmet cover and a dangling strap on the left side of his head. The subject also has a sling attached to the stacking swivel instead of being properly attached to the upper hand guard sling swivel of his rifle. [Encl (2), (7); Ref (e)]
- 10. Private Campbell took a contemporaneous photograph of the first flag being lowered while the second flag was being raised [Campbell/112718]. This photograph shows the individual in position 5 stepping away from the other members of the flag-raising detail. Although the Marine is almost entirely obscured by the group lowering the first flag and the surrounding terrain, the camouflage pattern and dangling strap on his headgear remain partially visible. [Encl (7); Ref (e)]
- 11. After the second flag raising, Mr. Rosenthal and Private First Class Burns took a group portrait that became known as the *Gung Ho* photograph. [Encl (7), (8)]
- 12. In the *Gung Ho* photographs, Private First Class Schultz is wearing a helmet with a camouflage-patterned helmet cover and a soft cap underneath, which curves down on both sides. The helmet tilts up on the left side of his head, with a broken helmet liner strap dangling on this side. [Encl (7); Ref (e)]
- 13. In 2016, the Huly Panel identified Private First Class Schultz as the Marine in position 5. [Encl (2)]
- 14. In 2019, the FBI's Digital Evidence Laboratory determined strong support (+2) for the proposition that Private First Class Schultz is the subject in position 5. [Ref (e)]

#### CONCLUSION RELATED TO POSITION 5

1. With strong-to-extremely strong support for identification, the board determined that the subject in position 5 is Private First Class Harold H. Schultz.

#### FINDING OF FACTS RELATED TO POSITION 6

Is Private First Class Ira H. Hayes in Position 6?

- 1. Private First Class Ira H. Hayes was a member of 2d Platoon, E/2/28. [Encl (4); Ref (d), p. 50]
- 2. Private First Class Hayes was a member of the wire-laying detail led by Sergeant Strank. [Encl (3); Ref (d), p. 50]
- 3. Private First Class Hayes arrived at the summit prior to the second flag being raised. [Encl (3); Ref (d), p. 51]
- Mr. Rosenthal took a photograph of the second flag as it was being raised. The subject in position 6 is wearing a helmet with a camouflage-patterned helmet cover and distinctive creases in the fabric. His complexion is noticeably darker than most of the individuals present on the summit of Mount Suribachi, and he is carrying an M1 carbine. [Encl (7); Ref (c), p. 65; (e)]
- Mr. Rosenthal took a subsequent photograph showing four individuals supporting the flagpole after it has been raised [Rosenthal/4502230123]. These individuals correspond to positions 1, 3, 4, and 6. [Ref (e)]
- 6. In Rosenthal/4502230123, the individual in position 6 is wearing a helmet with a camouflage-patterned helmet cover and distinctive creases in the fabric. His complexion is noticeably darker than most of the individuals present on the summit of Mount Suribachi, and he is carrying an M1 carbine. [Encl (7); Ref (e)]
- 7. After the second flag raising, Mr. Rosenthal and Private First Class Burns took a group portrait that became known as the *Gung Ho* photograph. [Encl (7), (8)]
- 8. In the *Gung Ho* photographs, Private First Class Hayes is wearing a helmet with a camouflage-patterned helmet cover and distinctive creases in the fabric. His complexion is noticeably darker than most of the individuals present on the summit of Mount Suribachi, and he is carrying an M1 carbine. [Encl (7); Ref (e)]
- 9. Eyewitness statements place Private First Class Hayes in proximity to the second flag as it was being raised. [Encl (3)].
- After their return to the United States in April 1945, Pharmacist's Mate Second Class Bradley and Privates First Class Gagnon and Hayes served on temporary assigned duty in support of the Seventh War Loan drive. [Ref (d), pp. 95–124]
- 11. In 2019, the FBI's Digital Evidence Laboratory determined extremely strong support (+3, i.e., the highest possible level of support) for the proposition that Private First Class Hayes is the subject in position 6, further stating, "In other words, PFC Hayes can be identified as the subject in Position #6 in the 2nd Flag Raising Photograph." [Ref (e)]

#### CONCLUSION RELATED TO POSITION 6

1. With extremely strong support for identification, the board determined that the subject in position 6 is Private First Class Ira H. Hayes.

#### OPINIONS

1. Previous attempts to accurately identify the flag raisers in Mr. Rosenthal's iconic photograph were complicated by the death of key participants, the stress of combat, the lack of recognition as to the

significance of the second flag raising at the time of its occurrence, the haste to include participants from the flag-raising event in the Seventh War Loan drive, and the subsequent passage of time.

- 2. An in-person review of period uniforms in consultation with National Museum of the Marine Corps Uniforms and Heraldry Curator Owen L. Conner is consistent with the uniform configuration worn by Sergeant Strank in the *Gung Ho* photograph (buttoned utility coat over zipped M1941 field jacket) and the visible portions of the uniform of the subject in position 4 of Rosen-thal/4502230123 (unbuttoned utility coat over unzipped M1941 field jacket).
- 3. Sergeant Strank is the only individual present in the photographs reviewed by the board with this uniform configuration who also is not wearing a ring on his left hand.
- 4. Prior to the break in the Genaust film, the presence of four Marines holding the second flagpole in combination with the identification of Sergeant Strank, Corporal Block, Private First Class Hayes, and Private First Class Sousley in positions 4, 1, 6, and 3, respectively, indicates that squad integrity of the wire-laying detail was retained.
- 5. Private First Class Gagnon was present in the vicinity of the second flag raising at the time Mr. Rosenthal captured his well-known photograph of that event.
- 6. Private First Class Gagnon played a key role in the second flag raising by carrying the larger American flag to the crest of Mount Suribachi and returning the first flag to be safely preserved.
- 7. Private First Class Gagnon may have departed the summit to return the first flag to the LT228 command post when the *Gung Ho* photograph was taken.
- 8. The individual in Private First Class Burns' *Gung Ho* photographs resembles known photographs of Corporal Block.
- 9. All members of the wire-laying detail led by Sergeant Michael Strank are depicted in the *Gung Ho* photograph.
- 10. All members of the second flag raising are depicted in the *Gung Ho* photograph.
- 11. The individual at the head of the first flagpole in Private Campbell's photograph [Campbell/112718] resembles known photographs of Private First Class Gagnon taken after his return to the United States.
- 12. The individual pictured smoking a cigarette in Private Campbell's photograph [Campbell/112715] resembles known photographs of Private First Class Gagnon taken after his return to the United States.
- 13. The uniform configuration of an M1936 pistol belt with a Marine utility knife or Ka-Bar is consistent with, albeit not exclusive to, the military occupational specialty of a messenger.
- 14. Early identification of Private First Class Gagnon in position 2 may have arisen from his participation in the simultaneous lowering of the first flag and the raising of the second flag.
- 15. Historical evidence clearly highlights the national imperative in 1945 for the defeat of Japan. The Seventh War Loan drive served as an essential component to prepare the nation fiscally for the final phases of war. The exigencies of the moment and the desire to capitalize on the victory at Iwo Jima symbolized by the second flag raising contributed to the initial misidentification of the flag raisers.
- 16. The participation of Pharmacist's Mate Second Class Bradley, Private First Class Gagnon, and Private First Class Hayes in the Seventh War Loan drive had positive strategic impact on the war.

#### RECOMMENDATIONS

- 1. Barring the presentation of new evidence to the contrary, the board concludes the identities of the subjects in the second flag-raising photograph are as follows:
  - a. Position 1: Corporal Harlon H. Block
  - b. Position 2: Corporal Harold P. Keller
  - c. Position 3: Private First Class Franklin R. Sousley
  - d. Position 4: Sergeant Michael Strank
  - e. Position 5: Private First Class Harold H. Schultz
  - f. Position 6: Private First Class Ira H. Hayes
- 2. That the Commandant of the Marine Corps inform the appropriate relatives of Sergeant Michael Strank, Corporal Harold P. Keller, Corporal Harlon H. Block, Private First Class Rene A. Gagnon, Private First Class Ira H. Hayes, Private First Class Harold H. Schultz, and Private First Class Franklin R. Sousley of the results of this board before they are made public.
- 3. That the Commandant of the Marine Corps issue a public statement regarding the revised identification of the second flag raisers based on the best information currently available, to include an acknowledgment of the collective efforts of all Marines, sailors, soldiers, and Coast Guardsmen during the Battle of Iwo Jima.
- 4. That the Commandant of the Marine Corps recognize that all previous efforts at identification were conducted in good faith and that no official blame be assessed for previous inaccuracies in the historical record.
- 5. That the Commandant of the Marine Corps recognize the assistance of Mr. Stephen Foley, Mr. Brent Westemeyer, Mr. Dustin Spence, Mrs. Kay Keller Maurer, Ms. Margery Wheeler Mattox, and Ms. Louise Miller; the FBI's Digital Evidence Laboratory whose personnel performed the FBI analyses; Dr. Parker Albee, professor emeritus at University of Southern Maine; Mr. Charles Zoeller, Associated Press communications officer; and Mr. Justin Gamache, curator at the Wright Museum of World War II.
- 6. That the Commandant of the Marine Corps direct that this board's report and associated records be deposited in the Marine Corps History Division's archives.
- 7. That the Office of Legislative Affairs inform appropriate members of Congress and congressional staff of the results of this board before they are made public.
- 8. That the findings of this board be made public.
- 9. That the Commandant of the Marine Corps coordinate the public release of the findings of this board with the Office of U.S. Marine Corps Communication.
- 10. That the National Museum of the Marine Corps and other Marine Corps monuments, displays, and educational programs be updated to reflect the correct identification of the second flag raisers.

WILLIAM J. BOWERS Brigadier General, USMC President of the Board

ROBERT C. FULFORD Colonel, USMC KEIL R. GENTRY Colonel, USMC (Ret)
WILLIAM J. GRIGSBY Sergeant Major, USMC

STACY M. PATZMAN Master Sergeant, USMC (Ret) DOUGLAS F. CUTSAIL Sergeant Major, USMC

BREANNE ROBERTSON PhD, Historian, History Division

#### ENDNOTE

1. This printing represents as closely as possible the original document, with minor alterations to the text based on current standards for style, grammar, punctuation, and spelling and to accommodate for readability and this publication's format.

# APPENDIX F

## ORAL HISTORY INTERVIEW WITH JOSEPH ROSENTHAL

by Fred H. Allison, PhD

Joseph Rosenthal's description of the famous flag raising on Iwo Jima comes from an oral history interview conducted by Benis M. Frank on 25 June 1975. Frank served as the Marine Corps History Division's oral historian from 1965 to 1991.<sup>1</sup> Indeed, he started the program. Frank traveled to San Francisco from Washington, DC, to meet with Rosenthal at his home. A major aspect and collecting focus of History Division's Oral History Program was (and remains) obtaining career interviews of noteworthy Marines or others who had a direct bearing on the history of the Corps. Rosenthal, although not a Marine, certainly played a substantial role in Marine Corps history by snapping the iconic Mount Suribachi flag-raising photo.

The following interview segment represents only a small part of the full 200-minute interview conducted by Frank. This interview resulted in an 85-page transcript. The interview was recorded with audio only on a reel-to-reel tape. In 2002, this audio tape, along with thousands of others, was digitized along with the transcript. These documents are now retained within the oral history collection at History Division, Marine Corps University, Quantico, Virginia.

When conducting an oral history interview, the interviewer will use a common technique of asking a broad, open-ended question and then allow the interviewee to speak at length on the topic. This allows the person to provide a thorough description of the event or experience in context, with reflections on its significance and effect, fully capturing the human perspective and personal experience. By this method, the interviewee recounts what they consider most compelling information that remains clearest in their memory. In the following interview, Frank asks a single question whereby Rosenthal tells his story. The interview continues for many pages with little input or prompt from the interviewer, as Rosenthal stays on subject, is well-spoken, and gives a cogent account of this historical event with a good bit of context and feeling. To provide the interview with structure and organization, simulated questions have been inserted in brackets at appropriate points to keep the reader on track.

#### U.S. MARINE CORPS HISTORY DIVISION ORAL HISTORY INTERVIEW

Interviewee:	Joseph J. Rosenthal
Interviewer:	Benis M. Frank
Date of interview:	25 June 1975 <sup>2</sup>
Location:	San Francisco, CA

- **Frank**: How did the Marines compare with them [referring to other components of the military that Rosenthal had visited previously as a war correspondent]?
- Rosenthal: The Marines are the greatest guys for going with on a fight! Sometimes they're boring as hell during peacetime; and yet, I guess I have to swallow that because when they're walking around, you can still see that pride in uniform. You don't see a sloppy Marine because it's been so hard to get into this Corps—The training has been so severe, and they have made good, and they know they've made good; and this is a number one team. They have read about their own history and it's been drilled into them. And when they go out into a battle area, they may not be conscious of their doing it, but they're urged along to make history of their own for the next group that comes along. . . . They are a select group; they have gone through difficult training to get in and stay in, and admonishment or an infraction is a very serious thing to them, even minor ones. I've watched them. They are proud of the accomplishments of their buddies. Some of the guys who've been in the most terrific action are the ones [who] are most surprised that you're talking about them.
- [What stands out in your mind about the fighting on Iwo Jima?]

Iwo Jima, in my mind, was like Peleliu, only

more of it. How can you explain going through the rain without getting wet? I was sitting in a shell hole and felt something burning my pants leg; and it was a tiny piece of metal. I just brushed it aside. Where in the hell did that come from? The piece of shrapnel, if it had come on a direct line, it would have torn through my leg. It had ricocheted a couple of times. That was as close as I came. It was very difficult to move around in, to move ahead. The sand was quite deep. You had to plow your way through; it was tiring. You picked out a spot, maybe 10 yards ahead at a time. How can you tell when the right time is to run ahead on a field, pick it out? A bullet doesn't tell you when it's coming.

Anyway, there were a lot of down-toearthy scenes. An assault landing is not something nice and neat, where a man carries and runs forward with a flag and he is hit by a nice, clean shot; [he] passes the flag to somebody else, and they go on. It smells; it's bodies lying around-maybe an arm here or a leg here or part of it. Dark splotches on the sand where the blood is seeping down. There are a number of places where up-ended rifle marks [a buried body]. Where a buddy has placed it for graves registration. And to see a lot of the smoke and the sounds, all kinds of sounds from little cracks to thundering types of things. To see corpsmen with stretchers slightly bent over; but they're still great targets as they run, trot with somebody in a canvas stretcher.

I once shouted, "Hey, see if you can come around that place here!" And somebody yelled back, "Why in the hell don't you do something useful?" It got to me. I went over to try to give a hand. But then, they got to where they were going, and I went on to do what I was being paid to do by AP [the Associated Press]. Yes, I was being paid to do this. I was getting a salary as an Associated Press correspondent. I had choices. I could go back. Of course, if you're in the landing boat, there's only one direction [to go]. You know everybody's going that way. What keeps you going is that the other guys are doing it. What the hell right have I to go back when they're doing this. Yes, they're creating pictures for me too.

I never felt that there would be any great loss if I were knocked off. I'd hate to be wounded badly; I'd hate to have a part of me shot away. When I got into the landing boat, off the ship- Now, we were scheduled to land about H+l hour [one hour after the first waves had hit the beach]. We didn't land until H+3 hours because of the mess, because of various other things that were happening. A heavy surf was piling up a lot of the boats; some of them were being hit by zeroed in artillery, messing up the beach. We circled for a long, long time. There were 18 or 20 youngsters in that boat, and there I was. By now, I'm the great veteran-New Guinea, Guam, Peleliu. I'm hardened. I'm supposed to be. I didn't want to know these guys. I didn't want to be friends. As I looked around the boat, I figured [that] you, you, you, maybe you are not coming back; you, you, you are very likely to be wounded-some, more or less, badly. With a little luck, some of us are going to come back. What if I started chatting with little Charlie Smith: What's your family like? Let me see your pictures. Get intimate. And then I find that Charlie Smith got it. This happened to me at Guam going into the boat. I got to know some of the guys.

[Can you describe the progression of events that brought you to the top of Mount Suribachi and in position to capture the famous flag-raising image?]

> My stumbling onto that picture was, in all respects, accidental. I had been out to the command ship the evening before and was

headed back toward shore. And as it got close, a boatswain on an LCT [landing craft, tank] told us, Bill [Hipple, correspondent for *Newsweek*] and me, that they heard over the radio that there was a flag—American flag—going up to the top of the mountain [Mount Suribachi]. I couldn't see it out there, but someone said he thought he saw a spot up there. Well, "I'd better go take a look." Now, there were other correspondent-photographers along the way, but I didn't know where they were.

But I went up, and I was late [by] at least an hour-an hour and a half-as they pinned it down later on. I found that the official time for that first flag going up there was about 1035 in the morning. And near as I can pin down, the time . . . this is by consulting with a priest who said mass up there, and various other things, which I did objectively-I mean, I went backward. I found that my picture was taken closer to noon. Anyway, when I heard that, I thought I'd better go up and take a look. Now, I heard that it was a patrol of four guys that had gone up there. That's the way I heard it. By the time that I got there, there was, more or less, a stream of guys going up. It's hard climbing. Every once in a while, we'd have to duck because there'd be [someone would shout] "fire in the hole" and throwing grenades in the caves. But as I approached the brow of the hill of Suribachi, I saw guys about a 100 yards away from the flagpole that was already up. And it was a fairly small flag on a long pole, and it was [waving] in the breeze. There again I felt one of those little clutches at the heart-this was our flag. I'm still touched by recollection. Stopped there for a moment.

And as I came closer— There were several Marines [who] were kneeled on the ground, and one of them had a folded flag in the traditional triangular folded [shape] under his arm. And they had a pole out there, and they were fiddling around with some kind of wire or rope—whatever it was—and I said, "What's doing, fellows?" They said, "Well, we've got to take down the other flag and keep that as a souvenir, and put up this larger flag so they can be seen better around the whole of the island."

That gave me time to walk around, and I made a survey. Now, I had no idea of any great importance to be attached to those pictures. It was an incident during the battle. I wasn't thinking, of course, in any terms that it would be a lasting picture, an inspiring thing, or any of that. It was one of a number of pictures that I was taking during the course of the battle. Some of them were tense situations; some of them were, more or less, pictorial in nature and so on. First of all, I tried to find the four guys [who] had been mentioned. I had some names. I looked around; I couldn't find them and I got no help from the lieutenant either. You know, he had things to do; he was busy. There was still shooting into caves. There was still a lot of potential opposition all around the place. That was [Harold G.] Schrier. . . . I don't mean it as critically as it might sound, because I do appreciate that he had things to do.

So I attempted to get those fellows; but it seemed to be too difficult to do and I just, again, I passed over it. I'm not thinking of something of any great importance anyway. So as I walked over and took a position where I could estimate that I would get the whole throw of this pole upward with that larger flag. I looked around and I spotted a couple of sandbags that raised me a foot or so, and I'm already pretty close to the ground. Well, it was enough, and I simply waited for a moment or two.

[Now you are in position to take a photo. What happened next?]

By that time, Bill Genaust, the Marine pho-

tographer, came across in front of me and over to my right, just an arm's length. He said: "I'm not in your way, am I, Joe?" And I said, "Oh, no." I turned from him, and [looking] out of the corner of my eye, I said, "Hey, Bill, there it goes!" By being polite to each other, we both damn near missed the scene. I swung my camera around and held it until I could guess that this was the peak of the action, and [I] shot. Of course, I couldn't say positively I had the picture—something like shooting a football play; you don't brag about it until it's developed.

Notice the historic moving sequence that he [Genaust] shot on this in color film-You'll note one thing: that that action of that flag raising starts right now. There's no preliminary footage. That's the reason that we both almost got caught short by this Alphonse-Gaston act.3 Bill was that kind of a guy. He was a high-grade guy. Bill was killed a few days later, a week or so later. He got too close to a cave entrance where Japanese [soldiers] had holed up, and [they] got him caught right in a cross fire. Now they shot him, and they pulled him inside the cave. I went down to inquire about him a couple of years after, and also 10 years after, and I could not find the grave registration for him. I think it was one of the caves that they simply had to seal up.

[Once the photograph is taken, what happens?]

After shooting this picture—and by this time, there was something like 50 Marines around, up on that top of that hill—some of them were still occupying themselves by testing caves and occasionally shooting, but there were grenades tossed and so on. So, it was still active up there. There I was. What I did after the first picture that I shot, I took a second picture of a couple of the Marines. One held the pole, while others were going for a

guy rope to hold it in an upright position. That was kind of a dull picture—didn't turn out too well. And then for a third picture, I went around and said, "Come on, fellows, I want to get a bunch of you. Wave your helmets and give it the old gung ho." They said, "Nah. We don't want-" I said, "Come on. It's a historic picture." I was just kidding, of course. I had no idea that any picture that I was taking had any lasting value. Well, I took that picture, and that third one was the end of a film pack. I substituted another film pack and repeated that one then I came down the hill. As I came down, took a couple of other inconsequential type pictures. Oh, I did take pictures of myself up there with my friends. And we changed positions and angle of the camera.

Now, I came down from the hillside; and although it was about one o'clock, as I recall, when I got down-and the reason I can remember: I was getting hungry. I bummed a small pack of rations. It was sufficient for me. Most guys threw the stuff around, but I liked it. I learned not to carry too much equipment. A couple of pairs of socks-that was important-not necessarily a change of any other clothing. No, you didn't need to call on it for several days. I didn't carry but one K-ration package about the size of a crackerjack box; but what I did carry and kept was the key [that] wound or unwound the tin top from the little hash that most of the guys threw away. I kept that key because some of the guys who were more persnickety were throwing their tins-chopped ham in a little tin-throwing it on the beach. Hell, I had my key in my pocket, and that's all I needed to carry. I'd pick up on the beach enough to satisfy my hunger. The first couple of days, you're not eating much anyway. A canteen of water was much more valuable. I carried two canteens of water, a package of K-rations, a couple pairs of socks. I did carry a small, compact flash unit. Maybe a half dozen flash bulbs just in case I was in a cave. I did carry a telephoto lens.

[Can you described how you came to learn that one of the photographs you took atop Mount Suribachi was quite a sensation?]

> Now the flag picture— Someone [who] was in the darkroom that saw it come up and responded to it, and said that was a good picture. And this is what I was told by guys who were out there in the lab. While I was still out there at Iwo, I got a radio message. It said, "Congratulations on fine Suribachi flag picture." Or something to that effect. Now, I didn't know which picture they meant, and I thought perhaps it was the one that I worked on getting these guys up there, not the one that was entirely accidental.

[What is your perspective on the famous image and its composition? Why do you think it received so much acclaim?]

> I had nothing to do with the number of people who were in that picture or who raised that flag. I did not give a signal as to when it would go up. All of the fortunate things that can happen in one picture happened together without any urging on my part. In this picture, I say that every essential of the picture happened as a fortunate circumstance for the photographer. The wind whipped that flag across the subjects in defiance of inertia. Normally, when you swing a pole up that way, the flag would be draped behind. It would have changed the complete composition entirely; it would have made it a mediocre composition. It whipped across because there was a wind at that particular time in the direction indicated in the picture. It took that flag across and made it part of the good composition; and I certainly didn't have the wind to make

it go that fast. Now the lighting effect, which comes from above—a noontime sun directly above these figures—gives it a sculpturing effect. The strain that is implicit in these pictures is because that is not a wooden pole; it happens to be an iron or lead pipe, something like 20 feet long, perhaps two inches in diameter. [It weighed] maybe 150 or 200 pounds, I would guess. It had to be thrown up in a sudden movement, an exertion of energy there; that shows in the picture. All of these elements [were] not under my control.

When I took that sandbag and piled it up so that I could get up high enough to get some of that bramble from cutting too much of the foreground, it was just the right amount. Those guys who blasted the top of the hill—the Japanese position there and left those bags around there, left me just enough. I think without some of that bramble in the foreground it also would lose something that contributed to the picture: the wildness of the scene gives it, again, more energy in the picture.

And this is why, as I said before, had I been setting up such a picture in the first place, I think I would have used fewer guys maybe three or four. I would have had them, perhaps, turn their heads a little bit so that they might be recognized. I'd have done things with all the skill that I say I've got. I think [as a result] I would have diminished its impact. I'm satisfied that never again will I have as good fortune in one picture. And yet, there are pictures that have as much meaning to me, that were difficult to get to and get away with; and I think I've been a very lucky guy for some time.

I was certainly, at that time, a lucky guy to be with great fighting guys, boys who became men very fast. And they did it for us. To this day—I don't want to lay it on [too thick]—but I'm appreciative that they did our fighting for us and for the people who are still here, citizens who are still here. Tremendous sacrifice!

[When did you finally see the photograph? What was your reaction?]

The first time I saw the picture was a few days after the radiogram. I say, I must have gotten that on perhaps the seventh or eighth day of the battle. Then I was there for about 12 days (13 or 14) at Iwo. Probably I saw it, myself—I would say perhaps about—perhaps 12 days after I had taken it. And when I saw it, I said: "That is a good picture. Good!" Who am I to differ with so many editors, you know?

I did have that feeling that it was all right. And there were copies of the picture around; and several of my buddies latched on to them. And then when I got the word that I was expected to come back, I left all those first prints there. But that doesn't matter. What's an "original"? I mean, it's all in the negative. Now, that negative is still in the vaults of the Associated Press. It's a thin-base film-probably has a lot of pinpoints on it now. I think a better print is really off of a copy of a good print. Although technically, it belonged to all of the syndicates-news services in the pool [such as] International News Photos, Time, Life, Associated Press, NEA [Newspaper Editors Association]-Acme-they agreed that Associated Press would copyright it; and that was for the purpose of protecting it from commercial use. They didn't want, for instance, to have a picture like this turn up for an underarm deodorant ad.

[Were you involved in any of the public relations activities featuring the flag-raising image?]

> And so, I came back. What they wanted me back there for was it was already engendered and in motion—the activity tour using this picture for the Seventh War Loan drive. They

wanted me back there to do a little public relations; public relations for Associated Press, public relations for the War Bond Drive.

[After returning to the States,] I was often asked to give speeches. Like one time, the guy in Louisville [Kentucky], Headquarters Recruiting there, wrote to me; and he wrote months ahead-he wrote in something like November for a February or March possibility-and he said very much to do that here, this friendly Kentucky small town- It turned out to be such a payoff for the Marines that, I think, it's almost indescribable. I saw some of the nicest people that I've ever seen in my life. From Louisville, they had to fly in helicopters about a hundred miles to this little Elizaville Cemetery, I think, near Franklin [Kentucky]—itself a small town. When we got there, it seemed like all the people, maybe all 125 of the region, were there at the cemetery. The governor flew in a helicopter too.

The whole thing was so beautiful. From little kids—little tots—on to teenagers and beyond, and some veterans, and some aging people from another war way back. They all were there. And this [Private First Class] Franklin [R.] Sousley was a symbol to them; really a symbol to them. They were so proud of this guy giving his life for his country. I was expected to make a talk—not the governor, who was really an attractive guy—I was forewarned. And I made notes about the battles; and I figuratively threw them all away when I looked out there on these people and I felt radar right back. All I could say was:

I'm proud to be here. I had the good fortune to be a correspondent in that war, one of many correspondents. And our job was to try to transfer something of what our boys were doing out there, transfer that to the people at home so that they could know what kind of job they were doing out there. We simply judge ourselves among ourselves on how well or how poorly we do that job. Sometimes it works out well. I had a vicarious part in it because a picture I took somehow transmits to you an action on the part of one of your own boys. We owe him, we all owe him, and all the boys like him. We, who are here today, owe him.

I thought I only took a minute and a half or something like that. I felt the quiet was good. I even had a feeling that I was good later and that's awful. And yet it was the most rewarding thing that I had ever in 30 years [done]. How do you do— I appreciate— And then we all should appreciate trying to say the right things. I was so glad that I went to Louisville.

[How did the photograph affect you personally? What is its significance?]

> Now, I do have the right to sell copies of the picture. I started to do it; and damn it, I couldn't do it. I simply couldn't get myself to do it. I suppose that sometime, if I'm in poverty—which I'm not that far gone by a long shot—maybe I'll sell some pictures.

> I see all that blood running down the sand. I see those limbs out there. I see those awful, impossible positions to take in a frontal attack on such an island where the batteries opposing you are not only staggered up in front of you, but standing around at the sides as you're coming on the shore. The awesome situation! Before they ever reach that peak. Now, that a photograph can serve to remind us of the contributions of those boys-that was what was important-not who took it or that even a photographer took it, or a carpenter, or whoever. This was a very important contribution to our survival-and they did it. And, of course, I'm pleased that I-and it could have been anybody-but it was me (I can't avoid that) who took the picture. The important thing is [that] what it is and what

it does to reflect and remind people that these guys were there.

#### ENDNOTES

- During its history, the current agency known as Marine Corps History Division has carried multiple titles, including Historical Section, Historical Branch, Historical Division, and History and Museums Division. For the purposes of this work, we will use the modern terminology for the division.
- 2. This partial transcript has been edited to facilitate ease of readership, eliminating obvious gaffs, duplications, and false starts. Otherwise, the text reflects what was spoken at the time, and readers are asked to bear in mind that they are reading a transcript of the spoken word rather than the written word. Note that some of the scenes described above are graphic in nature.
- 3. "Alphonse and Gaston" was an American comic strip by Frederick Burr Opper from the early 1900s. These bumbling Frenchmen's antics explored extreme politeness, coining the phrase "After you, my dear Alphonse."

## APPENDIX

## BIOGRAPHICAL SKETCHES OF KEY PERSONNEL

by Ross E. Phillips with Annette Amerman

#### C. C. BEALL

Cecil Calvert Beall was born on 15 October 1892 in Saratoga, Wyoming. Moving to New York City for his education, he studied at the Pratt Institute and the Art Students League of New York. Beall earned acclaim for his work for Collier's and the Saturday Eve*ning Post*, eventually becoming the art director for the National Democratic Party throughout President Franklin Roosevelt's administration. During World War II, Beall produced covers for Collier's depicting various World War II heroes. He also created the official poster for the Seventh War Loan campaign, using Rosenthal's famous photograph. At the war's conclusion, Beall's rendering of the Japanese surrender ceremony aboard the USS Missouri (BB 63) was selected as the official portrait of the event by President Harry S. Truman. Beall passed away on 4 May 1970.

#### HARLON H. BLOCK

Harlon Henry Block was born in Yorktown, Texas, on 6 November 1924. Block was inducted into the Marine Corps through the Selective Service System in San Antonio on 18 February 1943 and transferred to Marine Corps Recruit Depot San Diego. After recruit training, Block attended the Parachute Training School at San Diego. Shortly after his qualification, he was promoted to private first class. Prior to Iwo Jima, he participated in the campaign at Bougainville before returning to the United States and transferring to Company E, 2d Battalion, 28th Marines, in the newly created 5th Marine Division. Block landed on Iwo Jima on D-day, 19 February 1945. On 23 February, Block participated in the second flag raising on Mount Suribachi, but was killed a few days later, on 1 March, in an attack on Nishi Ridge. Initially buried on the island, his remains were returned to Texas for a private burial in January 1949.

#### JOHN H. BRADLEY

John Henry Bradley was born at Antigo, Wisconsin, on 10 July 1923. Prior to his enlistment in the Navy on 13 January 1943, Bradley completed a funeral director's apprenticeship. He attended boot camp at Farragut, Idaho, and was assigned to the Naval Hospital Corps School and the 28th Marines of the 5th Marine Division. He landed on Iwo Jima on 19 February and performed feats that earned him the Navy Cross just two days into the fighting. On 23 February, Bradley assisted in the raising of the first flag on Mount Suribachi and was present at the raising of the second flag. On 12 March 1945, he received shrapnel wounds to both legs from an enemy mortar shell for which he was awarded a Purple Heart. After recovering, Bradley was ordered by President Franklin D. Roosevelt to appear for the Seventh War Loan campaign. He was medically discharged from the Navy on 13 November 1945. After the war, Bradley owned and operated a funeral parlor in Antigo, Wisconsin, until his death on 11 January 1994 at the age of 70.

#### LOUIS R. BURMEISTER

Louis Raymond Burmeister was born 30 June 1924 in Milwaukee County, Wisconsin. Enlisting in the U.S. Marine Corps on 29 June 1943, Burmeister was designated a photographer for the 5th Marine Division's 28th Marines and landed on Iwo Jima on 19 February 1945. He was present on 23 February when the second flag was raised atop Mount Suribachi, though his work has not been widely acknowledged in general accounts. Burmeister took several photographs at the second flag raising and claimed to have taken one identical to Rosenthal's shot; however, Rosenthal's image found national success, while Burmeister's was lost to history. Burmeister also photographed Father Charles F. Suver, the Navy's Jesuit priest, administering Mass on the summit that afternoon. Burmeister was subsequently wounded and was awarded a Purple Heart. After the war, Burmeister ran a camera and gem shop in Medina, Ohio. He passed away on 2 November 1993 in Cleveland, Ohio.

#### GEORGE F. BURNS JR.

George Francis Burns Jr. was born on 6 April 1917 in Albany, New York. Before the war, Burns worked for the Albany *Times Union* and the Associated Press. In the U.S. Army, Burns was a still photographer for *Yank* magazine. Other than the Iwo Jima landings, he covered actions on the Mariana Islands, at Leyte in the Philippines, Okinawa, and the atomic bombing of Nagasaki, Japan. On 23 February 1945, Burns was photographed with Joseph Rosenthal on the summit of Mount Suribachi during the second flag raising, and one of Burns' photos from Suribachi was featured on the cover of the Pacific edition of *Yank* magazine shortly after the flag raising. After the war, Burns returned to upstate New York and worked as a photojournalist for *Life*, *Look*, and the *Saturday Evening Post*. He also served as the chief news photographer for General Electric. Burns passed away on 7 May 1988 and is buried in Park View Cemetery in Schenectady, New York.

#### ROBERT R. CAMPBELL

Robert Russell Campbell was born in Alameda County, California, on 10 September 1910. He was a still photographer for the U.S. Marine Corps during World War II. Following the first flag raising, he was ordered by 5th Marine Division chief photographer, Warrant Officer Norman T. Hatch, to photograph the second flag raising. Private First Class Campbell accompanied his good friend, Joseph Rosenthal, to the summit of Suribachi for the second flag raising, taking the photograph that shows the lowering of the first flag simultaneously with the raising of the second. Campbell survived the remainder of the war and worked with Rosenthal at the *San Francisco Chronicle* until his death on 4 April 1968.

#### LOUIS C. CHARLO

Louis Charles Charlo was born on 26 September 1926. Charlo was a Native American from the Bitterroot Salish tribe in the town of Evaro in northwest Montana and was the great grandson of the famous Chief "Charles" Charlo, also known as Little Claw of the Grizzly Bear. In November 1943, just weeks after his 17th birthday, he enlisted in the Marine Corps. Charlo attended recruit training at Marine Corps Recruit Depot San Diego and landed on Iwo Jima on 19 February 1945, serving as a Browning automatic rifle gunner for Company F, 28th Marines, 5th Marine Division. On 23 February, he participated in the initial four-man reconnaissance patrol led by Sergeant Sherman B. Watson to ascend Mount Suribachi and was long believed to have participated in the first flag raising on the summit. Charlo was killed in action on 2 March 1945 and posthumously awarded a Purple Heart. Though initially buried on Iwo Jima, his remains were returned to Montana and buried at St. Ignatius Catholic Cemetery in 1948. In 2016, the Huly Panel determined that Charlo did in fact provide security on the summit of Mount Suribachi between the first and second flag raisings.

#### MEYERS A. CORNELIUS

Meyers Arthur Cornelius was born on 3 November 1915 in Oklahoma City. Cornelius grew up working in his uncle's photography shop before journeying to Chicago to study music for a time. During World War II, he joined the Marine Corps and served as a combat photographer at the Battle of Iwo Jima, taking photographs of the first flag raisers. After the war, Cornelius continued working in photography, serving as president of the Professional Photographers of Oklahoma in 1947. In 1949, Cornelius moved to Tulsa, Oklahoma, and opened a photography business that he owned and operated until his retirement and relocation to Oklahoma City. Cornelius passed away on 26 March 1991 and was laid to rest in Memorial Park Cemetery in Tulsa.

#### RENE A. GAGNON

Rene Arthur Gagnon was born in Manchester, New Hampshire, on 7 March 1926. On 6 May 1943, Gagnon was inducted into the Marine Corps Reserve through the Selective Service System. After his training at Parris Island and a brief assignment in Charleston, South Carolina, he was assigned to the Military Police Company of the 5th Marine Division at Camp Pendleton, and quickly transferred to the 2d Battalion, 28th Marines, with whom he landed on Iwo Jima on 19 February 1945. Gagnon served as the company runner for Company E on 23 February tasked with supplying fresh radio batteries and a larger flag for the troops already on top of Mount Suribachi. After the Battle of Iwo Jima concluded, Gagnon was ordered by the president to appear on the Seventh War Loan campaign. He was discharged on 27 April 1946 at the rank of corporal. Gagnon passed away on 12 October 1979 after suffering a heart attack in his hometown of Manchester. Initially buried in the Mount Calvary Cemetery, he was reinterred at Arlington National Cemetery on 7 July 1981.

#### WILLIAM H. GENAUST

William Homer Genaust was born on 12 October 1906 in Sioux Falls, South Dakota, and raised in Minneapolis, Minnesota. In February 1943, he was inducted into the Marine Corps through the Selective Service System. As a combat photographer, Genaust filmed action on Saipan and Tinian, sustaining a leg wound on Saipan for which he was awarded a Purple Heart. On 23 February 1945, he accompanied Private First Class Robert Campbell and AP photographer Joseph Rosenthal to the top of Mount Suribachi, where he captured motion picture footage of the famed second flag raising. While the battle raged on, Genaust was reported as missing in action on 3 March after being shot near a cave around Hill 362A in northern Iwo Jima. He was ruled killed in action on 4 March. His remains were never found. Genaust was posthumously awarded a Bronze Star for his actions on Saipan in September 1945. In 1995, a bronze plaque was placed atop Mount Suribachi in his honor.

#### EDWARD R. HAGENAH

Edward Reno Hagenah was born on 16 April 1902 in New York City. He joined the Marine Corps for the first time in 1924 and was discharged in 1928 after advancing to the rank of sergeant. Between his tours of duty in the Marine Corps, Hagenah worked in the newspaper business as general manager of Lee Enterprises and an affiliate of the Brooklyn (NY) Daily Eagle and the Washington Post. On 20 March 1935, he rejoined the Marine Corps, accepting an appointment as a second lieutenant in the Marine Corps Reserve. During World War II, Hagenah participated in both theaters and served as an aide to the Commandant of the Marine Corps, Major General Thomas Holcomb. In September 1944, he was promoted to executive officer of the Division of Public Affairs, eventually overseeing Private First Class Rene Gagnon's initial naming of the Marines in the Rosenthal photograph. After World War II, Hagenah served in Korea as a senior advisor to the Korean Marines with the Headquarters Battalion, 1st Marine Division. He passed away on board a hospital ship on 2 December 1950 from a heart attack and is buried in Arlington National Cemetery.

#### HENRY O. HANSEN

Henry Oliver Hansen was born in Somerville, Massachusetts, on 14 December 1919. He enlisted in the Marine Corps in June 1938. Following completion of his initial training, Hansen was sent to the Marine Corps Sea School in San Diego and served on the USS Arkansas (BB 33). Following a request for combat duty, Hansen attended Parachute School at Marine Barracks New River, North Carolina, and was assigned to 3d Parachute Battalion, experiencing combat for the first time in the Bougainville campaign. In 1944, Hansen reenlisted and joined the 28th Marines in the newly created 5th Marine Division. Hansen landed on Iwo Jima on 19 February and was a member of First Lieutenant Harold Schrier's 3d Platoon of Company E that transported and raised the first flag on Mount Suribachi. He also was present for the second flag raising and appears in the group photograph of Marines and corpsmen posing beneath the flagpole. Hansen was killed by an enemy machine gun burst on 1 March 1945. Initially buried on Iwo Jima, his remains were reinterred in the National Memorial Cemetery of the Pacific in Honolulu, Hawaii, in 1947.

#### NORMAN T. HATCH

Norman Thomas Hatch was born in Boston, Massachusetts, on 2 March 1921. After graduating from high school, Hatch enlisted in the Marine Corps in July 1939. Following recruit training, Hatch taught English at the Marine Barracks Washington and later wrote for Leatherneck magazine before being assigned to the U.S. Navy's public relations office. Eventually appointed a warrant officer, Hatch was assigned to San Diego, California, for duty with the 5th Marine Division as their chief photography officer in June 1944. On 19 February 1945, along with the rest of the division, he and his fellow combat correspondents landed on Iwo Jima. Following the initial flag raising, Hatch assigned Private First Class Robert Campbell and Sergeant William Genaust to document the second flag raising on Mount Suribachi. Hatch's career in the Marine Corps came to an end when he retired from the Reserves in 1967 at the rank of major. As a civilian, Hatch ran a photography agency, sold photography equipment, worked as a civilian audiovisual advisor in the Pentagon, and was a consultant to the White House press office and Congress. He passed away at the age of 96 on 22 April 2017.

#### IRA H. HAYES

Ira Hamilton Hayes, a Pima North American Indian, was born in the Gila River Indian Community, a reservation in Sacaton, Arizona, on 12 January 1923. Hayes served in the Civilian Conservation Corps prior to joining the Marine Corps on 26 August 1942. Following recruit training, Hayes attended the Parachute School, and in March 1943, deployed with the 3d Parachute Battalion, Divisional Special Troops, 3d Marine Division, participating in the campaigns for Vella Lavella in the Solomon Islands and Bougainville. When the Marine parachute units were disbanded in February 1944, Hayes transferred to Company E, 2d Battalion, 28th Marines, 5th Marine Division, at Camp Pendleton, California. On 23 February, he assisted in the second flag raising on Mount Suribachi. After the Battle of Iwo Jima ended, Hayes embarked for Hawaii, where he was ordered by the president to participate in the Seventh War Loan campaign. He was honorably discharged on 1 December 1945 at the rank of corporal. Hayes returned to the Gila River Indian Community, where he died at Bapchule, Arizona, on 24 January 1955.

#### RAYMOND E. JACOBS

Raymond Edward Jacobs was born in Bridgeport, Connecticut, on 24 January 1926. He enlisted in the Marine Corps in May 1943 at age 17 in Los Angeles. After recruit training in San Diego, Jacobs volunteered for Marine Raider training. In March 1944, he transferred to Company F, 2d Battalion, 28 Marines, 5th Marine Division, after the Raiders disbanded, and volunteered for radio operator training. Jacobs was ordered to accompany First Lieutenant Harold Schrier's patrol from Company E to provide them with a radioman and supported the raising of the first flag on the peak of Suribachi. On 10 March, Jacobs suffered a wound in his back caused by shrapnel from a Japanese mortar. He was discharged in 1946 but remained in the Marine Reserves. He also served in the Korean War as a stateside instructor. After active duty, Jacobs worked for 34 years with television station KTVU-TV in Oakland, California, as a reporter, anchor, and news director. He passed away on 29 January 2008 at the age of 82.

#### CHANDLER W. JOHNSON

Chandler Wilce Johnson was born in Fort Dodge, Iowa, on 8 October 1905, but grew up in Highland Park, Illinois. He was educated at the U.S. Naval Academy in Annapolis, graduating in 1929. Through the 1930s, he served in the Philippines, Nicaragua, and China. Johnson was the commander of the 2d Battalion, 28th Marines, on Iwo Jima. Johnson gave the order for First Lieutenant Harold Schrier to lead a patrol to the summit of Mount Suribachi and raise the first flag atop it. On 2 March 1945, Johnson was killed by a mortar shell. He was posthumously awarded the Navy Cross for his leadership on Iwo Jima and was laid to rest in the National Memorial Cemetery of the Pacific in Hawaii.

#### HAROLD P. KELLER

Harold Paul Keller was born on 3 August 1921 near Brooklyn, Iowa. Before enlisting in the Marine Corps on 6 January 1942, Keller worked as a lineman for the Brooklyn Mutual Telephone Company. During World War II, he served with the 2d Raider Battalion and the 5th Marine Division. Keller fought in notable battles prior to Iwo Jima, including the Makin Raid and Bougainville, where he was awarded a Purple Heart for a wound suffered on 8 November 1943. On 19 February 1945, he landed on Iwo Jima with Company E, 2d Battalion, 28th Marines. As a member of First Lieutenant Harold G. Schrier's 3d Platoon, Keller was one of the first Marines to reach the summit of Mount Suribachi on 23 February and photographs show him in proximity to both first and second flag raisings. He returned from overseas on 23 April and separated from the Marine Corps on 19 September 1945. After the war, Keller worked for Surge, a dairy equipment company, and served his community for 30 years with the Brooklyn Fire Department, eventually becoming fire chief. Keller's participation in the second flag raising went unnoticed until 2018, when amateur historians Stephen Foley, Dustin Spence, and Brent Westemeyer raised concerns about a possible error in attribution. In 2019, the Bowers Board confirmed that Keller helped raise the American flag atop Mount Suribachi as captured in Rosenthal's famous photograph. Keller passed away in a car accident on 13 March 1979 and is buried in Brooklyn Memorial Cemetery in Iowa.

#### CHARLES W. LINDBERG

Charles Willard Lindberg was born on 26 June 1920 in Grand Forks, North Dakota. After graduating from Grand Forks High School, Lindberg enlisted in the Marine Corps in Seattle, Washington, in January 1942. After completing recruit training in San Diego and serving with the 2d Raider Battalion, he deployed with the 5th Marine Division and participated in the first flag raising on Iwo Jima on 23 February 1945. While in combat on Iwo Jima, Lindberg was shot through the arm, leading to his evacuation and eventually a Purple Heart. In addition, he was awarded a Silver Star for his valorous service on Iwo Jima as a flamethrower operator. Lindberg was honorably discharged in January 1946. After the war, Lindberg moved to Richfield, Minnesota, and worked as an electrician for 39 years. Like Raymond Jacobs, Lindberg spent his later years advocating for recognition as one of the first flag raisers. Though he passed away on 24 June 2007 at the age of 86, the Huly Panel did not confirm his role as a first flag raiser until 2016.

#### LOUIS R. LOWERY

Louis Robert Lowery was born on 24 July 1916 in Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania. As an employee of a Pittsburgh newspaper when the war started, Lowery took a leave of absence to enlist in the Marine Corps in 1943. As a combat photographer, Lowery captured the landings at Saipan, Tinian, Guam, Peleliu, Iwo Jima, and Okinawa, notably photographing the first flag raising on Iwo Jima. Lowery was later commissioned and rose to the rank of captain in the Marine Corps Reserve, retiring in January 1962. Following World War II, Lowery continued to serve on the staff of *Leatherneck* as photography editor. He later served as photography director for the Marine Corps Association until his retirement in 1982. He died on 15 April 1987 and is buried at Quantico National Cemetery in Virginia.

#### JAMES R. MICHELS

James Richard Michels was born on 18 January 1918 in Chicago, Illinois. He enlisted in the Marine Corps in January 1944, previously working as an arc welder at Whiting Corporation. Assigned to Company E, 2d Battalion, 5th Marine Division, Michels was a member of First Lieutenant Harold Schrier's 3d Platoon and features prominently in Louis Lowery's famous photograph of the first flag raising. He received a shrapnel wound to the finger on 23 February, the same day as the flag raisings, and was awarded a Purple Heart. Michels survived the Battle of Iwo Jima and was discharged on 18 May 1946. After the war, he returned home to Riverside, Illinois, living there until his death on 17 January 1982 at the age of 63. He is buried at Queen of Heaven Catholic Cemetery in Hillside. The 2016 Huly Panel ruled that he provided security for the first flag raising.

#### JOSEPH J. ROSENTHAL

Joseph John Rosenthal was born on 9 October 1911 in Washington, DC. In 1929, he moved to San Francisco, California, where he worked in the offices of the Newspaper Enterprise Association. By 1932, Rosenthal had become a news photographer, working as chief photographer and manager in San Francisco for Times Wide World Photo, later joining the Associated Press. Despite being declared ineligible for military service due to his poor eyesight, Rosenthal joined the United States Maritime Service as a photographer and served in the British Isles and North Africa before rejoining the AP in 1944. As a war correspondent, he covered the landings at Hollandia, Dutch New Guinea, Guam, Peleliu, Angaur, and Iwo Jima. On 23 February, Rosenthal accompanied his friend, Private First Class Robert Campbell, and Sergeant William Genaust to the peak of Suribachi and snapped the Pulitzer Prize-winning photograph of the second flag raising. After the war, Rosenthal joined the *San Francisco Chronicle*, where he worked for the next 35 years. Rosenthal passed away on 20 August 2006 in Novato, California, from natural causes at the age of 94.

#### HAROLD G. SCHRIER

Harold George Schrier was born in Corder, Missouri, on 17 October 1916. Schrier enlisted in the Marine Corps in August 1936, serving in China for two years prior to the outbreak of World War II. In 1942, he was assigned to the 2d Raider Battalion and saw action on Midway, Guadalcanal, New Georgia, and Bougainville, earning a field commission in February 1943. Schrier was reassigned to 2d Battalion, 28th Marines, when the Raiders were disbanded in 1944, landing with the unit on Iwo Jima on 19 February 1945. Two days later, Schrier assumed command of 3d Platoon after First Lieutenant John Keith Wells was wounded. On the morning of 23 February, he led the patrol up Mount Suribachi that raised the first flag. For his actions on Iwo Jima, Schrier was awarded the Navy Cross and Silver Star, having previously received the Legion of Merit for his actions on Guadalcanal as a part of the 2d Raider Battalion. After the war, he assisted in the filming of the movie Sands of Iwo Jima (1949) and later went on to serve in Korea at Pusan, Inchon-Seoul, and Chosin, for which he would be awarded a Bronze Star for his actions. He retired from the Marine Corps in 1957 as a lieutenant colonel. Schrier died on 3 June 1971 in Bradenton, Florida, and is buried in nearby Ellenton.

#### HAROLD H. SCHULTZ

Harold Henry Schultz was born on 28 January 1926 in Detroit, Michigan. Schultz joined the Marine Corps Reserve on 23 December 1943. Initially assigned as a mortar crewman in Company E, 2d Battalion, 28th Marines, of the 5th Marine Division, Schultz supplemented First Lieutenant Harold Schrier's 3d Platoon on the morning of 23 February. He is one of a few Marines who appear in photographs of both flag raisings. Two weeks after the flag raising, Schultz sustained shrapnel wounds in the abdomen and right thigh. On 17 October 1945, he was honorably discharged from the Marine Corps Reserve. Shortly after his discharge, he moved to Los Angeles and began working for the U.S. Postal Service sorting mail. Schultz remained single until his 60s, when he married his neighbor, Rita Reyes. Schultz's presence in the Rosenthal photograph was unknown until amateur historians Eric Krelle and Stephen Foley raised questions about the official roster of flag raisers nearly 70 years later. In 2016, the Huly Panel confirmed his presence in the photograph of the second flag raising. Schultz passed away on 16 May 1995 and is buried in Hollywood Forever Cemetery in Los Angeles, California.

#### FRANKLIN R. SOUSLEY

Franklin Runyon Sousley was born in Flemingsburg, Kentucky, on 19 September 1925. On 5 January 1944, he was inducted into the Marine Corps Reserve through the Selective Service System. Following his recruit training at San Diego, Sousley was assigned as an automatic rifleman to Company E, 2d Battalion, 28th Marines, of the 5th Marine Division at Camp Pendleton, eventually being promoted to private first class on 22 November 1944 while training in Hawaii. On 19 February, Sousley landed on Iwo Jima and later appeared in the photograph taken by Joseph Rosenthal on the summit of Mount Suribachi. On 21 March, Private First Class Sousley was killed by a Japanese sniper around Kitano Point on the northern end of Iwo Jima and buried in the 5th Marine Division Cemetery there. His remains were returned to the United States and reinterred in the Elizaville Cemetery in his native Kentucky on 22 March 1948.

#### MICHAEL STRANK

Michael Strank was born at Conemaugh, Pennsylvania, on 10 November 1919. Strank joined the Marine Corps in October 1939 and was stationed at Guantánamo Bay, Cuba; Parris Island, South Carolina; New River, North Carolina; and San Diego, California, until his transfer in September 1942 to the 3d Raider Battalion at Uvea in the Wallis Islands. He later saw action at Pavuvu in the Solomon Islands and Empress Augusta Bay on Bougainville in 1944. Following the disbanding of the Marine Raiders, Strank transferred to Company E, 2d Battalion, 28th Marines, 5th Marine Division, storming the volcanic beaches of Iwo Jima on 19 February 1945. Four days later, he participated in the second flag raising on the summit of Mount Suribachi. While staging an assault on the northern sector of the island on 1 March, Strank was killed by Japanese artillery fire. Like many of his comrades, Strank was buried on Iwo Jima but later reinterred at Arlington National Cemetery in January 1949.

#### ERNEST I. THOMAS JR.

Ernest Ivy Thomas Jr. was born on 10 March 1924 in Tampa, Florida, but grew up in Tallahassee. Before the war, Thomas studied aeronautical engineering at Tri-State University in Indiana (now Trine University). He enlisted in the Marine Corps Reserve on 27 May 1942, despite being colorblind. Due to his excellent performance at boot camp, he was retained as a drill instructor at Parris Island. Longing to see combat, Thomas transferred to 2d Battalion, 28th Marines, 5th Marine Division, in March 1944. He landed on Iwo Jima on 19 February 1945. Thomas was a member of Company E's 3d Platoon, led by First Lieutenant Harold Schrier, that raised the first flag on Mount Suribachi. Thomas was killed in action by enemy rifle fire on the northern end of Iwo Jima on 3 March 1945. He was posthumously awarded a Navy Cross and a Purple Heart for his actions on 21 February 1945. He was buried on Iwo Jima but reinterred in Roseland Cemetery in Monticello, Florida, in 1948. In 2016, his participation in the first flag raising on Mount Suribachi was confirmed by the Huly Panel.

#### PHILIP L. WARD

Philip Lavon Ward was born on 10 March 1926. A native of Crawfordsville, Indiana, Ward quit high school to help support his family and worked at a local creamery in nearby Mace. Two days before his 18th birthday, he enlisted in the Marine Corps to avoid being drafted into the Army. Ward hopped a freight train to attend basic training in San Diego, California, and saw his first action with Company E, 2d Battalion, 28th Marines, on Saipan in June 1944. After landing on Iwo Jima on 19 February, he participated in raising the first flag on Mount Suribachi on the morning of 23 February 1945 and appears in Rosenthal's Gung Ho photograph following the second flag raising that same day. He was discharged on 20 July 1946. After his service in the Marine Corps in World War II, Ward enlisted in the Army in 1958 and eventually served three tours of duty in Vietnam, working in the Transportation Corps. Ward owned a truck driving business in Indiana following his retirement from the Army in 1976. He passed away on 28 December 2005 at his winter home in McAllen, Texas, and is buried in Arlington National Cemetery. In 2016, the Huly Panel confirmed Ward's role in the first flag raising.

#### FELIX W. DE WELDON

Felix Weiss de Weldon, sculptor of the Marine Corps War Memorial in Arlington, Virginia, was born on 12 April 1907, in Vienna, Austria. Obtaining his bachelor of arts degree at Marchetti College in Vienna in 1925, he went on to earn his master of arts and master of science degrees in 1927 and allegedly added his PhD in 1929 from the University of Vienna's Academy of Creative Arts and School of Architecture. Further studies in art and architecture took him to Paris, Rome, Florence, and Oxford. De Weldon arrived in the United States in 1937 and was naturalized in 1945. He was commissioned to sculpt the 100-ton bronze Marine Corps War Memorial, which was dedicated on 10 November 1954, after more than nine years' work on the subject-sometimes for as many as 19 hours a day. During his career, he designed more than 70 fulllength statues and nearly 800 smaller sculptures, in addition to a large number of portraits, murals, and other paintings. Among his works, which have been shown from Egypt to Japan, are busts of such notables as England's Kings George V, Edward VIII, and George VI; President Harry Truman; Marine Corps General A. A. Vandegrift; and Admirals Chester W. Nimitz, William D. Leahy and Louis E. Denfeld. De Weldon passed away on 2 June 2003 in Woodstock, Virginia, and is buried in Arlington National Cemetery.

#### CORPORAL JOHN J. WIELAND

Wieland enlisted in Des Moines, Iowa, in January 1942, attending recruit training at San Diego, California. He was originally assigned to the 2d Raider Battalion in July 1942, and after the Raiders were disbanded, he was assigned to 2d Battalion, 28th Marines, 5th Marine Division. Wieland was wounded on 1 March 1945 and later awarded the Silver Star for his actions on Iwo Jima. He was honorably discharged from military service in late 1945.

# APPENDIX **G**

## AWARD CITATIONS

#### PHARMACIST'S MATE SECOND CLASS JOHN H. BRADLEY Navy Cross Citation

The President of the United States of America takes pleasure in presenting the Navy Cross to Pharmacist's Mate Second Class John Henry Bradley, United States Naval Reserve, for extraordinary heroism and conspicuous devotion to duty while serving as a Corpsman attached to a Marine Rifle platoon of the Second Battalion, Twenty-Eighth Marines, FIFTH Marine Division, in action against enemy Japanese forces at Iwo Jima, on 21 February 1945. During a furious assault by his company upon a strongly defended enemy zone at the base of Mt. Suribachi, Pharmacist's Mate Second Class Bradley observed a Marine infantryman fall wounded in an open area under a pounding barrage by mortars, interlaced with a merciless crossfire from machine guns. With complete disregard for his own safety, he ran through the intense fire to the side of the fallen Marine, examined his wounds and ascertained that an immediate administration of plasma was necessary to save the man's life. Unwilling to subject any of his comrades to the danger to which he had so valiantly exposed himself, he signaled would-be assistants to remain where they were. Placing himself in a position to shield the wounded man, he tied a plasma unit to a rifle planted upright in the sand and continued his life saving mission. The Marine's wounds bandaged and the condition of shock relieved by plasma, Bradley pulled the man thirty yards through intense enemy fire to a position of safety. His indomitable spirit, dauntless initiative, and heroic devotion to duty were an inspiration to those with who [sic] he served and were in keeping with the highest tradition of the United States Naval Service.

#### CORPORAL CHARLES W. LINDBERG Silver Star Citation

The President of the United States of America takes pleasure in presenting the Silver Star to Corporal Charles W. Lindberg, United States Marine Corps, for conspicuous gallantry and intrepidity while serving as a Flame Thrower Operator of Company E, Second Battalion, Twenty-eight Marines, FIFTH Marine Division, in action against enemy Japanese forces on Iwo Jima, Volcano Islands, from 19 February to 1 March 1945. Repeatedly exposing himself to hostile grenades and machine-gun fire in order that he might reach

These citations were taken verbatim from the original source without adjusting for current conventions in spelling, punctuation, or grammar.

and neutralize enemy pillboxes at the base of Mount Suribachi, Corporal Lindberg courageously approached within ten or fifteen yards of the emplacements before discharging his weapon, thereby assuring the annihilation of the enemy and the successful completion of his platoon's mission. As a member of the first combat patrol to scale Mount Suribachi, he courageously carried his flame thrower to the steep slopes and assisted in destroying the occupants of the many caves found in the rim of the volcano, some of which contained as many as seventy Japanese. While engaged in an attack on hostile cave positions on 1 March, he fearlessly exposed himself to accurate enemy fire and was subsequently wounded and evacuated. By his determinations [*sic*] in manning his weapon, despite its weight and the extreme heat developed in operation, Corporal Lindberg greatly assisted in securing his company's position. His courage and devotion to duty were in keeping with the highest traditions of the United States Naval Service.

#### FIRST LIEUTENANT HAROLD GEORGE SCHRIER Navy Cross Citation

The President of the United States of America takes pleasure in presenting the Navy Cross to First Lieutenant Harold George Schrier, United States Marine Corps, for extraordinary heroism as Executive Officer of Company E, Second Battalion, Twenty-Eighth Marines, FIFTH Marine Division, in action against enemy Japanese forces on Iwo Jima, Volcano Islands, on 23 February 1945. On the morning of 23 February when his combat team had advanced to the base of Mount Suribachi after four days of severe fighting, First Lieutenant Schrier volunteered to lead a forty-man patrol up the steep slopes of the mountain. Quickly organizing his patrol and placing himself at its head, he began the torturous climb up the side of the volcano, followed by his patrol in single file. Employing the only known approach, an old Japanese trail, he swiftly pushed on until, covered by all the supporting weapons of his battalion, he gained the top of the mountain despite hostile small-arms and artillery fire. Forced to engage the remaining enemy in a sharp fire fight, he overcame them without loss in his patrol and occupied the rim of the volcano. Although still under enemy sniper fire, First Lieutenant Schrier, assisted by his Platoon Sergeant, raised the National Colors over Mount Suribachi, planting the flagstaff firmly on the highest knoll overlooking the crater, the first American flag to fly over any land in the inner defenses of the Japanese Empire. His inspiring leadership, courage and determination in the face of overwhelming odds upheld the highest traditions of the United States Naval Service.

#### Silver Star Citation

The President of the United States of America takes pleasure in presenting the Silver Star to First Lieutenant Harold George Schrier (MCSN: 0-19234), United States Marine Corps, for gallantry and intrepidity as Commanding Officer of Company D, Second Battalion, Twenty-eighth Marines, FIFTH Marine Division, in action against enemy Japanese forces on Iwo Jima, Volcano Islands, on 24 March 1945. Realizing the seriousness of the situation when a group of approximately one hundred Japanese infiltrated through the main defensive positions shortly after midnight and launched a fanatical attack against the rear of his lightly-manned command post, First Lieutenant Schrier boldly rallied his men and opposed the onrushing enemy, setting a courageous example. His leadership and fighting spirit throughout this action were in keeping with the highest traditions of the United States Naval Service.

#### PLATOON SERGEANT ERNEST IVY THOMAS JR. Navy Cross Citation

The President of the United States of America takes pride in presenting the Navy Cross (Posthumously) to Platoon Sergeant Ernest Ivy Thomas, Jr., United States Marine Corps Reserve, for extraordinary heroism as a Rifle Platoon Leader serving with Company E, Second Battalion, Twenty-Eighth Marines, FIFTH Marine Division, during action on enemy Japanese-held Iwo Jima, Volcano Islands, 21 February 1945. When his platoon leader was wounded, Platoon Sergeant Thomas assumed command and, before supporting tanks arrived to cover him, led his men in an assault on a fanatically defended and heavily fortified sector at the base of Mount Suribachi. With the tanks unable to proceed over the rough terrain beyond positions seventy-five to one hundred yards at the rear of our attacking forces, Platoon Sergeant Thomas ran repeatedly to the nearest tank and, in a position exposed to heavy and accurate machine-gun and mortar barrages, directed the fire of the tanks against the Japanese pillboxes which were retarding his platoon's advance. After each trip to the tanks, he returned to his men and led them in assaulting and neutralizing enemy emplacements, continuing to advance against the Japanese with a knife as his only weapon after the destruction of his rifle by hostile fire. Under his aggressive leadership, the platoon killed all the enemy in the sector and contributed materially to the eventual capture of Mount Suribachi. His daring initiative, fearless leadership and unwavering devotion to duty were inspiring to those with whom he served and reflect the highest credit upon Platoon Sergeant Thomas and the United States Naval Service.

#### CORPORAL JOHN J. WIELAND Silver Star Citation

The President of the United States of America takes pleasure in presenting the Silver Star to Corporal John J. Wieland, United States Marine Corps Reserve, for conspicuous gallantry and intrepidity while serving as a fire team leader of Company D, Second Battalion, Twenty-eighth Marines, FIFTH Marine Division in action against enemy Japanese forces on Iwo Jima, Volcano Islands on 23 February 1945. In order that the Battalion Commander could plan the final assault, Corporal Wieland volunteered to form and lead a patrol of two men up the sheer cliffs of the volcano to locate enemy resistance and find routes of approach. Leading his men toward the summit over terrain in the face of heavy enemy rifle fire, he aided in repulsing several enemy attacks including one hand to hand engagement. Under is skillful leadership, the patrol ascended to the summit of Mount Suribachi, the first American troops to reach this vital position and brought back information of great value for the subsequent seizure of this Japanese stronghold. Corporal Wieland's resolute courage, indomitable spirit and devotion to duty were in keeping with the highest traditions of the United States Naval Service.

# 

## UNIFORMS, EQUIPMENT, AND ORDNANCE

by Owen L. Conner and Alfred Houde

U.S. MARINE CORPS UTILITY UNIFORM (P1941) Despite the creation of a new, improved combat uniform in early 1944, the vast majority of U.S. Marines who assaulted Iwo Jima were still dressed in the same utility uniform that had been approved for general issue in November 1941.<sup>1</sup>

Period photographs and color film footage of the invasion document how this uniform was often highly personalized by individuals. While in action, Marines were typically seen wearing multiple clothing layers with the uniform. The decisions made in how to layer garments were undertaken at the personal level and were not part of established rules or regulations. As a result, Marines were rarely seen in exact, specific uniform systems during combat operations. Each man chose suitable articles of clothing from his respective issue and wore these items in layers according to his own personal preferences; specifically, wool flannel or cotton service shirts were worn under the utility coat or, for the first time (widely seen in the Pacific theater), the 1941 model field jacket was worn in combat. In rarer cases, the U.S. Army's winter combat (or "Tankers") jacket made an appearance, when worn by Marines who were able to acquire them circuitously.<sup>2</sup>

At Iwo Jima, the layering of garments was likely a result of the colder temperatures experienced during the battle. The widespread use of the M1941 field jacket, in particular, was unique to the action. While the majority of Marines are photographed wearing the jacket as an outer layer, the occasional Marine chose to wear his field jacket beneath his utility coat. Sergeant Michael Strank can be seen with this unusual configuration of uniform in the Gung Ho group photographs taken by Associated Press photographer Joe Rosenthal and Army Private First Class George Burns after the second flag raising. At first glance, the layering of a lighter cotton coat over a medium-size, wool-lined jacket might seem impractical, but the failures of the M1941 jacket were well-known by 1945. The lack of adequate pocket storage and the ease with which the light khaki fabric stained may have informed Sergeant Strank's decision to wear his utility uniform as a cover for the field jacket.

The 1941 utility uniform was arguably the first unique combat uniform fielded by the U.S. Marine Corps. It replaced the cotton khaki summer field uniform worn since 1927, which had seen action on Guam, Wake Island, the Philippines, and Guadalcanal, during the early days of World War II.<sup>3</sup>



FIGURE H.1 U.S. Marine Corps utility jacket (P1941) National Museum of the Marine Corps

The utility uniform coat was made of herringbone twill cotton with four riveted buttons for the enclosure of the front. These buttons (first manufactured in copper-plate, or copper finish and later black painted steel) were emblazoned with "U.S. Marine Corps" in a circular pattern.<sup>4</sup> Each coat cuff also had a single riveted button of the same type. Three large, flapless, buttonless patch pockets were sewn to the front of the uniform coat. Two pockets were on each skirt at the waist and an additional pocket was sewn on the wearer's left breast. The chest pocket was stenciled in black ink with the U.S. Marine Corps' Eagle, Globe, and Anchor insignia with the letters "USMC" above it.<sup>5</sup> The baggy, straightcut utility trousers had four pockets. Early versions were manufactured with two patch-style pockets at the front, while in later contracts these were modified to more traditional interior, slash-style trouser pockets.<sup>6</sup> On the trousers' seat were two open, flap-



#### FIGURE H.2

The Bowers Board consulted with Owen Conner, uniforms and heraldry curator at National Museum of the Marine Corps, to determine the exact configuration of garments worn by Sgt Michael Strank in the Gung Ho group photograph, taken moments after the second flag raising. Using artifacts from the museum's collection, Conner demonstrated Sgt Strank's unusual decision to layer his utility jacket over his field jacket. Photo courtesy Owen L. Conner, National Museum of the Marine Corps

less patch pockets. The fly consisted of four to five riveted buttons of the same type as the utility coat.<sup>7</sup>

While the utility uniform was manufactured in a variety of sizes, the baggy uniform design was often ill-fitting for most wearers and its appearance varied widely according to the body type and size of each Marine. As a result, period photographs often show efforts by individuals to modify or adjust their clothing to size. This was especially true with the utility trousers, which due to their straightleg tailoring often required Marines to roll, fold, or cut the pant leg fabric to obtain their preferred height. Since Marines also tended to unblouse trousers from their canvas leggings, this habit features



FIGURE H.3 U.S. Marine Corps M1 helmet National Museum of the Marine Corps

even more prominently in period photographs. The practice is best illustrated in the difference between the combat utility trousers of Pharmacist's Mate Second Class John H. Bradley, whose rolled cuff reveals leggings underneath, and Private First Class Franklin Sousley, whose trousers hang straight, as seen in the Iwo Jima flag-raising photographs.

#### U.S. MARINE CORPS M1 HELMET

By February 1945, nearly every U.S. Marine participating in the assault on Iwo Jima was equipped with an M1 helmet. These helmets were typically worn with reversible camouflage helmet covers that covered the M1 steel shell. Inside, a plastic liner (i.e., resin-impregnated duckcloth) was attached to the main helmet by a thin leather liner chinstrap.

The M1 helmet had been the primary Marine Corps combat helmet since 1942, when it replaced the M1917A1 helmets worn on Wake Island, Pearl Harbor, and the Philippines. For much of the war, Marines were readily identifiable because of their unique camouflage covers. Developed in May 1942, and adopted in September the same year, the reversible covers had a beach or desert "brownside" pattern and an opposing green, tan, and brown "greenside" jungle pattern.<sup>8</sup> They were made from two separate sections (left and right) of herringbone twill cloth that were sewn together to fit (more or less) smoothly over the M1 helmet body. In all, during the war, three different patterns were created. The first version was constructed of solid cloth. The second and third versions improved on the design with the addition of 16 reinforced button holes that allowed for the addition of foliage.9 During the invasion of Iwo Jima, Marines were typically seen wearing all three types, as little effort was made to remove old types from the supply system.

When the plastic helmet liner and steel helmet were worn together, the thin leather liner chinstrap attached to the inside of the liner was folded over the steel helmet brim. Despite numerous small improvements made to the design during the course of the war, these straps were commonly damaged or removed by individuals during combat operations. A close examination of photographs of U.S. Marines during World War II often shows M1 helmets worn with or without the leather strap. During the flag raisings on Iwo Jima, Private First Class Harold Schultz can be seen with a broken leather liner strap, a distinguishing visual attribute that greatly assisted Huly Panel members in his proper identification.<sup>10</sup>

#### U.S. MARINE CORPS UTILITY CAP, 1944

The debut of the U.S. Marine Corps World War II-era 1941 utility uniform was notable for a lack of a specific hat or cap designed to be worn with the combat uniform. When not wearing steel M1 helmets, Marines commonly wore summer or winter service garrison "overseas" caps, fiber sun helmets, helmet liners, or (when available) the short-billed U.S. Army herringbone twill cap.<sup>11</sup> It was this paneled U.S. Army cap that was the direct forerunner of the Marine Corps utility cap commonly seen by 1945 and during the battle for Iwo Jima.

The early Army herringbone twill caps had a very short bill, panels, and were designed to look "baggy" in appearance. The style was popular with the Marines who could obtain them. These men often attached their Eagle, Globe, and Anchor ornaments to the front of the cap. With the development of an improved modified utility uniform in 1944, the Marine Corps borrowed heavily from this design and finally introduced a service-wide utility cap unique to the Marine Corps.

The new 1944 Marine Corps caps were most notable for the movement of the center seam to allow for the application of the U.S. Marine Corps' Eagle, Globe, and Anchor stencil in black ink on a center panel. The caps also had longer, more pronounced bills, measuring 7.5 inches in width and 2.5 inches in length, regardless of the individual wearer's personal head size.<sup>12</sup> While retaining the baggy appearance of a rail road engineer cap, the bill was similar in style to baseball caps of the era. Records indicate that the 1944 utility caps were issued one per individual beginning in November 1944.<sup>13</sup> By 1945, they were widely seen in the Pacific and proved exceptionally popular; the caps were often seen worn under helmets by Marines in the field.

The long cap bills seen protruding from under the M1 helmets were one of several details that greatly assisted the Huly Panel in determining which Marines participated in the Iwo Jima flag raisings. During the second flag raising, Private First Class Franklin Sousley and Sergeant Michael Strank both wore utility caps in this manner.<sup>14</sup> Sergeant Henry Hansen, by contrast, eschewed his helmet entirely. Wearing only a soft cover during much of his time on the summit, Hansen is easily recognizable in photographs of the first flag raising taken by Staff Sergeant Louis Lowery, as well as in the *Gung Ho* group photographs beneath the second flag taken by Associated Press photographer Joe Rosenthal and Army photographer Private First Class George Burns.



FIGURE H.4 U.S. Marine Corps utility cap, 1944 National Museum of the Marine Corps

#### OLIVE DRAB FIELD JACKET (M1941)

During the Battle of Iwo Jima, temperatures were noticeably colder than in prior Pacific campaigns. As a result, many Marines were seen wearing their second-pattern M1941 field jackets in action.<sup>15</sup> Two of the flag raisers in the Rosenthal photograph are readily identifiable by their jackets: Corporal Harlon Block and Private First Class Harold Schultz.

Often referred to informally as the "Parsons' jacket" for U.S. Army Major General James K. Parsons who originally designed it, the M1941 field jacket was similar in style to popular civilian windbreakers of the era. The short, waist-cut jacket was made of a light olive drab, wind- and water-resistant cotton poplin fabric.<sup>16</sup> The interior of the garment was lined with wool flannel and was enclosed by a full-length zippered fastener and plastic button cover flap. The back of the jacket featured a "half-belt" with buttons to allow the servicemember to tighten the fit at the waist to their personal preference. On the front, two diagonal, internal slash



FIGURE H.5A/H.5B Olive Drab field jacket (M1941). Left: front; right: back. National Museum of the Marine Corps

pockets allowed for the placement of hands during inclement weather. Originally intended to replace wool field jackets, the M1941 jackets were meant for "light combat wear" and could be layered with heavier wool overcoats or rainwear.<sup>17</sup>

For many reasons, despite their neat and well-tailored appearance, the M1941 field jacket failed in Europe as a combat uniform.<sup>18</sup> In reality, soldiers could not easily carry the additional layers required for combat operations. The short coat and light fabric also stained easily and quickly presented an unprofessional appearance in the field. The field jacket was soon replaced by the much more practical, popular, and effective M1943 field jacket et system. By 1943, remaining supplies of M1941 field jackets were relegated to the warmer China-Burma-India and Pacific theaters for both Army and Marine Corps units.<sup>19</sup>



In period photographs, the M1941 field jacket can be readily identified by its distinctive zipper, plastic buttons, and "half-belt" cloth closures at the sleeve cuffs and waist. Among the many distinctive features of Private First Class Harold Schultz's appearance that aided the Huly Panel in making a proper identification was the bulging right pocket of his olive drab field jacket. When viewed in combination with the broken helmet liner strap and unusual rifle sling attachment, the members of the Huly Panel were able to track Schultz's movements in the motion picture film shot by Sergeant William Genaust and in still photographs depicting both first and second flag raisings.

#### U.S. MARINE CORPS FLANNEL AND COTTON SERVICE SHIRTS

U.S. Marine Corps uniform regulations of 1937 note the issue of both cotton and flannel service shirts to enlisted Marines.<sup>20</sup> These shirts were most often worn with the winter service or summer service uniform. However, by 1945, the service shirts also doubled as undergarments with the loose-fit-



FIGURE H.6 U.S. Marine Corps wool service shirt National Museum of the Marine Corps



FIGURE H.7 U.S. Marine Corps cartridge belt (M1923) National Museum of the Marine Corps

ting herringbone utility uniform coat when individual Marines deemed necessary. Perhaps nowhere else during the war was this practice so colorfully illustrated than on Iwo Jima. Official images from the battle and personal photographs accompanying collections donated to the National Museum of the Marine Corps document the practice of service shirts worn as underlayers repeatedly on Iwo Jima. Shown here is an example of the wool service shirts typically worn by Marines and corpsmen under their coats during the battle.

#### U.S. MARINE CORPS CARTRIDGE BELTS

At the outbreak of World War II, U.S. Marine Corps riflemen were often still equipped with M1910 cartridge belts, as well as the U.S. Army-designed M1923 cartridge belt. Marine Corps contracts for the M1923 belts brought slight modifications to the adjustment buckle and cosmetically removed the Army's black "U.S." marking from the front of the belt, in favor of "U.S.M.C." stamped on the interior side.<sup>21</sup> The M1923 belt's individual pouches were designed to carry .30-06 caliber ammunition in clips for the Marines' M1 Garand rifles.

While individual equipment, such as canteens, field packs, and first aid, was worn by all Marines, cartridge belts were the exclusive property of the Marine riflemen. Marines such as officers or enlisted men serving in crew-served weapons wore pistol belts to support side arms or to carry ammunition for their M1 carbines. In photographs of the second flag raising, Private First Class Franklin Sousley



FIGURE H.8 U.S. Navy combat medic harness system National Museum of the Marine Corps

is recognizable for wearing a cartridge belt without suspenders along with wire cutters and an empty canteen cover.

#### U.S. NAVY COMBAT MEDIC HARNESS SYSTEM

One of the most unique examples of field equipment observed on Mount Suribachi during the first and second flag raisings is the U.S. Navy first aid pouch harness system worn by Pharmacist's Mate Second Class John H. Bradley.

Adopted by the U.S. Navy in 1943, these oversize first aid medical pouches were worn as a pair on the respective hips of the corpsmen. The top flap of the pouch was secured by two "lift the dot" snaps and the opening contained an inner sleeve to protect the pouch contents from contamination.<sup>22</sup> These dual pouches could be worn with either equipment straps or with a wide set of specialized medical suspenders that better distributed the load bearing weight of the bags.

First aid pouches or earlier medical pack bags were standard equipment for most corpsman in combat in the Pacific. These personnel were rarely seen wearing standard infantry equipment, such as the M1923 cartridge belts. This discrepancy in equipment was one of the first visual clues that an error in attribution may have occurred with regard to the servicemembers pictured in Associated Press photographer Joseph Rosenthal's famous flagraising image.

#### U.S. M1 GARAND RIFLE

The standard service rifle used by American forces during the Iwo Jima campaign, the M1 Garand was developed at Springfield Armory by Canadian engineer John Cantius Garand. The semiautomatic rifle was designed to be efficiently manufactured and easily maintained. Weighing approximately 9.5 pounds, much heavier than its predecessor the M1903 Springfield Bolt Action rifle, the gasoperated rifle utilized an eight-round clip to chamber and fire a .30-06 caliber cartridge. The M1 Garand can be distinguished from other rifles by its substantial length and the circular bolts on each side of the rear sight.

Although the Marine Corps was reluctant to replace the trusted M1903 Springfield, the M1 Garand fulfilled the need for a rifle that could deliver significantly more firepower. After much testing controversy, the recommendation was made in 1941 to adopt the M1 rifle as sufficient numbers became available. The M1 Garand served on all fronts throughout the Second World War, proving itself as successful, and as beloved by its users, as its predecessor: the M1903 Springfield.

The M1 Garand was integral to the Huly Panel's investigation into the true identity of the Iwo Jima flag raisers pictured in Associated Press photographer Joe Rosenthal's photograph. The individual in position 5, long believed to be Private First Class Franklin Sousley, had a unique flaw. The Marine had attached his sling to the stacking swivel at the end of the wooden stock of the rifle, rather than to the proper swivel attached to the stock ferrule. Upon further consideration of other factors, such as the loose helmet strap, members of the Huly Panel concluded that the individual was Private First Class Harold Schultz, who exhibits these same



FIGURE H.9 U.S. M1 Garand rifle National Museum of the Marine Corps



FIGURE H.10 U.S. M1 carbine National Museum of the Marine Corps

idiosyncrasies in uniform and equipment in photographs and motion picture footage from that day.

#### U.S. M1 CARBINE

First delivered in 1942, the .30 caliber M1 carbine saw extensive use throughout the Pacific theater, including Iwo Jima. The carbine was designed primarily as a self-defensive weapon for troops not on the front line, such as those operating artillery, mortars, or machine guns; it is distinguishable from the M1 Garand rifle by its smaller size and its distinctive 15-round magazine. The carbine provided greater range, accuracy, and effective stopping power than a pistol, the typical weapon for troops in rear areas. Though it became popular among frontline troops, its range was severely limited by its size and under-powered cartridge. The M1 carbine features prominently in Staff Sergeant Louis Lowery's famous photograph taken of the first flag raising at Iwo Jima. In that image, Private First Class James Michels prominently brandishes an M1 carbine while providing security for the flag raising.

#### U.S. M1 GARAND Ammunition bandoleer

Constructed of lightweight cotton material and measuring approximately 22.5 inches long and 4.75 inches wide, the M1 Garand ammunition bandoleer was designed to carry a total of 6 stamped, steel en bloc clips of .30 caliber ammunition for a total of 48 rounds. Fully loaded, each bandoleer weighed approximately 3.5 pounds.

Most soldiers or Marines were issued two bandoleers for immediate combat use. Shipped to



FIGURE H.11 U.S. M1 Garand ammunition bandoleer U.S. Army Center for Military History

combat zones in a wooden crate that held a total of 1,344 rounds of .30 caliber ammunition, it would not have been uncommon for Marines to receive bandoleers directly from the shipment container and carry them on into battle. Worn diagonally across the chest, the M1 Garand ammunition bandoleer permitted Marines to carry extra ammunition to share with fellow riflemen in combat.

#### ENDNOTES

 Alec Tulkoff, Grunt Gear (San Jose, CA: R. James Bender Publishing, 2003), 22–32; and Kenneth L. Smith-Christmas, "The Marine Corps Utility Uniforms of WWII," Military Collector & Historian 43, no. 4 (Winter 1991): 171.

- The National Museum of the Marine Corps' collection contains a winter combat jacket worn by Marine Gunner Clifton J. Cormier during the Battle of Iwo Jima (2005.92.1). He had obtained the jacket on New Zealand, and his oral history relates how the unique uniform item nearly cost him his life.
- Smith-Christmas, "The Marine Corps Utility Uniforms of WWII," 171.
- Smith-Christmas, "The Marine Corps Utility Uniforms of WWII," 171; and Tulkoff, Grunt Gear, 9.
- 5. Tulkoff, Grunt Gear, 9.
- Bruno Alberti and Laurent Pradier, USMC Uniforms & Equipment, 1941–1945 (Paris: Histoire & Collections, 2007), 37, 42–43.
- 7. Tulkoff, Grunt Gear, 11.
- Tulkoff, Grunt Gear, 46; and Mark Reynosa, The M-1 Helmet: A History of the U.S. M-1 Helmet in World War II (Atglen, PA: Schiffer Military History, 1996), 76.
- 9. Tulkoff, Grunt Gear, 46.
- 10. See appendix B.
- 11. Alberti and Pradier, USMC Uniforms & Equipment, 62.
- 12. Curatorial research in the collection of the National Museum of the Marine Corps.
- Tulkoff, *Grunt Gear*, 32. The earliest production contract (Nom 55773) observed for utility caps is 28 July 1944.
- 14. See appendices B and D.
- 15. The designation "M1941" was not used at the time. The modern term is primarily retained by material historians and collectors to differentiate between several different styles of field jackets used by U.S. forces during World War II. The term is used here for the sake of brevity.
- Henri-Paul Enjames, Government Issue: U.S. Army European Theater of Operations Collector Guide (Paris: Histoire & Collections, 2004), 36.
- 17. The wool service jackets to be replaced were the U.S. Army's service dress uniforms. These open collared uniforms, which traced their roots to World War I, had performed as the field uniforms in the interwar era and were no longer appropriate for use in modern combat operations by World War II. Mark R. Henry, *The U.S. Army in World War II* (Oxford: Osprey Publishing, 2001), 18.
- 18. Henry, The U.S. Army in World War II, 18.
- 19. Henry, The U.S. Army in World War II, 18.
- 20. The uniform regulations created in 1937 would remarkably remain in place until fully revised in 1949. During the war years, however, they were continually amended and deleted through hundreds of letters of instruction from Headquarters Marine Corps.
- 21. Tulkoff, Grunt Gear, 145.
- 22. Alberti and Pradier, USMC Uniforms & Equipment, 160.

## ACRONYMS, ABBREVIATIONS, AND GLOSSARY OF TERMS

ABMC	American Battle Monuments Com- mission		in World War II by the U.S. Army and Marine Corps (a.k.a. the Duck)
ANZAC	Australian and New Zealand Army	FMF	Fleet Marine Force
	Corps	GI	Government issue
ANZUS	The Australia, New Zealand, Unit-	HD	High definition
	ed States Security Treaty signed in	LCI	Landing craft, infantry
	1951 to protect the Pacific	LCT	Landing craft, tank; the predeces-
AP	Associated Press		sor to the LST, Allied Type II
APA	Amphibious attack transport	LST	Landing ship, tank
C-ration	Type C ration, an individual	LCVP	Landing craft, vehicle and person-
	canned, precooked, and prepared		nel (a.k.a. Higgins boat)
	wet ration of food for field issue	LVT	Landing vehicle, tracked
Chowder		KIA	Killed in action
Society	A group of Marine colonels who	Materiel	Military materials and equipment
	advocated in the Pentagon and	MIA	Missing in action
	Congress for the retention of the	NARA	National Archives and Records
	Marine Corps in the aftermath of		Administration
	World War II	National	
Corpsmen	Enlisted medical personnel in the	Security Act	
	U.S. Navy, often serving as medics	of 1947	The act merged the Department
	in the Marine Corps		of War, which became the Depart-
D-day	The day on which an important		ment of the Army, and the De-
	military operation or invasion is to		partment of the Navy to create the
	begin; for the Battle of Iwo Jima,		National Military Establishment
	this date was 19 February 1945		under the new position of secre-
DUKW	A six-wheel amphibious truck used		tary of defense

NPSL	Naval Photographic Science Labo-	USCGR	U.S. Coast Guard, Reserve
	ratory	USMC	United States Marine Corps
NPS	Naval Photographic Studio	USMCR	U.S. Marine Corps, Reserve
Operation		USN	United States Navy
Detachment	The designated name for the Amer-	USNR	U.S. Navy, Reserve
	ican landing and subsequent sei-	VFW	Veterans of Foreign Wars
	zure of Iwo Jima	V-J Day	"Victory over Japan Day" or "V-J
OWI	Office of War Information		Day" celebrates the date that Ja-
POW	Prisoner of war		pan surrendered unconditional-
SJ	Society of Jesuits		ly to the Allies, effectively ending
TG	Task Group		World War II
USA	U.S. Army	WIA	Wounded in action
USCG	United States Coast Guard		

## SELECTED BIBLIOGRAPHY

#### UNPUBLISHED SOURCES Archives

Archives Branch, Marine Corps History Division, Quantico, VA

Archives of American Art, Smithsonian Institution, Washington, DC

Center for Creative Photography, University of Arizona, Tucson

Harry S. Truman Presidential Library and Museum, Independence, MO

National Archives and Records Administration (NARA), Washington, DC

National Archives at College Park, MD

National Personnel Records Center, NARA, Saint Louis, MO

- Naval History and Heritage Command, Washington Navy Yard, DC
- Rare Book and Manuscript Library, Columbia University, NY

Reference Branch, Marine Corps History Division, Quantico, VA

Special Collections Research Center, Syracuse University Libraries, NY

U.S. Army Center of Military History, Fort McNair, DC U.S. Army Heritage and Education Center, Army War College, Carlisle, PA

#### Thesis

Follansbee, Kelsey N. "From War Photograph to a Museum for Forgetting: A Built Reproduction of Rosenthal's Iwo Jima Photograph." Undergraduate thesis, Middlebury College, 2017.

#### PUBLISHED SOURCES Books

Albee, Parker Bishop Jr., and Keller Cushing Freeman. Shadow of Suribachi: Raising the Flags on Iwo Jima. Westport, CT: Praeger, 1995.

Alexander, Col Joseph H., USMC (Ret). Closing In: Marines in the Seizure of Iwo Jima. Washington, DC: Marine Corps Historical Center, 1994.

Appleman, Roy E. South to the Naktong, North to the Yalu (June to November 1950). United States Army in the Korean War. Washington, DC: U.S. Army Center of Military History, 2000.

Ballendorf, Dirk A., and Merrill L. Bartlett. Pete Ellis: An Amphibious Warfare Prophet 1880–1923. Annapolis, MD: Naval Institute Press, 1997.

Bartley, LtCol Whitman S. Iwo Jima: Amphibious Epic.

Washington, DC: Historical Branch, G-3 Division, Headquarters Marine Corps, 1954.

- Beaumont, Joan, ed. Australia's War, 1939–45. Sydney, AU: Allen & Unwin, 1996.
- Bevan, Denys. United States Forces in New Zealand, 1942–1945. Alexandria, NZ: Mac-Pherson Publishing, 1992.
- Blum, John Morton. V Was for Victory: Politics and American Culture during World War II. San Diego, New York: Harvest Book, Harcourt Brace, 1977.
- Bodnar, John. Remaking America: Public Memory, Commemoration, and Patriotism in the Twentieth Century. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1992.
- Boime, Albert. The Unveiling of the National Icons: A Plea for Patriotic Iconoclasm in a Nationalist Era. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 1997.
- Boomhower, Ray E. Dispatches from the Pacific: The World War II Reporting of Robert L. Sherrod. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2017.
- Bradley, James, with Ron Powers. *Flags of Our Fathers*. New York: Bantam Books, 2000.
- Buell, Hal. Uncommon Valor, Common Virtue: Iwo Jima and the Photograph that Captured America. New York: Berkeley Publishing, Penguin Group, 2006.
- Burrell, Robert S. *The Ghosts of Iwo Jima*. College Station: Texas A&M University Press, 2006.
- Chapin, Lt John C. *The Fifth Marine Division in World War II*. Washington, DC: Historical Division, Headquarters Marine Corps, 1945.
- Christiansen, Erik. *Channeling the Past: Politicizing History in Postwar America*. Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 2013.
- Clark, Adm J. J., USN (Ret), with Clark G. Reynolds. *Carrier Admiral*. New York: David McKay, 1967.
- Coram, Robert. Brute: The Life of Victor Krulak, U.S. Marine. New York: Back Bay Books, 2011.
- Costello, John. *The Pacific War, 1941–1945.* New York: Rawson, Wade, 1981.
- Davis, Burke. *Marine!: The Life of Chesty Puller*. New York: Bantam Books, 1962.

- Del Pilar, Jessica, ed. Portal to the Corps: Chronicling the National Museum of the Marine Corps. Mulgrave: Images Publishing, 2007.
- Desmond, Robert W. Tides of War: World News Reporting, 1931–1945. Iowa City: University of Iowa Press, 1984.
- Eldridge, Robert D., and Charles W. Tatum, eds. Fighting Spirit: The Memoirs of Major Yoshitaka Horie and the Battle of Iwo Jima. Annapolis: Naval Institute Press, 2011.
- European Recovery and American Aid: A Report by the President's Committee on Foreign Aid. Washington, DC: Secretary of Commerce, 1947.
- Fanning, Kay. Arlington Ridge Park: Cultural Landscape Inventory, George Washington Memorial Parkway. Washington, DC: National Capital Regional Office, National Park Service, 2008.
- Faulkner, Richard S. Pershing's Crusaders: The American Soldier in World War I. Lawrence: University Press of Kansas, 2017.
- Fontenot, Col Gregory, USA (Ret), et al. On Point: The U.S. Army in Operation Iraqi Freedom. Fort Leavenworth, KS: Office of the Chief of Staff, U.S. Army, Combat Studies Institute Press, 2004.
- Frank, Benis M. U.S. Marines in Lebanon, 1982–1984. Washington, DC: History and Museums Division, Headquarters Marine Corps, 1987.
- Frank, Richard B. Guadalcanal: The Definitive Account of the Landmark Battle. New York: Penguin Books, 1992.
- Fried, Richard M. The Russians Are Coming! The Russians Are Coming!: Pageantry and Patriotism in Cold-War America. New York: Oxford University Press, 1998.
- Garand, George W., and Truman R. Strobridge. History of Marine Corps Operations in World War II, vol. IV, Western Pacific Operations. Washington, DC: Historical Division, Headquarters Marine Corps, 1971.
- Gardella, Peter. American Civil Religion: What Americans Hold Sacred. New York: Oxford University Press, 2014.
- Groen, LtCol Michael S., et al. With the 1st Marine Division in Iraq, 2003: No Greater Friend, No Worse Enemy. Quantico, VA: History Division, Headquarters Marine Corps, 2006.
- Hammel, Eric. Two Flags over Iwo Jima: Solving the Mystery of the U.S. Marine Corps' Proudest Moment. Philadelphia, PA: Casemate, 2018.
- Hariman, Robert, and John Louis Lucaites. No Caption Needed: Iconic Photographs, Public Culture, and Liberal Democracy. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2007.
- Harper, Norman. A Great and Powerful Friend: A Study of Australian American Relations between 1900 and 1975. St. Lucia: University of Queensland Press, 1987.
- Hasluck, Paul. Australia in the War of 1939–1945, Series 4-Civil, The Government and the People, 1942–1945. Canberra, AU: Australian War Memorial, 1970.
- Hastings, Max. *Retribution: The Battle for Japan, 1944–* 45. New York: Knopf, 2008.
- Haynes, MajGen Fred, USMC (Ret), and James A. Warren. The Lions of Iwo Jima: The Story of Combat Team 28 and the Bloodiest Battle in Marine Corps History. New York: Henry Holt, 2008.
- Hemingway, Albert. *Ira Hayes, Pima Marine*. Lanham, MD: University Press of America, 1988.
- Henri, Capt Raymond, et al. *The U.S. Marines on Iwo Jima*. New York: Dial Press, 1945.
- Henthorn, Cynthia Lee. From Submarines to Suburbs: Selling a Better America, 1939–1959. Athens: Ohio University Press, 2006.
- Hicks, Wilson. Words and Pictures: An Introduction: An Introduction to Photojournalism. New York: Harper, 1952.
- Hoffman, Col Jon T, USMCR. Chesty: The Story of Lieutenant General Lewis B. Puller, USMC. New York: Random House, 2001.
  - ——. Silk Chutes and Hard Fighting: U.S. Marine Corps Parachute Units in World War II. Washington, DC: History and Museums Division, Headquarters Marine Corps, 1999.

- Hornfischer, James D. The Fleet at Flood Tide: America at Total War in the Pacific, 1944–1945. New York: Bantam Books, 2016.
- Hughes, Jim. W. Eugene Smith: Shadow & Substance— The Life and Work of an American Photographer. New York: McGraw-Hill, 1989.
- Isaacs, Arnold R. Vietnam Shadows: The War, Its Ghosts, and Its Legacy. Baltimore, MD: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1997.
- Jackson, Ashley. *The British Empire and the Second World War.* London: Hambledon Continuum, 2006.
- Johnston, Richard W. Follow Mel: The Story of the Second Marine Division in World War II. New York: Random House, 1948.
- Jones, Charles. Warshots: Norm Hatch and the U.S. Marine Corps Combat Cameramen of World War II. Mechanicsburg, PA: Stackpole Books, 2011.
- Kemp, Martin. Christ to Coke: How Image Becomes Icon. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2011.
- Kershaw, Alex. Blood and Champagne: The Life and Times of Robert Capa. New York: Thomas Dunne Books, St. Martin's Press, 2003.
- Kessler, Lynn, and Edmond B. Bart, eds. Never in Doubt: Remembering Iwo Jima. Annapolis: Naval Institute Press, 1999.
- Kimble, James J. Mobilizing the Home Front: War Bonds and Domestic Propaganda. College Station: Texas A&M University Press, 2006.
- Krick, Robert K. A Virginia Marine on Iwo Jima. Appomattox, VA: H. E. Howard, 1987.
- Krulak, LtGen Victor H., USMC (Ret). First to Fight: An Inside View of the U.S. Marine Corps. Annapolis: Naval Institute Press, 1984.
- Leary, William M., ed. We Shall Return!: MacArthur's Commanders and the Defeat of Japan. Lexington: University Press of Kentucky, 2004.
- Lemay, Kate Clarke. Triumph of the Dead: American World War II Cemeteries, Monuments, and Diplomacy in France. Tuscaloosa: University of Alabama Press, 2018.
- Lippmann, Walter. *Public Opinion*. New York: Harcourt, Brace, 1922.

- Loengard, John. *Life Photographers: What They Saw.* Boston, MA: Little, Brown, 1998.
- Lucas, Jack H., with D. K. Drum. Indestructible: The Unforgettable Story of a Marine Hero at the Battle of Iwo Jima. Cambridge, MA: Da Capo Press, 2006.
- Marling, Karal Ann, and John Wetenhall. Iwo Jima: Monuments, Memories, and the American Hero. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1991.
- Maslowski, Peter. Armed with Cameras: The American Military Photographers of World War II. New York: Free Press, 1993.
- McLaughlin Jr., Howard N., and Raymond C. Miller. From the Volcano to the Gorge: Getting the Job Done on Iwo Jima. Standish, ME: Tower Publishing, 2011.
- McLeod, Tom. Always Ready: The Story of the United States' 147th Infantry Regiment. Texarkana, TX: privately published, 1996.
- Miller Jr., John. Guadalcanal: The First Offensive, U.S. Army in World War II: The War in the Pacific, CMH Pub 5-3. Washington, DC: U.S. Army Center of Military History, 1949.
- Miller, Donald L. *D-Days in the Pacific*. New York: Simon & Schuster, 2005.
- Millett, Allan R. Semper Fidelis: The History of the United States Marine Corps. New York: Free Press, 1980.
- ———. The War for Korea, 1950–1951: They Came from the North. Lawrence: University Press of Kansas, 2010.
- Millis, Walter, ed., with E. S. Duffield. *The Forrestal Diaries.* New York: Viking Press, 1951.
- Moeller, Susan D. Shooting War: Photography and the American Experience of Combat. New York: Basic Books, 1989.
- Monaghan, Frank. Heritage of Freedom: The History and Significance of the Basic Documents of American Liberty. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1948.
- Montgomerie, Deborah. *The Women's War: New Zea*land Women, 1939–45. Auckland, NZ: Auckland University Press, 2001.

- Montross, Lynn, and Capt Nicholas A. Canzona, USMC. The Inchon-Seoul Operation, vol. II, U.S. Marines in Korea, 1950–1953. Washington, DC: Historical Branch, G-3 Division, Headquarters Marine Corps, 1955.
- Mooney, James L., ed. *Dictionary of American Naval Fighting Ships*, vol. 7. Washington, DC: Navy Department, Office of the Chief of Naval Operations, Naval History Division, 1981.
- Morehouse, Capt Clifford P., USMCR. The Iwo Jima Operation. Washington DC: Historical Division, G-3 Division, Headquarters Marine Corps, 1959.
- Morison, Samuel Eliot. *History of United States Na*val Operations in World War II, vol. 14, Victory in the Pacific, 1945. Boston, MA: Little Brown, 1960.
- Morse, Jarvis M. Paying for a World War: The United States Financing of World War II. Washington, DC: U.S. Savings Bond Division, 1971.
- Muscarella, Anthony. *Iwo Jima: The Young Heroes*. Memphis, TN: Freedom Press, 1989.
- Nalty, Bernard C., and Danny J. Crawford. The United States Marines on Iwo Jima: The Battle and the Flag Raisings. Washington, DC: History and Museums Division, Headquarters Marine Corps, 1995.
- National Research Council. Identifying the Culprit: Assessing Eyewitness Identification. Washington, DC: National Academies Press, 2014. https:// doi.org/10.17226/18891.
- Newell, Reg. Pacific Star: 3NZ Division in the South Pacific in World War II. Auckland, NZ: Exisle Publishing, 2015.
- Noakes, Lucy, and Juliette Pattinson, eds. British Cultural Memory and the Second World War. London: Bloomsbury, 2013.
- O'Connell, Aaron B. Underdogs: The Making of the Modern Marine Corps. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2012.
- Orders, P.G.A. Britain, Australia, New Zealand and the Challenge of the United States, 1939–45: A Study in International History. Basingstoke, New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2003.

Reader, Ian. *Religion in Contemporary Japan*. Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press, 1991.

- Reaves, Wendy Rick, ed., Beyond the Face: New Perspectives on Portraiture. London: National Portrait Gallery, Smithsonian Institution, with D. Giles, 2018.
- Reed, Walt. *The Illustrator in America*, 1860–2000. New York: Society of Illustrators, 2001.
- Reynolds, Clark G. *The Fast Carriers: The Forging of an Air Navy.* Annapolis: Naval Institute Press, 1968.
- Reynolds, Col Nicholas E., USMCR (Ret). U.S. Marines in Iraq, 2003: Basrah, Baghdad and Beyond. Washington, DC: History Division, Headquarters Marine Corps, 2007.
- Roberts Jr., Charles C. *The Boat that Won the War: An Illustrated History of the Higgins LCVP*. Annapolis: Naval Institute Press, 2017.
- Roeder Jr., George H. The Censored War: American Visual Experience during World War Two. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1993.
- Schick, Ron. Norman Rockwell: Behind the Camera. New York: Little, Brown, 2009.
- Schubart, Rikke, and Anne Gjelsvik, eds. Eastwood's Iwo Jima. Critical Engagement with Flags of Our Fathers and Letters from Iwo Jima. New York: Wallflower Press, Columbia University Press, 2013.
- Sherrod, Robert. On to Westward: The Battles of Saipan and Iwo Jima. Baltimore, MD: Nautical & Aviation Publishing Company of America, 1990. *Tarawa: The Story of a Battle.* New York: Du-

ell, Sloan and Pearce, 1944.

- Shulimson, Jack, et al. U.S. Marines in Vietnam: The Defining Year, 1968. Washington, DC: History and Museums Division, Headquarters Marine Corps, 1997.
- Smith, Gen Holland M., USMC (Ret), and Percy Finch. Coral and Brass. New York: Charles Scribner's, 1948; Washington, DC: Zenger Publishing, 1979 reprint.
- Smith, Larry. Iwo Jima: World War II Veterans Remember the Greatest Battle of the Pacific. New York: W. W. Norton, 2008.

- Soule, Thayer. Shooting the Pacific War: Marine Corps Combat Photography in WWII. Lexington: University Press of Kentucky, 2000.
- Sparrow, James T. Warfare State: World War II Americans and the Age of Big Government. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2011.
- Stole, Inger L. Advertising at War: Business, Consumers, Government in the 1940s. Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 2012.
- Strahan, Jerry E. Andrew Jackson Higgins and the Boats that Won World War II, rev. ed. Baton Rouge, LA: Louisiana State University Press, 1998.
- Tatum, Charles W. Iwo Jima: Red Blood, Black Sand— Pacific Apocalypse. Stockton, CA: Charles W. Tatum Publishing, 1995.
- Terkel, Studs. *The Good War: An Oral History of World War II.* New York: Pantheon Books, 1984.
- Thacker, Joel D. History of the Iwo Jima Flag Raising. Washington, DC: Historical Branch, G-3 Division, Headquarters Marine Corps, 1951.
- Thomey, Tedd. Immortal Images: A Personal History of the Two Photographers and the Flag Raising on Iwo Jima. Annapolis: Naval Institute Press, 2008.
- Tucker, Anne Wilkes, and Will Michels, with Natalie Zelt. War/Photography: Images of Armed Conflict and Its Aftermath. Houston and New Haven, CT: Museum of Fine Arts, Houston, Yale University Press, 2012.
- Twomey, Christina, and Ernest Koh, ed. *The Pacific War: Aftermaths, Remembrance and Culture.* London and New York: Routledge, 2015.
- Updegraph Jr., Charles L. Special Marine Corps Units of World War II. Washington, DC: History and Museums Division, Headquarters Marine Corps, 1977.
- U.S. Coast Guard. The Coast Guard at War: Transports and Escorts, vol. 2, Transports. Washington, DC: Historical Section, Public Information Division, U.S. Coast Guard Headquarters, 1946.
- U.S. Marine Corps. *The Iwo Jima Flag Raising*. Washington, DC: Historical Branch, G-3 Division, Headquarters Marine Corps, 1962.

- U.S. Navy. Navy Department Communiques, 2 vols. Washington, DC: Office of Public Information, U.S. Navy, 1945.
- Vandegrift, Alexander A. Once a Marine: The Memoirs of General A.A. Vandegrift. New York: W. W. Norton, 1964.
- Warren, James A. American Spartans: The U.S. Marines: A Combat History from Iwo Jima to Iraq. New York: Pocket Books, 2007.
- Wells, John Keith. "Give Me Fifty Marines Not Afraid to Die": Iwo Jima. Abilene, TX: Ka-Well Enterprises, 1995.
- Wheeler, Richard. A Special Valor: The U.S. Marines in the Pacific War. New York: Harper, 1983.
- ———. The Bloody Battle for Suribachi. New York: Crowell, 1965; Annapolis: Naval Institute Press, 1994, reprint.
- Whelan, Richard. *Robert Capa: A Biography.* Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1994.
- Wierich, Jochen. Grand Themes: Emanuel Leutze, Washington Crossing the Delaware, and American History Painting. University Park: Pennsylvania State University Press, 2012.
- Willie, Clarence E. African American Voices from Iwo Jima: Personal Accounts of the Battle. Jefferson, NC: MacFarland, 2010.
- Wish Book for the 1979 Holiday Season. Chicago: Sears & Roebuck, 1979.
- Wukovits, John. American Commando: Evans Carlson, His WWII Marine Raiders, and America's First Special Forces Missions. New York: NAL Caliber, 2009.
- Yamamoto, Reiko, ed. Chikyu no Arukikata: Washington DC, Baltimore, Annapolis, Philadelphia. Tokyo, JP: Diamond Big Company.

### **Book Chapters/Journal Articles**

- Alexander, Col Joseph H., USMC (Ret). "Across the Reef: Amphibious Warfare in the Pacific." In *The Pacific War Companion: From Pearl Harbor to Hiroshima*, edited by Daniel Marston. London: Osprey, 2005.
  - -. "Battle of the Barricades: U.S. Marines in the Recapture of Seoul." In U.S. Marines in

*the Korean War*, edited by Charles R. Smith. Washington, DC: History Division, Headquarters Marine Corps, 2007.

- Beaumont, Joan. "Australian Memory and the US Wartime Alliance: The Australian-American Memorial and the Battle of the Coral Sea." *War & Society* 22, no. 1 (2004): 69–87, https:// doi.org/10.1179/072924704791202121.
  - —. "The Diplomacy of Extra-Territorial Heritage: The Kokoda Track, Papua New Guinea." *International Journal Heritage Studies* 22, no. 5 (2016): 355–67. https://doi.org/10080/13 527258.2016.1153496.
- Brewster, Todd. "Remembrance (More or Less) of Things Past." *Civilization* 6, no. 4 (August/ September 1999).
- Buell, Hal. "Photographs: Why Not a Camera?." In Breaking News: How the Associated Press Has Covered War, Peace, and Everything Else. New York: Princeton Architectural Press, 2007.
- ——, ed. "The Longest Image." In World War II Album: The Complete Chronicle of the World's Greatest Conflict. New York: Black Dog & Leventhal, 2006.
- Burrell, Robert S. "Breaking the Cycle of Iwo Jima Mythology: A Strategic Study of Operation Detachment." *Journal of Military History* 68, no. 4 (October 2004): 1143–86. https://doi. org/10.1353/jmh.2004.0175.
- Edwards, Janis L., and Carol K. Winkler. "Representative Form and the Visual Ideograph: The Iwo Jima Image in Editorial Cartoons." *Quarterly Journal of Speech* 83, no. 3 (1997): 289–310. https: //doi.org/10.1080/00335639709384187.
- Foss, Sonja K. "Ambiguity as Persuasion: The Vietnam Veterans Memorial." *Communication Quarterly* 34, no. 3 (Summer 1986): 326–40. https:// doi.org/10.1080/01463378609369643.

- Gallois, Mathieu. "The Aboriginal Flag as Art." Australian Aboriginal Studies, no. 2 (2016): 46–60.
- Groseclose, Barbara S. "Washington Crossing the Delaware: The Political Context." *American Art Journal* 7, no. 2 (November 1975): 70–78. https://doi.org/10.2307/1594000.
- Hariman, Robert, and John Louis Lucaites. "Performing Civic Identity: The Iconic Photograph of the Flag Raising on Iwo Jima." *Quarterly Journal of Speech* 88, no. 4 (November 2002): 363–92. https://doi.org/10.1080 /00335630209384385.
- House, R. C. "Battle of Iwo Jima: Alan Wood and the Famous Flag on Mount Suribachi." *World War II*, January 2000.
- Housman, A. E. "Free Clee to Heaven the Beacon Burns." In *A Shropshire Lad.* London: K. Paul, Trench, Treubner, 1896.
- Howat, John K. "Washington Crossing the Delaware." Metropolitan Museum of Art Bulletin 26, no. 7 (March 1968): 289–99. https://doi. org/102307/3258337.
- Irizarry, Joshua A. "Signs of Life: Grounding the Transcendent in Japanese Memorial Objects." Signs and Society 2, no. S1 (Supplement 2014): 160–87.
- Kelsey, Robin. "Of Fish, Birds, Cats, Mice, Spiders, Flies, Pigs, and Chimpanzees: How Chance Casts the Historic Action Photograph into Doubt." *History and Theory* 48 (December 2009): 59–76. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1468-2303 .2009.00518.x.
- Leff, Mark H. "The Politics of Sacrifice on the American Home Front in World War II." *Journal of American History* 77, no. 4 (March 1991): 1296–1318.
- Little, Stuart J. "The Freedom Train: Citizenship and Postwar Culture, 1946–1949." *American Studies* 34, no. 1 (Spring 1993): 35–67.
- Marling, Karal Ann, and Robert Silberman. "The Statue near the Wall: The Vietnam Veterans Memorial and the Art of Remembering." *Smithsonian Studies in American Art* 1, no. 1 (Spring 1987): 4–29.

- Messaris, Paul. "Visual Literacy and Visual Culture." In Imagery and Visual Literacy: Selected Readings from the Annual Conference of the International Visual Literacy Association, edited by D. G. Beauchamp et al. Blacksburg, VA: International Visual Literacy Association, 1995.
- Military Intelligence Division. "Minefield Patterns in the Defense of Iwo Jima." *Intelligence Bulletin* 3, no. 10 (June 1945): 15–22.
- Millett, Allan R. "Assault from the Sea: The Development of Amphibious Warfare between the Wars—The American, British, and Japanese Experiences." In *Military Innovation in the Interwar Period*, edited by Williamson Murray and Allan R. Millett. New York: Cambridge University Press, 2009.
- Pearson, Warren, and Grant O'Neill, "Australia Day: A Day for all Australians?" In National Days: Constructing and Mobilising National Identity, edited by David McCrone and Gayle McPherson. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009. https://doi.org/10.1057 /9780230251175.
- Rasgus, Jerome, John Dennington, Larry Memberg, and Ann Rae Jonas. "Proud Witness." *Civil Engineering* 77, no. 4 (2007): 56–64.
- Rechniewski, Elizabeth. "Remembering the Battle for Australia." *Journal of Multidisciplinary International Studies* 7, no. 1 (2010): 1–18.
- Renn, Melissa. "An Enduring Record: Peter Hurd's Art for Life Magazine." In Magical & Real: Henriette Wyeth and Peter Hurd, A Retrospective, edited by Kirsten M. Jensen. Doylestown, PA: James A. Michener Art Museum, 2018.
- ———. "The Famous Iwo Flag-Raising: Iwo Jima Revisited." *History of Photography* 39, no. 3 (August 2015): 253–62. https://doi.org/10.1 080/03087298.2014.995957.
- ———. "From Life: Tom Lea and the World War II art of Life Magazine." In Tom Lea, Life Magazine, and World War II, edited by Adair Margo and Melissa Renn. El Paso, TX: Tom Lea Institute, 2016.

Rosenthal, Angela. "She's Got the Look!: Eighteen th-

Century Female Portrait Painters and the Psychology of a Potentially 'Dangerous Employment'." In *Portraiture: Facing the Subject*, edited by Joanna Woodall. Manchester, UK: Manchester University Press, 1997.

- Saunders, Kay. "An Instrument of Strategy': Propaganda, Public Policy and the Media in Australia during the Second World War." War & Society 15, no. 2 (1997): 75–90. https://doi.or g/10.1179/072924797791201201.
- Smith, W. Eugene. "Chronology." In W. Eugene Smith: His Photographs and Notes. New York: Aperture, 1969.
- Special Issues of *Journal of American History* 75, no. 4 (March 1989).
- Stanley, Peter. "What Is the Battle for Australia?." Australian Army Journal 4, no. 2 (Winter 2007): 17–34.
- Stewart, Andrew. "The 1939 British and Canadian 'Empire Air Training Scheme' Negotiations." *Round Table: Commonwealth Journal of International Affairs* 93, no. 377 (2004): 739–54. https:// doi.org/10.1080/0035853042000300214.
- Torney-Parlicki, Prue. "Grave Security Obligations': The Australian Government's Refusal to Accredited Newspaper Photographers to Combat Areas during the Second World War." War & Society 16, no. 1 (2013): 105–23. https://doi.org/10.1179/war.1998.16.1.105.
- Toshio, Kuroda, and Allan Grapard. "The World of Spirit Pacification: Issues of State and Religion." *Japanese Journal of Religious Studies* 23, no. 3/4 (Fall 1996): 321–51.
- Wang, ShiPu. "Japan against Japan: U.S. Propaganda and Yasuo Kuniyoshi's Identity Crisis." *American Art* 22, no. 1 (Spring 2008): 28–51. https://doi.org/10.1086/587915.

#### Newspaper/Magazine Articles

- "8,000 Brave Threatening Weather Here to Inspect Freedom Train." *Daily Mail* (Hagerstown, MD), 9 October 1948.
- "After Kokoda Fell." *Courier-Mail* (Brisbane, AU), 13 November 1942.

- "Anzac Day Commemoration." *Rodney and Otamatea Times, Waitemata and Kaipara Gazetter* (New Zealand), 28 April 1943.
- "Arms, Character, Courage." Time, 5 March 1945.
- "Art from Life in Defiance of Death." *Times-Union* (Rochester, NY), 27 February 1945.
- "Artists Profile." New Yorker, 17 March 1945.
- Associated Press, "The Week's Work," Collier's, 12 May 1945.
- Barrier Jr., Ralph. "Eagle Rock Navy Veteran Remembers Iwo Jima Flag Raising, Battle." *Roanoke (VA) Times*, 23 February 2015.
- "Battle Rages on Iwo Jima. 'Doorstep of Tokyo'." Auckland (NZ) Star, 20 February 1945.
- "Behind the Lines of Flags of Our Fathers." (Auckland) New Zealand Herald, 2 November 2006.
- "Big Fight on Iwo Jima." *Daily News* (Perth, AU), 20 February 1945.
- Bruder, Col Jay. "The Dedication of the Belleau Wood Memorial." *Marine Corps Gazette* 99, no. 11 (November 2015): 24–29.
- "Burlington Meets the Freedom Train." *Look*, 6 January 1948.
- Christmas-Smith, Kenneth L. "Vietnam Veterans Memorial: 'Three Marines'?." *Leatherneck*, January 2013.
- "Country Like Gallipoli. American Casualties Fairly High." (Auckland) New Zealand Herald, 21 February 1945.
- Curtin, John. "The Task Ahead." *Herald* (Melbourne, AU), 27 December 1941.
- Devree, Charlotte. "Is This Statuary Worth More than a Million of Your Money?." *ARTNews*, April 1955.
- Dexter, Frank. "C Gloucester Marines Were Here —Tough Fighters Enjoyed Holiday." Argus (Melbourne, AU), 29 December 1943.
- Dower, John W. "Lessons from Iwo Jima." Perspectives on History, 1 September 2007, 54.
- "Famous War Photographs." *Advocate* (Melbourne, AU), 30 May 1945.
- "Famous War Picture Taken by Convert," *Catholic Weekly* (Sydney, AU), 31 May 1945.
- Feis, Aaron. "The Marine Who Shoved America

in Saddam's Face—15 Years Later." *New York Post*, 8 April 2018.

- Ferrebee, Robert A. "Retreat, Hell! We Just Got Here." *American Legion*, 11 December 2014.
- Fisk, James E. "Mass on a Volcano." *Catholic World*, January 1949.
- "The Flag Goes Up: Most Famous Picture of the War." Sun (Sydney, AU), 13 May 1945.
- Ford, W. G. "Atop Mt. Suribachi with Sergeant Lou Lowery." *Leatherneck*, June 2002.
- "Four Named to Arts Board." Washington Post, 20 June 1950.
- "Freedom Train." Leatherneck, September 1993.
- "Freedom Train 1947." Leatherneck, March 1998.
- " 'Freedom Train' to Tour U.S. in Fight on Crime." *Times Herald* (Washington, DC), 19 June 1947.
- "Gallipoli of the Pacific Seas." *Daily Examiner* (Grafton, AU), 24 February 1945.
- "George Hart Talks about Films." *Sun* (Sydney, AU), 7 August 1950.
- Gillum, Donald E. "Gallipoli: Its Influence on Amphibious Doctrine." *Marine Corps Gazette* 51, no. 11 (November 1967): 41–46.
- Grateful. "Memorial to USMC," letter to the editor. *Evening Post* (Wellington, NZ), 21 November 1945.
- Hansen, Matthew. "New Mystery Arises from Iconic Iwo Jima Image." *Omaha (NE) World-Herald*, 23 November 2014.
- Hatch, Norman T. "Flags Over Mount Suribachi." Marine Corps Gazette (February 2004).
- "He Helped Raise First Flag on Iwo Jima." *Minne-apolis (MN) Star-Tribune*, 29 May 1988.
- "Here's Your Infantry-A Rousing 7th Spectacle!" Minute Man, 1 May 1945.
- " 'Heroes of Iwo' Issue Still Rages." *Marine Corps Chevron* 4, no. 35 (8 September 1945): 3.
- "Historic Freedom Train Here Today." Daily Missoulian (MT), 15 April 1948.
- Holden, T. T. "Camera Topics." *Plaindealer* (Kansas City, KS), 4 May 1945.

Horowitz, Rick. "Maya Lin's Angry Objections,

Vietnam Memorial Artist on Changes." *Washington Post*, 7 July 1982.

- Humphreys, Adrian. "Frame by Frame: Canadian Video Analyst Corrects History of Iconic Second World War Photo of Iwo Jima Flag Raising." *National Post* (CAN), 1 July 2016.
- Imrie, Robert. "Vet Tries to Prove He's in Iwo Jima Photo." Albany (NY) Times Union, 18 March 2003.
- "Iwo Jima." Life, 5 March 1945.
- "Iwo Jima Peak Stormed." *Argus* (Melbourne, AU), 24 February 1945.
- "Iwo Jima, Scene of the Latest Pacific Landing by United States Marines." (Auckland) New Zealand Herald, 22 February 1945.
- "Iwo Jima Success." *News* (Adelaide, AU), 23 February 1945.
- "Iwo Photo Not Posed, Says Joe Rosenthal." Los Angeles (CA) Times, 15 June 1945.
- Jacobs, Nancy. Letter to the editor, Us, 22 April 1985.
- Keene, R. R. "Louis Lowery Captured Leatherneck." *Leatherneck*, October 2006.
- Kime, Patricia. "Iwo Jima Flag Legend Puts Services at Odds." Army Times, 12 December 2005.
- "La Complicatissima Storia della Foto di Iwo Jima." Il Post (ITA), 4 May 2016.
- Langille, Vernon A. "Instrument of Surrender: Anniversary Review." *Leatherneck*, September 1947.
- Leviero, Anthony. "Truman Shakes Up Arts Commission." *New York Times*, 20 June 1950.
- Louchheim, Aline B. "Memorials to Our War Dead Abroad." *New York Times*, 15 January 1950.
- Marin, Rick. "Raising a Flag for Generation W. W. II." *New York Times*, 22 April 2001.
- "Marines Take Mt. Suribachi: American Casualties on Iwo Mount to 5372." *Boston (MA) Globe*, 23 February 1945.
- "Marines to Enter Float of Iwo Jima in Parade." Joplin (MO) Globe, 30 April 1948.
- "Marines Win Bloody, Barren Sands of Iwo." *Life*, 12 March 1945.

- McLellan, Dennis. "Felix de Weldon." Los Angeles (CA) Times, 10 June 2003.
- "The Message on Memorial Gates." *Evening Post* (Wellington, NZ), 8 February 1963.
- Michaels, Jim. "Marines Misidentified One Man in Iconic 1945 Iwo Jima Photo." USA Today, 23 June 2016.
- Miller, Bill. "The Whine of Snipers' Bullets Comprised the Only Opposition." *Leatherneck*, September 1947.
- Morgan, Joyce. "Battlefield the Wrong Pitch for the Baggy Greens." *Sydney (AU) Morning Herald*, 30 May 2001.
- Moscow, Warren. "Japanese Overrun, Marines Smash through Maze of Defenses in Bloody Iwo Battle." *New York Times*, 25 February 1945.
- "Navy Hails Joe Rosenthal." New York Times, 9 March 1945.
- "NZ War Effort—Tribute to Mr Nash—Mr Roosevelt's Letter." *Auckland (NZ) Star*, 6 April 1943.
- "Parade, Mass Meeting to Precede Arrival." Ogden (UT) Standard Examiner, 19 March 1948.
- Povich, Shirley. "DC Man Tells How He Made that Iwo Flag-Raising 'Shot'." Washington Post, 13 March 1945.
- "Pulitzer Prizes." *Examiner* (Launceston, TAS), 9 May 1945.
- Reinwald, Col Mary H., USMC (Ret). "Confirming the First Flag Raisers." *Leatherneck*, October 2016.
- - ———. "Seventy Years Later—Was a Mistake Made?" *Marine Corps Gazette* (August 2016).
- "Roll of Honour." *Evening Post* (Wellington, NZ), 20 November 1945.
- Rosenthal, Joe, with W. C. Heinz. "The Picture that Will Live Forever." *Collier's*, 18 February 1955.
- "Saipan Won after Grim Fight," Auckland (NZ) Star, 11 July 1944.
- Schmidt, Michael S. " 'Flags of Our Fathers' Au-

thor Now Doubts His Father Was in Iwo Photo." *New York Times*, 3 May 2016.

- "Sculptor Finances Iwo Statue, but GIs Donate Labor." *Washington (NC) Daily News*, 10 November 1945.
- "Sculptor of Famous Marines Corps War Memorial." Los Angeles (CA) Times, 11 June 2003.
- Seidl, Von Christian. "Historische Aufnahme: Der Falsche Flaggenhisser von Iwojima." *Berliner Zeitung* (DEU), 23 February 2017.
- "Seventh War Loan Drive Gets Under Way Today." Los Angeles (CA) Times, 14 May 1945.
- "Spectator Hurt in War Bond Show." Washington Post, 10 June 1945.
- Share, Steve. "Local Union Retiree Gains New Recognition for Iwo Jima Flag-Raising." *Minneapolis (MN) Labor Review*, 26 May 2005.
- Sherrod, Robert. "The First Three Days." *Life*, 5 March 1945.
- Spahalaski, Christy. "Marine Vet Recalls First Flag Raising." Marine Corps Chevron, 12 March 1982.
- Silverstein, Judy L. "Iwo Jima: The Coast Guard Connection." *Reservist Magazine*, July 2004.
- Spence, Dustin. "Unraveling the Mysteries of the First Flag Raising." *Leatherneck*, October 2006.
- "Statues Unveiled for 7th War Loan." New York Times, 12 May 1945.
- "Story of a Picture." Time, 26 March 1945.
- "Thanks to Marines: Reserve and Beaches Saved." *Evening Post* (Wellington, NZ), 12 January 1943.
- "The Texts of the Day's Communiques on the Fighting in the Various War Theatres." New York Times, February 24, 1945.
- "Three Americans." Life, 20 September 1943.
- "Tribute in Transit: Bronze of Iwo Marines Makes a Monumental Move to Capital." *Life*, 20 September 1954.
- "To Inspire a Mighty 7th!" *Minute Man*, 15 May 1945.

- "US Generals' Flag Raising Fever." *Newcastle Sun* (New South Wales, AU), 20 June 1945.
- "US Marine Corps Monument." *Examiner* (Launceston, TAZ), 12 November 1954.
- Walters, Conrad. "So Why the Bloody Hell Did They Flag that Idea?." Sydney (AU) Morning Herald, 10 May 2009.
- "Washington Crossing the Delaware." New York Times, 22 January 1897.
- Wieland, John J. "Scaling Mount Suribachi." The Raider Patch, transcribed by Lowell V. Bulger, January 1983.
- Wells, G. Greeley. "The Man Who Carried the Flag at Iwo Jima." *New York Times*, 17 October 1991.
- Worden, William L. "The Self-Trapped Japs of Iwo." Saturday Evening Post, 28 April 1945.

#### **Online Sources**

- "1950 Fast Facts." United States Census Bureau, 18 July 2017.
- "25 of the Most Iconic Photographs." CNN, 27 September 2016.
- 2d Battalion, 28th Marines. Iwo Jima Action Report, 10 April 1945 (Declassified by Authority: E.O. 13526, by NDC, 31 December 2012). Fold 3. Ancestry.com, accessed 10 April 2018.
- "Arlington Ridge Park Nomination, 2009, Arlington, Virginia." Virginia Department of Historic Resources, 5 April 1996.
- Arraf, Jane. "Iraqi Who Toppled Saddam Hussein Statue 15 Years Ago Regrets His Action." *Morning Edition*, National Public Radio, 9 April 2018.
- "The Australia, New Zealand and United States Security Treaty (ANZUS Treaty), 1951." *Milestones: 1945–1952.* Office of the Historian, Department of State.
- Bowman, Tom. "Marine Corps Misidentified Man in Iconic Photo," *All Things Considered*, National Public Radio, 24 June 2016.
- Brown, Rodney Hilton. "The War Museum." 2012.
- "Conflicts of the 20th Century: Lot 79." Bonhams .com, 21 October 2015.

- The Lend-Lease Act of 1941. H.R. 177, 77 Congress,10 January 1941.
- Long, Patrick. "Military Honor Guards." TheBalance.com, 24 January 2016.
- *LST-758* War Diary, February 1945 (Declassified by NDC, Authority: Executive Order 13526, on 31 December 2012). Ancestry.com, II.
- "Marine Barracks, Washington D.C." Barracks .Marines.mil, accessed 1 August 2017.
- "MCWMF History." Marine Corps League, accessed 26 April 2017.
- Office of the U.S. Marine Corps Communication, Headquarters Marine Corps. "Marine Corps Updates Its Official Records of the First Flag Raising over Iwo Jima," press release, Marines.mil, 24 August 2016.
- Pruitt, Sarah. "Marine Corps Will Investigate Identity of Flag Raisers at Iwo Jima." History .com, 6 May 2016.
- "Tank Landing Ship (LST) Index." NavSource.org, accessed 9 August 2017.
- Theorywolf. "Iwo Jima Vet M1 Helmet and Grouping." U.S. Militaria Forum, 16 January 2011.
- Universal Studios Newsreel. Release 398. Universal Pictures Company. Aired on 14 May 1945.

#### Films

- Action at Anguar. U.S. Treasury Department. Aired in 1945. 28.27 min.
- Forgotten Flag Raisers: Pursuit of Truth. Directed by Dustin Spence, written by Liz Reph and Dustin Spence. Aired on 24 May 2014. 61 min.
- *The Oath.* Directed by Dusan Hudec. Aired at Embassy of the Slovak Republic in Washington, DC, on 8 November 2018. 58:30 min.
- The Unknown Flag Raiser of Iwo Jima. Produced by LtCol Matthew W. Morgan. Smithsonian Channel. Aired on 3 July 2016. 48 min.
- To the Shores of Iwo Jima. Directed by John Huston, featuring Mark W. Clark and John Huston. Aired on 7 June 1945. 20 min.

## CONTRIBUTORS

FRED H. ALLISON has managed the oral history program for the U.S. Marine Corps History Division since 2000. As a career Marine Reserve officer prior to joining the division, he served as a radar intercept officer in McDonnell Douglas F-4 Phantom IIs and was designated an air combat tactics instructor. In addition, he has taught history at the university level and published several articles on oral history and Marine Corps topics. Dr. Allison edited Pathbreakers: U.S. Marine African American Officers in Their Own Words (2013) and We Were Going to Win or Die There: With the Marines at Guadalcanal (2017) and coauthored History of Marine Fighter/Attack Squadron 232 (2015). He is the recipient of several Marine Corps Heritage Foundation awards, including the Dissertation Fellowship, the General Roy S. Geiger Award for aviation writing, and the Colonel Joseph Alexander Award for best biographical book. A Texas native, he earned a PhD in military history from Texas Tech University, Lubbock, in 2003. His dissertation is entitled "The Black Sheep Squadron: A Case Study in U.S. Marine Corps' Innovations in Close Air Support."

ANNETTE AMERMAN is the Marine Corps History Division's Reference Branch head. She joined the division in 1995 as an intern in the Reference Branch, and was later hired as a clerk, a position she held until 1997. She returned in 2003. Amerman is editor of the reprint of Major Edwin N. McClellan's *The United States Marine Corps in the World War* (2015) and author of *United States Marine Corps in the First World War: Anthology, Selected Bibliography, and Annotated Order of Battle* (2016), and *The Marines Have Landed: Eighty Years of Marine Corps Landings, 1935–2015* (2016). She holds a bachelor of science degree in history from Shenandoah University, Winchester, Virginia, and a master of arts degree in history from George Mason University, Fairfax, Virginia.

CRISS AUSTIN is the supervisor of the Motion Picture Preservation Lab at the National Archives and Records Administration. During the last decade, she has overseen preservation and digital restoration projects, including *Nine from Little Rock* (1964), *A Year Toward Tomorrow* (1966), *With the Marines at Tarawa* (1944), *The Negro Soldier* (1944), *Let There Be Light* (1915), and *The March* (1964). She recently completed digital preservation of William Wyler's outtakes from *The Memphis Belle: Story of a Flying Fortress* (1944) and Eva Braun's home movies. Austin is an active participant in multiple moving image professional organizations and in creating technical guidelines for archives, libraries, and museums. She holds degrees from Oberlin College, Ohio; the Nottingham Trent University, England; and the L. Jeffrey Selznick School of Film Preservation at George Eastman House International Museum of Photography and Film, Rochester, New York.

OWEN L. CONNER is the senior curator of uniforms and heraldry at the National Museum of the Marine Corps. He specializes in World War II matériel history and is recognized as the museum's subject matter expert for uniforms, medals, and equipment. He has written articles for Leatherneck magazine and The Military Collector & Historian published by the Company of Military Historians. Conner has also appeared on numerous television programs, such as Travel Channel's "Mysteries at the Museum," American Heroes Channel's "Secrets of the Arsenal," CNN, Stars & Stripes TV, and others. As the senior curator for the museum's uniforms and heraldry section, he is responsible for the research and care of more than 20,000 artifacts associated with some of the most prominent U.S. Marines and Marine moments in history. A resident of Fredericksburg, Virginia, Conner received his bachelor of arts degree from George Mason University in 1997. He returned to the university for his master of arts degree in applied history in 2006.

STEPHEN FOLEY is from Wexford, Ireland. He has had a lifelong interest in U.S. Marine Corps history, particularly of the World War II period, and he has researched the Battle of Iwo Jima extensively for many years. His fascination with combat photographs led him to discover misidentifications in the official lineup in Joseph Rosenthal's famous flag-raising photograph taken on Mount Suribachi on 23 February 1945. His research prompted the Marine Corps to undertake a formal investigation of both flag raisings and alter its official record. He continues to research the events of that day with the same fascination as always. Colonel Keil R. Gentry retired from the Marine Corps in 2016 after 30 years of service. In addition to making multiple combat deployments, he served as head of national plans for the Marine Corps, commanding officer of 12th Marine Regiment, deputy legislative assistant to the Commandant of the Marine Corps, and director of the Marine Corps War College. He currently serves as the vice president for business affairs at Marine Corps University. In 2016, he participated in the Huly Panel investigation that revised the identification of the raisers in both first and second flag raisings on Iwo Jima. In 2019, he participated in the Bowers Board.

CHRISTOPHER B. HAVERN SR. is a historian with the Naval History and Heritage Command (NHHC), Washington, DC, primarily engaged in researching and writing entries for the *Dictionary of American Naval Fighting Ships* (DANFS). Prior to working at NHHC, he was a historian with the U.S. Coast Guard Historian's Office from 1997 to 2015. Havern holds a master of arts in military history from the University of Maryland at College Park. His thesis is entitled "A Gunnery Revolution Manqué: William S. Sims and the Adoption of Continuous-Aim in the United States Navy, 1898– 1910." He also served as an infantry officer with the U.S. Army's 10th Mountain Division (Light) at Fort Drum, New York.

ALFRED HOUDE recently retired as the senior curator of arms and armor at the National Museum of the Marine Corps. During his tenure, he was responsible for thousands of ordnance and small-arms related artifacts, many of which are rare, unique, and in some cases one-of-a-kind experimental firearms. Prior to his museum career, Houde served as a firearms enforcement officer with the Bureau of Alcohol, Tobacco, Firearms and Explosives in Washington, DC. He is a nationally recognized subject matter expert in the field of firearms and ammunition. A veteran of the U.S. Navy, Houde completed an apprenticeship as an ordnance artificer through the U.S. Department of Labor in 1997, and most recently completed a certificate in hunting and shooting sports management from Montgomery Community College, Troy, North Carolina. Houde currently works as an independent firearms consultant and resides in Stafford, Virginia.

LIEUTENANT GENERAL JAN C. HULY retired from the Marine Corps in 2007 after 37 years of service, including assignments as the principal plans, policy, and operations officer for the Marine Corps and the commanding general of the Marine Corps Recruit Depot San Diego, California. Since leaving the Marine Corps, Lieutenant General Huly has built on his experiences working at the national and international level with U.S. and foreign governments, their agencies, and the business community. Currently, he is the president and chief executive officer of the Marines' Memorial Association and Foundation, a veterans' nonprofit, in San Francisco, California. In 2016, Lieutenant General Huly served as president during the Huly Panel investigation into the Iwo Jima flag raisings. He holds a master of arts from Central Michigan University in Mount Pleasant and a bachelor of arts from the University of California, Berkeley.

KATE CLARKE LEMAY is a historian and curator at the Smithsonian's National Portrait Gallery. She earned a dual PhD in art history and American studies from Indiana University, Bloomington. Her book, Triumph of the Dead: American WWII Cemeteries, Monuments and Diplomacy in France, received the 2018 Terra Foundation for American Art Publication Award. Its research was supported by fellowships from Institute of International Education Fulbright U.S. Student Program, the Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique in Paris, and the Smithsonian American Art Museum. Lemay has published with the International Journal of Military History and Historiography, the Journal of War and Culture Studies, the University of North Texas Press, and Princeton University Press.

DAVID W. MILLS teaches military history at the United States Army Command and General Staff College at Fort Leavenworth, Kansas. He obtained his PhD from North Dakota State University, Fargo, in 2009, and taught for several years at a community college in Minnesota. His primary area of focus is the early Cold War and society, including topics such as the Freedom Train. He is the author of two books and several articles investigating the era. His next research project examines the impact of agriculture as government officials used food and other commodities to shape the political and economic relationship between the United States and the Soviet Union in the early 1950s.

JOHN MOREMON is a senior lecturer at the Centre for Defence and Security Studies, Massey University, New Zealand. He also teaches at the Officer Cadet School of New Zealand. He completed his PhD in history at the University of New South Wales Canberra, Australia, and has since completed a postgraduate diploma in museum studies at Massey University. He has an interest in and professional experience with war commemorations, having spent some years as a historian with the Commemorations and War Graves Branch of Australia's Department of Veterans' Affairs. His research interests encompass military operations, particularly in relation to the Pacific War, and armed forces and society.

COLONEL DOUGLAS E. NASH SR., USA (Ret), is a graduate of West Point and the Army's Command and General Staff and War Colleges. During his 32 years of active duty, including 2 years of enlisted service, he served in a variety of armor, cavalry, and special operations assignments and tours with the Army's Special Operations Command (SOCOM) at Fort Bragg, North Carolina, and U.S. SOCOM at MacDill Air Force Base in Tampa, Florida. A senior parachutist with 54 static line jumps, he participated as a team leader, company commander, and staff officer in Germany, Saudi Arabia, Iraq, Turkey, Kosovo, Cuba, Uzbeki-

stan, and Afghanistan with a variety of conventional and special operations units. After serving a tour of duty with the State Department, Nash retired in July 2006 and began working for the Marine Corps History Division in Quantico, Virginia, as the senior historian until his retirement in 2019. His publications on military history include the book Victory Was Beyond Their Grasp: With the 272nd Volks-Grenadier Division from the Huertgen Forest to the Heart of the Reich (2015) and the article "Kesternich: The Battle that Saved the Bulge," which garnered Pulitzer Prize nominations for nonfiction and exploratory reporting, respectively. In addition to writing books and articles on military history, he is a certified ordinary seaman in the deck department of the restored World War II liberty ship, the SS John W. Brown, which conducts living history cruises out of Baltimore, Maryland.

CHARLES P. NEIMEYER recently retired from his position as the director of Marine Corps History Division and the Gray Research Center at Marine Corps University, Quantico, Virginia. During his 20-year career as a military officer, Dr. Neimeyer served in a variety of posts and stations in the Marine Corps, including tours in all three active Marine divisions and service at the White House. While on active duty, he earned a master of arts and PhD in history (with distinction) from Georgetown University, Washington, DC, and an additional master of arts degree from the U.S. Naval War College in Newport, Rhode Island, where he graduated with highest honors. Dr. Neimeyer edited the volume On the Corps: USMC Wisdom from the pages of Leatherneck, Marine Corps Gazette, and Proceedings (2008). His other publications include America Goes to War: A Social History of the Continental Army, 1775–1783 (1996); The Revolutionary War (2007); and War in the Chesapeake: The British Campaigns to Control the Bay, 1813-1814 (2015), which received the Marine Corps Heritage Foundation's Brigadier General Edwin Simmons-Henry I. Shaw Award in 2017.

ROSS E. PHILLIPS is a graduate student at

Texas A&M University in College Station, where he studies Marine Corps operations in the Vietnam War. As an intern with the Marine Corps History Division in 2018 and 2019, he provided research assistance to Dr. Breanne Robertson on projects related to Marine actions in Santo Domingo, Iwo Jima, and the American Civil War. Phillips received a bachelor of arts degree in history from the University of Georgia in 2017 and a master of arts degree in history from Texas A&M University in 2019. He is currently pursuing his PhD.

AUSTIN PORTER is an assistant professor of art history and American studies at Kenyon College, Ohio, where he teaches courses on modern art and photography. His research on American art has received support from fellowships provided by the Henry Luce Foundation, the American Council of Learned Societies, and the Smithsonian American Art Museum. Prior to his career in academia, Dr. Porter worked in advertising and later as a designer in an art museum, where he assisted with the creation of exhibitions and publications. He holds a master of arts degree from the University of Kansas, Lawrence, and a PhD in art history from Boston University.

COLONEL MARY H. REINWALD, USMC (Ret), is the editor of *Leatherneck* magazine and the director of strategic communications for the Marine Corps Association and Foundation. Colonel Reinwald retired from the Marine Corps in 2014 after serving as an adjutant and manpower officer. In 2016, she participated in the Huly Panel investigation that corrected the identification of the raisers in both first and second flag raisings on Iwo Jima.

MELISSA RENN is collections manager for the HBS Art and Artifacts Collection, Harvard Business School in Boston, Massachusetts. She has published widely on *Life* magazine, including in "*Life*'s Pioneer Painters: Dorothy Seiberling and American Art in *Life* Magazine, 1949–1968," in Rachel Esner and Sandra Kisters, eds., *The Mediatization of the Artist* (2018); in "Life in Color: Life Magazine and the Color Reproduction of Works of Art," in Regina Lee Blaszczyk and Uwe Spiekermann, eds., *Bright Modernity: Color, Commerce, and Consumer Culture* (2017); in "The Famous Iwo Flag-Raising': Iwo Jima Revisited," in *History of Photography* (2015); and in "Within Their Walls: Life Magazine's Illuminations," in the Archives of American Art Journal (2014). She is coeditor, with Monica E. Jovanovich, of Corporate Patronage of Art & Architecture in the United States, Late 19th Century to the Present (2019).

BREANNE ROBERTSON is a historian with the Marine Corps History Division at Marine Corps University in Quantico, Virginia. Dr. Robertson has published articles on Marine Corps activities in the Dominican Republic between 1916 and 1924 and on U.S. efforts to cultivate Pan-Americanism through the visual arts during World War II. She holds a PhD in art history from the University of Maryland in College Park, a master of arts degree in art history from the University of Texas in Austin, and a bachelor of arts degree in art history from the University of Missouri in Columbia. Prior to joining the staff at Marine Corps University, she taught art history and American studies at Wesleyan University in Middletown, Connecticut.

DUSTIN SPENCE is a graduate of the University of California, Davis. He is a published historian, filmmaker, and expert on the Battle of Iwo Jima and the Iwo Jima flag raisings. He served as an on-set historical consultant on the Steven Spielbergand Tom Hanks-produced World War II miniseries *The Pacific* (2010), and his documentary *Forgotten Flag Raisers* (2014) won the American Heroes Channel Award at the GI Film Festival. In 2006, Spence wrote the cover story for *Leatherneck* disclosing his findings on the first flag raising at Iwo Jima. The article was awarded the Colonel Robert D. Heinl Jr. Award by the Marine Corps Heritage Foundation. YUI SUZUKI holds a bachelor of arts degree in religion and philosophy and a master of arts degree in Asian studies from Sophia University, Tokyo, Japan, and a PhD in art history from the University of California, Los Angeles. She was an associate professor in the Department of Art History and Archaeology at the University of Maryland, College Park, where she taught from 2006 to 2017, and also served as the director of undergraduate studies from 2014 to 2017. A scholar of ancient and early medieval Japanese Buddhist art, Dr. Suzuki's research focuses on the mediating roles objects (both ritual and everyday) and human bodies play between the material and spiritual worlds. She is the author of Medicine Master Buddha: The Iconic Worship of Yakushi in Heian Japan (2012), as well as numerous articles. Her most recent research interests have expanded to include the material culture of demons, ghosts, and other spirit entities in both ancient and contemporary Japanese culture.

PAUL WESTERMEYER is a historian who joined the Marine Corps History Division at Marine Corps University in 2005. He earned a bachelor of arts degree in history and master of arts degree in military history from The Ohio State University in Columbus. He received the Marine Corps Heritage Foundation's Brigadier General Edwin Simmons-Henry I. Shaw Award in 2015 for his book U.S. Marines in the Gulf War, 1990-1991: Liberating Kuwait (2014). He is the author of U.S. Marines in Battle: Al-Khafji, 28 January-1 February 1991 (2008) and the editor of Desert Voices: An Oral History Anthology of Marines in the Gulf War, 1990–1991 (2016); U.S. Marines in Afghanistan, 2010–2014: Anthology and Annotated Bibliography (2017); The Legacy of Belleau Wood: 100 Years of Making Marines and Winning Battles, An Anthology (2018); and The Legacy of American Naval Power: Reinvigorating Maritime Strategic Thought, An Anthology (2019).

# INDEX

- Action at Angaur, 78, 81n45
- Ahern, Lt James J. (USA), 38
- Alexander, Roy, 50, 60n35, 62n54
- Alt National Park Service, 263
- American Battle Monuments Commission (ABMC), 105–6, 108, 114, 345
- American Heritage Foundation, 90, 93, 95-96, 100n22
- amphibious trucks (DUKW),172, 175–76, 345
- Amphitheater, the, 19
- ANZAC Day, 125, 128, 137n20
- AP Wirephoto, 47–49, 59n11
- Arlington Ridge, VA, xi, xxv-xxvi, 102, 108, 115, 117, 118–19n34. See also Marine Corps War Memorial
- Arnold, Henry H., 88
- Artists' Guild, 107
- Associated Press (AP), xix, 27, 45, 53, 59n11, 62n69, 65, 67, 120, 129, 138n34, 151, 161, 169, 184, 189, 195–96, 224, 228, 231, 237, 251, 267–68, 270, 277, 279, 291, 299–300, 303, 305, 309, 312, 315, 319–20, 323, 327, 335, 338, 341, 345
- Atherton, John, 71
- atomic bombs, 25, 37, 41, 88, 92, 121, 323 Hiroshima, 25, 41, 121
  - Nagasaki, 25, 41, 323
- Auburn (AGC 10), 175
- Australia, xxvi, 120-39
- Australia and New Zealand Army Corps (ANZAC), 125, 128, 134
- Australia, New Zealand, United States Security (ANZUS) Treaty, 131–32, 138n46, 345

Barrow, Capt Robert H., 257-58 Basilone, GySgt John, xviii battles Guadalcanal, 8, 28-29, 31, 33, 120, 124, 126, 132-33, 138n55, 153, 166n17, 194n14, 260, 328, 335 Okinawa, 8-9, 37, 51-52, 129, 323, 327 Beaches, 10, 174–75 Green, 11, 176-80 Purple, 33 Red, 85, 175-76, 180 White, 40-41 Yellow, 175 Beall, C. C., xxv, 63, 65, 67-71, 74-76, 78-79, 80n17-20, 322. See also Seventh War Loan drive Beech, TSgt W. Keyes, 26n37, 230, 306 Belleau Wood, 87, 114-17, 256. See also Iron Mike Bended knee speech, 88-89. See also Vandegrift, Gen Alexander A. Blandy, RAdm William H. P. (USN), 9 Block, Belle, xxii, 168n56, 198, 211. See also Block, Cpl Harlon H. Block, Cpl Harlon H., xxii, 18, 23, 109, 112-13, 164, 195-98, 201, 206-7, 210-12, 216n27, 218-20, 223, 225, 230-31, 233, 236-38, 243-44, 264, 322, 338. See also Official Report of the del Valle Board; Official Report of the Huly Panel Investigation, Part I and II; Official Report of the Bowers Board Investigation

Bloody Gorge, 21–22

Boeing B-29 Superfortress, 22, 37, 41

Bohm, BGen Jason Q., 200, 272–85, 286–97. See also Official Report of the Huly Panel Investigation, Part I and II

Boston Globe, 48, 59n17

Bowers, BGen William J., x, xii, xxiv, 218, 224, 236, 264. See also Official Report of the Bowers Board Investigation

Bowers Board, x-xii, xiv, xxiv, 185, 201, 215n3, 216n24– 25, 219, 225–26, 235–38, 240–45, 246n5, 264 Official Report of the Bowers Board Investigation, 298–313

Bradley, PhM2c John H. (USN), xv, xix, xxi–xxiii, xxiv, 26n37, 59n8, 98, 110–13, 119n43, 154, 160, 166n15, 168n51, 170, 195–98, 202–14, 215n1, 216n19, 216n22, 216n27, 219, 227, 238, 240, 244, 251, 254–55, 264, 322–23, 331, 337, 341. See also Official Report of the del Valle Board; Official Report of the Huly Panel Investigation, Part I and II; Official Report of the Bowers Board Investigation

Brooklyn Historical Society, 227, 301

Brooks, George C., 97

- Bruce, J. Campbell, 52
- Buell, Hal, xxviii, 61n50
- Burmeister, Sgt Louis R., 60n36, 161–65, 167n37, 215n8, 230, 295, 304, 323
- Burns, PFC George (USA), 60n36, 148, 156, 162–64, 215n8, 220, 222–23, 226, 231, 233, 243, 264, 295, 299, 303–11, 323, 335, 338

Burrell, Robert S., 25n4, 99

- Bush, George H. W., 260
- Campbell, Pvt Robert R., 59n10, 60–61n36, 161, 163– 64, 187, 194n8, 196, 207, 215n6, 220–22, 228–29, 233–37, 242–43, 264, 279–82, 295, 300, 303, 305– 11, 323–27

Camps

Lejeune, 94–95 Mackay, 132 Paekākāriki, 132 Pendleton, 98, 212, 299, 324, 326, 328 Russell, 132

Tarawa, 212

Cassel Jr., Pvt Dale O., 23

Cates, MajGen Clifton B., 10, 16, 19, 21, 26n40, 52, 61n46, 98

Chaney, MajGen James E. (USA), 34, 36

- Chambers, LtCol Justice M., 17
- Charlo, PFC Louis C., 96, 155–56, 163, 208–9, 292, 295–96, 323–24

Chowder Society, 88, 93, 345

Clark, RAdm J. J. (USN), 6

- Clark, Tom C., 89–93, 118n10, 118n26. *See also* Freedom Train
- Clement, BGen W. T., 270. See Official Report of the del Valle Board
- Cold War, xxvi, 99, 103, 109, 115, 117, 131–32

Collier's magazine, 68, 322. See Beall, C. C.

Commission of Fine Arts, 105-8, 118n15

Conner, Owen L., 240, 299, 301, 311. *See also* Official Report of the Bowers Board Investigation

Cornelius, SSgt Meyers A., 60n36, 152, 161–62, 215n8, 253, 305, 324

- Crowson, PFC Allan C., 15
- Curtin, John, 123
- Cutsail, SgtMaj Douglas F., 236. See also Official Report of the Bowers Board Investigation

Daskalakis, 1stSgt John A., 230, 242, 244

del Valle Board, xii, xxii, 112, 198, 200, 206–7, 212, 218, 243, 264, 278, 280–82, 299–300, 307 Official Report of, 267–71

del Valle, MajGen Pedro A., xxii, 198, 206, 230, 264, 283. *See also* Official Report of the del Valle Board

Dempsey, SSgt David K., 26n25, 45, 59n6

- Denig, BGen Robert L., 118n33, 230
- de Weldon, Felix W., xi, xvi, xxvi, 79, 83, 102–19, 201–2, 214, 236, 242, 251, 329–30

Digital Evidence Laboratory, xxiv, 216n25, 217n36, 233, 251, 264, 300, 302–12. *See also* Official Report of the Bowers Board Investigation

Dodds, PFC R. R., 56-57

- Doughty, Cpl Goodwin G., 13
- Duncan, David Douglas, 257-58

Eagle, Globe, and Anchor (USMC), 114, 120, 195, 336, 338 Eastwood, Clint, 134, 140, 213 Edwards, PFC Ralph Lee, 17–18 Eisenhower, Dwight D., 88, 102, 116 *Eldorado* (AGC 11), xix–xx, 168n59 Elkus, PFC Bruce (USA), 24, 37, 40–41 Empire Air Training Scheme, 123, 137n7 equipment ammunition bandoleer, 234, 243, 280, 303, 306–7, 342–43 cartridge belt (M1923), 206, 281, 340–41 combat medic harness system (1943), 341 M1 helmet, 206–7, 231, 234, 238, 243, 337–38 utility cap (1944), 160, 337–38, 343n13

Erskine, MajGen Graves B., 10, 24, 33, 36

Evanson, PFC Clifford, 160

Eversharp, 76-77. See also Seventh War Loan drive

- Federal Bureau of Investigation (FBI), xxiv, 216n25, 217n36, 231–38, 240–44, 251, 264, 300–10. *See* Digital Evidence Laboratory
- Fisk, James E., 163, 295
- Flags of Our Fathers, xv, 134, 139n59, 168n51, 169–70, 183n31, 213
- F. & M. Schaefer Brewing Company, 76. *See also* Seventh War Loan drive
- Foley, Stephen, xv, xix, xxii–xxiii, xxvi–xxvii, 238, 242, 252, 263–64, 299–300, 312, 326, 328. See also See also Official Report of the del Valle Board; Official Report of the Huly Panel Investigation, Part I and II; Official Report of the Bowers Board Investigation
- Forrestal, James V., xxi, 66, 85–86, 88, 91–92, 99, 164, 166, 168n53, 169–70, 183n31, 246n24, 278
- Fraser, Peter, 124
- Freedom Train, xxvi, 89-101, 104, 118n10

Honor Guard, xxvi, 90, 92–95, 100n38–39

- French, Daniel Chester, 70
- Fulford, Col Robert C., xiii, 236. *See also* Official Report of the Bowers Board Investigation
- Gagnon, PFC Rene A., xix. xxi, 23, 26n37, 46, 59n9, 98, 110–12, 164, 170, 177–79, 195–96, 198, 204–7, 209, 211, 214, 218–20, 224, 228–29, 231, 233, 236–38, 240, 242, 244, 246n23, 251, 254, 264, 324–25. See also Official Report of the del Valle Board; Official Report of the Huly Panel Investigation, Part I and II; Official Report of the Bowers Board Investigation
- Gallipoli, 125, 128, 134
- Gates, Robert F., 107
- Genaust, Sgt William H., xxvi–xxvii, 16, 60–61n36, 148, 161, 163–65, 168n63, 169–70, 182, 184–94, 196, 201, 203–9, 215n6, 216n25, 220, 222, 233, 235, 237–38, 244, 317, 324–25, 327, 339. See also Official Report of the Huly Panel Investigation, Part I and II; Official Report of the Bowers Board Investigation
- Gentry, Col Keil R., 200. *See also* Official Report of the Huly Panel Investigation, Part I and II; and Official Report of the Bowers Board Investigation
- Ghormley, VAdm Robert L. (USN), 123
- Ghosts of Iwo Jima, 99
- Gibbons, Floyd, 87
- Goode, Pvt Robert D., 157–58, 161, 232, 293

Great Depression, 88-89, 189

- Grigsby, SgtMaj William J., xiii, 236. *See also* Official Report of the Bowers Board Investigation
- Guadalcanal, xviii, 8, 28–33, 120, 122, 124, 126, 132– 33, 138n55, 153, 166n17, 194n14, 328
- Guam, xix-xx, 47-48, 59n15, 60n22, 123, 127-28, 136-37n2, 168n59, 186, 224, 316, 327, 335
- Guinnell, Vic, 73. See Seventh War Loan drive
- Gung Ho photograph, xxi, 201, 211, 219–20, 222–24, 227, 231, 233, 235, 240, 242–44, 318, 329, 335–36, 338. See also Rosenthal, Joseph J.; Burns, PFC George; Official Report of the del Valle Board; Official Report of the Huly Panel Investigation, Part I and II; Official Report of the Bowers Board Investigation

Hagenah, LtCol Edward R., 200, 206, 324–25. See Official Report of the del Valle Board

- Halls of Montezuma, 98
- Hansen, Sgt Henry O., xviii, xxii, 18, 23, 59n8, 112–13, 119n43, 148, 159–60, 167n38, 196, 198, 201, 208–12, 218, 220, 222, 232–33, 254, 264, 325, 338. See also Official Report of the del Valle Board; Official Report of the Huly Panel Investigation, Part I and II; Official Report of the Bowers Board Investigation
- Hatch, WO Norman T., 47–48, 163, 168n53, 187–90, 194, 215n6, 323, 325
- Hawkins, SgtMaj Richard A., 200. See also Official Report of the Huly Panel Investigation, Part I and II
- Hayes, PFC Ira H., xix, xxi–xxii, 25, 26n37, 78, 95, 98, 110, 112, 164, 168n56, 178–80, 195–98, 201, 204–14, 215n1, 216n27, 220, 225, 230, 235–38, 242–44, 254, 265n7, 325–26. See also Official Report of the del Valle Board; Official Report of the Huly Panel Investigation, Part I and II; Official Report of the Bowers Board Investigation
- Haynes, Capt Fred E., 12, 18, 21-22, 25, 230
- Henri, Capt Robert, 21
- "Here's Your Infantry," 78, 81n43–44. See also Seventh War Loan drive
- Heritage of Freedom, 95. See Freedom Train
- Hermanek, Cpl Thomas J., 157–58. *See also* Official Report of the del Valle Board; Official Report of the Huly Panel Investigation, Part I and II
- Hill, RAdm Harry W. (USN), 9, 31, 175, 178
- Hills

79, 257–58 362A, 18–19, 164, 186, 324 362C, 20 Hills (continued)

382 (Turkey Knob), 19

- Hjerpe, Maj Carl W., 22
- Hoagland Jr., Alexander C. (USNR), 104
- Hollywood, CA, 78, 98, 122, 124, 133, 160, 165, 185, 187, 190, 194n7, 202
- Hulburd, David, 52
- Huly, LtGen Jan C., 184, 199–201, 205, 223–24, 300, 361
- Huly Panel, ix–xix, 59n8, 60n36, 112, 167n38, 184–85, 195–217, 219–20, 223–24, 231, 243, 246 Official Report of, Part I, 272–85 Official Report of, Part II, 286–97
- Inaoka, Maj Masaru (Japanese Imperial Army), 39 Inouye, Capt Samaji (Japanese Imperial Navy), 19

Irizarry, Joshua A., 146

Iron Mike, 114-15, 117. See also de Weldon, Felix W.

Jacobs, PFC Raymond E., xxiii, xxviin16, 155–56, 159– 60, 165, 168n67, 210, 214–15, 326–27. *See also* Official Report of the Huly Panel Investigation, Part I and II

Jacquet, Paul F., 108

- Japanese Imperial Army, 143 2d Mixed Brigade, 39
- Johnson, Col Robert F. (USA), 30
- Johnson, LtCol Chandler W., xx, 15, 18, 54, 153–55, 164, 170, 183n31, 196, 208, 237, 326. *See also* Official Report of the Huly Panel Investigation, Part I and II
- Johnston, Richard W., 120, 137n4
- Ka-Bar knife, 228-29, 242, 281, 305, 311
- Keating, Paul, 133
- Keller, Cpl Harold P., xii, xxiv, xxvii, 109, 111, 154, 158– 59, 161, 166n17, 168n62, 218, 220, 222–23, 226– 30, 233–35, 237–38, 242–45, 251, 264, 326–27. See also Official Report of the Huly Panel Investigation, Part I and II; Official Report of the Bowers Board Investigation
- Keogh, Sgt John E. (USA), 30
- Kitano Point, 10, 21-22, 328
- Kokoda, Papua New Guinea, 129-30, 133
- Kolb, Capt James T. (USA), 30, 39
- Krelle, Eric, xxii-xxiii, 198, 200, 216n19, 264, 328
- Krulak, LtGen Victor H., 88
- Kuniyoshi, Yasuo, 69
- Kuribayashi, LtGen Tadamichi (Japanese Imperial Navy), xvii, 7–8, 12, 18–19, 21–22, 38, 157

- landing craft, vehicle and personnel (LCVP or Higgins Boat), 171–73, 345
- landing ship, tank (LST), xxvii, 164, 169-83, 345
- landing vehicle, tracked (LVT), 173-76, 345
- Land Rights Dance, 134–35
- Larcade Jr., Henry D., 103–7
- Lawrie, Lee, 105-6, 108, 118
- Leader, LCpl Robert A., 159, 208, 293-94
- Leatherneck magazine, 16, 51, 53–54, 56, 58, 61–62n50, 155, 164, 167, 196, 198, 201, 208, 214, 216n20, 309, 325, 327
- LeHew, SgtMaj Justin, 199–200, 208. See also Official Report of the Huly Panel Investigation, Part I and II
- Lejeune, MajGen John A., 288
- Lend Lease Act of 1941, 172
- Lenoir, Lt Joseph (USA), 38–39
- Letters from Iwo Jima, 140, 213
- Leutze, Emanuel, 54, 56, 62n62, 67
- *Life* magazine, xxv, 13, 45–62, 66–67, 133, 138n34, 164, 253, 257–58, 319, 323
- Lindberg, Cpl Charles W., 59n8, 157–60, 165, 167, 168n67, 208–10, 232, 245, 327, 331–32. See also Official Report of the Huly Panel Investigation, Part I and II; Official Report of the Bowers Board Investigation
- Liversedge, Col Harry B., 14-15, 153-54, 166n14
- Longwell, Daniel, 45, 50-51, 53, 54, 59n4, 62n54
- Los Angeles Times, 68
- Lovell, Sgt Tom, 58
- Lowe, Gen Frank E. (USA), 98
- Lowery, SSgt Louis R., xix–xx, xxv–xxvi, 16, 46–49, 51, 53–57, 60n19, 60n36, 61–62n50, 62n55, 66, 128–29, 155, 157–65, 167n38, 167n43, 167n59, 167n67, 196–97, 207–10, 216n20, 229, 231–32, 253, 327, 338, 342. See also Official Report of the Huly Panel Investigation, Part I and II; Official Report of the Bowers Board Investigation
- LST-758, 169-83
- LST-779, 169-83, 237
- Lucas, PFC Jacklyn H., 15, 26n14, 26n40
- Luce, Henry Robinson, 58
- Lucky 8 television, 184–85, 190, 193, 198. See also Official Report of the Huly Panel Investigation, Part I and II
- MacArthur, Gen Douglas (USA), 8, 123, 126-27, 257
- Maddux, SgtMaj David L., 200. See also Official Report of the Huly Panel Investigation, Part I and II
- Manchester Historic Association, 231, 301
- Marine Corps League, 96, 107–8, 112–13, 118n23, 118n26

Marine Corps War Memorial, 98, 102-19, 134, 140-47, 165, 195, 201-2, 214, 251, 254, 256, 259, 329-30. See also de Weldon, Felix W. Marine Military Academy, 231, 301 Marling, Karal Ann, 112, 167n34, 215n6 Marshall, Gen George C. (USA), 85, 88, 119n53 Martin, 1stLt Harry L., 22 Mercer, PFC George B., 155–56, 208, 292 Michels, PFC James R., xix, 160, 168n62, 208-9, 231, 292, 327. See also Official Report of the Huly Panel Investigation, Part I and II Midway, 133, 194n14, 328 Minute Man, The, 70-71, 76, 81n43. See also Seventh War Loan drive Missoula (APA 211), 95, 177 Missouri (BB 63), 100n12, 120, 322 Mitscher, VAdm Marc A. (USN), 6, 25n2 Molenda, Lt Felix J., 172, 178 Morgan, LtCol Matthew W., xxii-xxiii, 59, 193n1, 200 Morgenthau Jr., Henry, 69-70 Morrison, Maj Richard R. (USA), 27, 40-41 Motion Picture Preservation Lab, 190-91 Motoyama Airfield No. 1, 13, 15-17 No. 2, 18, 33 No. 3, 20, 33 Mulligan, Sgt James D., 154-55 Muscarella, PFC Anthony, 24, 26n40 Mykris, PFC Mike N., 161-62, 168n45-46

- National Archives and Records Administration (NARA), xiii–xxiv, xxvii, 27, 80n20, 184–85, 191, 216, 224–25, 300. *See also* Official Report of the Bowers Board Investigation
- National Museum of the Marine Corps, xii–xiv, 117n1, 231, 240, 256, 262, 285, 340, 343n2. *See also* Official Report of the Bowers Board Investigation
- National Park Service (NPS), 107, 118–19n34, 263 National Sculpture Society, 106
- National Security Act of 1947, 93, 99, 112, 345
- Naval Air Station Patuxent, MD, 102
- Naval Photographic Studio (NPS), 189-90, 194n7, 346
- Navy Photographic Science Laboratory, 185–88
- Naylor Jr., Capt Arthur H., 155, 161–62, 246n22. See also Official Report of the Huly Panel Investigation, Part I and II
- Neild, Edward F., 108, 118n32
- Neimeyer, Charles P., 200, 205, 216n16, 219. See also Official Report of the Huly Panel Investigation, Part I and II

Neller, Gen Robert B., xv, xxiii, 117, 184, 196, 199, 205, 209, 264 New York Times, xx, 45, 48-49, 108, 130, 170, 242 New Zealand, 120-39, 343 Nimitz, Adm Chester W. (USN), xxi, 21, 56-57, 107-8, 188, 254, 265n4, 330 Nisei, 37, 39, 43-44n18 Nishi Ridge, 18-19, 22, 164, 322 North Carolina (BB 55), 9 Now ... All Together, 64, 67-70, 74-77, 79. See also Seventh War Loan drive O'Connor, CWO William J., 83 Office of War Information (OWI), 47, 69, 346 Old Glory Goes up on Mount Suribachi, Iwo Jima, 45-49, 51, 63-68, 74-79, 122, 129, 140, 196, 271n2 Olson, PFC Dale E., 155, 166n19 Omaha (NE) World-Herald, xxii, 198 Pacific Negative Logbook (USMC), xx, 300 Papadopoulos, Randy, 200-1. See also Official Report of the Huly Panel Investigation, Part I and II Papsun, PHOM3 John (USCG), 148, 224, 305 Patzman, MSgt Stacy M., 226, 236. See also Official Report of the Bowers Board Investigation Pearl Harbor, HI, 28, 121, 138n34, 170, 172, 188, 257, 337 Peatross, Maj Oscar F., 153 Pershing, Gen John J. (USA), 28, 114 Pryor, Don, xix-xx Puller, Col Lewis B., 257-58 Quarry, the, 10–11, 13, 16

Reichert, Joseph, 75–76. See also Seventh War Loan drive Reinwald, Col Mary H., 219, 263. See Official Report of the Huly Panel Investigation, Part I and II
Resnick, QM Robert L. (USCG), xxvii, 170–71, 178–80, 182
Retreat, Hell!, 98, 115, 119n51
Richardson, LtGen Robert C. (USA), 43
Robertson, Breanne, 199–200, 224–46. See also Official Report of the Huly Panel Investigation, Part I and II; Official Report of the Bowers Board Investigation
Robeson, PFC James A., 158–60, 232, 293, 295, 309
Rockey, MajGen Keller E., 10, 20, 22, 164, 194n8
Rockwall (APA 230), 37

- Rockwell, Norman, 67, 69 Roll, LtCol George A., 163, 194n8
- INDEX 369

Roosevelt, Franklin D., xviii, xxi, 26n37, 70, 124, 196,

- 215n9, 218, 322–23
- Royall, Kenneth C., 93–94
- Rozek, PFC Leo J., 159, 208, 293–94
- Sands of Iwo Jima, 98–99, 133, 165, 256, 328
- Schlosberg, 1stLt Herbert B., 188, 190, 194n13
- Schmidt, MajGen Harry, 10, 17, 19–21, 34
- Schmitt, PFC John T., 157–58, 293
- Schmitz, SSgt Werner H., 47
- Schrier, 1stLt Harold G., xix, xxviiin16, 15, 59n8–9, 62n52, 153–55, 157–65, 166n14–15, 166–67n20, 167n38, 170, 196, 205, 208–11, 220–23, 234, 237, 252, 317, 325–29, 332–33. See also Official Report of the del Valle Board; Official Report of the Huly Panel Investigation, Part I and II; Official Report of the Bowers Board Investigation
- Schultz, PFC Harold H., xii, xvi, xxiii–xxiv, xxvii, 25, 109, 111, 159–60, 205, 207, 210–12, 217n39, 219, 225, 231–32, 235, 237–38, 242–45, 246n4, 251, 264, 328, 337–39, 341. See also Official Report of the Huly Panel Investigation, Part I and II; Official Report of the Bowers Board Investigation
- Seventh War Loan drive/campaign, xviii, xxv, 26n37, 63–81, 104, 165, 190, 196, 198, 216n22, 218, 230, 236, 254–55, 264, 269, 283, 306, 310–11, 319, 322–24, 326
- Severance, Capt Dave E., 15, 23, 59n9, 154–55, 166n14, 166–67n20, 167n26, 167n28, 196, 206, 215n7, 230, 304
- Shackle (ARS 9), 176, 179
- Shahn, Ben, 69
- Sherrod, Robert, xx, xxv, 6, 13, 23, 45, 48–50, 52–54, 56, 59n4, 60n28, 62n52
- Silent Drill Team, 92, 259
- Silverstein, PA2 Judy L., 171, 178-79
- Sloan, Robert, 71, 73
- Smith, LtGen Holland M., xix–xx, 8–10, 23, 25n6, 85– 86, 166, 169, 278
- Smith, SgtMaj Gary, 208. *See also* Official Report of the Huly Panel Investigation, Part I and II
- Smith, W. Eugene, 50-52, 60n34, 61n41-44
- Smithsonian Channel, xxiii, 184–85, 190, 193, 199–200, 273
- Snyder, Sgt Howard M., 158, 160, 210, 222–23, 293, 295, 303
- Sousley, PFC Franklin R., xix, xxii, 23, 109, 164, 195– 96, 198, 205–7, 211, 219, 225, 234, 237–38, 243– 44, 254, 320, 328, 337–38, 340–41. See also Official Report of the del Valle Board; Official Report of the Huly Panel Investigation, Part I and II;

Official Report of the Bowers Board Investigation Spence, Dustin, xxiii, xxvii, xxviiin3, 167n32, 208, 219-

- 20, 227, 229–32, 238, 242, 252, 299–300, 312, 326
- Spruance, Adm Raymond A. (USN), 6, 9, 25n2, 108
- Stafford, Col David A., 57
- Stars and Stripes, 27
- Steadman, Sgt Henry W., 94–95
- Steele, MajGen Orlo K., x, 219, 223, 299–300
- Strank, Sgt Michael, xvii, xx, 18, 23, 59n9, 109, 164, 168n56, 195–96, 198, 205, 207, 211, 220, 233, 235–38, 240, 243–44, 254, 329, 335–36, 338. See Official Report of the del Valle Board; Official Report of the Huly Panel Investigation, Part I and II; Official Report of the Bowers Board Investigation
- Streett, MajGen St. Clair (USA), 92–94
- Stryker, Sgt John M. (John Wayne), 133
- Sullivan, John L., 93–94, 107
- Sutter, LtCol Allan, 268, 270. *See also* Official Report of the del Valle Board
- Suver, Father Charles F., 163, 168n51, 295, 323
- Talladega (APA 208), 171, 179-80
- Tanaka, Sgt Ritsuwo (USA), 39
- tank landing craft (TLC), 171
- Task Force 58, 6, 9, 25n2
- Task Group 53.3 (Tractor Flotilla), 172
- Task Unit 11.1.2, 31
- Tatum, PFC Charles W., 160, 167n32
- Tentative Landing Operations Manual, 88
- Thomas Jr., PlSgt Ernest I., xix–xx, 59n8, 159–60, 167n38, 208–10, 220, 222, 234, 329, 333. See also Official Report of the Huly Panel Investigation, Part I and II; Official Report of the Bowers Board Investigation
- Time magazine, xx, 45-62, 67, 244
- To the Shores of Iwo Jima, 187, 189-90, 193
- Torrey, MajGen P. H., 228
- Towers, VAdm J. H., 188
- Tourism Australia, 134, 136
- Traub, PFC Donald W., 22
- Treasury Department, 63, 67, 69–70, 74–75, 78–79, 81n43, 104, 108. *See also* Seventh War Loan drive *True*, 52
- Truman, Harry S., 26n37, 85, 88–89, 93, 97–99, 108, 110, 118n30, 322. *See also* Freedom Train
- Turner, VAdm Richmond Kelly (USN), xix, 9-10
- Tuttle, 2dLt Albert T., 164, 170, 177, 183n31, 237
- Tuttle Jr., Col William B. (USA), 29

Unknown Flag Raiser of Iwo Jima, The, 184 uniforms,

field jacket (M1941), 206-7, 235, 240-41, 244, 281-82, 304-7, 311, 335-39, 343 service shirt (1937), 229, 231, 305, 335, 339-40 utility uniform (P1941), 335-40 U.S. Army Air Forces, xvii, 6, 10, 22, 24, 25n6, 27-28, 34-35, 41, 43n2, 88, 92 21st Fighter Group, 22-23 VII Fighter Command, 35 81st Infantry Regiment, 78 96th Infantry Division, 37 147th Infantry Regiment, 21, 23, 28-31, 33-44 Ammunition and Pioneer Platoon, 38 Garrison Force, 34, 40-42 U.S. Army Heritage and Education Center, 220, 224, 226, 300. See also Official Report of the Bowers **Board Investigation** U.S. Coast Guard, xxvii, 92, 148, 170-72, 180, 182, 190, 224 Historian's Office, 171, 182n11 U.S. Marine Corps V Amphibious Corps, 10, 25n1, 31, 34-35, 178 1st Marine Division, 121-22, 124, 126, 132, 136, 138n50, 198, 257-58, 325 3d Marine Division, 5, 10–11, 17–21, 24–25, 31, 33, 36, 121, 325 9th Marines, 17, 36 21st Marines, 17, 20 1st Battalion, 33 4th Marine Division, 5, 10-23, 27, 29, 31, 47, 152, 186, 188, 194n4, 224, 248 23d Marines 3d Battalion, 16 24th Marines 3d Battalion, 17 25th Marines 2d Battalion, 24 4th Tank Battalion, 19 5th Marine Division, 5, 10-20, 23-25, 27, 31, 34, 159, 215, 322, 327 26th Marines, 18, 21 1st Battalion, 26n14 2d Battalion, 23 27th Marines, 18, 22 1st Battalion, 160 2d Battalion, 13, 179, 183n23, 291 28th Marines, 10, 14, 18, 35, 49, 152 lst Battalion, 179, 183n23 2d Battalion, xvii, 15, 18, 23, 46, 153-58, 163-64, 167n22, 169, 170, 177, 179, 196, 208, 215n7, 226, 236, 242, 250, 322, 324, 326, 328–30 3d Battalion, 153–21 13th Marines, 22 5th Pioneer Battalion, 22, 35 Photographic Section, 47, 162–63, 187–88 Raider Battalion 1st Marine Raider Regiment, 153 2d Marine Raider Battalion, 153 3d Marine Raider Battalion, 153 U.S. Navy, 6, 8, 10, 15, 17, 25, 50, 61n46, 88, 103, 118n7, 126, 138n34, 163, 172, 325, 341 Third Fleet, 25n2 Fifth Fleet, 6, 25n2 Honor Guard, 92

Vandegrift, Gen Alexander A., 88–89, 92, 100n32, 107, 188–89, 198, 218, 264, 330. *See also* Official Report of the del Valle Board V–J Day, 88, 100n12, 346

war bonds, 63-81

Ward, Pvt Philip L., xxiii, 59n8, 155, 158-60, 165, 168n62, 197, 208-10, 230-32, 329. See also Official Report of the Huly Panel Investigation, Part I and II; Official Report of the Bowers Board Investigation Watson, Forbes, 104-5, 107 Watson, Sgt Sherman B., 155-57, 208, 292, 295, 324 Washington (BB 56), 9 Washington Crossing the Delaware, 53-56, 67 Washington Post, 66, 102, 104, 325 weapons M1 carbine, xix, 110-11, 235, 244, 310, 340, 342 M1 Garand, 15, 110, 235, 244, 340-43 M1918 Browning automatic rifle (BAR), 29, 158, 161, 163, 324 Wells, 1stLt G. Greeley, 164, 208, 230, 242, 292 Wells, Lt John Keith, 166n14, 230-31, 240, 328 Weslaco Independent School District, TX, 231, 301 Westemeyer, Brent, xxiii, 219-20, 227, 230-32, 238, 242, 326. See also Official Report of the Bowers **Board Investigation** Wetenhall, John, 112, 118n12, 119n39, 167n34, 215n6 What Price Glory, 98 Wheeler, Cpl Richard, 167n34, 226, 301 White, PFC Theodore J., 155-56, 208, 292, 295, 325 Wieland, Cpl John J., 154-55, 157, 166n19, 166-67n20, 330, 333-34 Williams, Capt Lloyd W., 115, 119n51 Wilson, Woodrow, 87 Winged Arrow (AP 170), 242, 244

Wood, ENS Alan S. (USNR), xxvii, 170–71, 177, 182n13, 183n34

Wright Museum of World War II, xxiv, 231, 301, 312

Wyeth, N. C., 71–72. *See also* Seventh War Loan drive Wyford, Phil, 75. *See also* Seventh War Loan drive

Yamamoto, Adm Isoroku (Japanese Imperial Navy), 7 *Yank*, 27–53, 162–63, 220, 223, 303, 323 Yasukuni Shrine, xxvi, 144–45, 147n6

Ziehme, PhM2c Gerald D., 154, 166n15, 201